



MINUTES - APPROVED

City of Flagstaff HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday, February 19, 2020

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Tammy Bishop 928-213-2611 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

CALL TO ORDER Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair **Present**
Harris Abernathy **Present**
Charlie Webber **Absent**
Jerry McLaughlin **Present**
Emily Dale **Present**
Jill Hough **Present**
Caitlin Kelly **Present**

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Liaison
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts & Science Manager, gave a brief presentation on the flower project they are working on for Southside and downtown

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

Addendum to item II in new business has been noted in the revised agenda

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

- a. Regular Meeting of January 15, 2020.

Motion to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of January 15, 2020 moved by Commissioner Dale seconded by Commissioner Abernathy motion carried unanimously

II. New Business:

1. Certificate of Economic Hardship – Windows at Chautauqua Townhomes, Unit #8

Address:	811 W Cherry Ave, Unit #8
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	100-47-008
Property Owner:	Eleanor Francis
Applicant:	Eleanor Francis
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approval of a Certificate of Economic Hardship for the replacement of conforming windows with non-conforming windows in the Townsite Overlay

In January, windows were replaced without a permit at this address. The property owners in the townhomes were unaware that their wood clad vinyl windows would need to be replaced in kind, and the HOA had approved the replacement of windows on the property. The HOA and property owners has stopped this activity and are working towards compliance on the rest of the windows. However, two windows have already been installed at Unit #8. It would be cost prohibitive for the condominium owner to remove the installed windows and a Certificate of Economic Hardship is being requested.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Approval of a Certificate of Economic Hardship

Mark Reavis, HPO, gave a description of the proposed economic hardship and answered questions from Commissioners

Michael Gurner, applicant representative, discussed that the windows that have been replaced are the only ones that will be replaced any others will conform to the standards and the trim will be painted.

Motion to approve the certificate of economic hardship for 811 W Cherry Unit #8 moved by Commissioner Hough seconded by Commissioner McLaughlin motion carried unanimously

2. Cultural Resource Study – El Pueblo Motel

Address:	3120 E. Route 66
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	108-08-002
Property Owner:	Thurcor Inn, LLC
Applicant:	Karl Eberhard, Architect
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approval of a Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study

This project proposes to transform the property at 3120 E. Route 66, the El Pueblo Motel, from Single Room Occupancy of 22 units to a motor inn with 14 guest rooms. Each room would be reorganized on the interior, patio additions and a wet room addition. The project includes site grading to address drainage issues. The applicant has submitted a concurrent Concept Plan. Comments are due from the Interdivision Staff to the applicant on February 20, 2020.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends the Heritage Preservation Commission approve with conditions the Phase 1 Cultural Resource Study including the addendum submitted on 2/13/2020.

Mark Reavis, HPO, gave a description of the project and the Phase I for 3120 E Route 66.

Karl Eberhard, applicant, gave a PowerPoint presentation on the proposed project and Phase I and answered questions from Commissioners

Discussion was held on the proposed Phase I CRS

Motion to approve the Phase I including the addendum submitted 2/13/2020 with the condition that the architectural changes are a major impact to be mitigated per staff recommendations by providing an interpretive center, or submittal of a Phase 2 **moved by** Commissioner Hayward **seconded by** Commissioner Dale motion failed 2-4 with Commissioners Kelly, Hough, McLaughlin and Abernathy dissented

Motion to approve the Phase I including the addendum submitted 2/13/2020
Moved by Commissioner Abernathy **Seconded by** Commissioner McLaughlin
motion carried 4-2 with Commissioners Hayward and Dale dissenting

III. REPORTS:

1. Review of Administrative Approvals:
 - a. PZ-20-00029 – 612 W TOMBSTONE AVE, Flagstaff, AZ 86001 – Cultural Resource Study Letter Report for demolition of single family home and accessory structure in the La Plaza Vieja neighborhood. Approved – 2/11/2020
 - b. CC-20-00162, PZ-20-00028– 109 E ROUTE 66, Flagstaff, AZ 86001 – Certificate of No Effect for a Sign Permit for Drinking Horn Meadery. The sign will be painted over a portion of a historic ghost sign uncovered by the renovation of the façade, based on the recommendations of the HPO. Approved – 2/11/2020

IV. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. Draft Educational Materials for Property Owners
 - i. 20% Federal Historic Preservation Tax Credits
 - ii. Supplemental write-ups for Design Handbook for Downtown Flagstaff
 - iii. Window Replacement guidelines for all Districts and Overlays
 - iv. Proper mothballing procedures

Mr. Reavis discussed the educational material he has put together for property owners.

V. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: March 18, 2019
Tiffany Antol, Planning Director will cover for Ms. Dechter at the next meeting
Ms. Dechter discussed future agenda items

VI. ADJOURNMENT : Chairman Hayward adjourned the meeting at 5:38 pm.