



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

4:00 PM – Wednesday August 19, 2020

The meeting was live streamed on the city's website (<https://www.flagstaff.az.gov/1461/Streaming-City-Council-Meetings>) and members of the public were able to join through a Microsoft Teams meeting posted on the Agenda.

The public submitted comments that will be read at the dais by a staff member to the Commission liaison, sdechter@flagstaffaz.gov.

Flagstaff City Hall, **Staff Conference Room Remote Meeting**, 211 W. Aspen Avenue



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Tammy Bishop 928-213-2611 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

Pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.02, notice is hereby given to the members of the Heritage Preservation Commission and to the general public that, at this meeting, the Heritage Preservation Commission may vote to go into executive session, which will not be open to the public, for legal advice and discussion with the City's attorneys for legal advice on any item listed on the following agenda, pursuant to A.R.S. §38-431.03(A)(3).

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS: David Hayward, Chair, - present
Jerry McLaughlin, Vice Chair, -present
Charlie Webber, -present
Emily Dale, - excused, arrived late
Jill Hough, - present
Caitlin Kelly - excused
Harris Abernathy - present

CITY STAFF: Sara Dechter, Commission Liaison
Mark Reavis, Heritage Preservation Officer (HPO)
Becky Cardiff, Recording Secretary

I. PRELIMINARY GENERAL BUSINESS

- **PUBLIC COMMENT** (per remote meeting compliance requirements)
 - (At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.)

None

- **ANNOUNCEMENTS**
 - (Reconsiderations, Changes to the Agenda, and other Preliminary Announcements) Note procedural changes required for remote meeting that is in compliance with open public meeting laws; which has been reviewed by Flagstaff staff attorneys.

Reminder for the public attending the meeting that public remarks are limited to 3 minutes per the City’s Board and Commissions Handbook.

- **APPROVAL of MINUTES.**
 - Regular Meeting of July 15, 2020.

1st by Hough 2nd by McLaughlin; Approved with change to heading from “Agenda” to “Minutes” 5-0

II. New Business:

1. PZ-20-00107 – Certificate of Appropriateness - 608 West Aspen Ave.

Address:	608 W Aspen Ave.
Assessor’s Parcel Number:	100-16-002
Property Owner:	Joel Agena
Applicant:	Joel Agena - Anne Soper, Architect, owner representative
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Approval of Certificate of Appropriateness

The apartment duplex building is located in the Townsite Overlay District and is within the Townsite National Register Historic District. The proposal includes adding a 2-story addition to the existing 2-story structure with the addition of front and back covered porches. The project includes the installation of new windows, painting and includes primary **façade modifications** for a compatible entry **façade**.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff finds that the front street façade modification are in compliance with the Townsite Overlay Zone standards guidelines. Staff does not have a recommendation for the rear addition and side yard improvements and would like the Heritage Preservation Commission to consider whether or not these changes to the building are architecturally appropriate and considerate of the impacts to the nearby historic structures.

Introduction by Mark Reavis, HPO

Presentation by Anne Soper, architect and owner representative

Commissioner Dale arrived during Ms. Soper's presentation

Public comment

- One email comment from Gerret van Hylckama
- Spoken Comment from Armando Berlasconi
- Verbal Comment from Duffie Westheimer
- Ms. Westheimer provided an additional written comment to the Commission by email which staff distributed prior to the vote.

1st by McLaughlin, 2nd by Webber, Approved 4-0-2, Dale and Hough abstained.

2. PZ-20-00140 – Historic Façade and Signs Grant, Lepler Home

Address: **407 W Aspen Ave.**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 100-22-015

Property Owner: Lepler Trust

Applicant: Lisa Leap/Maile Adler

City Staff: Mark Reavis, HPO

REQUESTED ACTION: Approval of a Historic Facades and Signs Grant Application

Project maintains and protects the historic aspects of the home. The project proposes rehabilitation techniques to protect the home per SOI Standards that includes painting (same color scheme) historic style storm window to protect the divided light windows and soffit repair at corner damage areas. The project has noted compliance with the US Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation. Project to receive Certificate of No Effect from HPO.

RECOMMENDATION: Approval of Historic Facades and Signs Grant application

Introduction by Mark Reavis HPO

Applicant provided additional information

Public comment:

- Email comment from Monika Bentley read aloud
- Spoken comment from Duffie Westheimer

1st by Hough, 2nd by Abernathy, Approved 6-0,

3. PZ-20-00141 – Historic Façade and Signs Grant, Sign Restoration, Whispering Winds Motel

Address:	922 E Route 66.
Assessor's Parcel Number:	104-05-005
Property Owner:	WW 66 LLC
Applicant:	Jose Alvarado, owner representative
City Staff:	Mark Reavis, HPO
REQUESTED ACTION:	Review of a potential Historic Facades and Signs Grant Application – historic Route 66 sign restoration/rehabilitation.

Proposal to provide a grant for the rehabilitation of the Whispering Winds Motel Sign. The property was inventoried by the National Park Service and is eligible for the National Register. Project may be reviewed for non-grant HP compliance from HPO.

RECOMMENDATION: Review potential for Historic Facades and Signs Grant application and Landmark Designation.

1st by McLaughlin, 2nd by Abernathy, Approved full historic sign restoration with condition that the Landmark rezoning required by the Zoning Code is approved. 6-0 in favor.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. Meeting Time Change

The Commission will determine if they would like the September, October, and November 2020 meetings to begin at 5pm to offset a work conflict for one of the commissioners.

Agreed

IV. REPORTS:

1. Building Permit Reviews and Approvals:
 - i. BP-20-01082 & PZ-20-00129 – 8 E Route 66, Interior redesign with no exterior changes. Approved 6/23/2020. *Karma Sushi & adjacent building w/ additional work with possible impacts to primary façade – resolved.* Review of alley façade modification (linking 6 & 8 buildings. Non-historic tertiary façade but compatible – Certificate of no Effect, 7/16/2020
 - ii. BP-20-00969 – •918 W Summit Drive, Replacement of entire roof structure – HPC application requested 6/2020. *Not currently proceeding, may have provided repair recommendation that will not result in significant impact to intact historic home.*
 - iii. BP-20-01085 – 19 W Aspen, Babb Financial, interior remodel and sign review 7/8/2020. Non-historic building but within Downtown Overlay, Certificate of No Effect.
 - iv. BP-20-01189- 3100 E Mont Elden Dr. 1925 home, Mrs. Shaff. 3 windows to be replaced. Waiting for Contractor to submit appropriate documentation.
 - v. PZ-20-00121 – 409 S San Francisco, Carpenter/Hope const. Small bar addition to non-contributing building within Southside Historic District. CR report confirmation. Small airstream Trailer to be removed.
 - vi. PZ-20-00132– 401 N Leroux St, Birchfield Remodel, Certificate of No Effect for window and door replacement project, 7/22/2020
 - vii. PZ-20-00136 – 824 W Cherry Ave, Collier shed/office. Certificate of No Effect with compliance review of Townsite Requirements, 7/29/2020
 - viii. PZ-20-00138 – 3615 E Industrial Dr, Shamrock Foods. Review and approval of “letter report” for demolition of warehouse building with billboard signs, 7/31/2020
 - ix. BP- 20-01328 – Museum building #11, 3100 N Fort Valley Road. Attic interior roof reinforcement. Project within museum overlay. Approved with condition of HPC application.

IV. ANNOUNCEMENTS

(Informal Announcements, Future Agenda Items, and Next Meeting Date)

a. Grants, Inspections and Certification of Payment

- i. 720 W Birch, CLT project home, follow up confirm payment.
- ii. McMillian Bank – no architectural plan submission – grant active.
- iii. D’Aloisio 112 E Elm, grant active, HPO to monitor compliance.
- iv. Christian Fellowship/ Historic Baptist Church. Roofing project complete.

b. Section 106 compliance review

- i. Rio de Flag Programmatic Agreement Amendments Army Corps – HPO review and comment return for 106 consultation. Confirmation from

Corps of HPO included provisions for required interpretive mitigation products, full specifications for interpretive plaques including mounting and all cost covered by Army Corps. Can be utilized as a model for future mitigation products for public installations.

c. HPO Consultation

- i. 401 N Leroux – Consulting with architect on compliant window, doors and detailing, meeting SOI Standards for Leroux project and use for other reviews. Waiting for full plan submission and Building Permit.
- ii. 824 Cherry – Small office/shed review of compliance within Townsite Overlay. HPC application submitted- awaiting improvement permit review.
- iii. Window Replacement submissions with interface review between HPO/HPC requirements and Flagstaff Building Permits issuance. Ongoing work with procedures with contractors and suppliers and public education and notification.
- iv. 723 W Birch Ave Cindy Jalet – **possible façade grant for modified** home within Townsite Overlay, owner working with neighbors on application and compliance with standards.
- v. 11 E Aspen – Taco Restaurant signage - AKA Tex-Mex Bandera bbq cantina, Downtown Overlay review for Guideline compliance, no grant requested.
- vi. Southside Stories – Marie Jones, Dr Guthrie & others. Project implementation possibilities, interface with Heritage Preservation Program and relationship to Southside Plan and Historic Context Document. Several email exchanges and video conferencing.
- vii. 320 N Humphreys – 1960s Catholic School and Babbitt home - redevelopment for Senior Housing – HPO discussion of demolition project requirements. HPO has acknowledged larger school will require demolition in order to accommodate Low-income senior housing project with a minimum of a CR letter report. Efforts will continue with exploration of avoidance of Historic Babbitt Home.
- viii. Federal Building, 114 N San Francisco – minor change to railing cap (safety & manufacture) HPO review.
- ix. Basque Handball court – Pelota Court S San Francisco – Resource protection issues with multiple property owners- only initial investigation, requires follow up.

d. Southside Historic Context

- i. Consultant wrapping up contracted work.
- e. IDS (Internal Divisional System) Reviews underway & monitoring - Project reviews by staff and required changes have potential to impact historic resources.
 - i. PZ-20-0034 – 42 S Trail of the Woods, Taney Multi-Family housing project. Question regarding 50 year plus home. Site investigation notes home is part of post WWII production housing in development.
 - ii. O’Conner SFD (single family development) PZ-20-00974, 6770 North Rain Valley Road. Waiting for Cultural Resource Report if it exists. Project adjacent to Picture Canyon, concerns regarding archaeological resources and human remains.
 - iii. BP-20-01180 & Oz-19-00024– 23 N Izabel St 7/9/2020. Apt complex no HP concerns.
 - iv. PZ-20-00124 829 E Butler, AZ Credit Union. Project on developed site 7/9/2020.
 - v. PZ-20-00122 – 5000 Cottonwood – required correction of application with Heritage resource fill out. Post WWII production housing.
 - vi. PZ-20-0089 – Canyon Del Rio 3200 E Butler Ave. Developed land with subdivision proceeding.
 - vii. PZ-20-00123 – 24 W Oak Ave “24 Oak” 5unit development – No HP requirements.
 - viii. PZ-20-00131 – 1860 S Milton, In n Out Burger – demo – no HP
 - i. PZ-18-00194-04 Miramonte @ Butler – 207 S Beaver – previous reviewed & approved for HP.
 - ii. BP-20=00451-01 – 525 N Switzer Canyon Dr, Skypoint Orthopedic Center – demo for construction – No HP.
 - iii. BP-20=01419 – 11 E Pine Ave – Uhl interior Demo, Not 50+ No HP.
- f. Previous reviews -ongoing
 - i. DCS offices/Mygrant Glass – 2163 N Vickey St
 - ii. CIC
 - iii. Jet Towing
 - iv. Pine Knole Brannon
 - v. El Pueblo – multiple review of 5 buildings.
 - vi. Lowell Observatory – Continuing - identification of NHLD and its improvements and potential expansion of designated resources
 - vii. Southside Plan – Public Hearing at Our Lady of Guadalupe, parking lot set up.

- g. Concept development of art mounting framework for alley installations. Framework independent of historic buildings to prevent damage. Work with Flagstaff Arts and other staff to initiate prototype installation.
- h. New timeline for HPC Submissions and agenda and packet delivery process starting September 2020
- i. Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: **September 16, 2020**

VI. ADJOURNMENT

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on July 9, 2020 at 9:30 AM in accordance with the statement filed by the Recording Secretary with the City Clerk.

Dated ?????? 2020.

Tammy Bishop, Recording Secretary