



Minutes **Draft**

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, April 17, 2019

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Deborah Cargill 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:03 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, [Present](#)
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, [Present](#)
Charlie Webber, [Present](#)
Jerry McLaughlin, [Present](#)
Emily Dale, [Absent](#)
Jill Hough, [Present](#)
Caitlin Kelly, [Absent](#)

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Co-Liaison, [Present](#)
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

[Pat Lovan, AZHS Board Member, discussed invitations that were sent to Commission to become members of the AZHS Board and would provide tours of the local museum.](#)

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

Sara Dechter will be the official HPO for the City of Flagstaff

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

a. Regular Meeting of March 20, 2019.

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Commission Webber seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

I. New Business:

1. Cultural Resource Study – NAU Downtown Travelodge

Address: 910 S Milton Road
Assessor's Parcel Number: 103-04-005
Property Owner: Arun & Shilpa A. Pandit
Applicant: Lindsey Shube/Gammage & Burnham, PLC
City Staff: Sara Dechter, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Phase 1 and 2 Historic Resource Study

In accordance with Flagstaff Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050, a Phase 1 and Phase 2 Historic Resource Study has been submitted. A Phase 2 Historic Resource Study is required when major impacts are proposed for a significant resource that has integrity and when no other mitigation measures are proposed that would maintain the significance and integrity of the resource. The property is planned for future development with the likelihood the existing business would end operation and the building would be demolished. A letter report was presented to the Commission at their meeting on March 20, 2019.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission accept the Phase 1 and Phase 2 Historic Resource Study.

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to accept the Phase I and Phase II Historic Resource Study with the amendment with a request that the building not be torn down until a building permit is issued . Commission Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

2. Cultural Resource Study – Manuel Chavez House

Address: 215 S. Park Street
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-37-006
Property Owner: Jonathan Robinson
Applicant: Jonathan Robinson

City Staff: Sara Dechter, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Letter Report approval

In accordance with Flagstaff Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050, a letter report has been submitted as documentation of completing a Cultural/Historic Resource Study for the subject property. A grant was approved for the replacement of the roof on this structure in July 2018. Due to unforeseen circumstances the owner is not able to save the structure.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation request additional information about the former ownership and families affiliated with this location prior to acceptance.

Discussion was held on the existing house and the property ownership with Jonathan Robinson, owner and his consultant. The owner indicated due to damage done during roof construction the home will now be demolished and property will be sold, and the grant will be relinquished.

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve the letter report. Commission McLaughlin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

3. Cultural Resource Study – 301 S O’Leary Street

Address: 301 S O’Leary Street
Assessor’s Parcel Number: 104-04-001a
Property Owner: RockJuniper Holdings LLC
Applicant: Lynn A. Neal, Consultant
City Staff: Tiffany Antol, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Letter Report approval

In accordance with Flagstaff Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050, a letter report has been submitted as documentation of completing a Cultural/Historic Resource Study for the subject property. The property is planned for redevelopment.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission accept the findings of the Letter Report.

Discussion was held on the existing house and the property ownership.

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the letter report.

Commission Webber seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

4. Historic Facades and Sign Grant– 314 N Beaver Street

Address: 314 N Beaver Street
Assessor's Parcel Number: 101-13-005
Property Owner: Hayden Investments
Applicant: Rob Trathnigg
City Staff: Tiffany Antol, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Historic Facades and Sign Grant

This is a request for a Historic Facades and Signs Grant of \$10,000 for improvements, including exterior siding and window replacement to a single-family residence located at 314 N. Beaver Street. The home is identified as being a contributing structure to the North End National Register Historic Residential District. Original date of construction is identified as 1916.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission review the application and approve the request as submitted.

Tiffany Antol gave some brief information on the property requesting the grant and gave information about work that has been started on windows that wouldn't be included in grant application.

Rob Trathnigg, owner, was present and answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve a Historic Facades and signs grant application with the scope of work to include restoring the original wood siding, period appropriate doors, restoration to the front doors and windows up to \$10,000. Commission Hough seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

5. Certificate of Appropriateness/Cultural Resource Study– Hotel Monte Vista

Address: 100 N San Francisco Street
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-19-0005
Property Owner: Cravens Ent. LLC
Applicant: Karl Eberhard, Architect
City Staff: Sara Dechter, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of Appropriateness/Letter Report

In accordance with Flagstaff Zoning Code Section 10-30.30.050, a letter report has been submitted as documentation of completing a Cultural/Historic Resource Study for the subject property.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission accept the findings of the Letter Report and require both a Phase 1 and Phase 2 CRS.

Ms. Dechter gave a summary of the letter report
Karl Eberhard, architect, gave a PowerPoint presentation about the proposed project and answered questions from Commissioners.

MOTION: Commissioner Hough moved to approve the certificate of appropriateness with Staff conditions as presented. Commission Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

6. Certificate of No Effect – Façade & Sign Changes

Address: 8 E Route 66
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-20-008
Property Owner: Aspen Consolidated Investments LLC
Applicant: Brookfield Communities
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Co-HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of No Effect

This is a request for a Certificate of No Effect for a repainting a façade and installing signs at 8 E Route 66 (APN 100-20-0008). The sign proposed would be painted over the building entrance (unilluminated) and the installation of vinyl in the windows. The property is in the Downtown Historic Overlay District (Downtown Overlay) and the Flagstaff Central [Sign] District. The existing building is on the National Register is a non-contributing structure in the Railroad Addition Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends that the Heritage Preservation Commission review the application and approve with conditions as identified in the staff report.

Commissioner McLaughlin recused himself
Ms. Dechter gave a summary of the project and indicated the building has already been painted and wood trim has been extended.
Jerry McLaughlin, owner, answered questions from Commissioners
Julie Sullivan, representative for tenant, discussed the sign requirements

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve the certificate of no effect

as presented by the applicant with a note that if they change sign from painted on the building to three-dimensional the commission will not need to see it. Commission Webber seconded the motion; the motion passed 4-0.

7. Certificate of No Effect – The McMillan Bar & Kitchen Neon Sign

Address: 7 N Leroux Street
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-20-018
Property Owner: Fleming Brothers LLC
Applicant: McMillan Bar and Kitchen
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Co-HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of No Effect

This project involves the installation of a neon sign at the McMillan Bar & Kitchen. Commission review and approval is required for all neon signs. The property is located in the Railroad Addition National Register Historic District and is located in the Downtown Overlay District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff has no recommendation on the proposed sign. If the Heritage Preservation Commission deems the sign to have no effect the sign permit will be approved.

Ms. Dechter gave a summary of the project

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the certificate of no effect as submitted. Commission Day seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

IV. REPORTS:

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:
 - i. None

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: May 15, 2019
Commissioner Day would like the address added to the staff report
Ms. Dechter gave information on a Federal register notice

VI. ADJOURNMENT

5:37 p.m.