

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

December 3rd, 2020

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held December 3rd, 2020, to order at 4:31 pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Kauffman
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkel
<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Dailey
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Coffey	

Others present: Dylan Lenzen (Staff Liaison), Lisa Clark (Staff Liaison), Nicole Antonopoulos (Staff Liaison), Marissa Molloy (Minutes), Sandra Lubarsky (Presenter), Austin Aslan (City Council Liaison)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Konkel, seconded by Commissioner Coffey to approve the October 22nd, 2020, minutes.

Vote: 5 – 0 Unanimously passed

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

5. Business

A. Potential Collaboration with Beautification & Public Art Commission (BPAC) (15 minutes)

Sandra Lubarsky, Commissioner, BPAC

Requested Action: Information & Discussion

Chair McCain briefly introduced the proposal. Ms. Lubarsky with the Beautification & Public Art Commission (BPAC) reached out to Chair McCain in October about collaborating on this project with the Sustainability commission. They would like to propose a project with the theme of sustainability, focusing on the Climate Action and Adaption Plan (CAAP), climate change, and hope.

Ms. Lubarsky shared more about BPAC and her vision for collaboration. She has become the liaison between BPAC and the Sustainability Commission. Currently, BPAC is in the midst of their 5 year budget planning. While Ms. Lubarsky is not sure where in the timeline of the 5 year plan a Sustainability proposal would fall and cannot guarantee funding, she will bring forward a proposal to BPAC to request funding if approved by the Sustainability Commission. Afterword, the Sustainability Commission would work with BPAC staff to put out a call to artists. These artists will be vetted through a committee.

Vice Chair White mentioned that one of the main issues in dealing with climate change and sustainability in general is conspicuous consumption from cultural markers of status. He asked if the commission could consider art projects that would reduce conspicuous consumption as status symbols, specifically water consumption. Ms. Lubarsky answered that the project doesn't have to be framed in a way that would encourage conspicuous consumption, and there could be more than one project. Ms. Lubarsky said there will be a theme, such as climate change, the CAAP, or water and its scarcity, that would put boundaries on projects. She added the artists will have to demonstrate their materials are sustainable and appropriate for the environment.

Commissioner Konkell asked if it was possible to stipulate that the artist is located in Northern Arizona. Ms. Lubarsky answered that according to procurement guidelines, proposals cannot be restricted to a certain population. She added there may be some way to language the proposal to encourage local artists. Ms. Antonopoulos agreed that there is framing that can be put in place that will lend itself to Flagstaff residents, such as local climate and community cultural identity.

Commissioner Dailey asked how firmly the desire was to tie it to the climate action plan. He expressed interest in tying a project to three or five higher level takeaways from the climate action plan. This would encourage interaction with the document.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Ms. Lubarsky mentioned the potential of collaborating on art in public gardens. Ms. Antonopoulos spoke to the history of partnering with BPAC. BPAC has funded some of the current garden infrastructure, such as water service lines. Mr. Lenzen also mentioned conversations he's been having with BPAC members about a potential project at the O'Leary St. garden. They are trying to come up with a public art project that will increase interest and cement the garden into the surrounding community.

Ms. Lubarsky also mentioned the Beautification In Action grants (BIA). Funding for these grants has increased to \$4,500 dollars and could be used for sustainability related projects. She suggests asking for a significant amount of funding so a substantial project could be taken.

Vice Chair White asked for clarification on the proposal. Chair McCain responded that the proposal was for the Sustainability Commission to request that BPAC allocates \$20,000 for a public art project based on climate change and hope.

Moved by Commissioner Konkel and seconded by Chair McCain to approve the proposal for the Sustainability Commission to request that the BPAC allocate \$20,000 for a public art project focused on climate change and hope.

Discussion: No comment

Vote: 5-0 unanimously passed

B. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Revisions – Working Group Update (30 minutes)

Commissioner Konkel and Lisa Clark, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Discussion & Vote

Commissioner Konkel explained some revisions that were made to the Sustainability Grant. Commissioner Kauffman and Chair McCain were a part of the working group. This group looked to address concerns raised in a survey after the last Sustainability Grant reviews. Nothing in the review process was changed. A draft of changes was only completed for the application process. Edits included those for continuity, clarity, simplicity for applicants and commissioners, and changes made based on responses from the survey.

One of the big items Commissioner Konkel wanted to ask the commission about was the potential of hosting grant writing workshops. The working group had discussed providing support for grant writing. It would help to ensure equitable access to this opportunity and potentially result in grants being awarded to new applicants. With this in mind, a Support for Grant Writing page was added. She would like to have

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

previous high ranking proposals posted for applicants to reference, but will need to look into this with Ms. Clark.

The Project Objectives Section was added as a unique section of the grant where the applicant will check off which objectives their proposal meets and then write a description of what activity aligns with that objective. If there is an overwhelming amount of proposals to review, Sustainability Program Staff can prescreen applications based on this question. This also keeps the commission from having to guess what objectives were met.

Vice Chair White asked if the "Education and Outreach" section was moved from "General Objectives" to "Category Objectives" in order to not be weighted twice during the ratings. Commissioner Konkol confirmed this and stated that this provides more specific and relevant examples of education depending on the category. Chair McCain stated this should make things easier for applicants and the commission. Commissioner Konkol continued saying it was helpful to have category specific examples of education that can give applicants ideas and ensure relevance to their project. This also highlights the importance of educational outreach in a project as it is in every category.

Commissioner Konkol asked if anyone had any thoughts on the potential grant writing workshop. Ms. Clark said Sustainability Staff can take point on workshops, but it would be great to have support from commission members. This would enable applicants to ask questions from the people evaluating the proposals. Ms. Molloy would likely take point on organizing these workshops unless another commissioner or staff person prefers to do so. Commissioner Konkol said the goal is to build consistency in the training and applications. Staff will be influential in designing the workshop process and she sees staff playing a larger role in that process. This will be an evolving training, and commissioners can lead later if they have time. Staff should provide support at first and assess as we move forward. Chair McCain is interested in being involved in first round.

Commissioner Konkol said it would be helpful to work more closely with Ms. Clark to make sure everything lines up to the vision the Sustainability Program had with staff involvement and to wrap up small details in this document. Chair McCain agrees she should work with Ms. Clark and Ms. Antonopoulos over the specifics.

Moved by Chair McCain and seconded by Vice Chair White to approve revisions to the Sustainability Grant, including final work with Staff on workshop and document details.

Discussion: Commissioner Konkol asked about the timeline of this project and if we

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

would use this revision for the next round of applicants before the end of the year. Chair McCain remembered talking about using this application for FY2021. Ms. Clark agreed that this would be good for consistency's sake.

Vote:

Motion passes 5-0 unanimously

C. Reopening of Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Application (10 minutes)

Lisa Clark, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion & Vote

Ms. Clark presented the timeline for the reopening of the Sustainability Grant. Additional funds were leftover after awarding previous grants. \$4000 remain for water conservation projects, and a little over \$3000 remain for other projects in climate action, resilience, food, and waste. This should lead to two water conservation projects and two sustainability project grants awarded based on applications recieved.

The proposed timeline is as follows:

Dec 14- Start advertising
Jan 4- Open applications
Feb 5- Close applications
Feb 11- Send applications to commission
Feb 25- Presentations
Mar 1- Reward date

Ms. Clark asked for approval from the commission to go forward with this timeline.

Commissioner Konkel asked how long the usual advertising period is, if the same amount of applications are expected, and if this is a shortened advertising time. Ms. Clark believes the spring timeline was about the same as this timeline. The grant should be advertised a little before opening but not long enough for applicants to forget. Advertising will continue while the application is open as well. There are usually not as many applications in the second round because fewer people are thinking of this kind of work at this time. This might change with creative ideas around Covid. If the advertising window is changed, presentations will likely need to be pushed back to the March meeting, which in turn pushes up on next fiscal year. In the past year or two, applications were kept open for an additional month. This is an option as well if there are not enough applications. Keeping applications open can be discussed in the January meeting if needed.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Moved by Commissioner Konkel and seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the Sustainability Grant Reopening Timeline.

Vote:

5-0 motion passes unanimously.

D. Materials Recovery Facility Planning Update (5 minutes)

Dylan Lenzen, Sustainability Specialist, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information

Mr. Lenzen gave an update on direction from Council on which Materials Recovery Facility (MRF) option to pursue. Current contract is set to expire in Sept 2023. Mr. Lenzen gave five options to Council: a hub and spoke model with Flagstaff processing additional recyclables from smaller jurisdictions, a transfer operation to Phoenix MRF for processing, to operate internally after facility updates and upgrades, usage of a different private MRF operator, or the suspension of recycling collections and processing. In the October Council meeting, City Council directed staff to pursue transferring material to an MRF in Phoenix, using the existing facility and removing current equipment so materials can be tipped, stored, and loaded for hauling recyclables to Phoenix. At Flagstaff's current volume, seven trips are estimated to be needed on average per week. Benefits include increased diversion due to better technology in Phoenix, better flexibility, a shorter arrangement if contract changes are needed, opportunity for innovation, and the ability to use Flagstaff's facility to collect different materials through drop off programs. This was the most cost-efficient option that still included picking up recyclable materials. A consultant will be brought on to create a design for the transfer station and how transport is handled. Once that is figured out, a plan will be put in place on how to efficiently deconstruct the facility and transition, and how to continue to process recyclables during this time. Cost estimates will then be refined and an MRF arrangement and hauling arrangement will be finalized.

Commissioner Coffey asked about the timeline for this process. Mr. Lenzen said there is no timeline worked out right now, but it will need to happen before expiration of the contract in 2023. He is having discussions with the consultant to figure out next steps.

Commissioner Dailey asked what percentage by weight gets put in people's bins is non-recyclable material. Mr. Lenzen answered that Flagstaff's current contamination rate is 35%. Solid waste staff says that number isn't totally accurate, but they are currently limited by the technology in the existing facility and how it sorts material. Commissioner Daily responded that the focus should be put on education around

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

recycling. Mr. Lenzen agreed that this will help with costs. Contamination affects costs from the MRF to process material. The incentive for good recyclable materials is high.

Councilmember Aslan said it was a great review and summary of what Council chose to do. There were good options in the presentation and he would like to look long term at how to process recyclables in Flagstaff, however he doesn't see Flagstaff ready for this yet as a municipality. He agreed with Commissioner Dailey about recyclable education.

E. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan Update (5 minutes)

Nicole Antonopoulos, sustainability Director, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Information & Discussion

Ms. Antonopoulos gave an update on Climate Action and Adaptation Plan revisions. These revisions are taking place as a result of the Climate Emergency Declaration by Council on June 23rd. These revisions will accelerate the Climate Action Plan. The goal of 80% greenhouse emissions reductions by 2050 has been changed to carbon neutrality by 2030.

Staff is continuing community education efforts. Presentations to 70 community members in various commissions have taken place. Staff is taking in advice from a steering committee and community members who participated in a survey. Just under 500 community members participated in this survey. Staff is engaging with technical experts and consultants they worked with on the Climate Adaptation Plan for help with data calculation and sector-based targets in solid waste, energy, transportation, and carbon sequestration areas. They are looking at a 10-year investment scenario for the community and Council to consider. Ms. Antonopoulos will be providing an update to the new Council on January 12th. She will be going over the Emergency Declaration and the work that has gone into the revision. An updated Climate Action and Adaptation Plan will be presented to City Council on February 16th for formal approval. Ms. Antonopoulos says the updated CAAP carbon neutrality goals need to be viewed as a living document. A firm path will be set for the first couple years, but there needs to be room for movement and new strategies to achieve the carbon neutrality goal for 2030.

Ms. Antonopoulos stated all work in sustainability supports work in climate action. Sustainability Grants and Beautification projects support this plan. She recognized climate action is broad and every action will help achieve aggressive and bold goals.

Ms. Antonopoulos can provide the commission with a detailed update in January as well as information provided to Council. She will be leaning on the commission for a

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

quick turnaround on this information.

F. Sustainability Section Update (5 minutes)

Dylan Lenzen, Sustainability Specialist, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Information

Mr. Lenzen gave an update and the Sustainability Section.

Ms. Molloy introduced herself as the new Administrative Assistant for the sustainability program. She will be taking over for Ms. Clark's commission duties, working with Maggie Twomey on event planning and community stewards, and providing assistance to the rest of the team.

City Council returned to phase 2 of their Covid reentry plan, which went into effect on November 30th. City hall and both libraries are closed to public, events are limited to 10 participants, and parks are open with the exception of ramadas. Mr. Lenzen said there will not be a huge impact on sustainability's work as staff is still working remotely and it is the slow season for events.

Mr. Lenzen then went over upcoming events. Community meetings will be held for the McMillan Mesa Rezone to discuss the rezone application in response to ballot initiative prop 413 rezone for public open space. Two meetings will be held on December 14th and January 13th from 5pm-7pm over zoom. Home energy efficiency workshops are happening virtually and staff is able to give out materials in a socially distanced manner after the event. The next one is January 7th at 6pm.

Mr. Lenzen gave an update on other areas of the Sustainability Program. Open space is working on the McMillan Mesa rezone. Those who miss the meeting can provide feedback through a survey on the city's community forum page. Open space also performed some Picture Canyon trail maintenance, leveling slopes on trails with volunteers. Food and Waste has been working on the Izabel and Bonito gardens, which are now accepting food scraps. Marketing for this will be delayed to make sure surrounding communities get the most benefits from this before opening it up to other communities. Staff is reporting on actions completed for the Mayor's 2020 monarch pledge to create habitats for monarchs and other pollinators. Staff is currently planning to repledge in 2021 with a new set of actions. The Christmas tree recycling program is coming up. Trees will be processed as mulch at the landfill. Curbside pickup will take place on January 4th. There will also be drop-offs at the Sustainability Office and Continental Park. Climate staff is working with APS to install new electric charging stations at the library, airport, and aquaplex as well as a winter energy efficiency campaign on social media. The Community Stewards section has been working on a new volunteer management software.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Commissioner Coffey announced a social action participation event coming up on Friday December 11th, from 12pm-2pm. Participants will gather appropriately with masks at City Hall to raise awareness for the 5-year anniversary of the Paris Climate Agreement.

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

none

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on December 3rd, 2020, adjourned at 6:15 pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2020.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison