



BEAUTIFICATION AND PUBLIC ART COMMISSION
APPROVED MINUTES

August 9, 2021 – 4:00 p.m.

City of Flagstaff – Microsoft Teams Remote Meeting

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko, (928) 213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

City Staff: Eliza Kretzmann – Staff Liaison, Jana Weldon – Project Administrator, Creag Znetko – Recording Secretary, VISTA AmeriCorps Member Erin Kaczmarowski

The Public is Invited to Attend this Remote Meeting: Please join us via Microsoft Teams by clicking on the following link, which brings you to the live meeting: [Join Microsoft Teams Meeting](#)

Please turn your camera off and mute your microphone except when speaking. If you need an invitation to the meeting, email cznetko@flagstaffaz.gov prior to 3:00 p.m. on the Monday of the meeting.

Provide Public Comment Prior to the Meeting: Email eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov with your public comment prior to 3:00 p.m. with PUBLIC COMMENT in the subject on the Monday of the meeting and it will be read during the public comment section or during the item to which your comment pertains.

A. CALL TO ORDER [Chair Garcia called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.](#)

B. ROLL CALL:

Anthony Garcia, Chair
Sandra Lubarsky, Vice-Chair
J Michael Cruz
Carla McCord

Matt McGrath
Jeremy Slater
Tina Zecher

C. UPCOMING EVENTS:

[Concert on 8-28 and golf tournament.](#)

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or acting on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commissioners may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. Public comment should be sent to eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov, prior to 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting with PUBLIC COMMENT in the email subject or during the designated public participation section.

[NONE](#)

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. July BPAC Meeting.

[MOTION: Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve as submitted. Second by Commissioner Cruz; the motion passed unanimously.](#)

F. ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. Thank you to Commissioner Weber
Chair Garcia: Thanked Commissioner Weber for his service.
Staff: Worked with Commissioner Weber on the airport project and thanked him for serving on the commission.
Vice Chair Lubarsky: Comments were always so thoughtful and insightful, thanks for the contribution to the conversations.
2. Welcome to Commissioner McGrath and Commissioner Zecher
Staff: Welcome to the new commissioners, looking forward to working with you and meeting in person.
Chair Garcia: Please share with the commission why you wanted to join and what your expectations are.
Commissioner McGrath: Been in Flagstaff for 2 ½ years, works for the Forest Service, also serves on the Pedestrian Advisory Committee.
Commissioner Zecher: Been in Arizona for 25 years; in Flagstaff for 4. Loves to volunteer and is happy to be on the commission. Is currently employed by NAU as an evaluator.
Chair Garcia: Introduced himself and gave brief monologue welcoming the new commissioners and what they could expect while serving on the commission.
Vice Chair Lubarsky: Glad to have new members and is looking forward for new perspectives from them.
Chair Garcia: Asked staff if the agenda as written will be followed.
Staff: Asked if the discussion item could be presented before the action item.
Chair Garcia: Yes, we can accommodate that.

G. ACTION ITEMS

1. **Traffic Signal Cabinet Pilot Project Approval of Selection Panel Recommendations of Artist Proposals** – Jana Weldon, Beautification, Arts & Sciences Project Administrator, City of Flagstaff.

In a staff-led process, three selection panels convened and evaluated the artist applications at four locations. For the location at Butler & Beaver, a panel recommended Dana Kamberg's proposal based on the concept of *Kulila* with wording placement modifications and direction to review proposal with the Southside Community Association; and approve Donald Palmer as an alternate; for the location at Mall & Market, a panel recommended Kayley Quick's Mountain Lion proposal to be modified to expand to three cabinets and to review the pattern source with staff; for the location of 4th St & 3rd Ave a panel recommended Jason Gallegos' *Welcome to Sunnyside* with a review with staff; and for the location at West & Dortha a panel recommended the artist Kimberly Gehle-Romberger to further her proposal with modifications to address all sides of the cabinets, expansion to two cabinets, and with additional review of the new proposal by the selection panel.

Suggested Action: Hear the presentation by Jana Weldon and approve the preliminary concepts and/or artists for each location.

Staff presented to the commission the proposals for the next wave of utility box art and also the process used for the selection of the pieces.

Mall Way/Marketplace

Vehicular signal light, across from Harkins Theatre, survey indicated support. Many wanted to put these on RT 66, but those are ADOT controlled cabinets.

MOTION: Commissioner Cruz moved to approve with the modification to adapt to three cabinets. Commissioner McCord seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

4th St and 3rd Ave:

The most called out location in the survey with a high volume of pedestrian traffic.

MOTION: Chair Garcia moved to approve (with guidance on spelling and different fonts). Vice Chair Lubarsky seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Cruz: What is the issue with the font? I think it looks great.

Commissioner McCord: It was a suggestion not to use the first two fonts available in the word file. A different font could potentially portray a weightier message with more legibility.

Chair Garcia: With those suggestions do they resubmit to the panel?

Staff: Will meet with the artist and relay the suggestions. May connect the artist with the panel depending on the responsiveness to the suggestion.

N West St and Dortha Ave:

Sunnyside location, mixed residential and small businesses. Both pedestrian and vehicular traffic with emphasis on the pedestrian as it is in close proximity to Coconino High School. The same selection panel for the 4th St and 3rd Ave was used to choose this artist. The artist submitted previous work and the panel was intrigued by the artist's submission. Staff would like to meet with the artist and give feedback. When a new piece is submitted, staff will convene the selection panel for approval. Probably won't come back to the commission. If the selection panel does not accept a new submission, this location may go back out to call.

MOTION: Chair Garcia moved to approve as stated "Approve Kimberly Gehle-Romberger to create a proposal for two cabinets with panel suggestions and subject to subsequent approval by selection panel." Commissioner Slater seconded. Vote 6-1 with Commissioner Cruz voting opposed. The motions passes with majority.

S Beaver St and E Butler Ave.:

Extensive pedestrian, cycle (bike lane on Beaver) and heavy vehicular traffic on Butler Ave. Extensive use by residents, students, tourists, close to the pilot project on San Francisco St. This intersection was the site of a recent cycling tragedy. The Southside has been underrepresented in the past. Dana Kamberg's submission focus on the black lumberjack as a historical figure for the Southside. The words on the front of the piece could distract drivers and is a safety concern. The panel decided the impact of the images will not be affected by moving words to the back of the cabinets. There is an alternate submission for this location as well. Donald Palmer submitted a wrap as a commemorative piece for the cycling tragedy. Vice Chair Lubarsky: Would like to remove the alternate submission. Would like to have a discussion regarding a commemorative or safety installation that would be separate and not on a signal cabinet.

Staff: This would not preclude a permanent memorial piece. That will take more time. This could be a temporary piece, but as discussed with the panel, this would not be the memorial for the tragedy.

Commissioner McGrath: Would not like to approve the alternate as well.

Commissioner McCord: This location should be entirely graphics and not have any words.

MOTION: Commissioner Cruz moved to approve the alternate submission and the proposal with word placement modification and with review by the Southside Community Association; Commissioner McCord seconded the motion; the motion carries 5-2, with Vice Chair Lubarsky and Commissioner McGrath voting to oppose.

H. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. **Downtown Connection Center Master Plan Approach for Art Projects— Review and Discussion:** Jana Weldon, Beautification, Arts & Sciences Project Administrator, Laura Haddad and Tom Drugan, Project Artists

Staff and the artist team have been actively engaged in the revolving and evolving site changes for the new Downtown Connection Center on Phoenix Avenue. Staff has also been engaged a number of community outreach processes and stakeholder discussions. Staff will present an overview of the process since the approval of the artist team by City Council last December. The artist team will present their Master Plan approach and projects that will be potentially funded by the current budget that are part of phase 1 and phase 2 of the site design.

Suggested Action: Discussion and Review of the Master Plan approach and initial projects.

Staff presented to the commission an overview of how the project is developing and the proposed site plan.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: What is the timeline for this area?

Staff: Could be up to 8 years or as soon as 3 years. Not sure yet.

Ms. Morley (NAIPTA): The bus bays will be built after the underground work is completed for the Rio. The new building (terminal) will be phase 1 and can start moving forward soon. The bus bays will be phase 2 and the civic space will be the last phase. It could be up to 8 years before completion, but we don't have a solid timeline at this time.

Haddad/Drugan (artists): Presented to the commission the influences for the Master Plan.

Staff: There is also funding from Historic Preservation, so full artistic pieces may be limited. Utilizing artists that have interpretive signage experience will be helpful.

Chair Garcia: Open this up for discussion.

Mark Reavis: If the arts commission wants an interpretive plaque on the bridge, we can put it there.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Likes the glass facade with backlighting, the rotating art on the bus space has a lot of unknowns at this time, hopes there will be shelters due to Flagstaff weather, prefers the artwork be installed on the crosswalk with the most use, could be problematic to have lumberjacks because of the value we place on trees, and the interpretive plaques are great, please use the nontraditional ones.

Commissioner McCord: May be able to create an Arizona hammering man and give tribute to sustainability. Likes when art provokes thought. Likes the glass art lighting as well. There will be a lot of activity around route 66 because of the 100-year anniversary in 2026. Thank you for taking on these challenges.

Commissioner Cruz: Appreciates the artists and meeting them. Really likes the mountain lion with the trees in the background. Loves the cross walk and all the vibrant colors, wants material that will last long. Instead of a lumberjack would like to see more appreciation for the trees.

Commissioner Slater: Served on the panel that chose the artists. We need to have a discussion within the commission about lumberjacks. Loves the backlighting piece too, great job.

Commissioner Zecher: Appreciates the presentation, likes the changing of the colors with the lighting, likes having rotating art in the shelters using local artists, likes the pieces proposed for the Rio culvert. Depending on culvert placement, is that how the piece would be determined? Size, shape, etc.?

Haddad/Drugan: If the culvert remains, might be hard to place the installation. Looking into what can be done. We have the same question for the Army Corp of Engineers.

Commissioner Zecher: Likes the crosswalk art if we ensure longevity. Whether pavers or robust materials. There may be a way to incorporate the lumberjack and sustainability, not sure how that would look just yet, but we should be able to get there.

Commissioner McGrath: Doesn't love the lumberjack idea, we have it covered, but deforestation is healthy. Content is more important than location. Can we rotate art on the crosswalks? More expense on the front end but could be an avenue to engage the community more often. Appreciates the work put in by the artists.

Chair Garcia: We should investigate the southside community history and how it came to be. Did you consider vandalism for the backlit glass?

Haddad/Drugan: Will use reinforced materials and make it beautiful. Hopefully the beauty will deter any vandals.

Chair Garcia: What about the budget?

Haddad/Drugan: Budgeting around \$100k for the glass, \$300k for the large items, the paving materials could be around \$15k; the budget was done before the concept.

Chair Garcia: Great job of spreading the budget around. Have you met with any indigenous representatives?

Haddad/Drugan: Not yet.

Chair Garcia: We should ensure that we keep the less fortunate population in mind while designing the civic space.

Haddad/Drugan: Thank you for the comments, good to have them currently. Great to hear other people's perceptions and will help guide the next steps.

2. Continued Discussion on Mission/Vision/Guidelines or Strategic Focus Areas – Chair Garcia

Chair Garcia asked Vice Chair Lubarsky to lead this discussion. There have been ongoing discussions for strategic planning. There was a brainstorming session with Chair Garcia, Commissioner McCord and Vice Chair Lubarsky to create a draft of questions to review projects. This is not intended to replace the guidelines we use currently, more of a "cheat sheet" to help with our decision making processes and our discussions.

Commissioner McCord: This is a nice way to ensure all questions are asked and addressed. Having a checklist will help when having an emotional discussion. This document is meant to facilitate good decision making.

Chair Garcia: This will be the first steps forward for the revising of the mission and vision statement.

Commissioner Cruz: Read the incorrect document, need to go back and read the correct one.

Commissioner Zecher: Great idea as a newcomer. Are there considerations to combine all the questions? It may be overwhelming for each decision to go through the entire document.

Chair Garcia: This would be good to go through and see which questions are duplicative and bring a bigger version back next month to discuss what we would like to see and start revising at that point.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: This doesn't need to be at the level of procurement processes. The hope is to just give tools to the commission to help aid in the process.

Commissioner Slater: This could be condensed and keep us on track. Get the commission centered on a process.

Commissioner McGrath: Have not had time to review but is looking forward to further discussion.

Chair Garcia: This is really the first step in getting it organized. Thank you to Vice Chair Lubarsky for putting it together. The next meeting will be to condense and prioritize.

Staff: They will be viable for the yearly project prioritizing during the budget process. It will be most helpful. Some of the questions may not pertain to all projects, but we want to ensure all aspects will be reviewed.

I. TO/FROM ITEMS

1. City Staff To/From and Updates: Eliza Kretzmann, Jana Weldon

a. Update on Airport Timeline – Jana

The art portion of the airport project will not be going forward in the fall due to the timeline being off. The first proposal needed to be revisited and the contract to build the parking lot wasn't able to combine the art piece. The fence will be installed around next May instead of this November.

b. Pedestrian and Bicycle Safety on next month's agenda - Eliza

Ms. Kretzmann was unavailable for this meeting.

2. Chair To/From and Updates: Anthony Garcia

NONE

3. City Council Liaison Updates

NONE

4. Additional To/From Items from the Commission (Reports on engagement with other Commissions, etc.)

NONE

5. Requests for future agenda items?

NONE

J. TIME/DATE FOR UPCOMING MEETINGS

- BPAC Meeting: Monday, September 13, 4 p.m., Microsoft Teams Meeting

K. ADJOURNMENT [Chair Garcia adjourned the meeting at 6:44 p.m.](#)