



Minutes Approved

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, June 19, 2019

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Deborah Cargill 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, [Present](#)
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, [Present](#)
Charlie Webber, [Present](#)
Jerry McLaughlin, [Absent](#)
Emily Dale, [Present](#)
Jill Hough, [Present](#)
Caitlin Kelly, [Present](#)

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Co-Liaison, [Present](#)
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

[None](#)

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

[None](#)

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

a. Regular Meeting of May 15, 2019.

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Commissioner Kelly seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

I. New Business:

1. Certificate of Appropriateness – Façade Improvement, formerly Galaxy Sales

Address: 108 E Route 66.
 Assessor’s Parcel Number: 101-21-009
 Property Owner: Flagstaff Historic Properties, Inc
 Applicant: Anne Soper, UPDESIGN studio
 City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
 REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of Appropriateness

This is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition and restoration of the commercial storefront to materials and brick patterns consistent with other buildings on the block. The property is in the Downtown Historic Overlay District and is within a Railroad Addition National Register District. The existing building has been heavily modified, is not eligible for the National Register.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission issue a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Ms. Dechter gave a brief description of the proposed certificate and answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve the certificate of appropriateness at 108 E Route 66 glass block originally around doors and windows be restored and door be off-centered as shown in original photos, with the HPO being able to review administratively as present by Staff. Commissioner Hough seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

2. Certificate of No Effect– Prema Mixed Use

Address: 111 N Leroux St.
 Assessor’s Parcel Number: 100-19-008A
 Property Owner: Leroux Retail, LLC
 Applicant: Karl Eberhard
 City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
 REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of Appropriateness

This is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the modification of the commercial storefront and the addition of 7,268 square feet of residential space. The subject property is 4,509 square foot building on a 0.33acre parcel. The property is in the Downtown Historic Overlay District and is not within a National Register District. The existing building has been heavily modified, is not eligible for the National Register. A Cultural Resource Study is not warranted, per a previous application. The Heritage Preservation Commission reviewed a previous draft of this proposal at the Wednesday December 19, 2018 public meeting. The proposal has submitted a first site plan for Inter-Division staff review but has not yet returned comments.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission make comments and recommendations to the applicant and ask for an updated and complete resubmittal before final site plan approval.

Ms. Dechter gave a brief description of the proposed certificate of no effect and answered questions from Commissioners

Karl Eberhard, architect for applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed certificate and answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Hayward moved to approve the certificate of no effect presented by staff with the condition that the commission review a color board at the next meeting. Commissioner Day seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously

3. Amendment to Grant Application

Address: 209 E Cottage Ave
Assessor's Parcel Number: 104-01-048
Property Owner: Scott and Paige Otero
Applicant: Scott Otero
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Amend grant to include other improvements

This is a request for an amendment to a grant approved by the Heritage Preservation Commission in August 2018. The property owner of the Brannen-Divine House at 309 E Cottage (individual NRHP listing) originally wanted to restore the porch and decking seen in historic photos of the building but has found they will not be able to do that this year, as other repairs will be required first. They would like to remove the porch from their grant's scope and add: (1) reroofing and siding of the back sunporch to protect original wood flooring, (2) repairs to woodwork and gutters along the roofline to prevent further water damage, (3) repairs to the historic

chimney, and (4) lead abatement associated with preserving the two original windows and replacement of the non-historic windows and front door. The front door replacements and window replacements that were part of the original grant would be retained in the scope of the grant.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission approve the modifications to the scope of the grant and extend the grant timeframe to December 31, 2019.

Commissioner Day recused himself

Ms. Dechter gave a brief description of the proposed grant amendment and answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to approve the grant amendment. Commissioner Hough seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously

4. Certificate of No Effect – Garage Construction

Due to an error in the posting notice for this case, this item may not be heard until 4:30pm.

Address: 506 W Birch Ave.
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-12-001
Property Owner: John Borhek
Applicant: John Borhek
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Certificate of No Effect

This is a request for a Certificate of No Effect for the construction of a garage behind 506 W Birch Ave. The subject property has a 2,727 square foot residential building (constructed in 1886) on a 13,400 square foot parcel. The property is in the Townsite Historic Overlay District and is on the National Register. This hearing was posted on the property following the Townsite Overlay requirements on June 4, 2019.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission issue a Certificate of No Effect with the condition that the review the building permit submittal to ensure consistency with this application.

Ms. Dechter gave a brief description of the proposed certificate of no effect and answered questions from Commissioners

Discussion was held about the roof pitch, windows, and materials

Public Comment

Lynn Corbin, resident, concerned about the size, siding

MOTION: Commissioner Webber moved to approve certificate of no effect with conditions presented by Staff and additional condition to have HPO review vents, siding, windows and roof pitch. Commissioner Kelly seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously

IV. Work Session

1. Possible Façade Improvements for 120 N Leroux (Old Town Shoppes)

The building at 120 N Leroux is an oddball in the Downtown. It is a midcentury modern building in the heart of the Downtown Overlay, which emphasizes pre-World War II development patterns. The owner and their consultant would like to discuss this unusual case before submitting an application. The commission should provide direction on if a new mid-century modern façade would be appropriate in this location, or if the commission would prefer to see façade improvements to take the building in a different architectural direction.

Discussion was held about the potential façade improvements at 120 N Leroux Karl Eberhard, architect, gave a PowerPoint on the potential façade changes and answered questions from Commissioners.

Further discussion was held

2. Fiscal Year 2020 Grant Guidelines and Procedures

Economic Vitality provides the funding for the Historic Facades and Signs Grant and would like clarification for a few issues within the grant guidelines:

- i. Do we want to be able to do a second grant on a property after a certain period of time for a project with a different scope?
- ii. If an applicant “failed to successfully carry out a previous grant project” does that mean they can never reapply for a grant on another property that they own?
- iii. Grant approvals currently expire one year after approval – under what circumstances can staff offer an extension? Should extensions require Commission approval?
- iv. Would the commission like a report on the grants that have been paid out? Quarterly or annually?

David McIntire, Community Investment Director, discussed the proposed changes to the grant guidelines and procedures and answered questions from Commissioners.

Discussion was held on the proposed changes.

V. REPORTS:

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:

- i. PZ-19-00098 - 900 N FOURTH ST, Flagstaff, AZ, 86004 - CRS Letter Report, approved 5/29/19, Finding: no historic or archeological sites found
- ii. PZ-19-00102 – 1313 S MILTON RD, Flagstaff, AZ, 86001 - CRS Letter Report, approved 5/29/19, Finding: building individually significant under state and local criteria, post-fire restoration to move forward without impact
- iii. PZ-17-00227-04 – Vacant Land on Ponderosa Parkway, north of Route 66 – CRS Letter Report - Approved 6/3/19, Finding: no historic or archeological sites found

Ms. Dechter discussed the administrative approvals.

VI. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: July 17, 2019
- b. Information to share of Commissioner's Training provided by SHPO on June 12, 2019

Application deadlines will be the first Friday of each month at 12 p.m. Discussion was held on the Commissioners training from prior week.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 6:55 p.m.