



# APPROVED MINUTES

## City of Flagstaff

### HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, July 15, 2015

---

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Conference Room**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

#### CALL TO ORDER

Chair Zimmerman called the meeting to order at 4:04 p.m.

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

David Zimmerman, Chair, *present*  
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, *present*  
Phil Scandura, *present*  
Laurel Dunn, *present*  
Josh Edwards, *present*  
Lynne Corbin, *absent-excused*  
Vacant

#### CITY STAFF:

Karl Eberhard, Staff Liaison, *present*  
Carrie Nelson, Recording Secretary, *present*

Others Present: Lauren Clementino, Annie Lutes, Tim Harrington, Lindsay Schube, Ben Angelo, Stewart Deats, Bruce Phillips, David McIntire, Mark DiLucido, Kerry O'Hair, Chris Kemmerly, and Duffie Westheimer.

#### I. **PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS**

##### 1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. *(At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)*

None

##### 2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. *(Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)*

None

##### 3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

Regular Meeting of June 17, 2015

#### **MOTION:**

Commissioner Dunn made a motion to approve the minutes from the June 17, 2015 regular meeting. Commissioner Edwards seconded the motion; the motion was approved unanimously.

## II. **OLD BUSINESS**

*(Continued, postponed, and tabled items.)*

### 1. **Executive Session**

Discussion or consultation for legal advice with the attorney or attorneys of the public body; discussion or consultation with the attorneys of the public body in order to consider its position and instruct its attorneys regarding the public body's position regarding contracts that are the subject of negotiations, in pending or contemplated litigation or in settlement discussions conducted in order to avoid or resolve litigation; and discussions or consultations with designated representatives of the public body in order to consider its position and instruct its representatives regarding negotiations for the purchase, sale or lease of real property, pursuant to ARS 38-431.03(A)(3) & (4), respectively.

#### **MOTION:**

Commissioner Edwards made a motion to go into Executive Session. Commissioner Day seconded the motion; Commissioners and City Attorney went into Executive Session.

### 2. **Historic Resource Study – Multiple Mike’s Pike Properties**

Address:	213 W Phoenix Avenue 13, 17, 17 ½, 25, 27, and 29 S Mikes Pike St 18 S Milton Rd
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	100-39-001C, 100-39-001G, 100-39-002A, 100-39-008, 100-39-009, 100-39-010, and 100-39-011C
Property Owner:	Various
Applicant:	Josh Edwards, Cornerstone Environmental Consulting, LLC
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Accept Historic Resource Study

As a result of this study, two significant cultural resources were identified—the buildings at 17 and 17 ½ South Mikes Pike Street. The Hub on Campus Flagstaff project would result in major impacts to these two buildings. Relocation of the buildings, in lieu of demolition, is recommended and a Phase 2 CRS for 17 and 17 ½ South Mikes Pike Street is recommended if demolition or relocation cannot be avoided. Electronic copy attached.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:	Accept Historic Resource Study and require a full or reduced scope Phase II Cultural Resource Study for 17 and 17 ½ South Mikes Pike Street.
---------------------	--

Commissioner Edwards gave a presentation on the cultural resources study on Multiple Mike's Pike Properties and noted that the only buildings that had historical significance were 17 and 17 1/2 South Mikes Pike Street. Mr. Edwards and Ms. Lauren Clementino have evaluated the indirect effects of the project and revised the Phase I Cultural Study.

Ms. Clementino presented on the following:

- Areas of potential effects
- Evaluation of Significance and Integrity
- Evaluation of Indirect Effects
- Summary of Impacts

Mr. Edwards summarized the presentation by stating that there are properties in the area of indirect effect but maintains the project does not cause major impacts. Phase II will be presented at a future meeting.

Public Comment:

Duffie Westheimer – Commended Ms. Clementino on her report. She does not agree to the large building on a historic street and makes the smaller buildings look insignificant. Other options could be to make it a location to celebrate Route 66. Ms. Westheimer also stated that the Heritage Preservation Commission will lose credibility from herself as well as the public should the building be approved.

Discussion:

Commissioner Edwards recused himself from discussion and left the room.

Commissioners would like to review the Phase II study and see better visualizations of effects of future projects.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Day made a motion to accept Historic Resource Study and require a Phase II Cultural Resource Study for 17 and 17 1/2 South Mikes Pike Street. Commissioner Scandura seconded the motion; the motion was approved unanimously.

*Mr. Eberhard stated that the Commission is only looking at and voting on the Cultural Resource Study Report. All other approvals should be addressed through other Commissions.*

**III. NEW BUSINESS**

**1. Phase II Historic Resource Study-919 West Montvale Avenue**

Address:	919 W Montvale Ave
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-26-007
Property Owner:	Conrad Family Limited Partnership
Applicant:	Chris Kimmerly, Kimmerly Company
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

This project involves the demolition of a bunkhouse built at the base of Mars Hill. The date of construction is unknown but appears to be pre-1945. The property is not located in a local or national historic district. The Consultant determined that significance was indeterminate and thus proposed that a Phase II Historic Resource Study was appropriate and has prepared same for consideration by the Commission.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

Ms. Annie Lutes presented on Phase II Historic Resource Study at 919 West Montvale Avenue. She stated that Phase I had no significance using the HABS method. She called the study the Montval Bunkhouse and The Montvale Rooming House. Currently the house at 919 W. Montvale is outside of the Flagstaff Townsite Historic Residential District.

Findings of Significance:

- No longer indeterminate
- Not individually significant for National or Arizona Registration of Historic Places
- Significant on a local level under Criteria A and C.
- Would contribute to expansion of Flagstaff Townsite Historic Residential District.

Public Comment:

Ms. Kerry O'Hair asked what is phase II and is there a picture of the development? Mr. Eberhard answered that the Commissioner is only evaluating the Cultural Study and Ms. O'Hair's questions can be answered via public records on file at the City's Community Development Office.

Commissioner Scandura asked that they be given a copy of the revised report. Mr. Eberhard will send and revised copy to Commissioners.

Discussion:

Commissioners' Day and Dunn stated that Ms. Lutes report was very comprehensive and well done.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Day made a motion to accept the Historic Resource Study. Commissioner Dunn seconded the motion; the motion was approved unanimously.

**2. Phase II Historic Resource Study – 907 West Montvale Avenue**

Address:	907 West Montvale Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-26-009
Property Owner:	Conrad Family Limited Partnership
Applicant:	Chris Kimmerly, Kimmerly Company
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

This project involves the demolition of a single family residence originally built as a rooming house, built at the base of Mars Hill. The date of construction is unknown but appears to be pre-1945. The property is not located in a local or national historic district. The Consultant determined that significance was indeterminate and thus proposed that a Phase II Historic Resource Study was appropriate and has prepared same for consideration by the Commission.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Accept Historic Resource Study

Ms. Lutes continued the presentation of the Montvale Rooming House.

Findings of Significance:

- No longer indeterminate
- Not individually significant for National or Arizona Registration of Historic Places
- Significant on a local level under Criteria A and C.
- Would contribute to expansion of Flagstaff Townsite Historic Residential District.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Scandura made a motion to accept the Historic Resource Study. Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion was approved unanimously.

**3. Nativity of the Blessed Virgin Mary Chapel**

Address:	16 West Cherry Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number:	101-13-004
Property Owner:	Bishop of the Roman Catholic Church
Applicant:	Roberta Wallace
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION:	Approve Historic Facades and Signs Grant
-------------------	--

The applicant is seeking \$10,000 of Historic Facades and Signs Grant funding to winterize the concrete trims and accents, making molds of the gargoyles, and for assessment of the stained glass windows.

RECOMMENDED ACTION:	Approve Historic Facades and Signs Grant in the amount of \$10,000 with the condition that funds not collected within one year are forfeit.
---------------------	---

Mr. Eberhard stated the applicant, who is not present is requesting a Historic Facades and Signs Grant approval to winterize the concrete trims and accents, making molds of the gargoyles, and for assessment of the stained glass windows. The project budget is \$21,500 and the applicant is eligible for \$10,000 from the grant.

Public Comment:

None

Discussion:

Commissioner Scandura asked if stabilization is in the purview of the Grant. Mr. Eberhard answered yes.

Chair Zimmerman asked if the money is going to stained glass windows and is it a part of the assessment? Mr. Eberhard answered yes.

**MOTION:**

Commissioner Dunn made a motion to approve Historic Facades and Signs Grant in the amount of \$10,000 with the condition that funds not collected within one year are forfeit. Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion was approved unanimously.

#### **IV. CONCLUDING GENERAL BUSINESS**

##### **1. REPORTS**

- a. Staff Report – Review of projects approved by staff consent.
- Dark Sky Brewing, 117 N. Beaver Street, Sign painted on the wall, approved on consent
- Multiple Stores, 111 E. Aspen, Signs for a couple of stores, approved on consent
- Visitor Center, 1 E. Route 66 – Approved on consent and not in the Commission’s purview

##### **2. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

*(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)*

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: August 18, 2015
- Correction: Next meeting is on August 19<sup>th</sup> (*Mr. Day will not be at August meeting*)
- Commissioner Dunn asked that Revised Reports should either highlight changes or add an Addendum of changes. Commission will start asking applicants to do this.
- Commissioner Scandura asked that agenda items not be identical in future agendas.

##### b. Future Agenda Items

- Commissioners want to poll for August meeting and make sure there will be a quorum present for the meeting.
- Phase II Study on Montvale.
- Commissioners asked staff to come up with a standard on Commission issues.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 6:09 p.m. with unanimous consent.