



Minutes Draft

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, October 16, 2019

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Deborah Cargill 928-213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER [Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM](#)

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, [Present](#)
Jonathan Day, Vice Chair, [Present](#)
Charlie Webber, [Present](#)
Jerry McLaughlin, [Present](#)
Emily Dale, [Present](#)
Jill Hough, [Present](#)
Caitlin Kelly, [Present](#)

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Liaison
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

[None](#)

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

[Ms. Dechter thanked those that filled in for her at the last meeting](#)

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

- a. Regular Meeting of September 18, 2019.

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve the minutes as submitted Commissioner McLaughlin seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

II. NEW BUSINESS:

1. Certificate of No Effect and Appropriateness – Monte Vista Hotel Master Plan

Address:	100 N San Francisco St.
Assessor's Parcel Number:	101-19-005
Property Owner:	Craven Enterprises LLC
Applicant:	Karl Eberhard
City Staff:	Alaxandra Pucciarelli, Current Planning Manager
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approval of a Certificate of No Effect and a Certificate of Appropriateness

100 N San Francisco St is the Monte Vista Hotel is a key historic resource in Downtown Flagstaff. The property owner is proposing improvements and expansion in three phases. The first phase has already been approved by the Heritage Preservation Commission. This application requests certificates for Phases 2 and 3.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of Certificate of No Effect for Phase 2 with conditions and Approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Phase 3 with the conditions, including that Phase 3 be resubmitted to the Commission for a second review between the first site plan submittal and the final site plan approval.

Karl Eberhard, applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed certificate of no effect and answered questions from Commissioners.

Discussion was held on the proposed project.

MOTION: Commissioner Day moved to approve Certificate of No Effect for Phase 2 at 100 N San Francisco with the condition that the paint color be approved by the HPO Commissioner Webber seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

2. Cultural Resource Study Phase I and II – 400 block of S. San Francisco St.

Address: 403 to 431 S. San Francisco St.
Assessor's Parcel Number: 103-15-0023, 103-15-0024, 103-15-0025, 103-15-0026
Property Owner: Northgate Holdings LLC
Applicant: Northgate Holdings LLC
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Phase I and II Cultural Resource Study

The applicant has prepared a combined Phase I and Phase II Cultural Resource Studies for 403, to 431 S. San Francisco St. Northgate Holdings LLC is proposing to demolish seven standing structures and to construct a five-story mixed use development. 413 and 415 S San Francisco were previously determined to be contributing structures to the Southside National Historic District.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff does not have a recommended action for this item. The Heritage Preservation Commission may: (1) Approve the Cultural Resource Study (2) Approve the Cultural Resource Study with conditions related to additional resources or (3) Require a Phase II be completed for additional buildings on the property that are greater than 50 years old.

Josh Edwards, applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed cultural resource studies and answered questions from Commissioners.

Discussion was held on the proposed project.

MOTION: Commissioner Dale moved to accept the cultural resource studies with conditions and the added conditions that a Phase II of the exterior of building 5, site level maps of the relationships of the buildings on the individual parcels, that 413 and 415 be put up for sale and buildings are not demolished until all permits are approved. Commissioner Day seconded the motion; the motion passed 6 to 1 with Commissioner Hough abstained.

Commissioner McLaughlin had to leave the meeting

3. Grant Application – E. A. Silker House

Address: 602 N Leroux St.
Assessor's Parcel Number: 101-08-0012
Property Owner: Joshua and Valerie Cross
Applicant: Joshua and Valerie Cross
City Staff: Sara Dechter, Interim HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Grant Application

The E.A. Silker house was constructed in 1914 and is a contributing property in the North End National Register Historic District. The owner of 602 N. Leroux St has applied for a Historic Facades and Signs Grant to evaluate and stabilize the foundation of the single-family home and to fund restoration of woodwork, window frames and eaves. The property owner is not proposing any significant changes to the exterior.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the grant application.

Valerie Cross, applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed grant application and answered questions from Commissioners.

Discussion was held on the proposed project.

MOTION: Commissioner Hough moved to approve the grant application as written for 602 N Leroux Commissioner Webber seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

IV. **REPORTS:**

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:

- i. PZ-19-00202 – 2222 E CEDAR AVE, Flagstaff, AZ 86004 – CRS Letter Report, Approved 10/8/19, Findings: The building is not significant under any criteria or theme. Therefore, alterations to the exterior façade will not impact any historic resources.

Ms. Dechter gave a brief summary of the approved letter report

V. **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

1. 10 E Fine St. – Accessory Building to E.A. Silker House – The property owner of 602 N Leroux St and 10 E Fine (APN 101-08-012) would like to know if these two buildings are both eligible for a Historic Facades and Signs Grant as they are addressed and inventoried separately though they are located on the same lot.

Discussion was held on the two separately addressed buildings. Decision was made to have the issue considered in the revision of the grant guidelines and will be revisited once guidelines are revised.

VI. **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: November 20, 2019

Meeting in December will be held on December 18th

Three Commissioners are up for reappointment

VII. **ADJOURNMENT**

Adjourned at 6:30 p.m.