

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

October 28, 2021

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held October 28, 2021, to order at 4:30 pm.

2. Roll Call

Chair McCain

Vice Chair White

Commissioner Steiger

Commissioner Konkol

Commissioner Dailey

Others present: Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Nicole Antonopoulos (Staff), Sara Sprague (Presenter), Ricardo Guthrie (Presenter), Selena Langner (Presenter), Sandra Lubarsky (Presenter), Marcus Ford (Presenter), Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom (Presenter), Oakley Anderson-Moore (Presenter), Wendy White (Presenter), Darrell Marks (Presenter), John Unale (Presenter)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address an item that is on the agenda, please use the Teams Chat function: simply type in 'public comment' to indicate to the Chair that you would like to comment. The Chair will then recognize you when it is time for public comment, and staff will unmute your microphone if needed.

No Public Comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Konkol, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the September 23rd, 2021 minutes.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

5. Business

A. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Presentations

Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Applicants

Requested Action: Informational

Sara Sprague introduced herself and presented on her Educational Youth Garden project for Colton Community Garden. Chair McCain asked why she didn't apply through MNA. Ms. Sprague answered that her supervisor suggested she apply as an individual volunteer. Commissioner Konkell asked for more clarification on how they will be recruiting youth. Ms. Sprague answered that they will be using established volunteers, flyers, social media, connections with NAU, the Murdoch Center, and the community, as well as email lists for monthly events and workshops.

Dr. Ricardo Guthrie presented his project on Resilience and the Lived Black Experience in the Historic Southside. Vice Chair White asked on what basis the budget figures for ethnographers, researchers, and artists, and admin oversight were decided. Mr. Guthrie said this was based on their experience. He has used internships over the last few years, which ranged from \$500 per semester for a stipend to a weekly subsidy at a prevailing range of \$1,000-\$1,500. The estimate is a ballpark. The student wage is currently \$13 per hour, but he uses stipends for specific projects. Administrative costs are 15% of the total budget to cover mailings, publicity, and support staff. Chair McCain asked how many art projects they intend to sponsor in the first year of the project. Mr. Guthrie said there were three templates budgeted: one paver, one pedestal, and one art cube.

Selena Langner presented for Coco-op's Community Tool Library project. Commissioner Konkell asked how this project would educate people about resilience. Selena answered that the tool library would provide an opportunity for people to learn skills to take their ideas and make them a reality. She said they have members that are building sustainable homes and systems and they have a lot of ideas coming in because of that. Having the tool library lets participants take what they are learning and bring it home to make those changes. Providing training on tools reduces barriers and helps participants practice skills safely.

Sandra Lubarsky and Marcus Ford presented for Flagstaff College's 3.5% project. Commissioner Konkell asked what strategies will be used to recruit participants. Ms. Lubarsky said they have 150 people participating at this point.

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

They have reached out through social media, personal phone calls, the Daily Sun, and word of mouth. People continue to register for the program. Chair McCain asked if they would record the Zoom sessions and make them publicly available. Ms. Lubarksy confirmed, saying that they will post them on the Flagstaff College website and make them available on a YouTube channel.

Sharon Tewksbury-Bloom presented on the Museum Flood Coalition's project. Chair McCain asked why 60% of requested funds were allocated to a celebration event. Ms. Tewksbury-Bloom answered that the event was an important part of the project. She said they have been doing a lot online, but the work they are trying to do is face-to-face outreach and building trust between people. They will do preliminary meetings before and during the flood season, but they really need something that will bring them together and help them heal. She further explained the budget, saying that food has been going up in cost, and they estimated 100 people attending. She also noted that they don't know what the event will look like because of the pandemic. Lastly, she said that they aren't sure if they will need to rent tables, tents, and chairs since they don't have a location and are starting from scratch. Vice Chair White asked if they would be willing to remove the funding for the celebratory event from the grant. Ms. Tewksbury-Bloom said she would rather not but was willing to reduce it. She said recognized that the costs were rough estimates, but that the event is a key piece of what they are trying to do. Commissioner Konkol noted that Tara Roark is listed as a partner but that she also applied for a grant. A third applicant has also applied for the same issue. She asked how they would collaborate to ensure the furthest reach and no overlap if more than one receives funding. Ms. Tewksbury-Bloom answered that the three projects are very different in scope and have different desired outcomes, as well as a reach beyond those impacted by flooding. They will hit different needs and have different outcomes but will collaborate. Chair McCain asked how the \$1,200 budgeted for meetings will be allocated. Ms. Tewksbury-Bloom said that they don't have existing supplies and will need to purchase everything needed. Since many of the meetings will be in person, they are looking to purchase things like easel pads, water resistant sticky notes, clip boards, markers, and name tags. Their first meeting drew 40 people, and they are expecting 30 to 50 people per meeting

Oakley Anderson-Moore presented for Superyard Farm's Carbon Farm Flagstaff project. Commissioner Konkol asked if she would consider incorporating a social media aspect strategically into the project to facilitate this idea, provide

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

examples, and share details or tips for participants. Ms. Anderson-Moore said she liked the idea. Vice Chair White asked what the estimated ratio of carbon sequestered in this process to carbon generated in the heating part of the process would be. Ms. Anderson-Moore answered that based on findings from the Utah State Forestry Association, when doing pyrolysis at a lower temperature and for a shorter time there are no bio-oils created. Instead, biochar is created, and gasses get burned off. She said 77% is biochar and the net carbon removal is 20%. She added that theirs would be higher because they aren't heating it to the point of creating biofuels. She said 25% hydrocarbons would be lost. Chair McCain asked what happens to other nutrients that are a part of the biochar. Ms. Anderson-Moore answered that most stay inert and some stay in the soil.

Wendy White and Darrell Marks presented on the Community Assistance Teams of Flagstaff's Mobile Outreach Bus Conversion project. Commissioner Konkel asked for more details on what will be accomplished for educational outreach. Ms. White answered that educational outreach will be an ongoing activity. She said they would provide materials and plaster the inside of the bus with information on services for those experiencing homelessness. Public outreach will be done through their website. Chair McCain asked for clarification on ongoing funding strategies to cover costs. Ms. White said it was their commitment for this to be an ongoing project. They started a GoFundMe and raised \$1,500. They received promised in kind donations for materials and supplies. They have an event on November 20th. She is not sure how much that event will raise, but similar events have raised up to \$15,000. She said they will continue to fundraise as any other nonprofit would do. Mr. Marks added that as they provide services to the community, there will be other opportunities to reach out to organizations to request funds and build into existing funding cycles.

John Unale presented for AZ Custom Plastics' project. Chair McCain asked about the longevity of the project and if the machine would continue to be used by the Flagstaff community if AZ Custom Plastics were to move or go out of business. Mr. Unale said he has been in Flagstaff for 40 years and is not planning on going anywhere, and that he can't see them going out of business. He added that they will get the community involved. With Willow Bend, they will bring youth into the whole process. Chair McCain asked if the project would continue after the first year. Mr. Unale said they are planning on starting this project in Flagstaff and working with other agencies in other states that

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

have the same issues with sled litter. Commissioner Konkel asked about their specific plans for facilitating education. Mr. Unale said they will be partnering with Willow Bend, as well as getting involved with high schools teaching plastic processes. They want to show kids the recycling process and let them design a finished product. They also would like to showcase benches or picnic tables in public places built out of sleds to bring awareness to the community on materials that are being discarded.

B. 10- Year Housing Plan Letter

Vice Chair White

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Vice Chair White read the letter he drafted with recommendations from the Sustainability Commission for the 10-Year Housing Plan. Nicole Antonopoulos said net zero housing was something requested by Sustainability Staff. She said there might need to be more clarification needed in the letter. Commissioner Dailey said the distinction he was drawing between net zero and highly energy efficient was rooftop solar. He said an all-electric house that is highly efficient is dependent on the cleanliness of the grid to be net zero, and that the grid is getting cleaner and cleaner. He said he thought it was of limited economic value to have all houses wired for rooftop solar. Ms. Antonopoulos encouraged the Commission to add another statement further clarifying that. Chair McCain asked for a specific suggestion. Vice Chair White suggested they strike "instead of" so the sentence would read "in addition to recommending the construction of net zero housing." Commissioner Dailey said he was trying to express that the goal should be highly energy efficient and all electric but not necessarily net zero. He said net zero is the extra step of requiring rooftop solar or wiring for rooftop solar and that money would be better spent on insulation. He suggested it read "we would like the housing plan to focus more on high energy efficiency and electrification rather than on applying a net zero standard." Ms. Antonopoulos said the net zero standard was an alignment with the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP) as the City strives for net zero construction. Chair McCain asked if Commissioner Dailey would prefer not to recommend net zero and if he felt strongly about having a highly efficient and electric standard instead. Commissioner Dailey confirmed. Chair McCain asked about the timing for the letter. Vice Chair White said Housing Staff will be presenting at the next City Council meeting and he was hoping to have it ready by then. Commissioner Dailey said in the interest of getting something in front of City

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Council, they could strike the whole paragraph. Vice Chair White suggested they replace the paragraph with a sentence recommending an analysis of the most cost-effective means of reducing a building's carbon emissions. Commissioner Dailey said it was a good middle ground. Ms. Antonopoulos agreed, saying she just wanted to ensure there was no disconnect and that the Commission knew that net zero was identified in the CNP. Vice Chair White rewrote the new sentence to read "we would like the housing plan to include an analysis of the most resource effective means of reducing the carbon impact of housing." Commissioner Dailey approved. Vice Chair White asked if they would replace the whole paragraph with the new sentence. Chair McCain confirmed.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve and send the letter as corrected.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

C. Sustainability Section Update

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy gave an update on the Sustainability Section Staff's activities.

6. To and From

Chair McCain said that Lowell Observatory was granted their land to only be used for observatory purposes in 1910, and that they are attempting to get a bill passed that would remove this stipulation. Lowell Observatory has asked the City to write a letter of support, and Council will likely be discussing it again next Tuesday. He encouraged Commissioners and attendees to look into this issue.

Ms. Antonopoulos said she will be back in front of the Commission at the November 18th meeting regarding bonding and bonds for climate action. She said they are in the process of determining what their legal authority is in Arizona to take climate action. She will be back in November with a more formal discussion regarding bonding and specific projects to be proposed to a bond committee that is being developed. More information regarding the bond committee and Sustainability Commissioner representation will be sent out.

Ms. Antonopoulos said the Sustainability Section is not promoting the Mayor's Solar Challenge. The decision not to promote the program came from significant

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

concerns around how the program was launched. She explained that there was not a statewide solicitation for installers, which does not help local installers moving forward, and that there had not been a lot of information on the process. She said she is happy to answer questions, and while they are not supporting the program, they are not speaking out against it.

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

Commissioner Konkell asked for a 15-to-20-minute review and check in on how the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant application process went.

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on October 28th, 2021, adjourned at 6:30 pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2020.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison