



# MINUTES

## City of Flagstaff

### HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, November 20, 2013

---

Flagstaff City Hall, **Staff Conference Room**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Michelle Book 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

#### CALL TO ORDER

Commissioner Paradis called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Tom Paradis, Chair, [present](#)  
Phil Scandura, Vice Chair, [present](#)  
Lynne Corbin, [present](#)  
Jonathan Day, [present](#)  
Laurel Dunn, [present](#)  
Rich Rummel, [present](#)  
David Zimmerman, [excused absence](#)

#### CITY STAFF:

Karl Eberhard, Staff Liaison, [present](#)  
Michelle Book, Recording Secretary, [present](#)

Others Present: [Brian Kulina](#), [Tiffany Antol](#), [Patty Luttrell](#), [Tim Martinez](#), [Mike Pullen](#), [Debbie Farnam](#), [Larami Sandlen](#), [Jacqita Bailey](#), and [John McCulloch](#)

### I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

#### 1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

[Patti Luttrell](#) – presented and read a letter to the commission.

#### 2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

[None](#)

### 3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

Regular Meeting of October 16, 2013

#### **MOTION:**

Commissioner Rummel made a motion to accept the October 16, 2013 regular meeting minutes. Commissioner Corbin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

## **II. OLD BUSINESS**

(Continued, postponed, and tabled items.)

### 1. Landmark Designation – Picture Canyon

Address:	None
Assessor's Parcel Number:	113-06-003
Property Owner:	City of Flagstaff
Applicant:	Heritage Preservation Commission
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 113-06-003.

This is a request to rezone parcel 113-06-003 (Picture Canyon) to the Landmarks Overlay **Zone**. This would make future development on the property subject to the Design Standards and Guidelines of the Landmarks Overlay Zone and subject to approval by the Heritage Preservation Commission. The recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission, along with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission, will be presented to the City Council for use in their review and consideration of the rezoning request. A Staff Report has been prepared for this item; was distributed to the Commission under separate cover; and is available for public review at the Historic Preservation Office (City Hall). This Public Hearing was noticed by mail and newspaper advertisements and serves as the Public Participation Meeting of the re-zoning process.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 113-06-003.

**See item 3 for motion.**

### 2. Landmark Designation – DeBeau Motel and Sign

Address:	19 W. Phoenix Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-41-014
Property Owner:	Hillside Enterprises, LLC
Applicant:	Heritage Preservation Commission
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 100-41-014.

This is a request to rezone parcel 100-41-014 (DeBeau Motel and Sign) to the Landmarks Overlay **Zone**. **This** would make future development on the property subject to the Design Standards and Guidelines of the Landmarks Overlay Zone and subject to approval by the Heritage Preservation **Commission**. **The** property is a contributing structure of the Flagstaff Southside National Register Historic District. The recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission, along with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission, will be presented to the City Council for use in their review and consideration of the rezoning request. A Staff Report has been prepared for this item; was distributed to the Commission under separate cover; and is available for public review at the Historic Preservation Office (City **Hall**). **This** Public Hearing was noticed by mail and newspaper advertisements and serves as the Public Participation Meeting of the re-zoning process.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 100-41-014.

**See item 3 for motion.**

**3. Landmark Designation – Yaeger Residence Outbuilding**

Address:	515 N. San Francisco Street
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	101-09-006B
Property Owner:	Jacquita Bailey
Applicant:	Heritage Preservation Commission
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 101-09-006B.

This is a request to rezone parcel 101-09-006B (Yaeger Residence Outbuilding) to the Landmarks Overlay **Zone**. **This** would make future development on the property subject to the Design Standards and Guidelines of the Landmarks Overlay Zone and subject to approval by the Heritage Preservation **Commission**. **The** property is a contributing structure of the North End Residential National Register Historic District. The recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission, along with a recommendation from the Planning and Zoning Commission, will be presented to the City Council for use in their review and consideration of the rezoning request. A Staff Report has been prepared for this item; was distributed to the Commission under separate cover; and is available for public review at the Historic Preservation Office (City **Hall**). **This** Public Hearing was noticed by mail and newspaper advertisements and serves as the Public Participation Meeting of the re-zoning process.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to parcel 101-09-006B.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Corbin made a motion to recommend that the City Council apply the Landmarks Overlay Zone to the following parcels:

- Picture Canyon parcel 113-06-003.
- DeBeau Motel and Sign parcel 100-41-014.
- Yaeger Residence Outbuilding parcel 101-09-006B.

Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

### **III. NEW BUSINESS**

#### **1. Certificate of No Effect – 214 N. Bonito Street**

Address:	214 N. Bonito Street
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-12-003B
Property Owner:	Robert and Erica Moran
Applicant:	Larami Sandlin
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval – Certificate of No Effect.

This is a proposal for renovations to an existing 850 SF outbuilding (guest house) including a new roof monitor and changes to the windows and exterior finishes. The project is located in the Townsite Overlay Zone (historic **district**). The main structure and the outbuilding are NOT contributing structures of the Townsite National Register Historic **District**. A Cultural Resource Study was not required for this application. Site photographs and Sketch-up simulations were distributed to the Commission under separate cover and are available for public review at the Historic Preservation Office (City Hall). This Public Hearing was noticed by on-site posting on November 4, 2013.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve – Certificate of No Effect with the condition that the design be modified to comply with the height requirements of the district.

#### **MOTION:**

Commissioner Day made a motion to approve certificate of no effect with the condition that the design be modified to comply with the district height requirements.

Commissioner Dunn seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

#### **2. Certificate of Appropriateness – Weatherford Hotel**

Address:	23 N. Leroux Street
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-20-026
Property Owner:	Henry Taylor
Applicant:	Tim Whiteside, JWA Architects
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval – Certificate Appropriateness.

This is a proposal for renovations and additions to an existing historic hotel including additional reconstruction of the balcony on the north elevation; an addition on the west (rear) elevation providing vertical circulation; lobby renovations including

storefront changes; and other exterior alterations. The project is located in the Historic Overlay Zone (downtown historic **district**). The property is a contributing structure of the Railroad Addition National Register Historic **District**. A Cultural Resource Study was not required for this application. The project was previously approved by the Commission, however the approval expired and the design has been altered.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve – Certificate of Appropriateness.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Scandura made a motion to approve certificate of appropriateness with the condition that the sign be excluded from approval, the stucco is to resemble old looking stucco in texture and color, and the brick is to be red like the existing sandstone, not shiny, and not “crisp” – meaning not tumbled but not rigid “new” look either.

Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**3. Certificate of Appropriateness – Monte Vista Hotel / Rendezvous Sign**

Address:	100 N. San Francisco Street
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	101-19-005
Property Owner:	James Craven
Applicant:	Sean McMahan
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval – Certificate Appropriateness.

This is a proposal for a new neon sign, albeit relocating and using an older sign cabinet. While signs are typically approved by the HPO through the consent process, the Commission has previously denied neon signs that are not on Route 66 and not “auto-oriented” and has directed that all neon signs be reviewed by the full Commission. The project is located in the Historic Overlay Zone (downtown historic district). The property is a contributing structure of the Railroad Addition National Register Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve – Certificate of Appropriateness if appropriate.

**Motion:**

Commissioner Rummel made a motion to approve – Certificate of Appropriateness if appropriate with the condition that Mr. Eberhard review on consent – use original building mount; keep original neon border, and background of sign be painted red to match the building.

Commissioner Dunn seconded the motion; the motion passed via majority vote.

**4. Historic Facades and Signs Grant – DeBeau Motel Sign**

Address:	19 W. Phoenix Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-41-014
Property Owner:	Hillside Enterprises, LLC
Applicant:	John and Lisa McCulloch
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval – \$2,750 in HF&S Grant Funding.

This is a request to fund refurbishment of the historic sign and sign tower including re-painting and neon **repair**. HF&S Grants cover 50% of costs and the Applicant has provided an estimate for the work in the amount of **\$2,622.94**. The property is a contributing structure of the Flagstaff Southside National Register Historic **District**. At this time, it is anticipated that the Historic Preservation Officer will approve the work (Certificate of No Effect) under a separate application.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve \$1,311.48 in HF&S Grant funding with a condition that funds not collected in one year are forfeit.

Karl suggested app be withdrawn and resubmitted as a completed app.

[The applicant agreed to withdraw and resubmit the application at a later time.](#)

**5. Historic Facades and Signs Grant – 220 W. Birch Street**

Address:	220 W. Birch Street
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-10-014
Property Owner:	William Ring
Applicant:	Tim Whiteside, JWA Architects
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval - \$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding.

This is a request to fund the replacement of historic and non-historic windows with historically sensitive energy efficient wood **windows**. HF&S Grants cover 50% of costs and the Applicant has provided an estimate for the work in the amount of **\$23,870.62**. The property is located in the Townsite Overlay Zone (historic district) and is a contributing structure of the Townsite National Register Historic **District**. At this time, it is anticipated that the Historic Preservation Officer will approve the work (Certificate of No Effect) under a separate application.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve \$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding with a condition that funds not collected in one year are forfeit.

**MOTION:**

[Commissioner Day made a motion to approve \\$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding with a condition that funds not collected in one year are forfeit.](#)

Commissioner Rummel seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**6. Historic Facades and Signs Grant – Switzer Building**

Address:	17 N. San Francisco Street
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-20-016
Property Owner:	Switzer Building Group, LLC
Applicant:	Mitch Walzer, JWA Architects
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of \$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding.

This is a request to fund the replacement of historic windows with historically sensitive energy efficient wood **windows**. HF&S Grants cover 50% of costs and the Applicant has provided an estimate for the work in the amount of **\$30,663.97**. The property is located in the Historic Overlay Zone (downtown historic district) and is a contributing structure of the Railroad Addition National Register Historic **District**. At this time, it is anticipated that the Historic Preservation Officer will approve the work (Certificate of No Effect) under a separate application.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve \$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding with a condition that funds not collected in one year are forfeit.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Scandura made a motion to approve \$10,000 in HF&S Grant funding with a condition that funds not collected in one year are forfeit.

Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**7. Archeological Cultural Resource Study – Number 1**

Address:	Confidential
Assessor's Parcel Number:	Confidential
Property Owner:	Little America Refining Co.
Applicant:	David Scholl, Vintage Partners, LLC
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Acceptance – Phase I Cultural Resource Study.

The Applicant anticipates significant earthwork in association with the proposed development of this undeveloped land. For this work, Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050 requires the preparation of a Cultural Resource Study to evaluate the presence, significance, and integrity of the resources; to identify impacts of the proposed work on significant resources; and to prescribe mitigation measures for major impacts. The Commission can reject the report and require additional research and documentation; reject the report and require additional mitigation measures; accept the report, finding that the impacts have been sufficiently mitigated; or accept the report conditioned on the development and implementation of additional mitigation measures.

The report finds that while some limited historic resources are present, none are significant, and the author recommends no further action.

A link to the confidential report has been sent to the Commission under separate cover. **Note** that information identifying locations of archeological resources, including the report, is privileged and should not be shared with unauthorized persons. Place information is thus omitted from this agenda. While a hardcopy of the report is on file in the Historic Preservation Office (City Hall), as an archeological report (including specific locations of sites), it is not a public document.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Review and accept the Phase I Cultural Resource Study.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Rummel made a motion to review and accept the Phase I Cultural Resource Study.

Commissioner Scandura seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**8. Historic Cultural Resource Study – Tourist Home**

Address:	52 S. San Francisco Street
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	103-08-001B
Property Owner:	John A. Martinez, LLC
Applicant:	Tim Martinez
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Acceptance – Phase I Cultural Resource Study.

The Applicant anticipates submitting for a Demolition Permit for the subject structure. For this work, Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050 requires the preparation of a Cultural Resource Study to evaluate the significance and integrity of the structure(s), to identify impacts of the proposed work on significant resources, and to prescribe mitigation measures for major **impacts**. The Commission can reject the report and require additional research and documentation; reject the report and require additional mitigation measures; accept the report, finding that the impacts have been sufficiently



mitigated; or accept the report conditioned on the development and implementation of additional mitigation **measures**. Preparation of a **Phase II** Cultural Resource Study is the required standard mitigation measure when total destruction is **proposed**. The property is a contributing structure of the Flagstaff Southside National Register Historic District.

Due to the length of the report (file size), it is not attached but can be downloaded by clicking [here](#). A hardcopy is on file in the Historic Preservation Office (City Hall) for Commissioner and public review.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Review and accept the Phase I Cultural Resource Study and require that a Phase II Cultural Resource Study be prepared as recommended by the author.

**Motion:**

Commissioner Corbin made a motion to accept the Phase I Cultural Resource study and require that a Phase II Cultural Resource Study be prepared as recommended by the author.

Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**IV. CONCLUDING GENERAL BUSINESS**

**1. REPORTS**

- a. Staff Report – Review of projects approved by staff consent.

**2. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: December 18, 2013

[\(Cancelled for holiday per Mr. Eberhard\)](#)

- b. Future Agenda Items

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 6:12 p.m. by unanimous consent.