



Minutes

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, August 21, 2019

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Deborah Cargill 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, [Present](#)
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, [Present](#)
Charlie Webber, [Absent](#)
Jerry McLaughlin, [Present](#)
Emily Dale, [Present](#)
Jill Hough, [Present](#)
Caitlin Kelly, [Absent](#)

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Co-Liaison, [Present](#)
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

[None](#)

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

[Ms. Dechter has submitted the grant application that was discussed at the last meeting](#)

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

- a. Regular Meeting of July 17, 2019.

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the minutes as submitted
Commissioner Hough seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

II. NEW BUSINESS:

1. Grant Application

Address: 720 W Birch Avenue
Assessor’s Parcel Number: 100-13-005
Property Owner: Townsite CLT
Applicant: Duffie Westheimer
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Award of a Historic Facades and Signs Grant

720 W Birch Avenue is a contributing property in the Townsite Historic District. The property is in the Townsite Historic Overlay zone. The Heritage Preservation Officer approved a Certificate of No Effect for the rehabilitation of the garage on March 7, 2019. Townsite CLT is requesting a grant to assist in this effort.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the grant application.

Duffie Westheimer, applicant, answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner McLaughlin moved to approve the grant application for matching funds up to \$10,000 for rehabilitation of the garage at 720 W Birch Ave
Commissioner Hough seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

2. Grant Application

Address: 116 S O’Leary Street
Assessor’s Parcel Number: 104-01-067
Property Owner: Dina Barnese
Applicant: Dina Barnese
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Award of a Historic Facades and Signs Grant

116 S O'Leary Street is a contributing property in the Southside National Historic District. The property owner is requesting a grant to replace windows.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the grant application.

Dina Barnese, applicant, answered questions from Commissioners

MOTION: Commissioner Hough moved to approve the grant application for matching funds up to \$10,000 for window replacement at 116 S. O'Leary Street Commissioner McLaughlin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

3. Certificate of Appropriateness

Address: 702 W Birch Avenue
Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-13-001
Property Owner: Constance Taylor
Applicant: Constance Taylor
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness

The owner of 702 W Birch Ave is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for changes that have already been made to the building, including the replacement of aluminum windows with vinyl windows, the replacement of a bay window (not original) with sliding glass doors and the replacement of mismatched siding with hardy board. The building is in the Townsite Historic Overlay, but it is not a contributing structure in the Townsite National Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends a partial approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with conditions for the sliding glass door and pergola. The condition should require a screening between the door and the street with at least 50% opacity. Staff recommends denial for the windows because the proposal does not meet the finding of compatibility based on the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines and associated Technical Reports.

Ms. Dechter gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed certificate of appropriateness.

Connie Taylor, applicant, gave a presentation on the proposed project.

Public Comment

Rose Houk, resident of townsite, discussed not knowing about the townsite overlay requirements and believe people will be resistant if they knew the restrictions and supports the proposed project

Duffie Westheimer, resident, stated that when the standards were done they were not meant to address window materials, siding material or paint color.

Michael Collier, resident of townsite, supports townsite overlay and the proposed project

Bruce Walker, resident, supports the proposed project

Discussion was held on the proposed project

MOTION: Commissioner Hayward moved to divide the question into the sliding glass door and the windows separately. Commissioner McLaughlin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

MOTION: Commissioner Dale moved to approve the sliding glass door with the condition that there be a pergola or some kind of screening with at least 50% opacity
Commissioner McLaughlin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

MOTION: Commissioner Hayward moved to deny the vinyl windows based on the proposal does not meet the findings of compatibility based on the Secretary of the Interior’s Guidelines and associated technical reports.

The motion lacked a second

MOTION: Commissioner Day to adjourn into executive session seconded by Commissioner Hough motion passed unanimously at 5:06 p.m.

Reconvened at 5:29 p.m.

MOTION: Commissioner Day to approve certificate of appropriateness for 702 W Birch for the windows seconded by Commissioner Hough. Discussion was held on the motion. Commissioner Hayward stated that the Commission was selecting to use their exemption allowed under the Townsite Overlay to not to apply the federal standards to this specific case because it was a non-conforming and non-contributing structure. Commissioner Dale stated that the fact they were changing out non-conforming windows for non-conforming windows and likely changed the opening size under previous renovations was compelling in this case. Commissioner Hayward pointed out that not every building has to be historic to be compatible with the neighborhood.

The motion passed unanimously.

IV. **WORK SESSION**

1. Arizona State Historic Preservation Plan Update 2019

The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) is consulting with Certified Local Governments in preparation of an update to the Arizona State Historic Preservation Plan. Staff will present a draft response to the Commission for endorsement.

Ms. Dechter discussed the draft response and asked for any comments or changes. Discussion held on the response. Commission asked for a separate letter form the commission and the HPO to be submitted. Commission Hayward will also submit personal comments.

2. Internal Illuminated Signs in the Central Sign District

Staff is requesting direction from the commission about the appropriateness of internally illuminated signs in the Central Sign District. The Zoning Code states they are not permitted although the code shows a picture of an internally illuminated sign at Pay 'N Take as an appropriate sign for the Central Sign District.

Mr. Symer gave a PowerPoint presentation on the direction the commission would like the City to take on signs in the Central sign district. Discussion was held.

Phil Keese, Northern Az Signs, discussed the difference in illuminations and what's been enforced.

Direction from the Commission was to expeditiously remove the graphic causing the conflict in the Zoning Code and to return to the Commission options for code amendments and design guidelines to allow minimal internally illuminated signs.

V. REPORTS:

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:

- i. PZ-19-00045-01 - 607 W TOMBSTONE AVE, Flagstaff, AZ 86001 – CRS Letter Report, Approved 8/2/2019, Finding: The property that was shown in the historic inventory for La Plaza Vieja was likely demolished in 1966 and there was no historical significance or integrity in the existing building.
- ii. PZ-19-00085-01 - 2906 N THIRD ST, Flagstaff, AZ 86004 – CRS Letter Report, Approved 7/23/19, Finding: The property did not meet any local, State or national criteria for significance. The report includes a brief historic context relevant to the structure because of a lack of historic context for Sunnyside.
- iii. PZ-19-00076-01 - 2010 E ROUTE 66, Flagstaff, AZ 86004 – CRS Letter report for a Garage Addition, Approved 7/23/19, Finding: This hotel is significant in the Route 66 context. There have been alterations to the building that impact its integrity. The requested garage addition required the removal of an attached storage unit that was not original to the structure. The addition was permitted with the condition that the construction of the garage, not remove the original rock work at the corners of the building.

Ms. Dechter discussed the administrative approvals

2. CLG Grant Status Update

VI. Ms. Dechter discussed that all the approvals have been received for the grant and it was submitted

VII. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: September 18, 2019

Ms. Hough has been promoted to curator for Az Historical Society

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Adjourned at 6:15 p.m.