



APPROVED MINUTES

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, Sep 16, 2015

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER Vice Chair Day called the meeting to order at 4:29 pm

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

David Zimmerman, Chair, *excused*
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, *present*
Phil Scandura, *excused*
Laurel Dunn, *present*
Josh Edwards, *present*
Lynne Corbin, *present*
Vacant

CITY STAFF:

Karl Eberhard, Staff Liaison, *present*
Creag Znetko, Recording Secretary, *present*

Others in attendance: Kurt Brydenthall, Laura Myers, Elizabeth Chanopensiri, Jesse Dominguez, Duffie Westheimer, Lynn Neal, Annie Lutes, Tyler Mark, Steven Shumway, Shane Shumway, and Jeff Byers.

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. *(At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)*

Duffie Westheimer addressed the commission and conveyed her concern with the number of historic buildings being demolished in Flagstaff. She stated concern regarding the "Art Barn" article in the Daily Sun, the demolition of the Midgley building and the possible demolition of a few properties located on W Route 66. She asked the

commission to consider having a local standard to judge historic properties instead of a national standard to preserve the character of Flagstaff.

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

NONE

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES

Regular Meeting of August 19, 2015

Commissioner Dunn motioned to approve the minutes as submitted.

Commissioner Corbin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

II. OLD BUSINESS

(Continued, postponed, and tabled items.)

None

III. NEW BUSINESS

1. La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Specific Plan

Address:	Multiple
Assessor's Parcel Number:	Multiple
Property Owner:	Multiple
Applicant:	City of Flagstaff Sara Dechter, Comprehensive Planning Manager
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Recommend plan adoption to City Council

This is an updated Plan to align with the new Regional Plan, incorporate up-to-date public involvement, and better incorporate the partnership between the City and the neighborhood. Before the Plan goes to public hearings for adoption in October 2015, staff is seeking input from City Commissions on the Plan's policies and implementation strategies. All recommendations gathered from city commissions will be incorporated into the final public hearing draft of the Specific Plan for La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Recommend plan adoption to City Council

City Staff, Sara Dechter, presented on topic and stated that this plan has been in process since 2008 and has been revived within the last year. Ms. Dechter stated that the neighborhood association has been intimately involved in the development process of this plan. The team would like to have the final plan in

front of City Council by the end of November and is asking the HPC for a recommendation for adoption.

Public Comment: Jesse Dominguez, 510 W Tombstone, addressed the commission and presented a letter that came from the La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Association. Mr. Dominguez thanked Ms. Lutes for the exhaustive work on the historic segments of the plan. Mr. Dominguez wanted to ensure the commission knew that some of the homes in the neighborhood are still structurally sound and would like the homes that have not been inventoried to be added.

Motion: Commissioner Dunn motioned to recommend the La Plaza Vieja Neighborhood Specific Plan to City Council for adoption. Commissioner Edwards seconded; the motion passed by unanimous consent.

Discussion: Commission thanked Ms. Dechter for the work she has put into the plan and show appreciation for involving the public and other commissions at the earlier stages. The commission asked if there was a pedestrian crossing in the works for connecting the two sections of the neighborhood across the railroad tracks. Ms. Dechter stated that there are funds budgeted in the Capital Improvement Plan for a pedestrian underpass which would connect the streets of Florence and Walnut. They are currently working with BNSF. The Commission stated to Ms. Dechter the availability of SHPO and Historic Facades and Signs Grants to be a part of the plan so residents of the neighborhood could restore their historic properties, if they so choose and qualify.

2. Picture Canyon Natural and Cultural Preserve – Management Plan

Address:	El Paso Flagstaff Road
Assessor's Parcel Number:	113-06-004
Property Owner:	City of Flagstaff
Applicant:	Betsy Emery, Sustainability Specialist
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Review, Discuss, and Provide Comments

The City of Flagstaff Sustainability Program has drafted a management plan as required by the acquisition process. City Staff consulted with representatives from Arizona Game and Fish, Coconino National Forest, Museum of Northern Arizona, State Historic Preservation Office, Arizona State Parks, Arizona State Museum, and tribal liaisons to complete the Plan. City Staff requests that the Commission review the document and provide comments that Staff can present to the City Council when presenting the management plan.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Review, Discuss, and Provide Comments

City staff, Betsy Emery, presented on topic and explained to the commission what the path forward is for the Management Plan. Commissioner Edwards asked that the plan be more specific under impacts to archeological sites in the cultural resource section regarding ground disturbing activity within the boundary of the site. There was discussion only.

3. Picture Canyon Natural and Cultural Preserve - Interpretive Signs

Address:	El Paso Flagstaff Road
Assessor's Parcel Number:	113-06-004
Property Owner:	City of Flagstaff
Applicant:	Betsy Emery, Open Space Aide
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

This project involves new interpretive signs for the Picture Canyon Natural and Cultural Preserve. The signs will educate visitors about archaeology, vegetation, wildlife, wetland ecology, geology, and the Rio de Flag. City Staff requests that the Commission review the language and illustrations for each interpretive sign. And, City Staff requests that the Commission approve the sign design as required by the City of Flagstaff Sign Code.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approve Certificate of Appropriateness

City staff, Betsy Emery, presented on topic and answered questions from the commission regarding verbiage, style, context, and information. Commissioners commended Ms. Emery on the work completed so far and are pleased with the interpretive signs. Mr. Eberhard inquired if this was the final version of the signs. Ms. Emery stated that this is not and it would not be cost effective to return in October with final versions that may need to be altered. Vice Chair Day asked if the commission could send this to Mr. Eberhard's consent calendar for final approval. Mr. Eberhard stated that is an option the commission can explore.

Motion: Commissioner Edwards moved to send the item to the HPO's consent calendar. Commissioner Corbin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously .

4. Flagstaff Marriott Residence Inn

Address:	100 N Humphreys Street
Assessor's Parcel Number:	100-19-013A, 011A, 019 and 100-21-007A
Property Owner:	Aspen, LLC
Applicant:	Steve Shumway, Whiting Brothers Investment Company
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Review concept plans and provide comments

This project involves the construction of a 110 room, four story hotel, elevated above flood elevation, and 100 surface parking spaces. It is proposed on multiple parcels; half of a block north of Aspen Avenue and a quarter of a block south of Aspen Avenue. As a part of the project, three non-historic buildings will be removed from the properties. The plans also describe the proposed project signs. The project is located in the Downtown Overlay District. The Applicant requests a preliminary review and will return with final project plans at a later date.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Review concept plans and provide comments

City Staff, Karl Eberhard, introduced the project to the commission and suggested the commission take some time to review the applicant's materials, discuss, and provide feedback from a work session type atmosphere, rather than getting into more minute details at this time. Applicant presented on topic and answered commissioners questions about materials to be used, what kind of sustainability efforts are being taken, how the design came into play, and what other projects the applicant has been involved in. Commissioners provided comments to applicant about aesthetics, architectural styling, utilizing local materials and over-all design guidelines. There was discussion only.

5. Swaddee Thai Restaurant

Address:	115 E Aspen Ave
Assessor's Parcel Number:	101-21-018
Property Owner:	Chennapha Pouenmuang
Applicant:	Chennapha Pouenmuang
City Staff:	Karl Eberhard, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Ask for a Certificate of Appropriateness

Swaddee Thai Restaurant is located in the Downtown Overlay District and listed on the National Register of Historic Places. This project includes framing a new doorway and adding a new exterior door to the front entrance that would be flush with the frontage to Aspen Ave. The current front entrance will serve as a secondary entrance and receive a new exterior door as well. City Staff requests that the Commission review the document and provide comments to Staff.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Review concept plans and provide comments.

City Staff, Karl Eberhard, introduced project to commission stating this project is in response to an enforcement action for completed tasks that did not receive prior approval:

1. Recessed entry way was made flush with storefront.
2. Light fixtures added to exterior façade.
3. Exterior masonry was painted.

City Staff recommended to commission to not ask for the Certificate of Appropriateness due to the applicant needing to address other commissions before a resolution can be reached regarding the aforementioned issues. Applicant explained to commission the doorway was enclosed because of cold weather drafting into the restaurant during winter months. Commission cited guide lines concerning the doorway. Commission also discussed the lighting fixtures and the painting of the stone. HPO suggested to that commission "bundle" all the issues into one motion to be addressed properly.

Motion: Commissioner Edwards moved to continue the item for one month and have applicant prepare a correct lighting plan that complies with city standards and historic guidelines, to redesign the entry to comply with building and engineering standards and historic guidelines and the commission will review and act upon the lighting, entrance, the paint and the signage at the next commission meeting. Commissioner Dunn seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

Discussion: Mr. Eberhard wanted to ensure that the record states if it is a yes or no vote, the commission would vote no. The commission would not approve of the lighting fixtures, entryway, or painting of the exterior masonry as submitted.

IV. CONCLUDING GENERAL BUSINESS

1. REPORTS

- a. Staff Report – Review of projects approved by staff consent.

HPO approved the following items on consent:

- a. Signage for new business at 21 E Aspen Ave.
- b. Restoration for wood trim on windows at 9 N Leroux.

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: October 21, 2015
- b. Future Agenda Items

Vice Chair Day asked HPO for clarification about what the code says and what the commissions responsibilities are concerning violations. HPO stated he would contact the appropriate staff and have them present to commission.

ADJOURNMENT

Vice Chair Day adjourned the meeting by unanimous consent at 6:43 pm.