



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday July 15, 2020

ATTENTION

To attend and speak on a public hearing item, [Join Microsoft Teams Meeting](#)

The meetings will continue to be live streamed on the city's website (<https://www.flagstaff.az.gov/1461/Streaming-City-Council-Meetings>)

The public can submit comments that will be read at the dais by a staff member to the Commission liaison, sdechter@flagstaffaz.gov.

Flagstaff City Hall, **Staff Conference Room Remote Meeting**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Tammy Bishop 928-213-2611 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

CALL TO ORDER at 4:15pm – [Recording unavailable for first 12 minutes of the meeting](#)

COMMISSION MEMBERS:	David Hayward, Chair, x
	Jerry McLaughlin, Vice Chair, x
	Charlie Webber, x
	Emily Dale,x
	Jill Hough,x
	Caitlin Kelly x
	Harris Abernathy absent
CITY STAFF:	Sara Dechter, Commission Liaison
	Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer (HPO)
	Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

1. PUBLIC COMMENT (per remote meeting compliance requirements)

- a. (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

2. ANNOUNCEMENTS

- a. (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements) Note procedural changes required for remote meeting that is in compliance with open public meeting laws; which has been reviewed by Flagstaff staff attorneys.

Agenda Item for 608 W Aspen Avenue was removed from this agenda and rescheduled for the August Commission Meeting.

3. APPROVAL of MINUTES.

- a. Regular Meeting of June 17, 2020.

First by McLaughlin

Second by Hough

Approved 6-0

II. New Business:

1. PZ-20-00107 – Window Replacement, 220 W Cherry Ave.

Address: **220 W Cherry Ave.**

Assessor’s Parcel Number: 100-09-004

Property Owner: Cherry Flagstaff LLC

Applicant: David Carpenter

City Staff: Mark Reavis, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of Certificate of Appropriateness

The apartment building is located in the Townsite Overlay District but is not within the Townsite National Register Historic District. The proposal includes replacing aluminum windows with vinyl window that meets egress requirements and energy efficiency standards. Installation of the windows includes façade modifications for egress.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness if the Commission determines submission by the applicant shows that the window replacement project has no significant adverse effect on the integrity of the apartment complex or the adjacent historic district. The HPC may at its sole discretion make exceptions to the SOI's Standards for Rehabilitation of Historic Properties.

Mark introduced the application that the building is over 50 years old but not in the Townsite Overlay and summarized the findings of the staff report

Applicant, David Carpenter, says that he looked at the DOI standards and they were unable to put back in aluminum windows. Agrees with the staff report findings. They are proposing to keep the depth from the windows the same way and to lower the sills where egress requirements require a larger opening.

Hayward – What color will the vinyl be? Carpenter: White Vinyl; everything green will be painted white and everything white will be painted light gray. [color approval by HPO pending]

4:27pm 5-minute recess because the meeting was not streaming and there was no audio or recording underway

Return from recess at 4: 35pm

Charlie Webber left during the recess – excused

Hayward – recognized that a window that meets energy efficiency standards is no longer available in aluminum

Hough – requested further clarification on the windows effect to integrity and for more explanation of why the window opening s were being lengthened

Reavis – the changes to the window shape are an egress requirement we want to approve for life safety

Carpenter – the previous owner made the changes to breeze block and not the current owner

Reavis – concurred that it was the previous owner in the motion please make the interior courtyard and vinyl approval a clear exemptions with rationale

Motion: Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 220 W Cherry Ave for the use of vinyl windows to replace aluminum windows because of the lack of other available products and for the interior courtyard window changes that the Commission has determined do not have an adverse impact on the integrity of the building.

First by Hayward,
Second by McLaughlin;
Approved 5-0

Noted that the Chairman and applicant would like the HPO to have broader authority to approve cases like this – noted for a later work session

2. PZ-20-0016 – Exterior Renovation Grant Review, D’Aloisio Home

Address: 112 E Elm St..
Assessor’s Parcel Number: 101-10-011
Property Owner: D’Aloisio
Applicant: Aude Stang, Architect
City Staff: Mark Reavis, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of a Historic Facades and Signs Grant Application

Project reverses non-historic modification, project proposes to return home to original stucco and improved historic detailing compatible with the District. Project to receive Certificate of No Effect from HPO.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval of Historic Facades and Signs Grant application

Aude Stang, architect, presented the details of the changes proposed for the grant application

Harris Abernathy joined the meeting

Dale – where is the total cost estimate?

Aude Stang – the total costs will be much more than the \$20,000 exterior work

Reavis – he has determined that the work exceeds the \$20,000 amount and will review a full cost estimate administratively when submitted..

Motion: Approve the Facades and Signs grant with the condition that the estimate will be provided to the SHPO.

First by McLaughlin
Second by Dale
Approved 6-0

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. Downtown Use of Right of Way for Outdoor Seating and Pedestrians

City Council has directed staff to work with Downtown businesses to expand use of the City right-of-way, including roads and alleys, to allow for outdoor seating and

social distancing for pedestrians. The specifics of this proposal are still being developed. It will likely start with tables and chairs in Heritage Square, then some type of street closure, either full or half with opportunity for seating. Initial changes will be designed to be temporary but the project has the potential to evolve into more permanent urbanism in the future. Staff would like to receive early feedback from the Commission on heritage preservation considerations that should be carried forward in the development of this proposal.

Daniel Folke, Community Development Director, presented information about proposal from the Downtown Business Alliance and the City Council direction that staff received. Phased implementation will be rolling out in the next few weeks.

Hough – Have you discussed the alley closures and the issues for delivery in the Downtown? Folke – We are sensitive to that issue. They may be timed or have other mitigations

McLaughlin – hand washing stations and public restrooms are also a concern for the area. Please be sure to address that.

Hayward – no issue if everything is temporary, then no historic impact. If it is popular and will become regular then HPO will need to figure out how to bring it back to the commission

Dale – Thinking about tables and how many people may want to move them and how that could impact the bricks and aesthetic pavement.

Hayward – caution about how tables chairs and other features are installed so it does not damage a historic structure.

Folke – lighting has been part of the discussion and the impacts from the installation of lights could be a concern that is being discussed. Starting with picnic tables from the City's Parks Department. Spirit of what we are doing is to try something and see if it can be done responsibly.

IV. REPORTS:

1. Building Permit Reviews and Approvals:
 - i. BP-20-01082 – 8 E Route 66, Interior redesign with no exterior changes. Approved 6/23/2020. *Karma Sushi building.*
 - ii. BP-20-00969 – •918 W Summit Drive, Replacement of entire roof structure – HPC application requested 6/2020
 - iii. BP-20-0958 – • 1401 N. Beaver St (Corner of Forest Ave.), Modifications to a secondary building over 50 years old, including window replacements and garage door replacement. Approved 7/1/2020 – HPC application and fee.
 - iv. BP-20-01085 – • 19 W Aspen Ave., Interior redesign with no exterior changes. Approved 7/8/2020.
 - v. BP-20-01083 - 1619 N Fort Valley, Window and addition modification. Exempted as post-World War II production housing. Approved 6/24/2020
 - vi. BP-20-01130 – •329 W Oak Ave., Heer home window replacement. Approved 6/24/2020 – Post- WWII production housing.

- vii. BP-20-01189 – 3100 E MT Elden Dr. Post-WWII production housing. Approved 7/1/2020

IV. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

- a. Grant Inspections and Certification of Payment
 - i. 720 W Birch, CLT project home (Duffie) – home and garage completion request for payment.
 - ii. 19 N Park Street home rehabilitation – Wilbert Odem, home repair and painting.
- b. Section 106 compliance review
 - i. Rio de Flag Programmatic Agreement Amendments Army Corps – HPO review and comment return for 106 consultation.
- c. HPO Consultation
 - i. Window Replacement submissions with interface review between HPO/HPC requirements and Flagstaff Building Permits issuance. Ongoing work with procedures and public notification.
 - ii. 723 W Birch Ave Cindy Jalet – **possible façade grant for modified home within Townsite Overlay.**
 - iii. 11 E Aspen – Taco Restaurant signage & painting, possible grant. AKA Tex-Mex Bandera bbq cantina.
 - iv. Bruce & Nancy Helin 1800 N Hereford Dr. 1939 rock home at Coconino Estates - Possible historic listing of home.
 - v. Southside Stories – Marie Jones. Project implementation and concepts.
 - vi. 401 N Leroux – Consulting with architect on compliant window meeting SOI Standards for Leroux project and use for other reviews.
[Hough: Arizona Historical Society has some information on the significance of 401 N Leroux](#)
 - vii. 320 N Humphreys – School and Babbitt home redevelopment for Senior Housing – HPO research of project requirements.
 - viii. 28 S Beaver St – Flood proofing – non-historic building – No HP issues.
 - ix. Basque Handball court – Pelota Court S San Francisco – Resource protection issues with multiple property owners.
 - x. 3861S Marble Canyon Trail – Phone Call - Neighborhood issues passed on to other staff.
- d. Southside Historic Context
 - i. Working with consultant to complete contract and secure information.

- e. IDS (Internal Divisional System) Reviews underway
 - i. Project reviews by staff and required changes have potential to impact historic resources.
 - ii. Joy Cone PZ-20-00106, 2843 W Sharell St. Correct Heritage Resource question.
 - iii. O'Conner SFD (single family development) PZ-20-00974, 6770 North Rain Valley Road. Waiting for Cultural Resource Report if it exists. Project adjacent to Picture Canyon, concerns regarding archaeological resources and human remains.
 - iv. Panda Express, Market Place Street – No HP concerns.
 - v. Pine Knowle Brannon – continuing review.
 - vi. El Pueblo - containing review by IDS.
 - vii. Lowell Observatory – Continuing review of site plan by IDS. Site plan has improved identification of NHLD and its improvements and potential expansion of designated resources.
- f. Southside Plan – Public Hearing facilities and COVID accommodations.
- g. New submission timeline for HPC Submissions starting September 2020
[Discussed if there were other ways to address the noticing issues.](#)

[Request to have another update on windows and nonconforming issues. Possibly two work sessions, one about window review in general and one about options for allowing the HPO to do exemptions for windows in the Townsite Overlay.](#)

- h. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: **August 19, 2020**

VI. ADJOURNMENT [Adjourn at 5:43pm](#)

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on July 9, 2020 at 9:30 AM in accordance with the statement filed by the Recording Secretary with the City Clerk.

Dated ????? 2020.

Tammy Bishop, Recording Secretary