



BEAUTIFICATION AND PUBLIC ART COMMISSION
APPROVED MINUTES

October 11, 2021 – 4:00 p.m.

City of Flagstaff – Microsoft Teams Remote Meeting

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Creag Znetko, (928) 213-2906 (or 774-5281 TDD). Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

City Staff: Eliza Kretzmann – Staff Liaison, Jana Weldon – Project Administrator, Creag Znetko – Recording Secretary, VISTA AmeriCorps Member MacKenzie Chase

- A. **The Public is Invited to Attend this Remote Meeting:** Please join us via Microsoft Teams by clicking on the following link, which brings you to the live meeting: [Click here to join the meeting](#)

Please turn your camera off and mute your microphone except when speaking. If you need an invitation to the meeting, email cznetko@flagstaffaz.gov prior to 3:00 p.m. on the Monday of the meeting.

Provide Public Comment Prior to the Meeting: Email eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov with your public comment prior to 3:00 p.m. with PUBLIC COMMENT in the subject on the Monday of the meeting and it will be read during the public comment section or during the item to which your comment pertains.

- A. **CALL TO ORDER** [Chair Garcia called the meeting to order at 4:00.](#)

B. ROLL CALL:

Anthony Garcia, Chair, [present](#)
Sandra Lubarsky, Vice-Chair, [present](#)
J Michael Cruz, [present](#)
Carla McCord, [present](#)

Matt McGrath, [excused](#)
Jeremy Slater, [present](#)
Tina Zecher, [present](#)

C. UPCOMING EVENTS:

1. October 29 Budget Retreat
[Staff announced that the budget retreat is set and will discuss more with the commission further in the agenda.](#)

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or acting on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commissioners may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. Public comment should be sent to eliza.kretzmann@flagstaffaz.gov, prior to 3:00 p.m. on the day of the meeting with PUBLIC COMMENT in the email subject or during the designated public participation section.

[NONE](#)

E. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

1. September BPAC Meeting.
[Commissioner McCord moved to approve the minutes as submitted. Chair Garcia seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.](#)

F. ANNOUNCEMENTS

1. None at this time.

G. ACTION ITEMS

1. **Beautification in Action Grant Applicants Presentations and Determination of Funding:** Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts and Sciences Manager, Applicants.

Each applicant has about 5 minutes to present, with about 8 minutes of questions from the Commission.

1. ~4:15 – Tonya Watson, Rotary Club Mural

Staff reminded the commission of the updates to the BIA grant process. Tonya Watson presented to the commission on the BIA grant for a mural on the back of the Peace Surplus building in the alley between Route 66 and Aspen Ave to the North and South and Beaver St and Leroux St. Lindsey DeStefano took over for Ms. Watson as she was having technical difficulties.

Chair Garcia: How does the art process work? Will you be directing the work? Who is going to be the artist? And will there be community/youth collaboration in the process?

Ms. Stefano: Yes, all of the above. I am lead artist for this and some of the other members of the Rotary Club would like to ensure that the arts community is well represented by all ages.

Chair Garcia: What about the timeline with colder weather coming up?

Ms. Stefano: We will use acrylic outdoor latex-based paint and are in contact with paint professionals with that knowledge. The timeline is to have this done in the spring.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Rotary symbol is on the mural, is that ok to promote a non-profit with city funding?

Staff: Signs promoting an organization is not allowed, this mural would be a judgement call, since it is not just a sign. It doesn't appear to be a logo to us but would defer to the commission for level of comfortability.

Chair Garcia: The city portion of the funding is around 50% or less. If others are contributing, does that make a difference in the final design?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: We have an obligation to be publicly minded with our fiscal responsibilities. Not comfortable if city funds are used for promoting an art project that may have the logo of the club applying for the grant.

Chair Garcia: Would you recommend a design change?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: I would ask for a change in design that does not include the logo. The peace promoting and volunteerism themes are wonderful, we just can't have the Rotary Club logo on the mural.

Commissioner McCord: Appreciates the coordination between the non-profit and the business owners. Agrees we don't want to set a precedent with having the logo on the mural.

Commissioner Cruz: Can we get this piece without any of the cogs? Too close to appearing like the logo.

Ms. Watson: We are good with that, may be up to the artist and change the title of the piece.

Ms. Stefano: I agree and will represent appropriately.

Chair Garcia: Is the Rotary good with the changes?

Ms. Watson: Yes, may change the title, but understand and this is why we wanted to present this at this time to receive feedback.

Commissioner Slater: What happened to the alley activation project? Hopefully this will be a shot in the arm for that project.

Staff: This is a complex project and has been put on hold. Staff has spoken with the artists involved to inform them of the pause. Staff let them know that the commission would consider other projects in the alleyway to organically move some of this forward.

Chair Garcia: Hopefully this will enhance the alleyway and provoke more projects in the future. We should stay focused on the art for this project. How would Vice Chair like to proceed with this?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Appreciates the Rotary Club's willingness to ensure the design is logo free, will there be a second review?

Staff: Given the changes about the logo and other groups possibly being brought in, would the commission like to see another design before it goes public?

Chair Garcia: Yes, we would like to review it once more.

Staff: Approval would be contingent on seeing another design. Would the commission be open to having the artist/club responsible have their names in small letters on the mural?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: That is a good way to recognize the artist and people responsible, so yes, we can agree to that.

MOTION: Vice Chair Lubarsky moved to approve the grant contingent on a revised design to be reviewed by BPAC prior to installation. Commissioner Slater seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

2. ~4:30 – Moran Henn, Willow Bend Mural and Little Library

Moran Henn presented to the commission on the application for the Willow Bend Environmental Education Center. The mural will be of the two tailed swallow tail painted on the side of an existing shed and a pollinator pathway will be built as well.

Chair Garcia: This is open for discussion.

Commissioner Zecher: Likes the idea, no questions at the moment.

Commissioner McCord: Really likes the concept. How will the side of the shed be painted?

Ms. Henn: The entire side will have plywood installed and the mural will be painted on that. The other thought on that concept is we could take the plywood off the shed and place it somewhere else intact.

Commissioner McCord: There is a lot of space on the wall, how will it be utilized?

Ms. Henn: There will be a lot of facts about the pollinator garden to help fill the space and the whole sheet of plywood be painted too.

Commissioner McCord: There is a potential to be more visually complex than what we are seeing here.

Ms. Henn: Yes, this is the extent of my photoshop skills. This is a prelim design and we are working on a final design now.

Commissioner McCord: What is the plan for the final design?

Ms. Henn: We wanted to get approval of funding before a request for proposals (RFP) goes out. Once an artist is solidified, the final design will be finished.

Commissioner Slater: Likes the idea.

Commissioner Cruz: Supports this concept.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: This is a great project. There are certain items BPAC can't fund, what is the idea for the other funding?

Ms. Henn: We applied for an arts and science project grant. We put it all together in one spot for the commission to see. The funding would be used appropriately.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Would need clarification on how funding is used. Can you break it out?

Ms. Henn: The arts and science grant will help with ensuring the BIA grant is used only for allowable items.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: I would ask staff if we need this broken out so we know what BPAC is funding.

Staff: We have parameters for the funding source, we need to ensure those are followed. We would need to see the clarification broken out.

Ms. Henn: Can rewrite the budget for clarification and ensure all funding is in compliance.

Staff: Did the applicant adequately answer the concerns about the budget or does it need to be broken out before approval?

Chair Garcia: I think we can move forward with this if there is a contingency in the motion.

Ms. Henn: Absolutely, we can clarify the budget and come back when the design is finalized.

MOTION: Commissioner Zecher moved to approve contingent on an approved design and revised budget. Commissioner McCord seconded the motion; the motion passed unanimously.

H. DISCUSSION ITEMS

1. **Budget Retreat Preparation:** Eliza Kretzmann, Beautification, Arts and Sciences Manager
In past years, we have centered our conversation around funds available and priorities. This year, we will focus our prioritization on time capacity rather than available funds. This conversation will provide some initial framing to help Commissioners prepare for the retreat on October 29.

Suggested Action: Listen to presentation in preparation of budget retreat, ask questions.

Staff presented to the commission about the budget retreat. First questions include if the commissioners want to meet in person or a hybrid in person/remote model? Meeting in person has not been approved by City leadership yet but staff wanted to ask.

Chair Garcia: Let's get the commission's answers.

Commissioner Zecher: In person.

Commissioner Cruz: Can we socially distance indoors? It would be nice to get lunch and take a break.

Commissioner McCord: Can't attend the meeting on that day, would choose in person.

Commissioner Cruz: In person.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Due to working with people that are not immunized, I would need to opt out of meeting in person and attend remotely.

Chair Garcia: In person.

Moving forward with an in-person hybrid model.

Staff: We will get an answer on meeting in person and get back with the commission. Any more questions before we move on?

Commissioner Cruz: I didn't hear an answer about social distancing?

Staff: Maintaining 6 feet of distance for the entire time might be challenging. It would depend on how many people choose remote. If there are more than 4-5 people meeting in the room, it could be done.

Chair Garcia: How have the hybrid model meetings been regarding success?

Staff: They have been really successful and work well for staff.

Staff: Framing the meeting; we will focus more on time capacity instead of the monetary side of the budget. There will be scoring for current projects by the commission for prioritization and if time allows to include new projects as well. Are there any questions about the framing on how we approach this?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Could we have a time to discuss if there is increased capacity? And how can we increase staff capacity in the future?

Staff: The point of creating a prioritized list is see what projects are at the top of the list should we gain some more capacity. Please send any new ideas to staff by Oct 18 and we can get those to the commission before the retreat. We are 6 projects over capacity at the moment.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: I want to ensure that we are still able to respond to future needs as they arise.

Chair Garcia: Should we focus on the plan at the retreat and then discuss some of the other projects throughout the year during the commission meetings?

Staff: We should be able to start the conversation at the retreat. Staff would be open to more in depth discussions during commission meetings.

Commissioner McCord: Important to respect staff capacity as well as keep an eye on what is going on in the community.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Knowing we don't have a lot of capacity, can we start a conversation about how the commission can be more engaged in advocating for public art? The intention would be to not use staff time for this.

2. **Continued Discussion on Mission/Vision/Guidelines or Strategic Focus Areas** – Chair Garcia

Chair Garcia: Using some of the guidelines compiled by Vice Chair Lubarsky will help us in decisions regarding projects.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: If there are more suggestions to add to the guidelines, please send them forward.

Chair Garcia: If we are good with the draft guidelines, we can move forward with what the Vice Chair has put together.

I. **TO/FROM ITEMS**

1. City Staff To/From and Updates: MacKenzie Chase, Eliza Kretzmann, Jana Weldon
 - a. Update on Murdoch Center Beautification in Action Grant and Maintenance Funding for Existing Murals – Eliza

Staff updated the commission about some complications with landscapers being too busy to give some time to ensure this project will be completed on time. The Southside Community Associations has been good with communicating to staff all the issues. Staff is not concerned.

- b. Rotating Art Idea at Sawmill Multicultural Art and Nature County Park with Indi Indigenous Representation inclusion. – Eliza, Jana

Staff is working with other staff/entities for this project. There are a few ideas that staff is pursuing and would like to have input from the commission in the future.

2. Chair To/From and Updates: Anthony Garcia
Chair Garcia: Attended the Art Wins Festival in Michigan to get a feel for how we can partner with our community in a similar fashion. Would like to present to the commission at a future meeting with some ideas.

3. City Council Liaison Updates
NONE

4. Additional To/From Items from the Commission?

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Reached out to the sustainability commission to see if there are some collaboration projects we can work with them on.

5. Requests for future agenda items? Please provide vote from additional 2 Commissioners to add to the list for future meetings.

Chair Garcia: Lone Tree Overpass conversation.

Vice Chair Lubarsky: Would like BPAC to weigh in and encourage the affordable housing team to ensure that aesthetics has value.

J. TIME/DATE FOR UPCOMING MEETINGS

1. BPAC Meeting: Monday, November 8, 4 p.m., Microsoft Teams Meeting

K. ADJOURNMENT Chair Garcia adjourned the meeting at 5:57 p.m.