



# MINUTES - Approved

## City of Flagstaff

### HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

#### 4:00 PM – Wednesday, January 15, 2020

---

Flagstaff City Hall, **Council Chambers**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Tammy Bishop 928-213-2611 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

#### **CALL TO ORDER** Chairman Hayward called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair **Present**  
Harris Abernathy **Present**  
Charlie Webber **Present**  
Jerry McLaughlin **Present**  
Emily Dale **Present**  
Jill Hough **Present**  
Caitlin Kelly **Present**

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Staff Liaison  
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

#### **I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS**

##### **1. PUBLIC COMMENT**

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

**None**

**2. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements)

b. Introduction of the new Heritage Preservation Officer/Neighborhood Planner – Mark Reavis, AICP, NCARB

Ms. Dechter introduced the new HPO Mark Reavis

**3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.**

a. Regular meeting of December 18, 2019.

**Motion** to approve the minutes of the regular meeting of December 18, 2019 moved by Commissioner McLaughlin seconded by Commissioner Dale motion carried unanimously

**II. NEW BUSINESS:**

**1. Cultural Resource Study - Letter Report**

Address:	608 S Fountaine St.
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	APN 100-37-006
Property Owner:	David Carpenter, Elm Tree Apartments LLC
Applicant:	David Carpenter
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approval of a cultural resource study referred to the Commission by the HPO

This is a study of a 1957 building in the Booker T Washington Subdivision. The building was found to be non-contributing in 1993 and was not inventoried as part of the 2009 update for the Southside Historic District because it was outside the boundaries of the proposed district. The report finds that the property is not significant under any national, state or local register criteria.

RECOMMENDED ACTION: Staff recommends approval of the letter report with the condition that the additional information provided by the HPO be incorporated and submitted within 60 days.

Josh Edwards, Cornerstone, gave a brief description of the property described in the letter report for 608 S Fountaine St.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Webber moved to accept the letter report for 608 S Fountaine with additional information provided in email and phone calls be attached to the report as an appendix seconded by Commissioner McLaughlin motion carried 6-1 with Commissioner Hough dissenting

## 2. Appointment of Commission Chair and Vice-Chair

Chairman Hayward will continue in the position of Chair and Commissioner McLaughlin is nominated to the position of Vice-Chair

### III. REPORTS

#### 1. Review of Administrative Approvals:

- i. BP-19-02643 – 313 S SAN FRANCISCO ST, Flagstaff, AZ 86001 – Exemption from Cultural Resource Study, approved 1/3/2020, Findings: Property owner replaced non-conforming and mismatched windows on a contributing structure in the Southside Historic District with double hung non-conforming windows. A resource study was not required because of the integrity of the building was poor and the building has an unusually large front set back that makes the street facing windows less visible. The property owner voluntarily altered the window trim to mitigate the impact of the non-conforming windows and provide a deeper profile.

Ms. Dechter and Mr. Reavis gave a update on the administrative approval and exemption of window replacement at 313 S San Francisco.

### IV. DISCUSSION ITEMS:

#### 1. **Potential updates to the Historic Façade and Signs Grant Guidelines**

Economic Vitality staff will discuss possibly refinements and clarifications to the grant guidelines based on recent applications.

David McIntire, Community Investment Director, gave an update on the proposed changes to the grant guidelines.

#### 2. **Window replacement permits on historic properties**

With the implementation of the 2018 Energy Code on January 1, 2020, all window replacements now require a building permit. Staff will discuss some of the recent challenges with communicating this change to the owners of historic properties and ask for direction on how to implement Division 10.30-30 of the Zoning Code in this context.

Ms. Dechter gave an update on changes to the building code in reference to window replacement

Michael Gerner, resident, representing a townhome community within the townsite district that is considering replacing windows and expressing concern about the historic requirement of their windows

Kathy McConnell, resident, resident of townhomes

Mr. Reavis updated the commission on updates to window replacement codes and discussed how the commission would like to see these permits handled.

The direction of the commission is to use exemption #6 on same for same window replacements on nonconforming structures that are over 50 years old not including structures in the Downtown or Townsite overlay districts.

## **V. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

Building Safety is having issues with historic structures that aren't secured and have health and safety issues

Next meeting will be held February 19, 2020 with a get together to welcome Mark to his new position

**VI. ADJOURNMENT** : The Commission will adjourn to a downtown location for a celebration of the holidays. No Commission business will be discussed at this event. **Chairman Hayward** adjourned the meeting at 5:45 pm.