

# Flagstaff Regional Plan 2030

Public Review DRAFT (March 2013) - Suggested Edits Needing Further Review

## Overall/Layout

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
1		Staff	Need a <b>one-page executive summary</b> - this is where we state elevation, unique eco-system, wildlife, urban growth and economic climate within more than 243,000 acres of national forest in the planning area; Rio de Flag overview; population; diversity; historical context of Native Americans; location on I-40, I-17; proximity to Grand Canyon, other cities in nation.		✓	
2	Overall	Eva Putzova	Additional Recommendations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social Capital should be added to the Plan's elements. Goals and policies then should support                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>o development of culturally appropriate strategies to engage the underrepresented public in civic discourse,</li> <li>o composition of boards and commissions that reflects ethnic diversity of the community,</li> <li>o economic equality,</li> <li>o government transparency and strong emphasis on consulting public on civic matters, and</li> <li>o improvements in voter turnout.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>The plan should identify community's strong connection to the Native American cultures of Colorado Plateau and a growing influence of Hispanic cultures.</b></li> </ul>	✓		Last point as appropriate for introduction
3		● Cynthia Pardo	Social Capital should be an essential goal! -The plan should identify that one of our community's largest demographics and contributors to positive economic growth is Native American and Hispanic people and cultures. The way our community grows and develops should consider the importance that culture plays on building strong communities. -There must be places where families can grow and thrive to develop healthy and successful children -Residential areas should have access to healthy sources of food, places where kids can be active and safe, and basic needs can be reached. -development of culturally appropriate strategies to engage the underrepresented public in civic discourse, -composition of boards and commissions that reflects ethnic diversity of the community, -economic equality, -government transparency and strong emphasis on consulting public on civic matters, and improvements in voter turnout.	✓		
4	Overall	Alex Wright	<i>Guide for reviewing document:</i> The policies found here are implemented when decisions are made regarding development; otherwise, all facets addressed essentially remain status quo without any disruption. Two primary populations will be using the document, those looking to develop, redevelop, or build and those public administrators inside city and county government making decisions. Due to this, it would be helpful to think of yourself as someone who is looking at the document as a general guidebook.	✓		
5	Overall	Alex Wright	<i>Guide for reviewing document:</i> As you go through the document, think to yourself <b>what you would need to learn from it if you were someone looking to open a business or a facility of some sort.</b> What would you need to know about your responsibilities as the person who is developing? Is the policy understandable, if it is too broad or too narrow is there reference to regulation or zoning that could clarify the meaning behind the policy? Bureaucracy notwithstanding, what in this policy would guide you through the development process and what is missing or what is overstated?		✓	
6	Overall	Alex Wright	<i>Guide for reviewing document:</i> given that policy within government is implemented primarily through budget allocations, will that policy aid in decision-making within city government if a budgetary allocation question arises, does the policy clearly state priorities? If we had to choose between spending more money with the CVB or for infrastructure would this policy help make that decision?	✓		
7	Overall	Phil Goldblatt public comment	Many folks come to Flagstaff b/c of beautiful landscape, great weather and quality of life. They also did so b/c Arizona folks still respect and value our heritage of free speech, pride in our country, and private property. Need to actually state in the Flagstaff Regional Plan that no one's private property rights are infringed upon by the Plan. Instead of just stating "Private property shall not be taken for public use without just compensation"; why not state that "Private property shall not be taken for public use without both just compensation as well as the owners permission and/or agreement?"	✓		
8	Overall	Carol Bousquet	There are a many long run-on sentences throughout the document.		✓	
9	Overall	Carol Bousquet	The word "ensure" is overused throughout		✓	
10	Overall	Carol Bousquet	It would be much easier to navigate if goals & policies for all chapters were moved to the end of chapter in one place	✓		
11	Overall	Jim McCarthy	Clean Document that states what we want to see, hard to implement a policy when there are various interpretations,	✓		
12	Overall	Jim McCarthy	Overall good document, need some shortening, write for the public		✓	
13	Overall	F3 BOD ● And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	"Social Capital should be added to the Plan's element. Goals and policies then should support: 1)development of culturally appropriate strategies to engage the underrepresented public in civic discourse 2)Composition of boards and commissions that reflect ethnic diversity of the community 3)Economic equality 4)Government transparency and strong emphasis on consulting public on civic matters 5) Improvement in voter turnout.	✓		
14	Overall	F3 BOD	"The plan should identify community's strong connection to the Native American cultures of Colorado Plateau and a growing influence of Hispanic cultures.		✓	
15	Overall	County Public Health	"The Coconino County Public Health Services District appreciates the City's dedication to the public process and hopes to work together toward a healthier and more prosperous Flagstaff."	✓		
16	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff is richly endowed with natural beauty. Quality of life is determined not by per capita income, but by the degree that citizens are encouraged and enabled to use the local environment recreationally."	✓		
17	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Unique to me that one town doesn't run into another as it does on east coast. More pavement,more roof tops. hotter it will be here. Just because there is lot of space, you don't allow building all over it."	✓		
18	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I tried to post what I have issue with, but your survey is not actually looking for real feedback apparently. I find that the plan to protect heritage sites needs to be more specific and broach hard issues the community is facing including the desecration of the San Francisco Peaks for the private profit of a company that does not even pay taxes to Flagstaff. As far as protection of cultural heritage, the protection of this site would be a first move in repairing the deep historical and current wounds experienced by a large portion of the community, which is Native. Flagstaff, and this plan, seems to be considering image. I am asking that anyone who is crafting a plan to dig a bit deeper and consider addressing long standing cultural discrimination of Native people, which would include the protection of their international cultural rights to maintain and protect sacred sites."	✓		
19	Overall	Public Online Survey	"None, this seems to take my individual rights away from my family."	✓		
20	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Really focused on Community Efforts"	✓		
21	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I don't support local government in taking resources from it's citizens to meddle in areas that they have no right to."	✓		
22	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff is a noisy city Geographically, the entire area is effected by overgrowth"	✓		
23	Overall	Public Online Survey	"All areas are important to improve the area in which we live."	✓		
24	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I do not agree with any of the goals and policies"	✓		
25	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I oppose nanny state restrictions on private property"	✓		
26	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I like the direction they're promoting. I don't know enough about the rest to comment on them."	✓		
27	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I own a large parcel of land just outside the development area and it appears your plan will not affect my zoning-friendly plans."	✓		
28	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Fiscal responsibility is desperately needed."	✓		
29	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff citizens do not have a right to take the resources of their fellow citizens to pay for projects outside the scope of city government."	✓		
30	Overall	Public Online Survey	"It is a socialist plan. Where we become # not individuals."	✓		
31	Overall	Public Online Survey	"It is often foolish to trust anything put together by a committee because the result comes from a series of compromises; however, this section is overwhelmingly aware and logical. Way to go."	✓		
32	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I hope the city follows through with its stated goals of responsible environmental stewardship. We must reduce our impact if we care about future generations being able to enjoy a healthy and enjoyable life on this planet."	✓		

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
33	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Freedom to walk out of the house into open space is basic to many residents of Flagstaff. Simplification of complex lives is beneficial, but the healing effects of walking in quiet woods and meadows is perhaps underappreciated by many. Therefore, the expansion of open space and education of citizens about opportunities for its enjoyment, will serve the community well."	✓		
34	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I would like to see our government stop using taxpayer resources to purchase land for preservation of open space. I don't want to see our government infringing on the rights of private property owners by limiting uses of their property."	✓		
35	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I've lived in Louisville, KY, Austin, TX, Phoenix and Flagstaff. The first thought I had when I first came to Flagstaff is "I can hike in the woods!!" I couldn't do that anywhere near my home in these other places. I had to drive a long ways and pay a fee to hike in the woods elsewhere. Before I knew anything about Flagstaff, I knew I wanted to live where I could access open spaces readily. It is a most healing quality of life issue for me."	✓		
36	Overall	Public Online Survey	"We have no rights to what we own."	✓		
37	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Supporting education is critical to future generations, although I think preserving the natural settings of Flagstaff is also important."	✓		
38	Overall	Public Online Survey	"There should be disincentives for doing greenfield development. Don't expand urban growth boundaries without analysis of available land or projected needs. Determine if projected area growth figures are realistic. Make suburbs and gated communities less important when considering housing choices. Challenge the inevitability of growth and its benefit to the economy."	✓		
39	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Can't get into chapters. Keep Frances Short Pond free of construction, free of more housing and people. Would disrupt area for birds and for fishing. Construction will muck up the waterway and population concentration there will mess up whole area."	✓		
40	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Again, my concern is that this Plan violates the constitutional property rights of land owners, and is in reality a back-door legislative move to "Take" my property rights away without fair compensation."	✓		
41	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I would emphasize the need to plan carefully for limited resources in the future. The days of progress through aggressive growth should be over with a balanced approach to maintain the quality of the community and deter unwarranted development that will promote change that is negative."	✓		
42	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Because the plan cites collaboration on methodologies."	✓		
43	Overall	Public Online Survey	"It's starting to sound like China. We didn't vote these government officials into office to tell us how we are going live. Is this really still the United States or what."	✓		
44	Overall	Public Online Survey	"because it directly negatively impacts properties that I own"	✓		
45	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Good ideas - focus on meeting community needs, eliminating imports and moving to a fossil-fuel-free economy."	✓		
46	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Who cares what Flagstaff looks like, if it is cheap for families and business, they will come."	✓		
47	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I need to know exactly what areas are going to be protected from future growth and what city counsel will be doing in the future as far as density and destroying rural environments"	✓		
48	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Better explanation needed on certain topics"	✓		
49	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Statistics of community development from the past until now, and how we can actively improve our future based on a model. What kinds of social influences can be employed in order to maximize success in a realistic way."	✓		
50	Overall	Public Online Survey	"How are students at NAU counted as residents?"	✓		
51	Overall	Public Online Survey	"water and conservation, land and wildlife efforts...."	✓		
52	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Will this be a guiding document without any teeth? Would like to hold the development community to these goals - still not seeing the regulatory teeth and development is same old cul-de-sac development that goes against ALL things compact and walkable."	✓		
53	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I don't live in Flag, so I can't vote. One concern I have is that this plan is meant to be looonnng term. Whatever current administration think isn't necessarily what future ones will adhere to."	✓		
54	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I would prefer to be able to vote for chapters individually rather than the entire plan. Would also like to see a plan for controlling human population growth through moratoria if the growth is predicted to exceed resource uses. These moratoria should take effect BEFORE the resource limits are reached."	✓		
55	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I will read the plan more thoroughly, but likely will vote upon the plan. There have been other plans for Flagstaff, and the City can only do so much with current funding...."	✓		
56	Overall	Public Online Survey	"I will have to see what the Council will do to this. I'm very concerned that the conservative majority will strip down anything that promotes sustainability and community well-being. Can't wait for Oravitz's comments...."	✓		
57	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Problem areas need work to be supported."	✓		
58	Overall	Public Online Survey	"Get to read the chapters by holding paperwork in my hand"	✓		
59	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"Flowery language-fills the page- says little be specific. The character of this area is mountain living, I didn't get that flavor when reading the descriptions. What is our activity center?"	✓	✓	
60	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"Ultimately, money and influence rule."	✓		
61	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"City in general in not built for growth."	✓		
62	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"City housing like Siler Home is too much to pay for rent it should be lowered housing ."	✓		
63	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"Need more specific support for culture."	✓		
64	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"I agree with most of it but I feel that it doesn't include enough provision for wildlife habitat preservation."	✓		
65	Overall	Public Mail Survey	"Downtown needs more focus along with 4th st."	✓		
66	Overall	P&Z	<b>Each chapter needs to refer back to the Guiding Principles for flow (at beginning or end of each chapter) with graphics?</b>		✓	Refer to Guiding Principles
67	Overall	NACA-Alex Wright	Guiding Principle needed:Balance future growth with tribal, cultural and natural resources. (Catalogue of Sacred Sites and gathering grounds)		✓	
68	Overall	NACA	Need to add photos of Native Americans throughout the document. Need to include a highly detailed map in the introduction section that might even take up one entire page.		✓	
69	Layout	Staff	Too much white space - expand text boxes, especially the goal/policy sections		✓	
70	Layout	Staff	Each chapter needs to be consistent in style and formatting - for example: a) background; b) existing; c) future vision (or past/present/future)		✓	
71	Layout	Staff	Each chapter needs a little 'table of contents' to lay-out the sub-sections		✓	
72	Layout	Staff	The sub-titles need to be carefully reviewed to make sure they articulate what is being discussed		✓	
73	Layout	Staff	Numbering -			
74		Public Survey - Sharon Hester	I strongly opposed the development of the city-owned property next to the Elks Lodge on N San Frant. There are numerous reasons why this land should be annexed into Buffalo Park or made into some sort of open space area. 1) Firstly the drainage issue, the neighborhood below already is dealing with serious drainage problems and this can only compound the issue. 2) • The traffic - there are only 2 streets to access this area on narrow streets with no sidewalks. These non-through fare streets see a lot of children and pets playing in front of their homes or walking to the park. An increase in traffic will certainly cause accidents. Traffic accidents will certainly be an issue. 3) • The area already is being used to either just walk or access Buffalo Park from social trails in the neighborhood. 4) • McMillian Mesa is rapidly becoming developed and this could offset some of that urbanization to a once central yet fairly pristine area.	✓		
75	Layout	Staff	Suggestion #1 - number each chapter - i.e. Open Space 1-14; Water Resources 1-32	✓		
76	Layout	Staff	Suggestion #2 - number the whole document 1-200.	✓		
77	Layout	Staff	COLORS - in the TOC use the darker color of each section. The lighter green and yellow are too bright	✓		
78	Layout	Staff	When referring to a map (name) also cite what page that map is on for quick reference.		✓	
79	Visual	NACA	Possibly a 2-page spread of the Peaks-see Mountain Living Magazine, name peaks, elevation and Native American story background. Could this be the background for the timeline suggested?		✓	
80		• Lisa Rayner	The plan misuses the word "resilience." For a meaningful definition, visit <a href="http://www.resilience.org">http://www.resilience.org</a>		✓	
81	27-345	State Trust Land Department	There are eleven references to "Greenfield Development" in the Plan. Add a definition of "Greenfield Development" to the Plan glossary.		✓	

Table of Contents

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
82	T of C	Staff	first four chapters are "Background" - Use the fourth umbrella of 'Introduction' for all four, combine and synthesize		✓	
83	T of C	Staff	Page # for Public Facilities		✓	
84	T of C	Carol Bousquet	The format of each "element" is difficult to follow - would make sense if each chapter was understood as presenting "past, present and future" - always in the same order.		✓	
85	T of C	Carol Bousquet	Instead of line dividers- use the primary colors in the chapter		✓	
86	T of C	Carol Bousquet	Delete "The" in front of Land, Place, People chapters		✓	
87	I	Staff	Guiding Principles - ¶ 1 'future development'; Sustainability - 'present action - future health' - make sure these all flow		✓	
88	2	Carol Bousquet	Rephrase second bullet under Community Goals		✓	
89	3	NACA	In the People Matter section, add "culture, ceremony. So it reads "health, safety, culture, ceremony, rivals, rituals, and devotion."		✓	
90	4	P&Z	"Relationship" of vision- guiding principles (See how Melbourne organized vision)		✓	
91	4	P&Z	Sustainable Flagstaff "Nationally..." is not needed. Edit these paragraphs down. Just say "this is why we want a sustainable Flagstaff."		✓	
92	4	P&Z	"We ASPIRE to..."		✓	
93	4	P&Z	How is this connected to p.5 "what does sustainable community look like? Bring it back around to what this plan is about. Walkable neighborhoods, diversity - and then tie it all back to the Guiding Principles.		✓	
94	4	Staff	One box can discuss "Smart Growth" but don't say "smart growth" and one box can be "What a sustainable Flagstaff looks like..."		✓	
95	4	Jim McCarthy	Rotate picture on top right corner	✓		
96	4	Jim McCarthy	Not right justified- Good	✓		
97	5	Carol Bousquet	"Inside the Regional Plan"- is this section necessary or is it a duplicate of the Table of Contents?	✓		
98	5	P&Z	The Land- (change to) "The Natural Environment" (air quality, dark skies)		✓	
99	5	P&Z	The Place- (change to) "Built Environment" (power of place)		✓	
100	5	P&Z	The People- (change to) "Human Environment" (land and place are nebulous, rather)		✓	
101	5	P&Z	10 Smart Growth Principles- expand so we know what they are (too general)		✓	
102	7	P&Z	"How is this plan organized?" Organize so it's easier to read		✓	
103	11-Jul	Staff	Process pages into one graphic		✓	
104	7,8,9,10	P&Z	Move "visitors" to later in the paragraph. Flip 2 halves- follow with specifics about area.		✓	
105	8	Carol Bousquet	Talk about the choice of City & County to partner on Regional Plan		✓	
106						
107	8	NACA	Add "Additionally, other jurisdictions surround the FMPO boundary including Parks to the west and Twin Arrows and Navajo Nation to the east and north". Add "Individuals from surrounding communities, including tribal lands, work and shop in the City daily."		✓	
108	10	Maury Herman	There are many assertions, but no sources. The assertions generally, and specifically on the last sentences of Paragraph 1 and 3 and the first sentence of paragraph 4, need some data or footnote source. Otherwise, they are editorial expressions of a point of view. Could we avoid the P.C. term "participatory democracy." Sadly, this term has been hijacked by many anti-democratic movements to justify practices that are neither democratic nor participatory. (Examples include the Kaddafi government in Libya, etc.) - <b>CITE SOURCES of information</b>		✓	
109	10	P&Z	Why- who, what, how- state purpose first	✓		
110	11	Maury Herman	Yellow box: What Does a Sustainable Community Look Like? This description doesn't seem to address sustainability. It does not describe a sustainable community as one that builds the future. <b>A sustainable community doesn't borrow from the future or exhaust the legacy of the past. This commitment to the future is reflected in the plan on financial issues/ water conservation / environmental legacy, etc.</b> Could we build these issues back into this description?		✓	
111	11	P&Z	necessary?	✓		
112	11	P&Z	"Challenge is to develop goals and policies (2nd paragraph) These are important to what we are trying to say.	✓		
113	11	P&Z	Scenario planning- refer to in document when we did A, B, C, D...		✓	
114	III	P&Z	Ensuring Transparency- make part of concise 7-10 (par way down) "Transparent government processes" in glossary. Simplify- concise- get to the point		✓	
115	13-15	NACA	Consider developing a timeline which goes along a few pages - touch on the various things which have made this community what it is. Highlight the diversity of people and when they arrived and what they brought with them.		✓	
116	13	Staff	This chapter - go back to "Community Profile Summary" and get the important points to make. Use graphics like Melbourne and the SEDI SCIP report to articulate clearly - who, how many, etc.		✓	
117	13	P&Z	Graphics- use consistent graphic style(charts/ graphs) throughout the whole document- these are too hard to understand.		✓	
118	13	NACA	Add "from surrounding communities such as Cameron, Tuba City, Leupp, the Hopi Reservation, Williams, The Grand Canyon" before come to shop, seek medical care," etc.		✓	
119	14,15,16	P&Z	3rd paragraph is same as page 7		✓	
120	15	NACA	Add "Such as Sinagua, Pai, Hopi, Navajo, and Apache ancestors" after Native American hunters and gatherers" Photos of Walnut Canyon cliff dwellings?		✓	
121	15	Maury Herman	Where We've Been: The sentence, "In addition, NAU was built in 1899..." should read ,: "In addition, the teacher's college (or Normal School) that developed into NAU was built in 1899.		✓	
122	16	Carol Bousquet	Include mentio of identity as "town" despite being a "city"		✓	
123	16	Carol Bousquet	Graphs- Lengends are too small and graphs need to be larger		✓	
124	16	NACA	List other tribes that live in Flagstaff (in descending order by most population). Also, need combined stats for the city of Flagstaff as well as the rest of FMPO boundary for Native American population. Change "people" to "population"		✓	
125	17	P&Z	Redundancy of population and NAU student numbers- be clear		✓	

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
126	17	NACA	Add "and surrounding public and indian lands such as the Navajo, Hopi and Havasupai Reservations." after "Lowell Observatory". Add "Therefore, the lands in and around Flagstaff are still of significant cultural importance to indigenous tribes, and their descendants still inhabit and continue to contribute to and build the Flagstaff community." to callout box.		✓	
127	19	Carol Bousquet	Above chart "Jurisdiction"- Is this the right term, and does it represent the FMPO area?		✓	
128	19	Carol Bousquet	Define Greenfield/Brownfield		✓	
129	20	P&Z	10% or 18% is 2nd homes- which? Cite the source don't just say "different studies show..." (Staff: see "Neighborhoods Chapter - 18% Buxton data. Stick to one number and cite source(s))		✓	
130	20	P&Z	Do justice to growth scenarios process numbers/metrics (Kimley Horn)		✓	
131	20	P&Z	Point out CAC's Direction- walkable neighborhoods- solution associated with activity centers		✓	
132	20	P&Z	Titles grow out		✓	
133	21	P&Z	"Discouraged" "Encouraged"- Make a strong position here!		✓	
134	21	P&Z	Need Tabs - we will use this document a lot, and need to easily reference the sections, terms, glossary, maps, etc.		✓	
135	21	P&Z	Water constraints- cross-reference with water resources section		✓	
136	21	NACA	Add "Red Gap Ranch is located adjacent to the Navajo Nation and surrounded by Arizona State Trust Land and private parcels owned by the Nation, Hopi Tribe, as well as other ranching families and companies."		✓	
137	23	P&Z	Move the planning triangle to this first page of this section - larger?		✓	
138	23-32	P&Z	Three sections: How the CITY uses the plan; How the COUNTY uses the plan; How COOPERATIVE EFFORTS use the plan.		✓	
139	24	P&Z	The plan is used by (City): list from City Council to Future Generation on one page		✓	
140	25	P&Z	The plan is used by (County) - need a similar list from County		✓	
141	IV	P&Z	The plan is used by (Cooperative Partners) - need a similar list of community members - NAU, CCC, FUSD, Businesses, etc.		✓	
142	IV	P&Z	How this plan works, how is this plan used, implementing the RP (Triangle picture) with bullets below- CIP, development, specific plans, econ incentives, staff reports		✓	
143	IV	P&Z	Map- who decides the line? GIS map online	✓		
144						
145	IV	P&Z	Coconino County, Planning Background- one graphic, relationship to other planning documents, annual plan review & monitoring comp. plan review, amendments- bullets on p. 32 poorly written guess what it means needs to be more clear.		✓	
146	22	Maury Herman	Typo paragraph two -- "comes" should be "come". Last Paragraph -- Typo "understand" should be "understood."		✓	
147	23	Carol Bousquet	Contrary to the assertions of this paragraph, Flagstaff was not solely a blue-collar community but always included a well-educated population. Founding institutions included Lowell Observatory and the Normal School.		✓	
148	23	Carol Bousquet	"How this Plan Works"- should be organized by: City Implementation, County Implementation, and collaborative		✓	
149	23	Maury Herman	Change "How this Plan is Used" to "How this Plan is Used in the City"	✓		
150	24	Maury Herman	First paragraph has many problems with spelling and grammar. The figure \$44,000 is not useful in isolation. It would be clearer if the national and state numbers were included to give a sense of our relative prosperity. Flagstaff has historically had a small Black community. Why specify that Blacks are present as a result of "earlier workforce migrations?" This history is true for the white, Hispanic, Asian and other communities as well. Some mention of the long presence of several Chinese families in Flagstaff would be appropriate.		✓	
151	25	Maury Herman	Where Are We Going: Typo "demographically" should be "demographic." The third sentence of the first paragraph contains two contradictory assertions. If multi-generational housing increases, then household size will grow, rather than become smaller. The prediction that, "We will be more prosperous," is hardly obvious. Greater competition internationally, higher cost of energy, the relative weakness of our education system and other issues may reduce standards of living. It's an open question. A resilient plan needs to take into account both possibilities. Though late in our process, I suggest that Nate Silver's recent book, <u>The Signal and the Noise</u> , Why so many predictions fail-but some don't, is a critical analysis of this type of linear prediction.		✓	
152	25	Carol Bousquet	The term "suffering" is a bit emotional in describing the greater cost of rents in Flagstaff. In general, comparably sized apartments in Flagstaff are more expensive than in most other parts of Arizona. However, renting in Flagstaff means you actually get to live in Flagstaff. The clean air, educational opportunities, access to the national forest combined with urban amenities make Flagstaff a better place to live, and better usually has a higher price. Perhaps one could say that higher rental cost is a "challenge" to families moving to Flagstaff from low cost communities like Phoenix or Kingman. However, when I moved here from West Los Angeles, our housing costs dropped by 2/3's even though we switched from renting to owning. The narrow range of the scale of Average Household Size is misleading. If the scale were from 1 to 5, rather than from 2.5 to 2.6, then the lack of change would be highlighted. I also doubt the accuracy of the prediction.		✓	
153	26	Maury Herman	"implementing the Flagstaff Regional Plan"- this title should be under/lesser than "How this plan is used in the City of Flagstaff"	✓		
154	27	Maury Herman	I am not sure what the first sentence, "For successful new development..." means. Is this a call for forced inclusion of low income housing in all projects or ??? What is the definition of "successful?" Second Paragraph first sentence should read, "The future population will desire to be connected to work, school, ...." Insert "more" before housing in first line of paragraph three.		✓	
155	28	Maury Herman	line 3 paragraph 1, After "economic," add "educational, cultural and medical opportunities."		✓	
156	29	Carol Bousquet	Land Constraints---As noted on the bottom of page 28, historically, the Forest Service has exchanged inholdings for land adjacent to Flagstaff. It is possible in the future that additional Forest Service land will be added to the private ownership segment.		✓	
157	29	Staff	paragraph 1, line five -- Add "scarcity" between "This" and "was the reason..."		✓	
158	30	Maury Herman	"Annual Plan Review" heading- this section should be under the Flagstaff section		✓	
159	30	Carol Bousquet	Study Area Plans are "Specific Plans (city) and Area Plans (county)"; Annual Review		✓	
160	30	NACA	the alternative of radical water conservation is not mentioned. If Flagstaff reduced its usage to European standards, I don't think additional supplies would be necessary. This goal is reflected in Policy E&C4.2 on page 52.		✓	
161	30	Carol Bousquet	Do the "Reviews" apply to county?	✓		
162	33	Carol Bousquet	Add "Changes in land ownership, usage or development in areas immediately outside of the planning boundary and jurisdiction (such as those that might be implemented on the Navajo Nation to the east and north, or by the Hopi Tribe in parcels owned by it, or by Camp Navajo, or in communities such as Parks)," as a final bullet point after "Changes in state or federal laws..."		✓	
163	34	Carol Bousquet	Why is this page blank?	✓		
164	34	Carol Bousquet	Glossary- wouldn't this be an appendix?	✓		
165	34	Carol Bousquet	Add- brownfield & greenfield here	✓		
166	35	NAACA	Glossary: Add and define "Native American".		✓	
167	V	P&Z	Last paragraph- edit for clarity.		✓	
168	V	P&Z	Glossary at back with tab		✓	
169	V	P&Z	Why was a more general plan requested by community?	✓		
170	V	P&Z	land, place, people not caste in concrete	✓		
171	37	Maury Herman	Future interpretations- Substitute "May" for "Should."	✓		
172	44	Carol Bousquet	Use Shultz Fire photo here instead		✓	

## Acknowledgements

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
167	acknowledgements	Staff	City and County Planning and Zoning Commissioners		✓	
168	acknowledgements	Staff	CAC member Mike Jones		✓	
169	acknowledgements	P&Z	Awkknwledgments: P&Z on there		✓	

## Land

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
170	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Our environment is every important."	✓		
171	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	Environmental quality is key to a healthy, active lifestyle favored by many members of the community, now and in a sustained way. Any degradation is hard to remedy once quality is reduced."	✓		
172	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Caring for the quality of the environment is key to the quality of life in Flagstaff, and the enjoyment of the outdoors."	✓		
173	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I choose the above because they are the most critical to an environment that is protected by all levels of government supported by the citizenry. To be a genuinely protected community we need to think of the needs and sustainability of all species and not serve just our own."	✓		
174	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff's natural treasure make it what it is. Besides being important natural resources--water, clean energy, timber--they are also economic resources--."	✓		
175	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Agree with strategies of preservation, conservation (i.e., conserving water and land resources and reducing overuse). Would like to see a stronger stance on RESTORATION of ecosystem health, environmentally sensitive lands, wildlife, as each of these has been degraded with past land use practices."	✓		
176	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"water is life; without a sufficient supply of water, there simply cannot be sustainable growth."	✓		
177	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"There is not enough emphasis on the need for the city/region to limit its growth because of the limited amount of water available. Available water should drive how we grow, not the other way around."	✓		
178	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"The 100 year supply is not a meaningful metric. It is artificial, created by the state to allow for increased development. Existing and new development must be tied directly to actual rates of proven recharge rates - given the existing and projected low water conditions."	✓		
179	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I disagree with water resource use and allocation. I also disagree with water demand and feel that plans to expand quantity to serve a greater demand do not match with the sustainability listed in this plan's vision."	✓		
180	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"We in AZ live in a desert, whether on the desert floor or the high planes. We cannot afford to waste a drop of water, nor can we still afford to send water to other states."	✓		
181	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I feel a significant investment needs to be made in upgrading our water reclamation processes."	✓		
182	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"because flagstaff claims it sustainable but it really is not sustainable"	✓		
183	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"we seem to be burning more wood and pellets, and need to do more wind/solar"	✓		
184	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"By 2030 energy and water usage may be a global problem so The City of Flagstaff should start thinking of this now in order to preserve community interests."	✓		
185	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"None. I believe that energy policies should be market-based not "good intention"-based."	✓		
186	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Water is probably the most limiting factor in the ecology of the city and surrounding communities. As climate change progresses more water will be needed to just maintain what we have: attractive managed landscapes, gardening, local food production etc. But initiatives for restoration etc. are likely to need more water, for example in revegetation along stretches of the Rio de Flag, beautification of the city, and concealing ugly buildings with vegetation."		✓	
187	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Again, I am offering some view points that are not addressed in the plan. The plan discusses, in my opinion, unsustainable options for future water use without considering current mis-use of water. The City of Flagstaff signed a contract with Arizona Snowbowl to send reclaimed water to be poured over the San Francisco Peaks. Apart from the cultural issues with this policy, the use of water does not demonstrate any real concern for our community's water deficit issue. Also, while this plan discusses sustainable uses of water it does not discuss strict penalties for company's that use water in unsustainable ways. What repercussions does this plan state for Arizona Snowbowl and the number of golf courses we have in the community. We live in a desert and we are running out of water. We cannot afford to squander it for the mis-use of these companies. I call it mis-use, because it does not serve the immediate water needs of the community. Maybe, having things like golf courses would make sense if we lived in a water rich environment. We do not, however. I do not see how this plan addresses mis-use of water and ask that the smart and sustainable use of water we currently have in the boundaries of the city of Flagstaff be	✓		
188	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Disagree with any measures that involve seeking more sources of water (e.g., Red Gap Ranch groundwater). Strongly feel that education and mandatory reduction of residential and commercial water uses should be employed first. Creating strong restrictions on water use for any new building/business, and gradually phasing in similar restrictions with existing residential and business use would be more appropriate. There should be exceptions for raising food locally (though wise water use measures should be employed for this as well). Consider implementation of human waste and kitchen compost systems to reduce the amount of water needed for sewage treatment."	✓		
189	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Water is the most critical factor for the future of all species in the community. We can't allow development that places a burden on the future paradigm of available water. There is a need for improved conservation of water for all wild species that are a critical component of the community."	✓		
190	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I feel very strongly that open space especially in areas like Walnut Canyon should be preserved forever, both for hikers and bikers and also for wild life. The area north of Buffalo Park that connects to the Peaks should also be preserved and not developed."	✓		
191	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Preserving our open space should be top priority."	✓		
192	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff has little open space left, developers can and will take whats left."	✓		
193	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"This is a taking or private property rights. You can't just declare Open Space and prevent future property owners from doing with their property what is legal and permissible in this manner."	✓		
194	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff has not been wise in its designation and protection of open space. Wonderful opportunities such as protection of McMillan Mesa have been lost forever. City planners seem unaware of citizen interest and commitment to open spaces."	✓		
195	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I feel that being in nature restores mental and physical health. Also it is necessary for wild life."	✓		
196	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Open space is a huge aspect of what makes Flagstaff a unique location. While there is certainly tension between in-fill, public transportation and open-space, this is an area that I am emphatic about the importance of citizen input and leadership versus capital interests."	✓		
197	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Open Space is just that, it needs to be left along for everyone to enjoy, and the city not have any control over it. There needs to be required areas for equine, atv's, and hikers to enjoy the open spaces while not having to meet each other on the trail's."	✓		
198	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"We have to plan for the effects of climate change."	✓		
199	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Can't get into the chapters. Air quality, dark skies, Natural quiet, wildlife. Unique environment for people from congested city areas and the suburbs of same. Emissions control on vehicles. Every vehicle over 5 yrs. old gets emission test at state testing facilities or private garages that have to answer to state. No SMOG in northern AZ. Southern Az. would be clear if you did emissions testing."	✓		
200	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Why is Environmental Planning and Conservation important, where are our natural resources located? Ex- Air quality, Climate change & adaption (climate change impacts in the Flagstaff Region, climate adaption and reducing risk), Dark skies, Ecosystem health, Environmental sens., Natural quiet, soils, wildlife	✓		
201	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Where is our water connection, water demand, water quality, regional water planning?	✓		
202	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Energies role in our community, efficient use of energy, renewable energy	✓		
203		Staff	<b>Add:</b> Purpose of Regional Plan Natural Environment Maps:		✓	
204			a) To illustrate / reflect the GOALS and POLICIES of 'Environment and Conservation Element' and 'Open Space Element'		✓	
205			b) To provide a community resource illustrating the bio-diversity of the Flagstaff region.		✓	
206			c) To inform the development community of scientifically significant ecologically sensitive areas; to guide development proposals through conservation efforts, if they appear in the location of the proposed project.		✓	
207			d) To guide the City's OPEN SPACE COMMISSION in developing a strategic plan for Open Space Planning and Acquisitions. A strategic plan for acquisition has the ability to gain voter-approved funding to acquire Open Space within the city. The Open Space Commission has Council authority to make recommendations for the Regional Plan (Open Space) Natural Environment Map.		✓	
208			e) To further enable the County's Coconino Parks & Open Space Program (CPOS) - to implement their plan in purchasing land for		✓	
209			f) To provide a framework for a more detailed Conservation Land System effort, by an inter-agency stakeholder's group.		✓	
210			g) To engender Regional coordination, collaboration and planning.		✓	

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
211	Overall	Staff	This chapter should be used in conjunction with Land Use, Growth Areas and Transportation - GIS overlay map layers? Policy cross references needed.		✓	
231	Overall in "Water" Chapter	F3 BOD endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	Water: Existing water resources should determine growth policies. The City of Flagstaff wastewater and reclaimed water services should only be provided within City limits. Outside the City limits, the City potable water services should be limited due existing residences. Future development within the City limits should bear the cost of necessary water and sewer system improvements needed to accommodate new users. Water rate structure should be set to promote conservation. Agricultural rate should be introduced with the intent to motivate conversion of lawn and decorative landscaping into food gardens. All new development or redevelopment should be designed to incorporate systems facilitating water conservation. Water uses should be prioritized to provide guidelines for the community to allocate water resources in times of drought or shortages cause by other circumstances. The priority should follow this order: drinking/other human consumption, ecosystem needs, agricultural uses; commercial water efficient, residential landscaping, public recreation, non-residential landscaping, private recreational/commercial water intensive. Policies should address ecosystem and not only anthropomorphic water needs. No			These are Water Policies for the Utilities Master Plan to limit water use by City Council decision
232	45	AZ Game & Fish	Note economic benefits for natural resources and ecosystems		✓	
233	45	P&Z	Too wordy, needs extensive mirco-editing. Ex- passive voice is inappropriate and dark green box is redundant.		✓	
234	45	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision"		✓	
235	46	Carol Bousquet	Map is too hard to read	✓		
236	46	AZ Game & Fish	Bold the sentence: <b>"It is important to note that locating natural resources does not negate any development rights"</b>		✓	
237	46	P&Z	Dark green- highest sensitivity areas- use tools on p. 71/72 to move these areas into conservation over time. The do not take away development rights (refer to map/Maps with Figure numbers)	✓		
238	46	State Trust Land Department	Concentration of Natural Resources illustration, caption "Does not preclude the right to build on private land with development rights." should be "Does not preclude the right to build on private land and/or State Trust Land with development rights".		✓	Change incorporated into map - as "existing development rights remain"
239	46/47	County Planning Staff	For the Natural Environment Maps - need more description of how they were developed, what their purpose is and how they are intended to be used.		✓	Methodology noted on map
240	46/47	P&Z	Natural Environment Maps- "Guidelines" are unclear as to whether it's saying anything; does not tell me what we can/cannot do.	✓		Guidelines are now 'considerations' following maps
241	46/47	P&Z	"promote," "support" - means what?		✓	
242	46/47	P&Z	Layout- Policies get lost in the chapters- need to be 1st or last/different color (make different in some way)		✓	
243	46/47	P&Z	Guidelines in two pages is confusing- put them all in one box. It's hard to connect Narratives and Policies which makes people wonder what this document is for?		✓	
244	46/47	P&Z	A big disconnect is- narrative and the policies. Narratives can be reduced substantially. Maybe there's a guide on how the policies were developed?		✓	
245	46	County Planning Staff	Guidelines for Developers - 5th bullet point - "resource protection standards" - the plan doesn't have these; it has goals and policies.	✓		
246	48	Maury Herman	Air Quality -- first sentence is a run on. Please edit. The goal of avoiding a violation is a low goal for a community that has some of the best air in the country. Could this be reframed as maintaining Flagstaff's historically excellent air quality?		✓	
247	48	P&Z	Don't like "haze"		✓	
248	48	P&Z	Last paragraph- "got dizzy reading this" (formatting?)		✓	
249	48	County Planning Staff	Clean air is not a popular tourist attraction. Last paragraph - what regulations? Need to reference if any.		✓	
250	49	Maury Herman	Confusing as to the goal. Is it to maintain or to improve the region's air quality?		✓	
251	49	P&Z	Policy EC 1.3- Reduce vehicle emission (out of control, cannot do this) Suggest: improve air quality with increased walkability, bikability, and public transit connectivity (Cross reference See second bullet point): Transportation; bike, walk, bus Land Use; walkable neighborhoods Character; ?)			Policy EC 1.3 - Proactively improve the region's air quality. approve
252	49	P&Z	You can reduce vehicle emissions by many ways. Possible redundancy because of how it is organized?		✓	
253	49	P&Z	Do not repeat policies, just refer back to the other chapters		✓	
254	49	P&Z	Need a policy to encourage more efficient residential wood heat.			?
255	50	P&Z	Reduce green box on coffee			Delete
256	50	Maury Herman	"Start Hoarding your Beans" There may be a stronger and more immediate example. The impact of climate change and over-fishing is already having an impact on menus in Flagstaff. For example, Buster's now prices its Ahi tuna on a daily basis, and Charlie's and other restaurants have removed Ahi from their lunch menus. Insert "glacial" before "ice" on line 4. Paragraph two is confusing, ranging from insurance to national security. It needs a structure and source references. Last bullet point - This assertion should have a source. The migration from reservations to urban areas combined with opportunities to become commodity suppliers of wind and solar energy indicate there are opportunities as well as vulnerabilities for Native Americans.			Delete
257	50	P&Z	Native Americans do not understand the extreme vulnerability	✓		
258		NACA	Why "Native Americans are more vulnerable"? We have been adaptable and resilient for thousands of years.		✓	
259	50	AZ Game & Fish	Add at the beginning of second paragraph: Many climate models predict further decreases in annual precipitation and increased temperatures for our region which in turn are likely to .....		✓	CAC Suggestion: update intro paragraph, do not use 'undeniable' use science to state facts, not assumptions. Maybe delete first
260	50/51	AZ Game & Fish	Define "mitigation" by stating " Mitigation refers to reducing the severity of climate change by decreasing greenhouse gas emissions and limiting their concentration in the atmosphere"		✓	
261	51	County Planning Staff	The Shultz Fire was not a climate change event but a result of long term forest management practices. This belongs more in forest health section.		✓	
262	50/51	P&Z	Climate Change: Any predictions or statements that could turn people off should be kept out of this document		✓	
263	50/51	P&Z	Goals & Policies (this section needs to be here): Good, yet statements in narrative are political turn-off. Do not say 'undeniable'		✓	
264	50/51	P&Z	First sentence is a ture statement, but tie it into drought, not ocean temperatures. Implications are the same- need to be ready for disasters	✓		
265	51	Maury Herman	Add volcanic activity to paragraph 2 risks. An example of how preparedness would have lessened the impact of an extreme event would help.	✓		
266	51	P&Z	Map- Label the red "Shultz Fire" and "Past Fires"		✓	
267	51	P&Z	Cut back on "burning fossil fuels (refer to Econ. Dev. Self Resilient Community)"- to reduce greenhouse gas emissions.	✓		
268	52	Maury Herman	Policy E&C4.2 Excellent but could it be stronger? Delete word "attempt?" Plainly state that Red Gap is a last ditch solution.	✓		See text revisions
269	52	Carol Bousquet	Make spacing format consistent		✓	
270	52	CSF	Add New Policy after EC.2: Use resources from the Flagstaff science and educational community to estimate greenhouse gas emissions in the FMPO and issue periodic reports.	✓		See Annual Report template
271	52	P&Z	Policy to reduce Greenhouse- E:C2.1- Encourage the reduction or reduce (consistency)		✓	Grammar consistency
272	53	Maury Herman	Dark Skies: Modify last sentence of first paragraph to read, "...Lowell Observatory will continue to contribute to significant scientific research as well as bringing economic activity associated with research and tourism to the area." Add as policy -- Continue to support state regulation of light sources.		✓	Modify sentence, do not add policy
273	53	P&Z	Reference Economic Development- Money from Dark Skies/astronomy		✓	
274	53	County Planning Staff	The Flagstaff Region (not just Flagstaff). Please refer to the region throughout the document.		✓	

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
276	53	● US Naval Observatory - Flagstaff Station. Chris Luginbuhl	<p>1. The plan alludes, briefly at the end of the current draft section on dark skies, that development in areas near the observatories may raise issues of special concern concerning lighting impacts. We believe this text is unnecessarily unclear, and support the improved text as we have seen submitted by the Flagstaff Dark Skies Coalition on this item in an e-mail to this address dated this afternoon. 2. Following on to the recognition of the critical nature of development impacts in the areas near the observatories, which we specifically interpret to mean Lighting Zone 1 of the Flagstaff and Coconino County outdoor lighting codes, the Naval Observatory Flagstaff Station is disturbed to note on the map indicating the location of "activity centers" that two activity centers are proposed to be located on the west side of Flagstaff within Lighting Zone 1 near the US Naval Observatory Flagstaff Station, with a third located at the boundary of this zone at the intersection of West Highway 66 and Woody Mountain Road. The Observatory is highly concerned about the increase in lighting amount that will follow from such a proposed increase in land used intensity, and the disproportionately large impacts increased lighting in this area will have on the dark skies critical to operations at the Flagstaff Station. 3. We therefore <b>request that there be no "activity centers" proposed within or at the boundary of Lighting Zone 1. Alternatively, clear and specific language regarding the special lighting restrictions that would be necessary to ameliorate night sky impacts within this zone may be added to the Plan</b>, though by our interpretation the Plan does not address development at this level of detail. This request is consistent with the text of the current 2002 Regional Plan Strategy NCR 1.9 (c): "Develop Lands Within Astronomical Zone 1 with Observatory-Compatible Uses Discourage uses which require all-night outdoor illumination in Astronomical Zone 1 of the lighting codes of the City and County, and encourage those uses that do not require outdoor night lighting." Our request is further consistent with the text contained in the Coconino County outdoor lighting code Section 17.5.B: "Day/Night Uses: Uses which can turn off their outdoor lighting during night hours are to be encouraged in Lighting Zone I; those which require all night illumination are to be discouraged." The Flagstaff Station is also aware of and supports the suggested revisions offered by the Flagstaff Dark Skies Coalition in an e-mail to this address dated this afternoon, especially concerning their increased emphasis on both of the worldwide reputation and visibility that the region has and has earned due to its dark sky protection efforts, and the additional text acknowledging the value of dark skies to all sectors of the community.</p>		✓	Suggest Adding Policy E&C 5.3 - Development within Astronomical Zone 1 to be in compliance with the dark sky ordinances. Policy 5.2 - Prevent light trespass and enforce dark sky ordinances. Strategy: all residential communities will monitor and improve light trespass. Address in text - Flagstaff has Lighting Zones 1-3 to help assure that dark skies remain a resource to be enjoyed by the Flagstaff community and its visitors, and to provide safe and efficient outdoor lighting regulations that protect Flagstaff's dark skies from careless lighting practices. Dark stary nights provide the natural resource upon which our world-renowned astronomical industry depends. The topographic and atmospheric conditions surrounding the City are uniquely suited for astronomical observation, observatories have been established in the City and the City promotes the reduction of light pollution which interferes with the successful operation of these observatories. The effect of outdoor lighting on light pollution to the observatories is
277		● Flagstaff Dark Skies Coalition	<p>We suggest the following text to, we hope, further clarify and broaden the scope of the dark skies element. We address the following specific items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>&gt; Increase emphasis of the <b>world-wide significance of both the region's dark-sky resource, and the local astronomical sector</b>;</li> <li>&gt; Increase emphasis on the region's <b>innovative and world-leading role in dark sky protection</b>;</li> <li>&gt; Clarify <b>text concerning critical nature of land use in areas near observatories</b>;</li> <li>&gt; Add critical text concerning value of dark skies as an environmental quality and resource o all members of the community;</li> <li>&gt; Add text to point out world-wide recognition Flagstaff and the region has earned for its leadership in dark sky protection;</li> <li>&gt; Correct some minor errors in names.</li> </ul> <p>Christian B. Luginbuhl - Lance K. Diskan - for the Flagstaff Dark Skies Coalition</p>		✓	
		● Flagstaff Dark Skies Coalition	<p><b>FDSC suggested modified text:</b> The Flagstaff region is fortunate to enjoy some of the world's clearest, darkest views of the night sky, due to an unusually favorable combination of weather conditions, altitude, clear air, and low population densities. Our community has recognized the value of this asset with an unmatched history of dark-sky protection, beginning with the world's first regulation to protect the night sky (ordinance 400, adopted by the Flagstaff city Council in 1958), and continuing into the present with innovative and world-recognized quality outdoor lighting standards. Flagstaff's vanguard role in protecting the night sky was recognized by the International Dark-Sky Association in 2001 with its recognition of Flagstaff as the world's first International Dark-Sky City. The community and the region continue to benefit from the global awareness of this recognition.</p> <p>To maintain the benefits of this vital industry, the region must control artificial light and air pollution. As the community grows, the challenges will become greater. Yet research demonstrates that the current trend-setting lighting standards can maintain and even improve the condition of the astronomical night sky if ways can be found to improve old, inefficient and light polluting yet grandfathered lighting in the region. Particularly in the areas nearest the observatories, future development planning decisions must remain highly cognizant of the effects of land use on the total amount of light generated in these critical areas, and minimize the intensity of development and the consequent generation of light at night in these zones.</p> <p>Finally, beyond the value of the dark sky resource to the professional astronomical sector, the ability of residents and visitors to the region to enjoy the views of an unspoiled night sky reflects a core value of our community, as repeatedly demonstrated through more than a half-century of leadership in night sky protection. Protecting the region's night skies not only reflects deep and long-established community priorities, but also facilitates long-term economic opportunity. Planning that remains responsive to these resource concerns and incorporates Flagstaff's identity as the world's first International Dark-Sky City helps builds on decades of public and private cooperation to assure retention of this critical resource.</p>		✓	
278	54	AZ Game & Fish	Beginning with the establishment of Lowell Observatory in 1894, Flagstaff has long fostered the development of professional astronomical facilities, and has become one of the leading astronomical research sites in the world. In addition to Lowell Observatory, the region is home to the US Naval Observatory's Flagstaff Station, the National Undergraduate Research Observatory, the Navy Precision Optical Interferometer (NPOI), the Atmospheric Research Observatory at Northern Arizona University, and the US Geological Survey Astrogeology Science Center. Building on the foundation of Flagstaff's commitment to dark skies, Lowell Observatory has recently built the Discovery Channel Telescope southeast of Flagstaff, the fifth-largest and one of the most technologically advanced telescopes in the continental United States; the NPOI will be dramatically increasing its capabilities in the coming years. These activities underscore the vitality of the professional astronomical industry utilizing the quality dark sky resource of the region. This environmentally-dependent sector contributes substantially to the region's scientific reputation and economic sustainability.		✓	
279	54/55				✓	
280	55	County Planning Staff	End of 2nd paragraph - add "Rio de Flag, Walnut Creek, <b>Sinclair Wash</b> , and Pumphouse Wash."		✓	
281	55	County Planning Staff	"Invasive and noxious weeds" - restore the sub-heading and text. "Noxious and Invasive Weeds"...		✓	
282	56	County Planning Staff	Restore Noxious Weed Goal and Policies; goal changed to policy and majority of policies removed.	✓		
283	56	Maury Herman	Policy E and C 6.8 is a tactic, not a policy.	✓		
284	56	AZ Game & Fish	EC.6.4. More explicit about "riparian ecosystem" by adding " ... to the <b>region's riparian ecosystem</b> " at the end of the sentence.		✓	
285	56	CSF	Under E&C 6.10. <b>Begin statement with "Planting in"</b> . And suggest to change "limit" to "minimize"		✓	Change "limit" to "minimize"
286	56	CSF	Under 6.9. Add New Policy: Protect Native landscapes by requiring construction and development practices that minimize land disturbance.	✓		
287	56	AZ Game & Fish	Combine policy E&C.6.7. & E&C.6.8.		✓	E&C 6.7 (combined) - Use best environmental practices to control the spread of exotic and invasive plants, weeds and animals, and eradicate where possible.
288	54-56	P&Z	Eco System Health (Explain why we are doing things; big ideas, goals, policies, strategies. Who is reading the document and how would they find what they want to know? Cross reference		✓	
289	54-56	P&Z	"Guidelines for Development" - Implementation Tool? Maybe this should be in the Zoning Code as a "Design Guideline?"		✓	
290	56	P&Z	"E&C 6.10- Limit use of herbicides, insecticides, and similar material. <b>Develop guidelines to limit the use of herbicides, insecticides, etc."</b>		✓	
291	57	Maury Herman	It would be useful to affirmatively state what types of landscape are most appropriate for development.		✓	Can cross-reference City and County zoning code which both outline appropriate landscaping

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
292	57	P&Z	Guidelines for Development- Not allowed to build anywhere? Need to state a positive need for compromise: "Encourage clustered development to conserve natural forest stands or meadow land..."	✓		
293	57	P&Z	Opening "we value all of our natural areas..."		✓	
294	57	County Planning Staff	Guidelines for Developers - map for Riparian Areas? "Guidelines..." boxes should be highlighted a different color than goals and policies.	✓		
295	57/58	P&Z	Put goals & policies with narrative together on same page.	✓		
296	58	P&Z	Sentence-even in developed areas, noise -air handling and equipment shielded for "urban noise" commercial/residential		✓	
297	58	CSF	E&C.7.2. Expand the mechanism of the city and county to other options through collaborations, partnerships with non-profit organizations.	✓		
298	58	Maury Herman	Natural Quiet: Although the recent sound reduction from the train is very welcome, Flagstaff is historically a community that coped with train and highway noises. Its signature event for many years was the extremely noisy Pow Wow. In comparison with our other goals, this one may have a low priority.	✓		
299	58	County Planning Staff	Policies under Environmentally Sensitive Lands were reduced from 7 to 2. Several policies were combined during the editing process, a couple of ideas were lost by removing policies specific to restoration. Every policy that contained "shall" was deleted. Consider looking at original and compare.	✓		
300	58	County Planning Staff	Natural Quiet: What are "buffers between uses and highway corridors"?	✓		
301	59	Maury Herman	The detailed discussion of soils only makes sense as a heads up to homebuilders and other developers that soil is often an issue. It should be followed by a <b>policy that construction techniques will be adapted to actual soil conditions so that structures will remain stable and useful for their normal economic life.</b>		✓	Can add to text in first paragraph, last sentence: "...differ accordingly, and construction techniques will adapt to the soil conditions for building stability.
302	59	P&Z	"More specialized foundation systems..." Remove- this is not for this document		✓	
303	59	County Planning Staff	"Site development" should be "structural"		✓	
304	60	Maury Herman	line three "draws visitors from around the state" add "and beyond..."		✓	
305	59/60	CSF	Suggestions to replace Guidelines for Developers on p.60. What to look for: Map designations of rare plants or soil, Description: Rare or unique plant communities often occur on specific soil type and / or topography. These plant communities are sometimes described by the soil type or sometimes designated by a single plant found in the community. Importance: Uncommon plants play an important role in sustaining biodiversity through interactions with other plants and animals, including serving as hosts and nectar sources for invertebrates and birds. Their occurrence makes an area exceptional and can be considered a natural amenity.		✓	New 'Considerations for development' submitted to be a two-page spread after maps.
306	60	CSF	Sentence-even in developed areas, noise -air handling and equipment shielded for "urban noise" commercial/residential		✓	
307	60	CSF	E&C.9.3. Strike "when using prescribed burns" since many other practices are covered in BMP		✓	Strike policy
308	61	CSF	Comments on Wildlife: include a policy that refers to the effects that loose dogs and cats have on scaring and eating wildlife. Perhaps discuss enforcing the leash law for dogs on trails and in natural areas, and also encouraging keeping cats indoors.	✓		Not RP
309	61	AZ Game & Fish	"Guidelines" at the bottom at the page - use more specific title e.g. "How to use ... for Wildlife Linkages"	✓		
310	61	AZ Game & Fish	Add a sentence "The wildlife linkage just west of Flagstaff known as the 'Woody Ridge Corridor', which connects habitat on the San Francisco Peaks to lower-elevation areas near the Mogollon Rim, is particular importance for many species of local wildlife" before the sentence that begins "Effective wildlife ..."		✓	
311	62	CSF	Replacement for Guidelines for Development: Prairie Dog Colonies Importance: Prairie dogs are considered a Keystone Species and a Species of Greatest Concern by AZ Game & Fish in the Inter-agency Management Plan for Gunnison's prairie dogs. They provide food and shelter for other animals and insects of the prairie ecosystem. They also contribute to the permeability of the soil and pruning of the grasses. Guideline: When there are prairie dogs on land proposed for development, they should be a consideration in the development process. Management of prairie dogs is the preferred option. If that is not possible, relocation should be considered. Contact AZ Game & Fish or Habitat Harmony, Inc.	✓		Considerations for development re-worked
312	63	AZ Game & Fish	Delete "Consequently, the action plan focuses on habitat types and riparian systems" and add "The AGFD is also collaborating with partners including the City of Flagstaff to develop a network of watchable wildlife sites known as the Arizona Watchable Wildlife Experience (AWWE) to promote ecotourism in the planning area"		✓	
313	63	CSF	E&C.10.3. change the word "avoiding" to " <b>accomodating</b> "		✓	Or strike after "avoiding" see G&F comment below - #318
314	63	CSF	E&C.10.5. Add in cooperation with other agencies.		✓	
315	63	CSF	E&C.10.6. Add at the beginning: "Cooperate in efforts to" and "where practical" at the end. Also, "thermal" gradients need to be added to keep this section current in light of climate change.	✓		
316	63	CSF	After E&C.10.1. Add "when appropriate" because we really don't want all wildlife to be everywhere all the time.		✓	E&C 10.1 - Encourage local development to protect and conserve natural wildlife habitat where feasible.
317	63	AZ Game & Fish	Edit the goal "Protect indigenous wildlife populations ..." - don't need "and diverse"		✓	
318	63	AZ Game & Fish	E&C.10.3 Delete the last part of policy: "... through open space acquisition efforts, avoiding the features ...?"		✓	
319	65	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block		✓	
320	65	P&Z	Open Space- "How this plan addresses open space"- make this first in the chapter		✓	
321	65	P&Z	3rd- Natural Environment map in document? Available on-line?	✓		yes
322	65	Marilyn Weissman	The sentence of: "There are some parcels which have been acquired over the years for various reasons, and the City or County may dispose of these parcels at their discretion" is contradict Policy OS.1.2.		✓	I do not read that sentence anywhere?
323	65-73	Eva Putzova	<b>Open Space</b> • City owned open space should be identified as an important asset of the community, for its intrinsic not just functional value as flood protection.		✓	Noted in text
324	65	● Cynthia Pardo	Open Space o City owned open space should be identified as an important asset of the community, for its intrinsic not just functional value as flood protection.		✓	
325	65	● Mark Nigrelli	I noticed an omission to any map that I have seen showing existing and potential open space in Flagstaff. I would like to suggest that the city owned parcel on the north end of San Francisco Street be considered for retention as open space either through a change in zoning or as an annexation to Buffalo Park. This parcel is directly adjacent to Buffalo Park on top of the mesa, includes a small rocky escarpment with diverse vegetation, leads down to a sloped open grass area with views of the San Francisco peaks and ends as a drainage/floodplain. As such, this parcel has many of the specific values and objectives for open space as laid out on page 70 of the regional plan. Specifically: • Preserve significant natural areas characterized by unusual terrain, scenic vistas, unique geologic formations, intact or unique vegetation, or wildlife habitat • Provide wildlife movement corridors • Preserve wildlife habitat • Support recreational opportunities • Protect the area's scenic quality • Provide wildlife movement corridors • Utilize open space to prevent encroachment into floodplains. • Safeguard people and property through flood control		✓	See Natural Environment Map - maybe we need to <b>bold text in Open Space Planning that notes to use these maps for the City and County Open Space commissions to develop their strategic plans.</b> See Figures x, x and x, pages xx-xx

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
326	65	● Suzanne Motsinger	The regional plan should reflect the high value citizens of Flagstaff place on our few remaining city-owned open spaces. These should be voter-protected from ever being sold by any sitting city council.	✓		City Council decision
327	65	● Becky Myers, Geoff Barnard, Patrice Hostman,	Desires the City to NOT sell the city-owned parcel at N. San Francisco Street by Elks Lodge	✓		
328	65-66	Staff	Currently, City Open Space commission is looking at the definitions of 'Open Space' from OSGWP, 2001 RP, this RP draft, city zoning code, and the Open Space commission ordinance. The definitions used ' i.e. conservation area vs. 'vacant land' is really important for the rest of the document and then subsequently the documents which follow.	✓		
329	66	County Planning Staff	When referring to a map name - also note what page it is on for quick reference.		✓	
330	66	AZ Game & Fish	Suggestion to change the heading from "Where is Our Open Space?" to "Natural resources and open space"		✓	
331	66/67	AZ Game & Fish	Suggestion to add statements of 'acquisitions of Rogers Lake and Picture Canyon' at the paragraph that starts "in 1996 Arizona adopted ..."		✓	
332	67	County Planning Staff	Ft. Tuthill is FORT TUTHILL. Edit "In 2010, the Coconino County Parks & Recreation Department acquired Rogers Lake..."		✓	
333	67/68	AZ Game & Fish	Not sure about acquisition of ASLD to expand Ft.Tuthill		✓	
334	68	County Planning Staff	Add date of plan after mentioning another plan. Coconino County Comprehensive Plan (2003)		✓	
335	68	County Planning Staff	reference to acquisition of a State Trust parcel in Fort Tuthill - that has not been completed at this point in time.		✓	
336	69	AZ Game & Fish	Under "How this plan addresses open space" add with the EPC element, e.g. "As described in the EPC Element of this Plan, future development should strive to balance preservation of important of open space ..."		✓	
337	69	State Trust Land Department	"How this Plan Addresses Open Space" first sentence, "An important task is to address where open space should be preserved [add 'regardless of ownership'] thus defining where sustainable urban expansion can occur".		✓	
338						
339	69	County Planning Staff	The Coconino County Comprehensive Plan will be coordinated with the updated Flagstaff Regional Plan policies through an amendment. Coordinated open space planning between the County and City is a priority, and will simplify the amendment process.		✓	
340	69	County Planning Staff	"How this Plan Addresses Open Space" last sentence...add "urban development in less sensitive areas."		✓	
341	70	AZ Game & Fish	Move the paragraph with the beginning "While open space conservation ..." to p.65		✓	
342	71	AZ Game & Fish	Bold bullet #2 and #3 of the words "Coconino County" and "City of Flagstaff"		✓	
343	71	County Planning Staff	5. bottom sentence: or as open (green) space forever.		✓	
344	72	County Planning Staff	8. Green Infrastructure: This map - what map?		✓	"The Concentration of Natural Resources, Figure __, can be considered the community's 'Green Infrastructure' as it includes..."
345	72	AZ Game & Fish	Suggestion to add a bullet such as: "Clustered Development" or "Conservation Subdivisions" or "Density Bonus"		✓	
346	72	State Trust Land Department	Zoning: The Public Lands Forest (PLF) Zone applies to areas of the city designated as National Forest, state, county, and municipal permanent open space / preserve lands." change to "...National Forest, State Trust lands classified as "Suitable for Conservation Purposes," county, and municipal..."		✓	
347	73	P&Z	OS.1- 'Quality of Life (take out or use charater)" different to different people.	✓		
348	73	CSF	Goal OS.1. Add "undeveloped" before natural areas - it will read "undeveloped natural areas"		✓	
349	73	CSF	Goal OS.1 After "and greenways" we suggest adding "which compliments and supports the function of and access to, surrounding public lands.". We also suggest adding the phrase "and serves as a setting for the city. To the end of the goal.		✓	Add "access to public lands" after 'trails'
350	73	CSF	Policy OS.1.1. Add "a joint city/ county" between "Establish" and "Conservation". Building on current open space to provide connective between public spaces for non-motorized travel, preserve special and unique areas and resources and provide for outdoor education.	✓		The list after 'stakeholders' defines this
351	73	● Betsy McKellar	Policy OS.1.3 needs to add to the list of things that Open Space can buffer - "Cultural Resources"		✓	
352						
353	73	State Trust Land Department	Goal OS.1.3: Use open spaces as natural environment buffer zones to protect scenic views and roadways, separate disparate uses, and to separate private development from public lands, scenic byways, and wildlife habitats." Public lands and State Trust lands should be defined as distinct and separate classifications. These terms should be included in the Plan's glossary.		✓	Glossary - 'Public Lands'; 'State Trust Lands' two different definitions
354	73	Staff	Policies missing: Open space may be integrated with complimentary land uses (passive or active recreation, agriculture, housing, etc.); also need to add policy - 'integrating open space into the built environment'.		✓	Add Policy OS 1.4 - Open spaces may be integrated with complimentary land uses, such as passive and active recreation, agriculture, and housing, as appropriate. Add Policy OS 1.5 - Integrate open space qualities into the built environment.
355	74	Maury Herman	Presumably, the social and economic well-being of the community could be included in each goal. Why call it out specifically in WR1?		✓	This discussion had the combination of regional ll-being of the citizens totaling up to the 'sustainable water budget'(hydrology, ecosystem needs AND the social and economic we
356	75	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block		✓	
357	75	County Planning Staff	Water resources - bottom line- this section needs to be updated and re-organized.		✓	Water section re-worked by Sue Pratt (County) and Erin Young/Brad Hill (City) see new version.
358	75	Marilyn Weissman	Comments: 1) The assumption that the City of Flagstaff will forever be able to provide water for endless growth not only is illusion but leads us to make poor choices about water uses and priorities now.		✓	
359	75	● Mary McKell	Water -- Future developments within the City limits should bear the cost of necessary water and sewer system improvement needed to accommodate nw users. Conservation should be stressed at all levels. Neighborhoods and Community Character-- consider incentives.		✓	
360	75-89	Eva Putzova	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Existing water resources should determine growth policies.</li> <li>The City of Flagstaff wastewater and reclaimed water services should only be provided within the City limits. Outside the City limits, the City potable water services should be limited to existing residences.</li> <li>Future development within the City limits should bear the cost of necessary water and sewer system improvements needed to accommodate new users.</li> <li>Water rate structure should be set to promote conservation. Agricultural rate should be introduced with intent to motivate conversion of lawns and decorative landscaping into food gardens.</li> <li>All new development or redevelopment should be designed to incorporate systems facilitating water conservation.</li> <li>Water uses should be prioritized to provide guidelines for the community to allocate water resources in times of draught or shortages caused by other circumstances. The priority should follow this order: drinking/other human consumption; ecosystem needs; agricultural uses; commercial water-efficient; residential landscaping; public recreational; non-residential landscaping; private recreational/commercial water-intensive.</li> <li>Policies should address ecosystem and not only anthropomorphic water needs.</li> <li>No new development should be allowed to create artificial lakes for recreational/ decorative purposes.</li> <li>Create programs that would allow residents to "buy out" a portion of their reclaimed water generation for conservation purposes.</li> </ul>		✓	Water section re-worked by Sue Pratt (County) and Erin Young/Brad Hill (City) see new version.

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
361	75	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	<p>Managing for a safe and sustainable supply of water is critical to the future of the City of Flagstaff. With estimated annual population growth of 1.4%, permanent drought due to global warming, and emerging pollution concerns, ensuring a sufficient supply of clean water for today and into the future requires careful attention to where our water comes from, how we use it, and how we treat it.</p> <p>Today the City of Flagstaff uses on average eight million gallons per day of drinking water drawn from the waters of the Coconino Aquifer (70%) and from Lake Mary and the Inner Basin (30%). Six million gallons of this water eventually enters the municipal sewer system and receives some treatment before two million gallons is distributed as man-made snow on the San Francisco Peaks or as irrigation for local parks, schools and golf courses; the remaining four million gallons is discharged to the Rio de Flag riverbed, where it returns to the Coconino Aquifer in three to 700 days via vertical ground fractures and solution channels (USGS North Central Arizona Water Supply Study).</p> <p>Following treatment, this reclaimed wastewater still contains many contaminants known to be detrimental to humans, animals and the environment: nitrates, pharmaceuticals, personal care products, antibiotic-resistant gene fragments, and estrogenic compounds (NAU Summary Report to the City of Flagstaff on Pharmaceuticals and Organic Contaminants in City Wastewater and Well Water; Antibiotic Resistance Gene Testing of Recycled Water Samples in Flagstaff, AZ).</p> <p>Science-based sources indicate that Flagstaff's current supplies of drinking water will become insufficient to meet our community's needs in about 20 years. Surface water from Lake Mary and natural recharge of the Coconino Aquifer are</p>		✓	
362	76	Maury Herman	What is the meaning of WR3.2? With reference to 3.1 and 3.2, Macy's, Beaver Street Brewery and other Southside buildings span the Rio de Flag. I don't expect that the policy enunciated in this section 3.1 is to restore the water course by acquiring these parcels or otherwise seeking to demolish these buildings. Perhaps "existing open water course" would be clearer.	✓		It does not say that
363	77	Staff	cannot show water system map - illegal according to Homeland Security Act		✓	
364	78	Maury Herman	Managing Demand see prior comments on page 30 and 52.	✓		
365	78	CSF	Add New Policy after WR.1.2.: Begin the process of investigating and planning for the direct re-use of reclaimed water			
366	78	CSF	WR.1. add: "with appropriate water conservation measures" after well-being.			Water section re-worked by Sue Pratt (County) and Erin Young/Brad Hill (City) see new version.
367	78	CSF	Add New Policy after WR2.2.: Dedicate at least five percent of reclaimed water produced per month to conservation purpose including ground water recharge and wetlands.			
368	78	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	<p>Goal WR.1. Maintain a sustainable water budget incorporating regional hydrology, <b>permanent drought due to global warming</b>, ecosystem needs, <b>prevention of groundwater pollution</b>, and social and economic well-being</p> <p>Policy WR.1. 1. Participate in and support regional processes to develop a sustainable water budget that <b>incorporates regional hydrology, permanent drought due to global warming, ecosystem needs, prevention of groundwater pollution, and social and economic well-being.</b></p> <p>The Colorado Plateau Water Advisory Council is expected to soon publish the results of a NACR model which attempts to determine how changes in the groundwater budget will affect change across the Coconino Aquifer, given three scenarios to meet future regional water needs. This model only looks at anthropomorphic water needs. It fails to account for potential changes to ecosystems from groundwater withdrawal, and it fails to account for potential effects of permanent drought due to global warming. The City of Flagstaff will need to address the failings of the NACR modeling by funding research to generate a <b>groundwater budget that accounts for ecosystem needs and for prolonged/permanent drought.</b></p>		✓	
369	78	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	<p>Policy WR.1.2. Seek regional opportunities to partner with resource land managers and adjacent landowners to <b>design and implement only those actions that will produce a permanent and sustainable improvement in</b> water yield and hydrologic processes.</p> <p>In the 1950's and 1960's, Salt River Project funded research on the Beaver Creek Watershed in order to ascertain if reducing the density of ponderosa pine trees on the watershed would increase the yield of water into the SRP desert lakes. Areas of trees were thinned to varying densities, and water gauges were established in affected drainages to measure water flows. The immediate result of the thinning was a substantial increase in stream water flow. Within a few years, however, water flows declined to levels recorded prior to the thinning, as grasses and forbs took over the thinned sites and utilized the available soil water. The City of Flagstaff should not rely on forest thinning schemes to provide a long-term increase in ground or surface waters. Such estimates should not be part of any water budgets.</p>			
370	78	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	<p>Policy WR.2.1. Develop and adopt an integrated water master plan that addresses water resources, water production and its distribution, wastewater collection and its treatment, and reclaimed water treatment and its distribution. <b>Master planning will include installation and operating costs for technologies that produce drinking water from wastewater.</b></p> <p>As ground and surface water supplies are taxed over time by population growth and long-term drought, reclaimed water will become an increasingly valuable water resource. The technology exists today to turn wastewater into drinking water, returning 76% of the drinking water drawn from surface and groundwater sources to the municipal drinking water system. The cost to implement this technology in Flagstaff is likely to be less than the cost to withdraw and transport groundwater from Red Gap Ranch to Flagstaff, or to transport water from Lake Powell.</p> <p>Flagstaff sits near the headwaters of the Coconino Aquifer, and its waters flow SW to NE under the City prior to flowing across the region. Recharging the aquifer with reclaimed water is problematic, as most of it enters the aquifer in under two years via vertical faults and solution channels. This water is not filtered by slow percolation through rock layers, and its contaminants are entering the aquifer. One of many benefits of turning our wastewater into drinking water is that downstream users will draw</p>			Water section re-worked by Sue Pratt (County) and Erin Young/Brad Hill (City) see new version.
371	79	County Planning Staff	The Stormwater/Watershed Section is entirely new from the last CAC draft. Policies 3.6 and 3.7 seem to contradict with each other.			
372	79	Staff	Discuss Rio de Flag flood control project here - pros/cons/challenges/benefits; better drainage map			
373	81	CSF	WR.3.1. Add "of the Rio de Flag and other washes" after "floodplain"			
374		Staff	Stormwater - address Rio de Flag flood control project. Potential if not completed; issues when completed. Reference to "Reinvestment - Land Use" for reinvestment issues.			
375	81	P&Z	The availability of water in reality and not on paper should determine how much we can grow.			
376	82	P&Z	The plan should be very specific about what our potable water can be used for.			
377	82	P&Z	Assumption for climate change? Asterical at bottom			
378	82	P&Z	What does "stipulation with Navajo Nation" mean?			
379	82	P&Z	GRAPH: dark green- renewable. Light green- non sustainable (if this is true inconsistent with Guiding Principles #3 and objectives on p. 76) This makes people think we are taking water that is not replenishable. So we do drill more wells or not? Reclaim water use? Golf Course? Rio de Flag?			Water section re-worked by Sue Pratt (County) and Erin Young/Brad Hill (City) see new
380	83	Maury Herman	Acceptance of Red Gap should indicate that it is not the preferred solution.			
381	83	P&Z	Last paragraph- Water from Lake Powell- we do not have water rights to. River is over-allocated already. If there is a shortage on Colorado River- California gets water first not Arizona. To plan your water future on Navajo-Hopi Indian water rights settlement is not good water planning.			
382	84	Carol Bousquet	All little light green boxes should have the same formatting (spaces/italics)			
383	84	County Planning Staff	In Water demand, two policies were deleted from the CAC approved draft. Combined during editing? Seen as duplicate of Goal WR.4. Satisfy <b>only those current and future human water demands which use low amounts of water and are designed to use water efficiently.</b> Satisfy the needs of the natural environment through sustainable and renewable water resources and strategic conservation measures.			
384	84	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	<p>Given permanent drought, attempting to satisfy all current and future human water demands is not sustainable. Such policies will leave us with ever more scarce and costly water supplies, damaged regional ecosystems, and a declining economy. Master planning by the Flagstaff Utilities Department indicates that additional water conservation measures can reduce water consumption by 20%. City conservation measures should include, but not be limited to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Invest in locating and repairing water line leaks;</li> <li>2) Increase commercial and residential water rates for high-water use;</li> <li>3) Evaluate the high use of water by motels and hotels and develop strategies to reduce their water use;</li> <li>4) Discourage new high-water use businesses and community enterprises;</li> <li>5) Increase the Utilities Department budget for water conservation awards, rebates, and education.</li> </ol>			
385	85	County Planning Staff	Goal W5 (previously W4) by CAC approved language was: <i>Goal WR.4: Avoid leap-frog development by logically enhancing and extending public water, wastewater, and reclaimed water services including their treatment, distribution, and collection systems in both urbanized and newly developed areas of the City.</i> New Goal is: "Logically enhance and extend public water, wastewater, and reclaimed water services including their treatment, distribution, and collection systems in both urbanized and newly developed areas of the city to provide an efficient delivery of services."			
386	85	P&Z	Water Quality- Reclaim water is recharging our aquifer.			

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
387	85	P&Z	This chapter reads "if you want a golf course- need to go for it." <b>Need a policy: recreational amenities will only use reclaimed water, cannot use potable water.</b>			
388	85	Friends of Flagstaff's Future Water Policy Team	Goal WR.5. Logically enhance and extend public water, wastewater, and reclaimed water services including their treatment, distribution, and collection systems in both urbanized and newly developed areas of the city to provide an efficient delivery of services. <b>Require all new residential developments, and business and community enterprises to incorporate water-saving technologies and measures known to most efficiently reduce water use.</b> Limit the allowable square footage of grass on residential lots in new developments. Prohibit the installation of grass for commercial and commons landscaping, with the exception of ball/playing fields.			
389	86/87	P&Z	"Regional Water Planning"- Regulatory framework in beginning of chapter			
390	89	Carol Bousquet	Map?			
391	90	Maury Herman	Building E.1.6 Insert the words "cost effective" before "energy efficient." Some showcase "energy saving" projects consume more energy than they save. Policy E.1.10 -- Disbursed energy generation should be included as a benefit worthy of consideration for incentives.		✓	
392	91	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block		✓	
393	92	County Planning Staff	Blank on the number of businesses that could be affected.		✓	
394	92	P&Z	Public transit- bike, walk, etc. Address the weather here in the Winter (difficult in doing this). Other things we can do to mitigate this: closer bus stops more often, build student housing close to capus so walking is easy.		✓	
395	92	Carol Bousquet	bottom table- this would make more sense is all on one page		✓	
396	92/93	P&Z	Do not split the table- hard to read (technical manal)		✓	
397	93	Carol Bousquet	Too much space between last paragraph and bottom green box		✓	
398	93	CSF	Policy E.1.2. under Education belongs under use of energy, not education		✓	
399	93	P&Z	Energy- add commercial buildings		✓	
400	93	Alex Wright	Additional policy needed under "Building": <b>Promote traditional and indiginous building materials and structures.</b>		✓	Add Policy E1.12 - Promote traditional and indiginous building materials and structures as climate adaptable energy efficiency measures.
401	93	County Planning Staff	Goal E1: ORIGINAL CAC APPROVED GOAL"Increase Energy Efficiency" NEW GOAL: "Reduce total and per capita non-renewable energy use through efficiency and conservation". Suggest going back to original language.		✓	Go back to original goal
402	93	County Planning Staff	ORIGINAL CAC APPROVED POLICY under E1: <i>(new policies italicized)</i> E.1.1: Promote and encourage innovative building practices through instruction on efficient building materials and methodology with the collaboration of government, Flagstaff Unified School District, Northern Arizona University, Coconino Community College, and community partners. <i>Identify and pusue cost-effective energy efficiency option in the context of long-term planning.</i> E.1.2: Support workforce training for the installation and maintenance of energy efficient technologies. <i>Develop land use regulations that promote land use patterns that increase energy efficiency in the building and transportation sectors. - this does not apply to "Education"</i> E.1.3: Empower all community members to make smarter energy choices through education and incentives. <i>Develop and implement education and outreach opportunities focused on efficient building materials and practices in collaboration with the public sector and educational institutions - Flagstaff Unified School District, Northern Arizona Universty, Coconino Community College and community partners.</i> Building E.1.4 Promote energy efficient technologies and design in all new and retrofit buildings for residential, commercial and industrial projects. <i>Support workforce training for the installation and maintenance of energy efficient technologies.</i> Transportation E.1.5 Promote and encourage the expansion and use of energy efficient modes of transportation. <i>Promote and encourage the expansion and use of energy efficient and multi-modal transportation to reduce vehicle miles traveled.</i> a. Public transportation b. Bicycles (Flagstaff Urban Trail System; bike lanes; bicycle parking) c. Pedestrians (sidewalk grid, crosswalks, street planting strips and medians, underpasses)  E.1.6 Promote and encourage the use of fuel efficient vehicles and vehicles that use renewable fuels and/or electricity. <i>Develop policies and programs that incentivize the use of fuel efficient vehicles and vehicles that use renewable fuels and/or electricity.</i>		✓	Some of the new suggestions make sense, much of the original is easier to understand. This seems to be mostly a re-organization of order - New E1.1 is original E 1.2; New E 1.2 is original E1.4; E 1.3 is revised E1.1; etc. CAC direction: remove "non-renewable"
403	93	County Planning Staff	Six new policies under E1: Building. Came from Sustainability Program - CAC needs to review.		✓	
404	94	CSF	Add <b>New Policy after E.1.6.:</b> Create design standards so that residential and commercial lot lay outs will be oriented to optimize solar energy collection.		✓	Add Policy E 1.12 - Create site design standards for optimal solar gain.
405	95	P&Z	One graph by itself- not meaningful, need three pie charts: 2009, 2012, future goal		✓	
406	96	P&Z	We are not home to a local manufacturer of small wind energy now.		✓	
407	97	P&Z	Renewable Energy Policies- "Best example of policy" Adverbs in present action tense- good.	✓		
408	97	P&Z	E1.8- same as E2.3			compare and deleteredundancy
409	97	P&Z	Natural gas potential- huge gas line in our community (talk to Unisource).		✓	
410	97	Maury Herman	Community Character -- People Matter- I think this overstates the goal on health, safety and devotion. While there should be no governmental restraints on creating a worship community for any faith, it's not incumbent on our community to provide a place of worship, though citizens do this. The language implies that the larger community is obliged to assure members of every religion access to a local religious program.  With reference to the other elements, in a society with unequal income distribution, the opportunities for health, education, safety and many other important services are related to means. For example, every charter school in Flagstaff may have open enrollment, but few if any provide transportation. Participation in these schools may be more easily accessed by families that can afford to transport their child to school.  I suggest dropping the word "devotion " and saying, "All residents should be assured opportunities for a range of decent choices in housing, education, employment, health and safety." Even this is pretty visionary.  Cooperation Matters -- This language is very poetic, but it actually calls for greater regulation and bureaucracy -- how else would such global accountability be achieved? Also, while this local planning effort is important, adaption to global trends we cannot control (e.g., climate change, energy issues) will probably have greater impact.			Drop 'devotion';
411		NACA	Energy Hopi Tribe Economic Council/Economic Dev long range plan I-40 corridor study. Large scale alternative energy production? own alot of property. Not feasible inside the region but potential outside of the regional boundaries and grid capacity needs. Seven Generations, energy efficiency, traditional Native American dwellings are naturally made of locally derived materials which produces highly efficient structure		✓	Energy section - text - Alternative energy production potential is great right outside of the planning boundaries, yet to take advantage of this opportunity, grid capacity needs must be addressed. Traditional living patterns of indiginous cultures are inherently energy efficient.
412	97	Alex Wright	E .2: Work collaboratively with local tribes to expand renewable energy capacities on tribal lands.		✓	Policy E 2.6 - Workcollaboratively...

Place				No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment			
413	Overall chapter	NAACP	Add diversity in community by adding/replacing pictures that reflect diversity of people in community.		✓	
414	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Defining our community character & what is our community character (are these the same?), vistas and viewsheds, heritage preservation, community design, design traditions, art, sciences, education		✓	
415	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	This chapter is especially difficult to navigate	✓		See updated chapter
416	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	The following should be grouped under Background in Land Use Chapter: Planning for balanced land use, our evolving land use patterns, trends and existing conditions, land supply and capacity	✓		See updated chapter
417	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	The following should be grouped under Area Types: Area types context and building blocks, growth areas, downtown Flagstaff, Urban areas, Suburban areas, Rural areas, Placemaking Corridor, Employment center, special planning areas	✓		See updated chapter
418	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Cost of Development: what are the community costs, funding and financing mechanisms?		✓	
419	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Public Building, Services, Facilities, and Safety: Serving our people, public building, facilities, and services, location Public buildings & facilities, public safety.		✓	organization
420	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Guidelines for Developers- The public looks directly to policies and goals- will "guidelines be viewed as NOT important? What is the true applicability when its put in front of a client? Most clients "if its not part of ordinance if I'm not required to do it, I won't." But they will consider it. What's more important? Policies or guidelines? Developers will use depending on: size of property, developers attitudes. Ideas: Consideration for development, Goals and Policies should be first page of every chapter or consistent organization	✓		See updated Considerations for development
421	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Map & Guidelines in on place		✓	
422	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Format like a Textbook- 1)G&P first 2)Why-text or (G&P at beginning as a mini table of contents) 3)Maps 4) How to use maps & text-guidelines/considerations- trade offs- policy analysis as part of the public, participation, process 5) Implementation "How to implement the policies"	✓		
423	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Could policies/goals listed by chapter be second T.O.C? Beginning of document all G&P		✓	Under consideration
424	Overall in Chapter	Public Comment Email	"the community character section refers to ancient peoples who lived near current-day Flagstaff, but I could find no mention of the current populations of Native Americans who live in Flagstaff or those who live nearby and use it as a community center. Also, there is no mention of the historic and current communities of Hispanic and African-American people in Flagstaff. All these groups play a large part in the vitality of our community and deserve consideration in the narrative, the plan itself and the photographs of our community."		✓	Note current Native American tribes and as active community members
425	Overall in "Transportation" Chapter	F3 BOD • And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	"To get a better understanding of the current bicycle connectivity, show a bicycle connectivity map and highlight the areas that need improvement in terms of safety and needs of bicyclists (poor traffic light programming, high curbs, narrow shoulders). Clearly prioritize transportation modes to guide future investments and improvements. The priority order from the highest should be: pedestrians, bicyclists, public transit, passenger rail, automobiles.	✓		See FUTS masterplan map
426	Format in Chapter	P&Z	In the text: Goals and Policies with tabs guidelines/considerations for development on one page and related to maps.	✓		
427	Format in Chapter	P&Z	Update document. P&Z needs larger maps for reference.		✓	
428	Format in Chapter	P&Z	Goals & Policies at the beginning is more interesting, many policies that say to take "Considerations for Nat. Env."	✓		
429	Rio de Flag	P&Z	Guidelines for development, rio as a Greenbelt (environment), community vision-address Rio de Flag flood control project at all costs: stormwater, public facilities, urban conservation.		✓	
430	Rio de Flag	P&Z	"Restore Natural floodplains" in city preposterous, not to original condition. Compromise? Floodplain/Floodway	✓		See updated stormwater / water section
431	101	NAACP	Add a sentence at the beginning of second paragraph: <b>People who live in the Flagstaff Region represent a long history of diverse cultures that are rooted deep in the community, including Native American, Asian, African-American, Hispanic, and others from Europe and the Middle-East. The vibrant celebration of each culture is reflected every year and treasured by present and hopefully by future generations.</b>		✓	
432	101	Maury Herman	line three of last paragraph -- On First Amendment grounds, it would be better to say that some sites are considered sacred by regional Native American Tribes. The current wording could be taken as advocacy for the belief rather than factual reporting of a belief system.		✓	
433	101	Kim Notes P&Z	The word "Character" is used 13 times		✓	
434	102	Carol Bousquet	"Scenic Resources and Natural Setting"- Format item: some of the areas that have goals & policies are in orange heading and others are in black.		✓	Formatting
435	103	Maury Herman	It would be helpful if the plan recognized that preservation <b>goals in the Historic Districts will be best served when the historic districts are economically and socially dynamic and evolving to meet the changing needs of residents and visitors.</b>		✓	Note in text
436	104	P&Z	CC 1.3: Protect the region's topographical features, <b>such as mountains...</b> . Preserve as much as possible - how to protect a forested setting when it is privately owned? Cross-reference with Open Space chapter; cross-reference with zoning code-resource protection and Coconin County conservation codes.		✓	
437	104	County Planning Staff	Policies CC 1.5 and 1.6 say the same thing - combine?		✓	Glossary terms
438	104	P&Z	Policy !! 1.5 - define "rural areas", "open lands", "sensitive environmental areas" in the glossary		✓	
439	104	CSF	Policy CC.1.5 may belong in open spaces section		✓	
440	105	P&Z	Community Character: Railroad and its contribution. First paragraph- "respect historic arch. & design in new development.		✓	
441	105	NAACA	Add Preserve traditional cultural properties that connects places of worship to the native people "sacred sites and gathering grounds". Peaks in their entirety are sacred, traditional gathering of herbs. Concern of burial grounds-how to document.		✓	Text - local indigenous cultures strive to maintain traditional places and customs, which may at times be challenging as traditionally tribal places become private property.
442	106	CSF	Guideline for Development to accompany Cultural Sensitivity Map: How to Use the Cultural Sensitivity Map What to look for: Archaeological and Historical Resources Description: Artifacts, structures and cultural relics Importance: Evidence of our past is important to defining our sense of place and our understanding of ourselves and our surroundings. Historical and archaeological evidence is widespread and can be found almost everywhere within the FMPO. Guidelines: Archaeological survey prior to development planning is recommended to identify such sites so that plans can provide for their avoidance or mitigation, thus avoiding expensive surprises late in the planning process. Avoid destruction or damage to historical and archaeological sites and comply with state and local laws if human remains are discovered. The Cultural Sensitivity Map does not include "Traditional Cultural Properties" as defined in federal regulations (36 CFR Part 800). An obvious zone of concern in this regard are the San Francisco Peaks which are regarded as sacred by many neighboring Indian tribes. Assistance with cultural sensitivity maybe available through the city, NAU, the Museum of Northern Arizona, land management agencies and local professional consultants depending on the circumstances.		✓	See updated Considerations for development
443	108	Maury Herman	Policy CC.2.3 -- The goal may be to fully mitigate development impacts on heritage resources, but the policy should be to "mitigate as much as practical development impacts on heritage resources." This is one of the tradeoffs to development. I am not sure what the appropriate language is, but an alternative to mitigation (or perhaps an alternative mitigation) is the documentation of historic sites before they are disturbed. There is significant precedent for this in management of archeological sites in our region.	✓		mitigate' means as much as possible
444	108	NACA	<b>Add policy</b> -Consider revising existing codes to allow for ceremonial structures of Native Americans.		✓	<b>Add Policy CC 2.6 - Respect the indigenous cultures modern needs to continue cultural traditions.</b>
445	108	CSF	Goal CC.2. Replace "this" with "our"		✓	
446	108	CSF	Policy CC.2.1. - Add "interpret" after "identify and "in cooperation with other agencies and NGOs".		✓	

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
447	108	CSF	Policy CC.2.1. <b>Add new policy</b> "Integrate consideration of historical, archaeological, and cultural resource into city and county processes and practices.	✓		This is already part of the zoning process
448	108	CSF	Policy CC.2.5. Add "and integrate into city planning"	✓		
449	108	Alex Wright	Add Policy: Promote / foster Native rites access to sacred sites and gathering grounds / traditional cultural property.	✓		See Added Policy CC 2.6
450	108	Alex Wright	Revise zoning and codes to reflect the needs of traditional ceremonial structures of Native Americans	✓		See Added Policy CC 2.6
451	116	CSF	Policy CC.4.5. Change to encourage local landscaping using xeriscape, low impact principles and native vegetation wherever possible.		✓	
452	116	CSF	Policy CC.4.7. Insert "native and/or locally adapted ", and drop "catalog" since it would take a large effort and not be very beneficial.	✓		
453	109 & 110	NACA-Dorothy & Leo Gishie ddgishie@nacainc.org, Rose Toehe rtoehe@nacainc.org	Community Design-Like "Ft. Tuthill" and "180 Corridor" all named after Generals who came through here. Consider naming places and streets after important historical Native American people. Approval of Signage? Ex Sante Fe, celebrate their culture, spanish, Natives, and Anglo-Blend. This does not happen in Flagstaff. Many Native Americans here grew up in Bellemont, Navajo Camp, Hopi Camp (Cline Library/MNA) talk about this in the "History Portion". Econ Dev-Cultural Center-Rodeo, Pow-Wow. See Pueblo Cultural center in Albuquerque (19) Pueblos. We all value this place-There is no conflict in this value-that is sacredness. The view of the Peaks/The peacefulness of quiet.	✓		
454	110	County Planning Staff	Urban Design' text should be equivalent to the other sections	✓		
455	110	Carol Bousquet	Lower picture- Where is this Pizzicetta? If so it needs to be updated		✓	
456	112	Carol Bousquet	bottom paragraph- seems preachy, is it necessary?		✓	
457	112	Maury Herman	Many of the revitalization projects came to fruition in the 90's, but the Flagstaff Main Street Foundation was incorporated in the mid 80's, and the activities in the 90's reflected the effort by many volunteers in the prior period.		✓	Can be noted in 'reinvestment' text or Built Environment umbrella
458	116	CSF	Goal CC. 3 Add that Flagstaff is the first identified STEM city	✓		See economic development
459	116	CSF	Policy CC.3.5 Link this science section to education for kids and science outreach to the public		✓	
460	116	County Planning Staff	CC 3.1, 4.1 and 4.2 all use "Ensure" which is the same as 'require'		✓	
461	116	County Public Health	Policy CC 4.4 & Policy LU 3.1 & Policy T.1.2 "A compact and connected city design can encourage residents to walk and bike from place to place, creating a lifestyle of health. The dangers of a sedentary lifestyle are many. Chronic diseases like heart disease, diabetes, and some cancers can be prevented when the built environment enables walking and biking, instead of promoting sitting in cars. Complete Streets, a transportation paradigm, allows urban redesign to make transportation routes friendly to pedestrians, bikers, and transit users, while still accommodating cars. We commend the City for forward thinking on compact design and transit diversity."	✓		
462	116	County P&Z	Policy CC.4.8. "Add 'storage containers' and add 'native plant.' Native plants save water and prevent the introduction of plants that may become invasive."		✓	
463	116	County P&Z	Policy CC.3.1. "Add Fort Valley Rd Gateway Corridor."		✓	
464	117	Maury Herman	Specific mention of Flagstaff's commitment to the STEM initiative and designation as America's first STEM city would be appropriate.		✓	In text
465	119	NACA	Public Art - encourage Native American Artists. "art" which is showing body part dismembered is OFFENSIVE.		✓	Text could say - huge potential for improving public art by leaning on the Native American artists.
466		F3 BOD And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	Land Use & Growth Areas: Urban growth boundary should be maintained at the same level as it was in the 2001 plan. Section 20 should not be included for possible development as the inventory of private land that can be developed is sufficient until the next revision of the plan. This will help limit "sprawl" and incentivize infill/redevelopment. Impact fees or other fiscal tools should be identified to limit greenfield development and to incentivize infill/redevelopment. Section 10 on Route 66- a gateway road to the community should not be zoned industrial. The plan should not state that growth is inevitable or that it is necessary good for the community. Resilience of the community is what our goal should be as that is a more equitable and sustainable strategy to pursue. Policies supporting speculative zoning should be eliminated. A map of brown fields should be created to facilitate and encourage industrial infill.	✓		GB is 2001 plan; section 20 was inside growth boundary 2001. Impact fees are discussed in Cost of Development. Growth is probable, and it is economically good for the community. Map of brownfields would draw law suits from property owners
467	121-199	P&Z	Land Use: Reorganize and clarify		✓	
468		Cynthia Pardo	Land Use and Growth Areas o Urban growth boundary should be maintained at the same level as it was in the 2001 plan. Section 20 should not be included for possible development as the inventory of private land that can be developed is sufficient until the next revision of the plan. This will help limit "sprawl" and incentivize infill/ redevelopment. o Impact fees or other fiscal tools should be identified to limit greenfield development and to incentivize infill/ redevelopment. o Section 10 on Route 66 – a gateway road into the community should not be zoned industrial. o The plan should not state that growth is inevitable or that it is necessary good for the community. Resilience of the community is what our goal should be as that is a more equitable and sustainable strategy to pursue. o Policies supporting speculative zoning should be eliminated. o A map of brown fields should be created to facilitate and encourage industrial infill.		✓	Text regarding 'gateways' and section10 - the opportunities
469	121-199	Michael Manson	There are several classic economic realities we need to communicate, understand and adhere to create the balance necessary for a quality living environment. I labeled these principles as Supply and Demand - Ringed Community, Free Market Leadership – cost/benefit Responsibility, and Imbedded Public Feedback. <b>A. Supply and Demand – Ringed Community</b> First, we need to recognize our community provides very limited developable land for both housing and commercial property. Flagstaff is what some planners call a "Ringed Community" where the community cannot expand outward due to structural restrictions from growing. This creates a ring around the city forcing the prices to rise more quickly to meet rising demand. The visual used by economists is water (symbolizing demand) spreading out over a broad area versus restricted by a smaller area limited by a barrel. As you add water to the broader area the water level stays low while the same amount of water in the barrel rises more quickly. MAG – Municipal Arizona Governments prepared a growth study of communities across Arizona showing the every city growing in area except Flagstaff. This sounds OK in the short term but in the long term this means prices will rise strongly increasing the cost of living and taxes owed. This will decrease the livability of our community and force people and employers to choose more affordable communities. The limits the supply of any product with ever growing demand causes the price of the product to raise quickly, more quickly than normal due to additional limitations of supply. These price increases cause the cost of living to raise even more quickly due to costs compounding on themselves such as: 1. Rental increases due to limitation of commercial space; 2. Rise in cost of living due to higher housing costs; 3. Limitation of taxable base causing taxes per resident to rise; 4. Higher labor costs due to greater housing costs, product costs, limitations of labor supply due to high cost of living, greater distance to travel to obtain affordable housing, etc., etc.; and also. <b>B. Free Market Leadership – Cost/benefit Responsibility</b> As responsible community leaders, family members and personal citizens we inherently know every decision has tradeoffs, goods have a price, and benefits have a cost. Inevitably if we ask someone if they want something for free of course they will want it. Without requiring them to weigh the counter balancing costs, showing the tradeoffs and or requiring the individual to personally pay the bill, of course they will want it. If someone can vote themselves benefits without paying for them people will do so. It's the grade school politician's promise to have root beer every in every drinking fountain. It's the reason we have such a high deficit – the current congress doesn't have to pay the bill for what they are receiving today. Future generations will pay but not now. But there are costs to everything, tradeoffs to be weighed – short term versus long term, personally paid or community paid. Though we all want to live in a quality environment with responsible development we need to seek a balance to assure affordability for the future and taxes are paid. I am afraid this no cost to benefits is exactly what we have done in our planning process. If by asking if everyone wants something without directly weighing the costs and tradeoffs tied to the decision they assuredly will want more root beer. We need to realize the free market will respond to almost any restriction but can we afford it.		✓	Note in text
470	121-199	Michael Manson	As responsible community leaders, family members and personal citizens we inherently know every decision has tradeoffs, goods have a price, and benefits have a cost. Inevitably if we ask someone if they want something for free of course they will want it. Without requiring them to weigh the counter balancing costs, showing the tradeoffs and or requiring the individual to personally pay the bill, of course they will want it. If someone can vote themselves benefits without paying for them people will do so. It's the grade school politician's promise to have root beer every in every drinking fountain. It's the reason we have such a high deficit – the current congress doesn't have to pay the bill for what they are receiving today. Future generations will pay but not now. But there are costs to everything, tradeoffs to be weighed – short term versus long term, personally paid or community paid. Though we all want to live in a quality environment with responsible development we need to seek a balance to assure affordability for the future and taxes are paid. I am afraid this no cost to benefits is exactly what we have done in our planning process. If by asking if everyone wants something without directly weighing the costs and tradeoffs tied to the decision they assuredly will want more root beer. We need to realize the free market will respond to almost any restriction but can we afford it.		✓	Note in text

Edit #	Page #	928 856 0556	Edit/Comment	Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
471	121-199	Michael Manson	<p><b>C. Imbedded Public Feedback</b></p> <p>Realize the development process submits to an enormous amount of imbedded public feedback. Through public hearings, building codes, zoning restrictions, planning review as well as trying to respond to market demands, the developer fulfills a huge amount of public opinion requirements. If we add additional risks, restrictions and requirements we will further restrict supply.</p> <p>At one point some planners wanted to insert additional public opinion conferences and reviews at the end of the process. This additional review either:</p> <p>a.) adds another point of adversity and risk into an already difficult process but does so after much has already been determined, planned out, restricted to, engineered, committed to and invested in; or,</p> <p>b.) deliberately creates division and animosity within our community without the responsibility to pay the cost or the real ability to affect the outcome.</p> <p>This creates great risk after the landowner believes they fulfilled their contract, makes the community believe they may make changes at no cost or gives citizens expectations of influence and control when they may not.</p>			Note in text
472	121-200	Eva Putzova	<p><b>Land Use and Growth Areas/ Cost of Development</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Urban growth boundary should be maintained at the same level as it was in the 2001 plan. Section 20 should not be included for possible development as the inventory of private land that can be developed is sufficient until the next revision of the plan. This will help limit "sprawl" and incentivize infill/ redevelopment.</li> <li>Impact fees or other fiscal tools should be identified to limit greenfield development and to incentivize infill/ redevelopment.</li> <li>Section 10 on Route 66 – a gateway road into the community should not be zoned industrial.</li> <li>The plan should not state that growth is inevitable or that it is necessary good for the community. Resilience of the community is what our goal should be as that is a more equitable and sustainable strategy to pursue.</li> <li>Policies supporting speculative zoning should be eliminated.</li> <li>A map of brown fields should be created to facilitate and encourage industrial infill.</li> </ul>			Note in text
473	121	County Planning Staff	This section needs major editing, make it less complicated. All terms need definitions here or in the glossary (greenfield development, for example). Vacant parcel map needs to be just vacant parcel map - clear and easy to read.			
474	121	Carol Bousquet	Italics on citations			
475	121	Sally Kladnick - Democrats of NAZ	1) Growth should not be allowed if there is not sufficient water plans and provisions included and paid for. 2) Open Space parcels #10, 20, and 30 should not be used until other available parcels are used or infilled.			
476	121	Marilyn Weissman	Suggestions: 1) the plan provide additional guidance to staff on all parcels it sees as zoned incorrectly; 2) The Regional Plan shall discourage the form of speculative zoning and encourage a process that give the public as much information as they need to make an informative decision in support or against a particular type of use in their neighborhood.			There is no speculative zoning
477	125	State Land Department	add to "Growth Boundaries: Growth boundaries have been established to ensure compact development .....established for rural areas in respect of public, State Trust, and private land ownership."			
478	126	Carol Bousquet	Perception that we can and must accommodate endless growth does not reflect the plan overall themes of resiliency and sustainability.			
479	127	State Land Department	add to "Greenfield Development is possible within the region in areas reserved for development...Private lands and State Trust lands within the city and county hold entitlements for development."			
480	128	Maury Herman	I would delete T.1.3. I think the priority is providing options to people. When I first came to Flagstaff, Jerry Craig, the traffic "engineer" expressed the view that his only responsibility was to move cars and that once people got out of their cars, it was no longer his concern. This priority will support the opposite view, but could have significant unforeseen (and negative) consequences. This type of prioritizing can lead to misallocation of resources such as the beautiful but rarely used pedestrian bridge over Cedar.			RE-WRITE T 1.3 (p.206) - Prioritize PEOPLE in all transportation systems.
481	131	Carol Bousquet	Plan should encourage NAU to take responsibility for housing their students on their land for their future growth			Not a politically correct thing to convey - ideas for language?
482	132	Maury Herman	Option T.5.6 I believe it is more important to focus our limited transportation resources in areas with the highest need and ridership potential. If Fourth Street gets frequent service, as planned, and I still need to walk from Linwood to Cheshire to take the bus, it's probably an efficient use of resources.			T 5.6 - Enhance public transportation in key urban areas to that one could live without a car. See p. 212 in document
483	132	State Land Department	Change - "State Trust Lands: At this time, the Arizona State Land Department has identified its holdings within the city limits as "appropriate for conservation" or "development potential", based upon City Planning documents.			
484	133	Carol Bousquet	Have an inventory on variety of housing types that we have and what actually need and want to see more in Flagstaff.			
485	133	Carol Bousquet	Questioning- "800 faculty" says this number includes all campuses			
486	133	Marilyn Weissman	The Urban Growth Boundary should not be expanded (re: existing developers & planning for the lands around Little America to have 7000 housing units). And Proposing Section 10 to be zoned industrial also seems unnecessary.			
487	134	Carol Bousquet	Map is too small			
488	135	Maury Herman	Pursuant to federal statute, public entities need to meet a certain level of accommodation. (ADA Title II) It isn't clear from this language whether the policy is to meet or to exceed the federally required standard. If the policy is to exceed the federal standard, what is the new standard?			Not clear on what policy you are referring to.
489	135	Marilyn Weissman	The Regional Plan should set the goals for the type of development we want.			
490	137	Carol Bousquet	Chart is confusing, wondering if it adds value?			See updated chapter -
491	141	Staff	Growth Illustration Map - need one at FMPO scale; one at city scale. Maps need to be 11x17 and high resolution with clear legend.			
492	141	Maury Herman	It is unclear to me what the meaning or implications of this chart are.			
493	141	Carol Bousquet	Legend in graph is too small and "special districts (add or category)" throughout the document make these changes			formatting
494	141	County Planning Staff	Growth Illustration Map: county areas of private land has been colored "open space" - needs changed; some rural areas are noted as "suburban" and needs changed; need the rural growth boundaries layer on. Show map to full FMPO.			See updated maps - all say "existing development rights remain".
495	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map "Open Space" designation on State Trust Lands - add language indicating that- allowed by Arizona State Law, the backup designation, of 1 dwelling unit per acre applies except for lands classified Suitable for Conservation Purposes."			
496	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map: T21N, R8E Sec. 4: Clearly identify the remaining State Trust land in this section and apply the "Rural State Trust land" designation.			
497	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map: T21N, R8E Sec. 8: Southeast Quarter-section (south of I-40): Apply the "Rural State Trust land" designation.			
498	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map: T21N, R8E, Section 10: Add a mixed-use suburban node along Route 66 and add a reference to the ability to use the area south of I-40 for future transfers of density, tree canopy, and/or open space credit in exchange for applying an "Open Space" land use designation.			
499	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map: T21N, R8E, Section 30: Apply the "Rural State Trust land" designation.			
500	141	State Land Department	Growth Illustration Map: T21N, R7E, Sections 6, 8, 18 and T21N, R6E, Section 12: Color code these sections as "Open Space" to reflect the State Land Commissioner's reclassification of the land as "Suitable for Conservation Purposes".			
501	141	State Land Department	Add a new "Rural State Trust land" land use category with a minimum density of one dwelling unit per acre, per ARS 9-461.06N, to be applied as noted above (Growth Illustration Map, p. 141)			
502	141	Bob Kampwerth	The land which circles the Flagstaff Pulliam airport should be categorized as "off limits" to development. As we have seen by the recent plane crash which landed in Mountairaire, maintaining a buffer zone around the airport is critical to public safety.			Added a 'flyzone' layer to Future Growth Illustration map
503	143	State Land Department	Edit: Neighborhood Commercial is intended for all commercial retail and service uses that meet consumer demands for frequently needed goods and services, with an emphasis on serving the surrounding residential neighborhoods."			
504	145	State Land Department	"Public Multiple Use Lands: Given that some State Trust lands are designated Public Multiple-Use, where such lands cannot be acquired or protected as Public Multiple-Use, or the property owner has not consented to the Public Multiple-Use designation, then such lands would be considered appropriate under this designation for residential development either through appropriate existing residential zoning or requested and granted rezoning, provided the rezoning request addressed the applicable requirements of a rezoning beyond conformance to the general plan." Delete stricken language, ownership cannot be used to require different standards for development. Its questionable that this category should be included in the General Plan since it is not shown on the 3/2013 Land use map.			
505	147	CSF	Goal LU 2 and "and cultural" after natural setting			
506	147	CSF	Policy LU 2.2: Suggested adding cultural elements to Guidelines for Development, as follows: "Utilize the following as guidance in the development process: Natural Environment maps, Environmental Planning and Conservation policies, Guidelines for Development, Cultural Sensitivity and Heritage Preservation maps, and Community Character policies." Maps are key to implementing this policy. These resources should be part of the various processes and carefully considered, but the presence of the resources should not usually preclude development.			Tish?
507	147	CSF	after Policy LU.2.2 There should be a new policy: Hire an Urban Wildlife Planner for the City			Not RP purview
508	147	County P&Z	Policy LU.2.2. "Hire an Urban Wildlife Planner for the City. This person would help with land use decisions to reduce the negative impacts and increase the positive impacts of urban wildlife. The half-time urban wildlife planner position in the County has proven very useful."			Not RP purview
509	148	CSF	Add to Goal LU.4. "Develop standard practices regarding the potential for open space set aside during development to be integrated into the open space system and how maintenance will be accomplished."			cross-reference with open space chapter - tools for conservation

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
510	149	Staff	Goal LU 5: Ensure future growth has Adequate Water Supply Policy LU 5.3: Revise to say: "Encourage high efficiency and water conservation to support the rural land use pattern compatible with limited water resources, in compliance with Coconino County's Comprehensive Plan."		✓	CAC approved revised language: <b>Proposed Goal LU.5</b> Balance future growth with available water resources
511	149	County Planning Staff	Goal LU 5 and Policies LU5.1-LU5.3 were all added subsequent to the discussion of water resources—the goal requiring adequate water for future growth has legal meaning which is not supported by any of the text in either this element of the water element. The water element includes discussion about the difficulties in obtaining State determination for adequate supply due to the current statutory and regulatory framework. The County would not support this goal and policies as written. If there is a desire to link water and growth, then that should be clearly articulated in the text of both water and land use/growth elements and any goal and related policies would need to be realistic based on current statutes and state rules governing water planning.		✓	<b>Policy LU.5.1</b> Availability of water resources should be a consideration for all major development and subdivision applications. <b>Policy LU.5.2</b> Impacts on the city's water delivery infrastructure should be a consideration for all residential and non-residential development proposals. <b>Policy LU.5.3</b> Continue to pursue opportunities to address water resources on a regional basis.
512	149	CSF	LU. 6.4. Add "and in selected open space parcels"		✓	
	149	County Public Health	Policy LU 6.4 "Community gardens and urban farming can encourage residents to be active outdoors and eat more fresh vegetables and fruits. A diet full of fresh produce and short processed, packaged foods helps residents maintain or lose weight and prevent diabetes, heart disease and some cancers. We commend the City's efforts to encourage the production of fresh food at a local level and hope that this focus on urban agriculture grows in a way compliant with regulations by the Arizona Department of Agriculture."	✓		
513	150	Carol Bousquet	Box "Vision for the Future" - seems to run on	✓		
514	150	State Land Department	"Greenfield Development - areas that exist mostly on the periphery of the city, within or contiguous with the urban service boundary, are prime locations for greenfield development. <del>Much of this is privately owned land and State Trust lands.</del> Consider deleting the stricken language which identifies property ownership.		✓	
515	152 & overall	Carol Bousquet	All "Vision for the Future" Boxes add specific location Ex.- "Vision for the Future (add Activity Centers)"		✓	
516	153	Carol Bousquet	Graph is too small		✓	
517	153	County Planning Staff	Include all activity centers		✓	
518	155	CSF	After Policy LU.7.7. <b>add new Policy: Study the use of accessory structures (mother-in-law apartments and small outbuildings) to increase density and provide affordable rental units.</b>	✓		already part of the zoning code - this is a vision for the future
519	155	County P&Z	Policy LU.7.7. "Study the use of accessory structures ("mother in law apartments" and small outbuildings) to increase density and provide affordable rental units."	✓		
520	159	CSF	LU.8.3. After "streetscape" add "and maintaining selected appropriate open space".		✓	
521	159	CSF	LU.9.3 after "corridors add "where appropriate"		✓	
522	149	CSF	LU.5.1. After "water supply" add "is truly available and"	✓		re-written see above
523	160	County Public Health	Policy LU 10.10 "As all residents of Flagstaff and especially those with special needs have the right to exercise, be active, and participate in social events, we commend the City for complying with ADA standards. For the mental, emotional, and physical well-being of special needs individuals, the Health District would like to suggest that ADA considerations be expanded outside of the downtown area. We would especially like to see ADA compliance in the 4th St. corridor, which supports many lower-income individuals who may not be able to afford the coping devices more accessible to higher-income disabled individuals."		✓	Add text in Community Character - GREAT STREETS section of accessibility. Cross-reference to T2.3 p. 207
524	163	NAIPTA	LU 11. Accommodate pedestrians, bicyclists, transit riders and private cars to supplement Downtown's status as the best served and most accessible location in the region." In policies it does not mention transit and how transit will meet this goal. Please reference the Transportation section goals to meet this goal; as well as the Public Transit 5-year & Long Range Transit Plan for strategies to better accommodate transit riders and transit routes within the Downtown Area.		✓	Cross-reference to Public Transit section and appendix of related documents
525	165	Carol Bousquet	Bottom left photo- update		✓	
526	168-169	County Planning Staff	Special Districts need to be "Special Planning Areas" throughout - be consistent. Cannot use 'Special districts' as that is a legal term with specific meaning in the county.		✓	
527	180	CSF	LU.14.1. add "selected" before "wildlife"		✓	
528	181	County Planning Staff	County staff would like to help revise the rural areas section		✓	
529	187	CSF	LU.15.1. At the end of the policy add "and updates".		✓	
530	187	CSF	LU.15.4. Change to either drop "equestrian" or add "foot and bicycle"		✓	add foot and bicycle
531	188	County Planning Staff	Placemaking corridors might be better in the Community Character section		✓	
532	188	Staff	Placemaking corridors - remand "Great Streets" so as not to confuse with 'Corridors' that are a land-use designation for commercial development. Put 'great streets' in community character section.		✓	
533	190	Sat Best - County P&Z	Policy LU.16.3. "Begin negotiations between the City and County to study, modify as necessary, approve and begin implementation of the existing Fort Valley Corridor Feasibility Study. This an excellent opportunity to build City and County cooperation and demonstrate the importance of quality gateway planning in maintaining community character."		✓	Its in Community Character - cross-reference this section
534	195	County Public Health	Goal LU 16 & Policy T2.3 "Intrinsic in the first goal is the redesign of business corridors for pedestrians and bicycles, traffic calming devices that prevent accidents and the development of business opportunities on 4th St. and other "underutilized" corridors. As increasing walk-ability and bike-ability was supported in a talking point above, we would like to focus here on traffic safety and injury prevention, which the Health Distice also supports. The Health District would recommend that, <b>when redesigning corridors with safety in mind, the City consult the various stakeholders, including the Disability Awareness Commission, the Pedestrian and Bicycle Advisory Committees, neighborhood groups, and Safe Routes to School experts.</b> "		✓	As process when design Activity Centers and Corridors.
535	196	County P&Z	Policy LU.17.4. "Insert" native plant."		✓	
536	197	County Public Health	Policy LU 18.4 " We appreciate the consideration of health in industrial design, but suggest that the City provide clarification and detail as to what aspects of health this policy will consider. The Health Distict encourages the City to condiser waste water treatment, traffic safety, effluent leaching, and air quality associated with increased industrial development."		✓	Add to end of LU 18.4 "...such as waste water treatment, traffic safety, etc...."
537	198	State Land Department	Should Lowell Observatory be considered a special planning area?		✓	They have a 'campus' like master plan
538	201-222	Eva Putzova	<b>Transportation</b> • To get a better understanding of the current bicycle connectivity, show a bicycle connectivity map and highlight the areas that need improvement in terms of safety and needs of bicyclists (poor traffic light programming, high curbs, narrow shoulders). • Clearly prioritize transportation modes to guide future investments and improvements. The priority order from the highest should be: pedestrians, bicyclists, public transit, passenger rail, automobiles. • From the map on page 204 (and any other maps) remove references to a proposed access road crossing McMillan Mesa and a regional travel road in the area of Picture Canyon that is supposed to connect US89 and I-40		✓	
539	201	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block		✓	
540	201-222	Cynthia Prado	<b>Transportation</b> o To get a better understanding of the current bicycle connectivity, show a bicycle connectivity map and highlight the areas that need improvement in terms of safety and needs of bicyclists (poor traffic light programming, high curbs, narrow shoulders). o Clearly prioritize transportation modes to guide future investments and improvements. The priority order from the highest should be: pedestrians, bicyclists, public transit, passenger rail, automobiles. o From the map on page 204 (and any other maps) remove references to a proposed access road crossing McMillan Mesa and a regional travel road in the area of Picture Canyon that is supposed to connect US89 and I-40		✓	
541	Services	NACA-Derrick	Services/Transit, people walk in from Timberlind/Doneypark to access transportation and transit to Doney Park work with Hopi senum, Navajo Transit. Transit-Efficient energy use - transit and allow for equestrian.		✓	Note in public transit text the need for daily commuters from Doney Park and further outlying communities; potential for collaborating with Hopi and Navajo Transit exist.
542	201	County Planning Staff	Describe the role of the FMPO and the FMPO Regional Transportation Plan. Also, with transit - give some background on NAIPTA and how it works today. Bring it around to how all three-Regional Plan, FMPO RTP and NAIPTA's planning all work closely together.		✓	
543	201	Marilyn Weissman	No new road adjacent to Picture Canyon or a connector across McMillan Mesa.	✓		Gone on map
544	204 (map)	Molly Larsen Email	"Please note that I strongly oppose the location for the road planned short-cutting I-40 to Page that will greatly effect Picture Canyon."	✓		
545	204 (map)	Larry/Betty Kahr Email	"We oppose the Regional Plan for the connecting road between Townsend-Winona Road and I-40 where it would run parallel to the western boundary Picture Canyon. Preserving this valuable area was years in the making. The proposed connecting road parallel to the western boundary of Picture Canyon would carry heavy traffic and would disrupt wild life corridors, archaeological sites and recreation. Please preserve the peace, serenity and wildlife of Picture Canyon and oppose the road in this location."	✓		

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
546	204 (map)	Bob James Email	"I went down to the library and looked at the map of the Picture Canyon changes. We certainly do not need a road to the west of the Canyon. Why don't we leave that out."	✓		
547	204 (map)	Public Comment Email	"We oppose the regional plan for a road that short cuts I 40 to Page"	✓		
548	204 (map)	Public Comment Email	"I am very much opposed to another road to I-40 from Townsend Winona Road. The proposed new road would have a drastic affect on the Picture Canyon wildlife habitat, wildlife corridors, archaeological sites and recreation. For what do we need another road?? It seems to me that there are much better ways to spend taxpayer money!"	✓		
549	204 (map)	Marshall/Carol Scholing Email	"We understand that the Regional Plan contains a proposal for a road connecting Townsend Winona Road with I-40, and that said road would run immediately parallel to the Western boundary of the newly purchased section of Picture Canyon. We are writing to express our opposition to the building of this road, as the traffic would greatly impact the peace and serenity of the wildlife living in the Canyon. The people of Flagstaff fought hard to preserve Picture Canyon. Please let us not destroy the peace and tranquility of this beautiful natural site!"	✓		
550	204 (map)	Ann Higgins Email	"The Flagstaff Regional Plan contains a proposal for a road that would be a disaster for Picture Canyon - immediately parallel to the west boundary of the newly purchased section that includes Picture Canyon and connecting Townsend-Winona Road with I-40."	✓		
551	204 (map)	F3 BOD And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	"remove references to proposed access road crossing McMillam Mesa and regional travel road in the area of Picture Canyon that is supposed to connect US89 and I-40."	✓		
552	204 (map)	Public Comment Email	"I am a resident of Kachina Village and plan to move into Flagstaff proper soon. I have a couple concerns: 1) the plan for a road parallel to the west boundary of the section including Picture Canyon could cause major problems for this natural resource. Please reconsider it."	✓		
553	204 (map)	Bea Cooley	A very serious concern is the future road along the western portion of the Picture Canyon section. What a terrible shame it would be to put a truck bypass alongside such a valuable open space, wildlife habitat and corridor, riparian zone, preserve, Northern Arizona Audubon bird sanctuary, archaeologically rich zone, cultural site for many tribal members, and etc. That stretch of the Rio used to be just a dumping ground but has been transformed by the attention of the Flagstaff public into a real treasure. The plan refers to "natural quiet", wildlife linkages, important wildlife corridors, lists the Picture Canyon Working Group as a community partner, among its considerations. I truly hope that the final plan to be presented to the public will not have that future road in it so that I can support it.	✓		
554	204 (map)	Robert Mark	I am very concerned that this map still shows a future bypass road running along the west edge of the Picture Canyon Natural and Cultural Preserve. This is totally unacceptable, as it would severely impact the Preserve. It is my understanding that this was to be removed from the Plan map. Please do so!	✓		
555	204	Sally Kladnick - Democrats of NAZ	3) There should be plans to build or pave the forest roads that connect Hiway #40 with Hiway #180. It is a dangerous traffic jam problem as well as an eyesore entrance to the community to come through Milton, Humphreys and Hiway #180. The bypass for those going to Snowbowl or the Grand Canyon would free the traditional corridor up for those who want to come in to Flagsaff to conduct business, spend the night, or dine.	✓		
556	204	Susan Longerebeam	I write to bring another voice to the concern about the proposed extension of the High Country Trail. We as residents do not believe such an extension is necessary for traffic flow. The road would undermine the quality of life for the thousands of residents who live in Ponderosa Trails. There are few parks within walking distance on the south side of town (Fort Tuthill is across the freeway), and the current open space near the airport provides both a recreational outlet, and a safety buffer for planes taking off and landing. The Ponderosa Trails homeowners association recently surveyed the residents, and most were opposed to or neutral about the proposed High Country extension. The future traffic flow from Pulliam to the Powell extension is sufficient, obviating the need for High Country to Powell, and would not cut a swath through the remaining open space meadow area near the airport.	✓		
557	206 - 235	CSF	Suggest new Policy between policy T.1.1.1. and T.1.1.2. Assess impacts on transportation before approving or endorsing new projects	✓		Traffic Impact Analysis is currently part of all development projects
558	Goals & Policies	Sat Best - County P&Z	Policy T.1.1. "Assess impacts on transportation before approving or endorsing new projects.Council effectively approved and endorsed the Snowbowl expansion with no plan to handle increased traffic on Highway 180."	✓		A 180 Winter Traffic Study was conducted directly following
559	208	CSF	<b>Policy T.3.2. would be a stronger if it read "Promote transportation systems that reduce the use of fossil fuels and eventually replace with carbon neutral alternatives."</b>		✓	Change as suggested
560		NAIPTA Planning - Erika Mazza	Page 210. This is the second sentence, it really directs the reader that ONLY NAU uses transit. I would highly suggest rewording this sentence. "Thousands of NAU faculty, staff, and students rely on transit as a cost-effective means of getting to and across campus." The Graph on the bottom of p.210 is very blurry and unreadable. We can supply a new graph if you would like. It also can supplant the graph above that is hard to read.		✓	
561	212	County Public Health	Policy T 5.7 "We highly encourage NAITA to establish rural transit services, as transportation for outlying residents was noted as a primary challenge to attending doctor's appointments or hospital based test and treatments."	✓		NAIPTA is considering service to outer communities in their 5-year and long range transit plan
562	212	FMC - Janet McNeese	Flagstaff Medical Center - Survey Results - 46 people took a sample survey - 87% use the Eco-pass (transit) provided to them daily or often.		✓	Could be a fun factoid
563	213	County P&Z	Policy T.6.1. "Separate bike lanes and motor vehicle lanes with barriers or curbs wherever possible.It appears that most bike/vehicle accidents in Flagstaff happen when bikes and vehicle share lanes or the bike lane is in the street."		✓	Add as strategy under 'Transportation'
564	213	CSF	Policy T.6.1. At end of Policy, add "and include in transportation planning". And add new Policy to separate bike lanes and motor vehicles lanes with barriers whenever possible.		✓	Add as strategy under 'Transportation'
565	214	NAIPTA Planning - Erika Mazza	FUTS box is not showing someone on the FUTS trail system. It is Beaver St. with a bike going thru an intersection		✓	
566	215	NAIPTA Planning - Erika Mazza	should have a pedestrian on the ped bridge. All the street photos need to show transportation actually happening - bikes, walking, cars, transit, etc.		✓	
567	235	CSF	After Policy PF.1.5. insert a new policy to create an educational and promotional program that encourages citizens to prepare their households for the temporary loss of regional infrastructure services.		✓	Strategy under Public Facilities
568	228	P&Z	1.5/1.6- Logical but could use some "fair & proportional", which means different things to different people. 1.6- provide incentives for redevelopment project. "Correlate to other redevelopment sections: Land use, econ. Development, Ex- Econ. Dev. Subsections and "farm" them throughout the document. Each section could discuss the "The economics of _____, How _____ contributes to the sustainability."		✓	Cross-reference to other sections
569	Public Facilities	P&Z	Public Facilities- Resiliency- be prepared for next Shultz fire/flood	✓		
570	Public Facilities	P&Z	missing Civic Spaces (Zoning- all development 20kt or 100 units and have a public outdoor ? . Where people can congregate.) Where? Heritage Square. Policy to incorporate civic spaces where? Why? For whom?		✓	Community Character - Land Use
571						
572	Public Facilities	County Planning Staff	Need a reference to County Fire Districts under Fire and the Sheriff's Office under Law Enforcement.		✓	
573	231	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block		✓	
574	231	Carol Bousquet	Make wording on headings consistent		✓	
575	235	Carol Bousquet	Goals and Policies Box- Goal P.F.1 does not make sense		✓	
576	235	County Public Health	Goal PF 1 "The mitigation of climate change events will be extremely important as the Flagstaff area experiences stronger storms and droughts. The community needs to be informed or educated about how to cope with climatic variability and what the local government entities are doing on a systemic level. The constant communication about mitigation strategies before, during, and after an event will prevent wide-spread panic in an emergency."		✓	Add a policy following regarding education and information

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
577	235	P&Z	PF 1.5- Last sentence rewrite "climate caused disasters" or "natural disasters"		✓	
578	235	P&Z	PF 1.5- Policy is the same as p.240 (2.2)- rewrite with the focus as public facilities.		✓	
579	235	County P&Z	Policy PF.1.5. "Create an educational and promotional program that encourages citizens to prepare their households for the temporary loss of regional infrastructure services." "Provide a science based, ongoing assessment of the region's vulnerability to regional climate change and the possible mitigation measures. " "There is redundancy among these important strategies. This list should be tightened up and the major points should become goals and/or policies. "	✓		See policy suggestion above #235
580	236	County Public Health	Policy PF 3.5 "Participating in cross-institutional training exercises is a good way to simulate a disaster and a great way to encourage coordination for greater public safety. The Health District would be happy to discuss coordinated disaster exercises with the City and welcomes collaborative problem solving around funding for backfall plan."		✓	Add to text
581	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I believe it shapes the character of our community."	✓		
582	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"there is little left for wildlife and too many people"	✓		
583	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"History was not taken as a community resource until the last 15 years or so. Do not turn what we have into a mountain Disneyland, but stick to true character of 'real' people living here. I like the shout-out on the Ball Court. The city missed a grand opportunity to purchase property and create a Basque cultural center, like they have in Boise. that includes the house on Aggassiz."	✓		
584	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"There is a strong tie between the natural heritage of the area and the design for community and economic development. <b>Learning from the low water, conservation traditions of native cultures, combined with newer technologies and a fossil-fuel-free transportation and energy systems can lead to the development of a strong, community-focused, resilient economy.</b> "	✓		Strong sentence - can use
585	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	" <b>Flagstaff is both a tourist town and has a vibrant environment for locals. We need to look at who we are and maintain an understanding and connection to our past while continuing to pursue the best of what the future has to offer.</b> "	✓		Strong sentence - can use for introduction?
586	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Our Flagstaff Community Character is synonymous with our scenic and natural setting, our heritage, our unique community design and our intelligence/interests/learning opportunities. Except for the ever-present Peaks, there are areas of Flagstaff that look like ANYWHERE USA and I think it's enough!! Don't PHX FLG!! I know of other southwestern mountain towns that have effectively kept the large retail corporations out and choose to support the endeavors of talented local entrepreneurs. We're no Telluride or Aspen, We're Flagstaff!! I believe that most long term residents here are IN LOVE with our town's character and want to die here. Every non-locally owned franchise erodes our unique character and usually puts some locals out of a job and in many instances, out of their favorite town."	✓		
587	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Activity centers relieve stress, promote productivity, and reduce crime."		✓	part of Activity Center text?
588	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Flagstaff should continue to support public institutions such as community centers, libraries, and other public services."	✓		
589	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"No one seems to pay enough attention to the NOISE in the world. And it is ruining our lives"	✓		
590	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"The Pedestrian Infrastructure section needs to be stronger, including the need for a sidewalk development plan and how pedestrian needs are better met through compact development." Add policy language?		✓	Make sure transportation covers sidewalk plan for compact development connectivity
591	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"We need accessible and efficient ways to get through town."	✓		
592	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"We have become a society whose transportation defines us. Cars are primary. Walking, biking secondary. The city wants and actively markets for tourists but does not plan for them. Traffic and driving is frustrating and aggravating. There must be plans made now to increase the number of roads, especially peripherals, that can allow its citizens to cross town without fighting tourist traffic. This is a big problem and will get worse. Parking downtown? Not on a weekend..."	✓		
593	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	" <b>A walkable city is a livable city.</b> I'm not actually opposed to air travel and automobiles completely, but I want to emphasize the importance of encouraging public transit, cycling, and walking so that they are no longer seen as "alternative" forms of transportation. Flagstaff has been proactive in this area, so I hope the good work continues."	✓		Quote?
594	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"The current bus system is inadequate, very slow, and feels unsafe. I would like to make use of our busses but they dont go to doney park and even in town it can take 1 1/2 to get where you need to."	✓		
595	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I prefer to focus on multi-modal since we live in such a hugely pedestrian area, and walking/biking is the most eco-friendly way around town."	✓		
596	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Reduce transportation and you will reduce problems with poor air quality, traffic and cite problems."	✓		
597	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"ability to get around safely and efficiently is another key component to our stability. Need to emphasize on the development of bike paths and better bike path connection points across major roadways."	✓		
598	Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Obviously, autos are here to stay, but with good integration of bike lanes and pedways we can have a wonderful multi-modal transit system. <b>We need to keep people safe and consider design and function.</b> "	✓		

## People

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
599	Overall	● Cynthia Prado	Neighborhoods and Community Character o Consider incentives for subletting to minimize sprawl and expand the affordable housing options. o Remove a policy that promotes accessory dwelling units (NH.3.2).	✓		
600	Overall in Chapter	Duffie Westheimer	Dense development around downtown is most appropriate and will allow people to use vehicles less is inaccurate.	✓		
601	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Flagstaff's roots are in the historic core we have to maintain and preserve - the neighborhoods around downtown cannot take more density without sacrificing their historic core.	✓		
602	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Questions on what percentage of students should NAU provide housing, whether it is fair to permanent residents compared to temporary residents?	✓		
603	Overall in Chapter	Carol Bousquet	Recreation: Flagstaff is our playground, where are our Rec. facilities, development of rec. areas	✓		
604	Overall in "Economic Development" Chapter	F3 BOD ● And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	"The goals and policies should be reframed to state that we are seeking improvement in economic well-being of the community members. Businesses are some of the means to help achieve that. Start-up, attraction, retention, and expansion policies should explicitly express support ONLY for socially and environmentally just businesses, especially when supported through public funding.	✓		
605	Overall in "Neighborhoods & Community Character" Chapter	F3 BOD ● And endorsed via e-mail by Andrew Gould, Cynthia Johnson, Andy Bessler, Floye Bradford, Hilary Giovale, Sallie Kladnik	"Consider incentives for subletting to minimize sprawl and expand the affordable housing options.	✓		
606	General	Marilyn Weissman	Invasive plants: The policy requires developers/land owners while and after their projects are completed to be responsible for invasive species eradication along with revegetation when the cause of an infestation is their construction. (land disturbance is a big source of invasive species multiplication)	✓		See Natural Environment section
607	249-259	Eva Putzova	Neighborhoods and Community Character • Consider incentives for subletting to minimize sprawl and expand the affordable housing options. • Remove a policy that promotes accessory dwelling units (NH.3.2).	✓		duplicative
608	249	Staff	Where is the goal in the very front page "We need affordable housing". Define "neighborhood"		✓	Glossary
609	250	Bothands Public Policy	Serving Our Community's Housing Needs: As a community priority, <b>creating a greater mix of housing types...</b>		✓	
610	250	Staff	second paragraph: City of Flagstaff <b>federally funded</b> housing programs...		✓	
611	251	Staff	Conserving our urban character - goes with Neighborhood Conservation Efforts, p. 254		✓	

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
612	251	Bothands Public Policy	How do we manage...should be "Challenges"...add 'housing for the elderly, multi-generational families and downsizing'		✓	
613	252	Bothands Public Policy	18% second homes - stick to it and cite the source. This is typical of a university mountain town though lower than the national average.		✓	
614	253	Bothands Public Policy	Graphs - old data. Show trends, not just one year. Compare us to other places, not show amounts\$.		✓	
615	253	Carol Bousquet	Cite data source on all graphs		✓	
616	254	Bothands Public Policy	Neighborhood Conservation Efforts - means what? Neighborhood conservation efforts include...Photo not appropriate. "Community expectations challenges".		✓	
617	254-255	Bothands Public Policy	Not one person's role; do not put "County's role" - it is the private and public sectors's role to help make it happen. Acknowledge that the private sector builds the majority of all housing in the community.		✓	
618	255	NACA	"Special Needs" define and include mentally ill, add substance abuse or detox facility. Housing for non-market...first.	✓		Cannot begin to strategic plan
619	256	Bothands Public Policy	arrows at each end of graphics. Title graphic "Housing Continuum: Everyone is somewhere on this line". Note that we are listing all programs because it is a state statute requirement.		✓	graphic design
620	256	Duffie Westheimer	Suggest to have "Enforceable standards" rather than just "guidelines"	✓		
621	257	Duffie Westheimer	Goal NH.1. is vague and contradictory	✓		
622	258	Bothands Public Policy	downtown goal and policies are duplicates of "Land Use - Downtown" - just cross-reference to this section when referring to the downtown neighborhood.		✓	Cross - reference - check to make sure the policies in Land Use say this
623	258	Bothands Public Policy	Goal NH 3: A variety of housing types...is available; NH4: All housing is decent, safe, and sanitary. Make these GOALS, not action statements.		✓	GOAL Statement; Policy is an action
624	258	Duffie Westheimer	Goal NH.2 Sounds great but the policies are contradictory	✓		
625	258	NACA	Policy NH.3.2. need mmore explanation	✓		
626	258	Alex Wright	NH 2: Add policy 2.4: Encourage Native art and southwestern culture.		✓	Look in Community Character
627	258	Staffq	only one policy encouraging affordable housing in this whole document? That is not much to negotiate with	✓		
628	259	Bothands Public Policy	NH 6: Neighborhood conservation efforts... NH 6.1: Promote quality redevelopment and infill projects that are contextual with surrounding neighborhoods.		✓	
629	259	Duffie Westheimer	Policy NH.4.6 This policy is vague and not work well with another. What does "contextual" mean?	✓		
630	259	NACA	Add a policy to address mental illness and addiction.	✓		
631	259	Alex Wright	under "Eliminate homelessness" add a policy to address mental illness and addiction.	✓		
632	261	Carol Bousquet	Missing "Vision" block	✓		
633	261-281	Eva Putzova	<b>Economic Development</b> • The goals and policies should be reframed to state that we are seeking improvement in economic well-being of the community members. Businesses are some of the means to help achieve that • Start-up, attraction, retention, and expansion policies should explicitly express support ONLY for socially and environmentally just businesses, especially when supported through public funding. • Remove the word "flexibility" from ED 4.2.	✓		
634	261	Aaron ODonnell	Economic Development o The goals and policies should be reframed to state that we are seeking improvement in economic well-being of the community members. Businesses are some of the means to help achieve that o Start-up, attraction, retention, and expansion policies should explicitly express support ONLY for socially and environmentally just businesses, especially when supported through public funding	✓		
635			Growth is not nessecary to maintain financial stability. Please don't sell unessarily to make the quick buck. Promote stability, not growth! Reduce, Re-use, Recycle!	✓		
636	261	NACA	"BBB Sales tax income is greatly derive from surrounding tribes need to keep track of numbers (how many people) and \$\$ spent. "Flagstaff Chamber of Commerce grant to study Native American impact on our community.	✓		
637	261	Chamber of Commerce	Verify the number of businesses - 8,000 may contain duplicates and out-of-date or never opened business liscences. The introduction needs to use the concept that a strong business climate creates a strong community.	✓		
638	261	NACA	Bring the Native American Pow-Wow back. Stories of the Pow-Wow, year-round resources, respect the culture. Recognizing the importance of how casinos impact on our economy. Need a goal and policy regarding this.		✓	Goal of growth in cultural visual preforming arts, particularl of the Southwest culture. Policy: Develop a business plan for the annual Native American Pow-wow
639	261	NACA-Catherine Esquivel, Navajo	Responsible Government-Need to have diversity of representation on of the the commissions. 2nd, over 5000 people commute to Flagstaff...and about Native Americans commute daily from the Navajo Nation, some as far as Shonto, Red Lake, Kayenta. Shopping-Millions \$ from Native Americans is spent annually in Flagstaff for shopping, service and healthcare and they are not tourists. Art reflecting local history and culture. Omit 2nd & 3rd. The ordinances we, the five-fingered ones, made will effect the air, water and space that we share with the winged ones the 4 legged ones and... If our deliberations bring equality to all who reside within its boundaries, then it will also be fair for those who will be born 7 generations from now.		✓	Add policy in 'Responsible Government' - active recruitment of diverse cultural representation for all the committee vacancies
640	261	ED Staff	"healthcare manufacturing..." add advanced manufacturing and/or biomedical manufacturing		✓	
641	262	NACA	Repeat from 3 pages before!		✓	
642	262	Chamber of Commerce	Where does "agriculture and regional food" fit into the second paragraph? This is not a concept that is prevelant in economic circles we work with. Emphasis on small business growth and success should be more prevelant.	✓		It is a community-wide accepted and promoted concept
643	262	ED Staff	2010 data? Please use more current data		✓	
644	263	NACA	Add Hopi Tribe Economic Council, Navajo Nation Economic Dev Council, Navajo Nation Chamber of Commerce, Navajo Nation Small Business Center. Resource committee? Add Arizona Native American Business. Add AZ Assoc of Economic Developers Tribal Committee. Center for American Indian Econ Dev @ NAU. Native American Council for Community Action.		✓	
645	264	CSF	Policy ED.1.1. add "where they are potentially an effective tool" at the end.		✓	
646	264	Chamber of Commerce	Under "Education and Workforce Training", add manufacturing to the list of business catagories; delete "well established" labor forced and substitute "high quality".		✓	
647	266	ED Staff	Charts should use more regular ranges (ex. \$5,000)		✓	
648	268	Chamber of Commerce	There is no "Flagstaff Middle School" - delete		✓	
649	268	Chamber of Commerce	Private and Charter schools information is from 1999. Use a recent statistic that relates to our community and our private and charter school current, accurate enrollment.		✓	
650	269	Chamber of Commerce	Delete "Southwest Windpower" as large manufacturing employer. IML has 35 employees - large? "Gore" needs to be "W.L. Gore and Associates".		✓	
651	269	Chamber of Commerce	Arrange Public sector employers by ranking (# of employees) - Northern Arizona University would be first.		✓	
652	270	Chamber of Commerce	It is "Northern Arizona University" - not Northern Arizona State University.		✓	
653	270	ED Staff	CCC - 2,600 studentsin FLG then square feet in page - use both students or square feet to compare. There are more than 2,600 students.		✓	
654	271	Chamber of Commerce	For the all the goals and policies in Economic Development - need to use terms such as "creating a business friendly climate", "creating a strong business climate", 'working closely with the private sector to create jobs'. There is too much focus on the government sector? Or it just reads that way.		✓	
655	274/275	NACA	Economic Dev: if a business advertises with Native cultural symbols, or "for Native Americans" this business needs to consult NAACA, use diversity committee "pubicly vetted over 2 week process.	✓		Regulatory
656	275	NACA	If a business advertises "Native American jewelry or _____", we need to develop a Northern Arizona (NAZ) Certification of REALLY Native American Made.	✓		Regulatory
657	275	Alex Wright	Policy needed: any signs referring to Native American culture should go through a public review process. See NACA 274 above.	✓		Regulatory
658	275	Alex Wright	Policy needed: recognize the importance of Native arts in economic development and foster the accessibility of venues for Native art events. See NAACA ED / Recreation suggestion below.	✓		See goal addition #638

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
659	276	Alex Wright	<b>Policy needed:</b> balance future growth with tribal, cultural and natural resources.		✓	CAC like policy - requested this to be reviewed by City Attorney's office
660	276	Alex Wright	<b>Policy needed:</b> the utmost good faith shall always be observed towards Tribes, tribal land, rights and liberties shall never be disturbed without consent.		✓	<b>New Policy ED 3.9 - Support and encourage Native American heritage and culture as contributors to the region's economy.</b> <i>Could this be in the introductory text?</i>
	276	Alex Wright	Policy ED 3.10 - (to replace ED 1.67) - Promote the development of infrastructure for job growth, including telecommunications: access to high-speed internet community-wide.		✓	Agreed - This was added 7/15/13 after reviewing notes.
693	ED/Recreation	NAACA	Need for a Cultural Park (land, publicly owned property) for recreation, Pow-Wow, Rodeo, Native American Appreciation day. Like Gallup NM and Gathering of Nations in Albuquerque, dancers from around the world. Picture Canyon area? Developing space for activities, camping facilities, & late night drumming-parade of wagons. View of the Peaks. Make it colorful, celebrate diversity and take the load off of the Peaks.	✓		See goal addition #638
661	278	County Planning Staff	Activity Centers should be combined with "Land Use - Activity Centers"		✓	
662	280	County Planning Staff	Redevelopment section should be combined with "Land Use-Reinvestment" section		✓	
663	280	ED Staff	Revitalization toolbox to "Land Use" Revitalization section. "Redevelopment and Infill" is "Reinvestment"		✓	
664	289	CSF	In Goal REC.1. add "and grow" after "Maintain"		✓	
665	289	CSF	After Policy REC.1.2. add a new policy to coordinate City, County and Forest Service recreational planning.		✓	<b>New Policy Rec 1.3 - Coordinate City, County and Forest Service recreational planning to best serve the community.</b>
666	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"They work for the people."	✓		
667	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Locally owned businesses contribute greatly to our community's character and personality. Locally owned businesses seem fragile and easily displaced by the soon to open REI, as well as BIG 5, Dunkin Donuts, Chik Fillet, etc. I and my friends in the outdoor gear business can expect to be hit hard if not put out of business by REI's location here. Hence, the lousy joke "Poverty with a View" continues. It saddens me how many friends and neighbors have had to (or soon will have to) pack up and move because their small business couldn't stay open with the large corporations moving in."	✓		
668	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"The cost of development may be a problem, and a feasible, realistic plan need to be considered now to make funding possible."	✓		
669	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Our quality of life has declined in Flagstaff over the last 20 years due to greed and over development"	✓		
670	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Cost is important to both the developer & to the community. Its a great balance of keeping the cost appropriate for the developer while providing a benefit to the community. (waterline extensions, utilities, etc.)"	✓		
671	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Economic development truly defines a city. Our entire society has changed dramatically in the past 30 years due to the monopolization of large business that control our shopping choices. Clean business/industry must be attracted and negotiated. Infill is absolutely necessary to decrease auto traffic and increase personal/cultural satisfaction. The role of the government, and not an easy one, must be to manage the wants of many into viable realities for all."	✓		
672	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"In order to meet the high cost of living in Flagstaff, serious attention to how existing jobs can improve and how new jobs can be fostered are very important. We are a tourism gateway which can bring in plenty of funds for further development. We are also an enterprising community full of small businesses and local color. The Flagstaff municipal government and nonprofit partners can facilitate small businesses development while making the community more enticing for tourists to visit and spend their money here. Many Flagstaff residents are capable and determined, if given the appropriate tools I believe small businesses could continue to grow. "Business attraction," while significant, may only impact a small group of new employees; it is important to experiment with broad, grassroots economic growth that positively impacts all or most of Flagstaff."	✓		
673	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"because my housing needs are not being met. It is too expensive to live and I hope this plan will make it possible for low-income single mothers to make ends meet."	✓		
674	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I'm planning to raise my family here, I want to know we'll have good options of where to live."	✓		
675	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Helps to improve the area in which my children will grow up in!!! It will allow more opportunities for them in the very near future to come."	✓		
676	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Because we are currently running in to a problem were we make to little working full time yet cannot afford housing because there is not enough affordable housing."	✓		
677	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Where we live and what we can gain from our neighborhoods impacts everything else we do on a daily basis."	✓		
678	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I want Flagstaff to support low and middle income families by having supportive communities and affordable housing developments."	✓		
679	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I think some of the recent housing developments have the character of 1950's Moscow."	✓		
680	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"The City has made it very difficult to develop land in the City with all the regulations and requirements."	✓		
681	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I want to see the historic neighborhoods preserved AND improved at the same time. I want local people to be able to afford nice, safe and energy efficient housing, grow local food and be proud of where they live."	✓		
682	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"I believe in the vision of Flagstaff to continue to cherish our resources but find a way to make living here affordable"	✓		
683	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"Neighborhoods tend to get taken over by new development and multi story housing."	✓		
684	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"My neighborhood is rapidly changing and not necessarily for the better"	✓		
685	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"We want to ensure that all members of the Flagstaff community have the opportunity to live in safe and healthy environments. We need to ensure that all neighborhoods are attractive and desirable for a cross-section of the population."	✓		
686	Why/Open Ended	Public Online Survey	"An aggressive plan to meet Flagstaff's housing needs is important. As we try and figure out what the future of Flagstaff looks like, we have to plan our neighborhoods, our homes, and our access to services around those goals. This is an expensive community and will likely continue to be. Housing that meets the needs of residents first should be one of the number one planning doctrines for the community. Planning that guides developers and housing rehab in smart, effective ways should be heavily emphasized."	✓		
687	Goals & Policies	County Public Health	Goal NH 3 & Policy ED 4.7 "Economic status is one of the most powerful correlates to an individual's health. Lower economic status individuals are prone to stress, lack of access to care, and a less nutritious diet. Ensuring affordable housing and encouraging livable wage jobs for all socio-economic groups can take the stress out of "just getting by" and free up money to pay for healthcare and healthy foods."	✓		
688	Goals & Policies	County P&Z	Goal NH.3. "Make Goals NH.3 and NH.4 Policies under the following new Goal: Ensure high quality, affordable and energy efficient housing."	✓		
689		NACA	Economic Development/Tourism: promote a CULTURAL CENTER for annual Pow-wow; regional rodeo association; large concerts and events; work with Navajo Nation (Now: Holbrook, Window Rock, Farmington's indoor arena) Regional Finals, need indoor arena, Twin Arrows?	✓		
690	Goals & Policies	County P&Z	<b>Policy ED.3.1. "Assure community access to high speed internet.</b> This is the basis of many jobs that pay well and consume few resources."		✓	<b>ED 3.10 - Infrastructure development to assure community access to high-speed internet and telecommunications.</b>
691	Goals & Policies	County P&Z	Policy ED.4.2. "Evaluate potential City support for new businesses based on their impact on goals relating to low water use and reducing greenhouse gas production."	✓		
692	Goals & Policies	County Public Health	Policy Rec 1.1 " Having safe public spaces for recreation, community building, and exercise are key in relieving stress and increasing physical fitness. We highly comment the City for actively promoting the mental and physical health of its citizens through the creation and maintenance of walk-able and bike-able, connected city parks."	✓		

## Appendix

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
693	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Need appendix which states the data, data sources and methodologies for all three Natural Environment maps in Regional maps.	✓		
694	Overall in Chapter	P&Z	Appendix: List of data sets & cite sources		✓	
695	290	Carol Bousquet	Note: Appendices are not a part of the adopted and ratified plan but are references for resources. Subject to update separate from a regional plan amendment.		✓	
696	Appendix A	NACA	Include studies from nearby/adjacent jurisdictions such as the Hopi Tribe's "1-40 Corridor Economic Development Feasibility Study" and other pertinent regional plans from the Navajo Nation, etc.		✓	
697	Appendix B	Carol Bousquet	Are we going to vet the strategies or put in a disclaimer? "Possible Strategies..."		✓	
698	App.B.p.300	CSF	Second paragraph under Overall Wildlife Strategies: belongs somewhere else.		✓	
699	App. B p.300	CSF	Comments on Overall Wildlife Strategies: "All Guidelines for Development refer to a map that is not in the Regional Plan at this time. Possible ways to correct this are to include the map of natural resources referred to in the Guidelines in the Plan, on line, or both. My preference would be both. Bruce Higgins has pointed out that including the map in the plan entails the problem of how to encourage readers to use the map on line which will be more current. I agree that is a problem. But I think it is more of a problem to refer many times to a map that is not in the Plan. Perhaps there could be language directing the reader to the map on line in the introduction to the Guidelines for Development on page 46. And perhaps a statement that the map will be continually updated in its on line version can be on the map itself. Susan Bean refers to this map as the Significant Natural Resources: Wildlife, Vegetation, Hydrology, and Geology Map. Updating this map on line could be added to Policy LU.2.2 or could be a strategy under that policy.		✓	
700	App.B.p.300	CSF	Under OS.1.1. Strategies #1 add: county comprehensive plan as a guiding document.		✓	
701	App.B.p.300	CSF	Under OS.1.1. Strategies #4 change the words "clearly to "accurately", "as means" to "a tool"		✓	
702	App.B. p.301	CSF	Drop the first strategy on top of the page under OS.1.1.		✓	
703	App.B.p.301	CSF	Under OS.1.2./ Strategy #3 substitute "Picture Canyon" to "Observatory Mesa" and riparian sites		✓	
704	App.B.p.302	CSF	WR.1.2. under Strategies #1 add "and watershed" after "forest health"		✓	
705	App.B.p.302	CSF	WR.2.2. add "potable" before "water"; it reads: and cost-effective potable water.		✓	
706	App.B.p.307	CSF	CC.1.3. under strategy #1 "Environmental Features to Protect" map different than "Concentration of natural resources" map? If so - how?		✓	
707			Under Overall Heritage Preservation Strategies: Establish and archaeological sensitivity map		✓	
708	App.B.p.319	CSF	CC.4.8. Add strategy that promotes protection of native plants and animals, including Gunnison's prairie dogs, Mexican voles, and pocket gophers. This policy would state that non-lethal control methods should be employed if these species are perceived to be a threat (substantiated or unsubstantiated) to the landscaping. Strategy #4 add: 'storage containers' before 'building', and #5 add 'native plant' after 'low-water'		✓	
709	App.B.p.310	CSF	Under CC.3.1. Strategies #1 change Fort Valley Road to " Fort Valley Road Gateway Corridor"		✓	
710	App. B. p. 311	CSF	Under Policy LU.2.2. There should be a policy that the City of Flagstaff will have an Urban Wildlife Planner.		✓	
711	App. B. p. 326	CSF	Under Overall Strategies to support Goal PF.1.: New Goal: Provide a science based, ongoing assessment of the region's vulnerability to regional climate change and the possible mitigation measures. - There is redundancy among these important strategies. This list should be tightened up and the major points should become goals and/or policies.		✓	
712	App. B p. 331	CSF	In the first strategy under Policy NH.3.5. which is "Utilize city and county owned land for affordable housing development, where appropriate." add "Assess the suitability of existing city and county owned land for suitability for affordable housing, opens space FUTS and other public uses prior to taking any action on those properties." And we would like to see a strategy that encourages the City to keep an up-to-date inventory of all City-owned parcels, that includes why they were acquired, whether that purpose is still germane, and their relative values for open space, affordable housing, administrative use, other public use or sale. With the latter, that should be done through a public process. Not sure where it should go; maybe Land Use. It's really "good (open) government."		✓	
713	Appendixes	Staff	Annual Report will outline measurements to be included in report and as live data kept and communicated on-line.		✓	

## Visuals

Edit #	Page #	Source	Edit/Comment	No Change Needed	Send to Editor	Change Recommended
714	Maps	Staff	All reference maps will need to be a two-page spread with high resolution, clear legend and references to it.		✓	
715	p.45/46	AZ Game & Fish	Add comment about how these maps "created with input from natural resource professionals from a variety of disciplines		✓	
716	Maps	Staff	Each map will need to be numbered, with a "List of maps" in the front or appendix		✓	
717	Maps	Staff	Growth Illustration Map:		✓	
718	Maps	Staff	one to FMPO boundary showing the county areas,		✓	
719	Maps	Staff	include rural growth boundary,		✓	
720	Maps	Staff	open space issues,		✓	
721	Maps	Staff	Belmont private property		✓	
722	Maps	Staff	Natural Resources Map		✓	
723	Maps	Staff	Refer to "how to use this map" and "guidelines for development (not developers)		✓	
724	Maps	Staff	Natural Concentration Map		✓	
725	Maps	Conservaytion Study Forum	Corrections on label Sections 5, 6, and 7 among private, National Forest, County, and State Land Dept.		✓	
726	Maps	Staff	Explain what the natural resources are and how to apply the map; explain how to use guidelines with these maps.		✓	
727	Charts/Graphs	Staff	Charts / graphs: use the same style - not 17 styles - please see Melbourne Plan and SEDI Sustainable Community Indicators (SCIP) report - these are consistent, easy-to read graphs and charts		✓	
728	Charts/Graphs	Staff	All charts needs dates and data source cited		✓	
729	Charts/Graphs	Staff	All charts need to be related to the text they are next to		✓	
730	Charts/Graphs	Staff	p. 232 chart - what is this?		✓	
731	Charts/Graphs	Staff	p. 82 water chart - larger and needs to be explained in the text. Many other sections can refer back to this chart, for example in discussing development constraints and in natural resources vs. development		✓	
732	Photographs	Staff	Full page photos - only use three - one for "Land", "Place" and "People". And these need to be the BEST photo examples		✓	
733	Photographs	Staff	photos need to reflect our community demographics - more of other races than white, not so many university students		✓	
734	Photographs	Staff	Photos need to thoughtfully reflect the text they are next to - they tell the story as well as the words		✓	
735	Photographs	Staff	Have fewer photos but concentrate on those which are meaningful to our community		✓	
736	Photographs	Staff	No skewed photos		✓	
737	Photographs	Staff	CITE all photos - where, who, etc. - relevant to the text - why are you showing this photo?		✓	