



Approved Minutes

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, May 20, 2015

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

Staff Liaison asked commissioner Scandura to Chair the meeting due to Chair Zimmerman's and Day's excused attendance. Commissioner Scandura agreed and called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm. Vice-Chair Day arrived at 4:05 pm.

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

David Zimmerman, Chair, *excused*
Jonathan Day, Vice-Chair, *present, late*
Phil Scandura, *present*
Laurel Dunn, *present*
Josh Edwards, *present*
Jean Hockman, *present*
Lynne Corbin, *present*

CITY STAFF:

Karl Eberhard, Staff Liaison, *present*
Creag Znetko, Recording Secretary, *present*

Others in Attendance:

Betsey Emery, Robert Breunig, Annie Lutes, Josh Whiting, Lauren Clementino, Pat Stein, Bruce Phillips, Duffie Westheimer, Lynn Neal, and Stewart Deats

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. *(At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)*

Annie Lutes commented on the Historic Preservation Conference and that it went well. She also wanted to thank the HPO for his involvement in the coordination of the conference and teachings he gave.

Ms. Lutes also asked the HPC if working sessions for archeological studies could be warranted for future meetings.

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

Mr. Eberhard announced that Item III New Business, Items 1 & 2 be presented together as they pertain to the same project. Mr. Eberhard also announced that Chair ~~Zimmerman~~ Edwards is excused and asked Commissioner Scandura to chair the meeting. The announcement that the meeting is being streamed live was made as well.

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES

a. Regular Meeting of April 15, 2015

Motion:

Commissioner Corbin motioned to approve the April 18, 2015 minutes as written. Commissioner Dunn seconded the motion. The motion passed by unanimous consent.

II. OLD BUSINESS

(Continued, postponed, and tabled items.)

1. Historic Resource Study – 822 W. Route 66

Address:	822 W. Route 66
Assessor's Parcel Number:	103-02-020
Property Owner:	Williams & Associates
Applicant:	Lynn Neal, EnviroSystems
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Accept Historic Resource Study

The applicant has documented that the building is less than 50 years old and that a Cultural Resource Study is not required. However, they have elected to produce a Phase I Cultural Resource Study. The applicant has also concluded that the structure does not meet the criteria for significance which contradicts previous National Park Service documentation.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

Applicant presented on topic with documentation regarding input from the commission during the April 15, 2015, meeting. Applicant has revised the study to reflect guidance given by commissioners apropos to the more recent documentation concerning the historic significance of the building. Commissioners thanked the applicant for the exhaustive research that was presented.

Staff reminded the commission that this study should only meet local requirements and that a debate about eligibility is not warranted.

Commissioners discussed with applicant the concerns for documenting the buildings with plans and drawings. Commission acknowledges the demolition of the building will not cease, but would like to ensure historical relevant documents are available and safeguarded for future reference.

Commission and applicant discussed findings in the more recent documentation and applicant expressed the information in those documents may not be appropriate to consider for this study based on the fact that some of the information was not researched exhaustively, but taken from other unfinished documents.

Commissioners responded and asked about verbiage in the study that pertains to the integrity of the building and whether or not the building should be considered significant in the NHRP. Discussion ensued regarding significance, what criterion should be met, what architectural changes have been made, and how Interstate 40 has bypassed that area of Route 66. During the discussion, it was revealed that the study submitted to the commission was not the most recent version. Applicant stated some of the language was reformed, but did not resubmit a copy to the HPO or the commission. The commission was concerned about not having an opportunity to review the latest version of the study. Staff liaison also conveyed discomfort about not receiving the revised copy of the study.

Motion:

Commissioner Edwards cited Flagstaff Zoning Code 5 a (1), that the cultural resource study presented was indeterminate for the commission and motioned to continue the item since the commission's assessment for cultural resource significance is indeterminate and a phase 2 study be required. Vice-Chair Day seconded the motion; the motion to continue passed unanimously.

III. NEW BUSINESS

1. Historic Resource Study - Museum of Northern Arizona

Address:	3101 N. Fort Valley Road
Assessor's Parcel Number:	111-01-001F
Property Owner:	Museum of Northern Arizona
Applicant:	Robert Breunig
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Accept Historic Resource Study

This is a proposal to remodel approximately 3,000 SF and add approximately 1,200 SF to the existing exhibition building. The building is listed on the National register of Historic Places and is located in the Flagstaff Landmark Overlay Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

Mr. Breunig presented on topic stating the Museum has received a large temporary collection of Hopi Kachina Dolls that would be displayed with some of the older collection. The current square footage of the Kiva will not accommodate the design of the display. Commission and applicant discussed concerns. Vice-Chair Day has recused himself from this vote due to conflict of interest.

Motion:

Commissioner Corbin moved to accept the Historic Resource Study. Commissioner Edwards seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously with one recusal.

2. Certificate of Appropriateness - Museum of Northern Arizona

Address:	3101 N. Fort Valley Road
Assessor's Parcel Number:	111-01-001F
Property Owner:	Museum of Northern Arizona
Applicant:	Robert Breunig
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

This is a proposal to remodel approximately 3,000 SF and add approximately 1,200 SF to the existing exhibition building. The building is listed on the National register of Historic Places and is located in the Flagstaff Landmark Overlay Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Breunig presented on topic stating the Museum has received a large temporary collection of Hopi Kachina Dolls that would be displayed with some of the older collection. The current square footage of the Kiva will not accommodate the design of the display. Commission and applicant discussed concerns. Vice-Chair Day has recused himself from this vote due to conflict of interest.

Motion:

Commissioner Corbin moved to accept the Certificate of Appropriateness. Commissioner Edwards seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously with one recusal.

3. Certificate of Appropriateness – Picture Canyon Natural and Cultural Preserve

Address: El Paso Flagstaff Road
Assessor's Parcel Number: 113-06-004
Property Owner: City of Flagstaff
Applicant: McKenzie Jones, Sustainability Specialist
City Staff: Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

This is a proposal to improve facilities and restoration including removing debris, naturalizing illegal roads, installing a gate, treating invasive weeds, fabricating and installing trail signs, installing stone benches, fabricating new informational kiosks, finishing a parking area, installing a wayfinding sign on Townsend Winona, and constructing a new trail. A large portion of the property is listed on the National register of Historic Places and is located in the Flagstaff Landmark Overlay Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

Applicant presented on topic with discussion ensuing about the land being city or state owned, fencing materials to be used, situated in the overlay district, joint efforts between Coconino County and the Forest Service, and having requirements being explained about work performed on land in the [NRHPNHRP](#). The second part of the certificate had not been completed prior to the commission meeting. Vice-Chair Day suggested the project was worthy and could be given to the HPO for consent once the certificate was finished.

Motion:

Vice-Chair Day moved to approve the certificate of appropriateness on the condition that finished document is approved by consent by the HPO. Commissioner Corbin seconded the motion; the motion passed by unanimous consent.

4. Discussion – Flagstaff Zoning Code Update

Applicant: Roger Eastman, Zoning Code Administrator
City Staff: Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Discuss and provide comment.

This is a discussion of proposed changes to the Zoning Code, primarily as they pertain to Heritage Preservation. With some exceptions, most changes are minor in nature.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Discuss and provide comment

Staff presented on topic and acknowledged changes made to the current Zoning Code that staff felt would be specific to the commission's duties. There was discussion about verbiage changing and the current Zoning Code needing to be updated. Staff assured commission that changes are for clarification of issues

that have been brought up in the past and will be stated more clearly in the revised code. Commission appreciates the City's work on this and is confident the changes are appropriate. There was discussion only.

IV. CONCLUDING GENERAL BUSINESS

1. REPORTS

- a. Staff Report – Review of projects approved by staff consent.

Staff reported the following items as approved by consent:

- a. Cultural Resource Study Letter Report at 6820 N Rain Valley Rd homesite.
- b. Application for Permanent Sign, Late for the Train, 22 E Birch Ave.
- c. Certificate of Appropriateness, Museum of Northern Arizona, 2101 N Fort Valley Rd., for re-paving of existing east parking lot, paving the existing southeast gravel parking area and improving existing pedestrian walkways on the east and south sides of the building.

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- Information Announcements: Vice-Chair Day announced escrow will close on grandma's house the following day.
 - a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: June 17, 2015
 - b. Future Agenda Items
- Vice-Chair Day asked for "as built" to be defined and added on as a future agenda item.
- Commissioner ~~Dunn~~Corbin asked for a handbook, guideline reference guide, or something similar to refer to for policies and procedures be added as a future agenda item.

ADJOURNMENT

Acting Chair Scandura adjourned the meeting at 6:42 pm by unanimous consent.