



**BEAUTIFICATION AND PUBLIC ART COMMISSION**  
**APPROVED MINUTES**

December 14, 2020 – 4:00 p.m.

*City of Flagstaff – Microsoft Teams Remote Meeting*

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko, (928) 213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

City Staff: Eliza Kretzmann – Staff Liaison, Jana Weldon – Project Administrator, Creag Znetko – Recording Secretary

- A. **The Public is Invited to Attend this Remote Meeting:** Please join us via Microsoft Teams by clicking on the following link, which brings you to the live meeting: [Join Microsoft Teams Meeting](#)

Please turn your camera off and mute your microphone except when speaking. If you need an invitation to the meeting, email [cznetko@flagstaffaz.gov](mailto:cznetko@flagstaffaz.gov) prior to 3:00 p.m. on Monday, December 14.

**Provide Public Comment Prior to the Meeting:** Email [eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov](mailto:eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov) with your public comment prior to 3:00 p.m. on the Monday of the meeting and it will be read during the public comment section or during the item to which your comment pertains.

- A. **CALL TO ORDER** Chair Garcia called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

**B. ROLL CALL:**

Anthony Garcia, Chair, [present](#)  
Sandra Lubarsky, Vice-Chair, [present](#)  
George Averbeck, [absent](#)  
J Michael Cruz, [present](#)

Carla McCord, [present](#)  
Jeremy Slater, [present](#)  
Kraig Weber, [present](#)

**C. UPCOMING EVENTS:**

[NONE](#)

**D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

*The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or acting on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commissioners may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. Public comment should be sent to [eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov](mailto:eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov), prior to 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting or during the designated public participation section.*

[NONE](#)

**E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- A. November BPAC Meeting  
B. October Budget Retreat

**MOTION:** Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve the minutes with suggested corrections. Commissioner Cruz seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**MOTION:** Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve the November minutes as submitted. Commissioner Slater seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

## F. ACTION ITEMS

### A. Continued Budget Decisions – Arts and Sciences: Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts & Sciences Manager, City of Flagstaff.

In October, BPAC met for a budget retreat. This continued discussion will determine items for the Arts and Sciences portion of the Bed, Board, and Beverage (BBB) tax allocation, including:

- Recap of decisions made during October budget retreat.
- Suggested recession measures for the budget by staff: recap cut projects in recession measures in the fall of 2020, and suggested budget changes by staff.
- Time-sensitive Decisions: determine direction for: (1) \$5K of funding for temporary public art project with ArtWins; and (2) Determine direction for \$50K funding request in FY22 for an Art Festival (either the locally-led 'Art and Ideas' Festival or ArtWins). This can be earmarked for something specific, such as public art, or left as a more flexible item if funded.

**Suggested Action:** Hear the presentation and determine changes to the Arts and Sciences budget and the direction for the time-sensitive items listed above.

Staff presented to the commission and discussed sensitive timelines about budget processes. Staff reminded the commission of some of the cuts that had already been made. FY22: Identified \$230k in cuts.

**Indigenous Representation: \$75k in FY22 and \$50k in FY23 and FY24.**

Staff suggests moving across multiple years.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Does the Coordinator for Indigenous Initiatives know about the budget cuts?

Staff: Happy to speak with her, have not spoken about the budget specifically.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Makes sense to spread out over a couple years.

Commissioner McCord: Meeting with the indigenous commission would be appropriate and beneficial. Agrees that spreading out over multiple years is good.

**City Hall Lawn Project:** Eliminate the art aspect of this project, **\$12.5K**

**Banner Sign Holders:** Move to beautification, **\$10.5k**

**Traffic Boxes:** Move to beautification but retain \$10k for increasing funds for the indoor art program.

Staff: Juvenile Courts are building a new center for court purposes and are asking to have some murals painted when the project is completed. Would like to have the funding available for this.

Commission: Agrees

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Recap of the cuts so far?

Staff: Identified \$364K for FY22 to cut.

**FY23:** Looking good and no cuts are necessary.

**FY24:** Need to identify \$111k

**Rio Project:**

Staff: There is \$115k for the art component of this project, this can take care of this.

Heidi: There is grant funding identified for this project, can we use that money?

Discussion included how the grant requires a certain amount of vegetation and having some historical plaques placed throughout but, as understood at this moment, there is not funding for an art project.

Staff: Happy to dig further.

Heidi Hansen: The library had funding set aside for the Rio project and found out that the approved grant can satisfy the projects that the funding was set aside for, thus, releasing the funds for other use. Just curious if we can apply that here.

Staff: This is likely the only funding source for public art for the project but will investigate it.

Chair Garcia: Would make sense to look at future years for the Rio.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Timing is important. Would like more information on the timeline of the project. Doesn't want to cut entire line item.

Staff: Yes, we will get more information.

Chair Garcia: Agrees that timing is key and having a placeholder makes sense.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: I understand that it should take about six years from the start of the project to completion. We should leave some funding in this line item.

Staff: We can move this to the next FY and not miss it at all.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: If we move it to FY25, what is the impact? Can we leave some funding in case we have an opportunity in FY24?

Discussion ensued about cutting projects and the impact it would have on the budget.

Commissioner Cruz: Can we discuss deleting 7 projects to save one?

Chair Garcia: If we move the entire line item for the Rio to FY25, we wouldn't need to cut the seven other items suggested.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Would like to leave \$25k to \$30k in FY24 and identify a smaller project(s) to cut but is comfortable moving all to FY25.

Staff: It is simplest to move all funding to FY25 but can move a partial amount and cut smaller projects.

Discussion included which projects can be cut and how the funding can be rolled forward if the line item is not spent.

Commission agrees to keep \$20k in the Rio line item and cut the Aspen Bike Pedestrian Improvements for FY24.

Staff: We have identified the cuts needed but would like to remind the commission that there is not much room for new ideas, although there are two time sensitive items to review.

#### **Art Wins:**

Staff: We can fund the temporary art installation with cuts identified already. Only \$5k to \$10k is needed to start in FY22. There is a lot of interest in this project in its entirety including the art festival, which would be \$50k. Would like to get clarity and direction from the commission.

Chair Garcia: There is funding available but would like to know where we are with the buffalo sculpture.

Staff: We have a survey ready to get input from the community, placed on hold during the pandemic. Will explore what reengaging this project will do. City leadership is very interested in keeping this.

The commission is looking to move forward with all the funding that Art Wins is asking for. \$10k from the Route 66 sculpture for the temporary art installation and moving \$50k from the Buffalo sculpture line and retaining \$25k.

**MOTION:** Commissioner McCord moved to approve the suggested decisions to the Arts & Sciences Budget. Commissioner Slater seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

B. **Continued Budget Decisions – Beautification Items:** Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts & Sciences Manager, City of Flagstaff.

In October, BPAC met for a budget retreat (as mentioned above in Action Item A). The Commission did not determine details of the Beautification Budget during the retreat. This is to continue the conversation and the decisions related to budget for Beautification. This meeting will include:

- Current active projects and programs across all areas for context of work.
- Consider culling the list. Look over existing Beautification projects to determine if any no longer feel like a priority and cut items that are no longer priority.
- As time allows: New suggestions for next Fiscal Year (FY22) from Commission and Staff for beautification projects. Recap decisions made during budget retreat. Recap ideas brought forward from the Commission at the retreat; discuss other new ideas and go over staff suggestions gathered from the public and the City and determine which items the Commission wants to move forward for the updated budget.
- At future meetings in early 2021 we will discuss new projects in later years out (FY23 and beyond) and prioritize beautification projects.

**Suggested Action:** Hear the presentation and determine if any Beautification items are recommended to be cut as they are no longer priority to the Commission. Determine direction of new beautification project proposals for FY22. The beautification discussion will continue into January 2021.

Staff presented current projects as well as a few new projects and stated there is funding available for completing them. This will determine what direction the commission will move towards in the future.

**Phone Booth Library: \$20k**

Staff: This was put on hold during the pandemic and Chair Garcia asked if this project can have its own line item.

Chair Garcia: Can we fund this?

Staff: Yes

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Sandbag Beautification: \$10k**

Staff: Can we make these less ugly?

Chair Garcia: Community input is positive but concerned about the work involved.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Can we make them in different colors? What if we had a fund available for the public to utilize for creating a better barrier?

Commissioner Cruz: Can we get sandbags that resemble stone? Maybe issue an RFP for design ideas. Likes to have funding available.

Commissioner McCord: The county has a better understanding of how long these will be here; we can have a placeholder for when we get a solid idea.

Staff: There are BIA Grants available to the public for this type of project. This being a new project, do we want to fund it separately?

Commission is supportive to move forward with its own line item.

**Traffic Signal Boxes: \$10k (moved from Arts & Sciences)**

Staff: We can move funding and add more to this program.

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Theatrikos: \$91k**

Staff: Last discussion was about covering all the costs, window murals, sandstone restoration and paying the artists, with Beautification funds.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: This seems like a big project, does staff have the time?

Staff: They have a clear vision of what they would like to do. Staff would phase this into smaller steps and help when needed, knowing this could take significant staff time. They will apply for a BIA grant if this does not get funded.

Discussion included whether this can be split into two projects, how much staff time is required, can the BIA grant get the ball rolling, and how splitting this project into two could affect the procurement process and timelines for completion.

Chair Garcia: Can we move this out to a different fiscal year?

Staff: If that is what the commission would like to direct staff to do, yes, we can.

Commission: Would like to inform Theatrikos of the BIA grant process to get it started. Then have them come back to the commission with a timeframe of when it may be feasible to complete this.

**Library Entry Project Increase: Additional \$150k**

Discussion included clarity on the increase as the original design has changed and evolved profoundly since it's inception.

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Banners in the Historic Core: \$20k**

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Will this cut into staff time? Consider the storefront activation and leave this for next year.

Staff: Agrees with moving this to next year.

Commission agrees.

**4<sup>th</sup> St – Lockett Roundabout: \$125k**

Discussion included the relationship to the Switzer Roundabout project, and this won't be really considered ready to go before the construction is complete.

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Empty Storefront Activation: \$20k**

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Sustainability/Beautification Collaboration on Climate Change and Hope: \$20k**

Vice Chair Lubarsky: How does the BPAC commission feel about this? The NAIPTA bus wraps can be a good conduit to fund this idea with an existing line item that has \$25k available.

Staff: We can use the bus wrap line item to fund this.

Commission is supportive to move forward.

**Rotary Club Centennial Clock: \$14.5k (total project \$40k)**

Commissioner Weber: Is there landscaping?

Staff: Yes, at a future time.

Chair Garcia: Remind the commission of too many ideas can bog down our progress.

Staff: We can revisit this project later.

Commission: For now, it's a no but would like the Rotary Club to come back later.

**MOTION:** Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve the proposed budget recommendations.

Chair Garcia seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

**B. DISCUSSION ITEMS**

None at this time.

**C. TO/FROM ITEMS**

A. City Staff To/From and Updates:

- City Council approved the artist contracts for the Library Entry Project and the Downtown Connection Center. Council also heard an update on the Courthouse Artwork and provided feedback.

No discussion

- Beautification in Action Grant application update is complete. Please spread the word to the community that these grants of \$4500 for projects is now available.

No discussion

- Installation of Adam Nash's artwork for Traffic Signal Cabinet pilot project is installed at Butler and San Francisco.

No discussion

- A small portion of the Eastside Beautification line item was used for benches outside the East Flagstaff Community Library. These may include artwork and additional elements such as plantings in the future.

No discussion

- Budget Discussion Next Steps: We will continue the discussion at our January meeting.

No discussion

B. Chair To/From and Updates

New City Council will be meeting for the first time tomorrow.

C. BPAC – update on communication with other City Commissions?

NONE

D. City Council Liaison Updates

Chair Garcia thanked Councilmember Charlie Odegaard for his service to the commission and the community.

E. Additional To/From Items from the Commission?

NONE

F. Requests for future agenda items?

NONE

**D. AGENDA ITEMS AND TIME/DATE FOR UPCOMING MEETINGS**

- BPAC Meeting: Monday, January 11, 4 p.m., Microsoft Teams Meeting

#### **E. ADJOURNMENT**

Chair Garcia adjourned the meeting at 6:36 p.m.