

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

November 18, 2021

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 7:00 PM

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held November 18, 2021, to order at 4:30 pm.

2. Roll Call

Chair McCain

Vice Chair White

Commissioner Steiger

Commissioner Konkel (left at 7:00pm during Business Item D).

Commissioner Dailey

Commissioner McCormick

Others present: Marissa Molloy (Minutes, Staff Liaison), Nicole Antonopoulos (Staff), Jenny Niemann (Staff), Danya Gorel (Presenter), Pete Morrow (Presenter), Barb Tait (Presenter), Michele James (Presenter), Dr. Alice Christie (Presenter), James Kennedy (Presenter), Heather Marcy (Presenter), Dawn Rodriguez (Presenter), Cullen Kirk (Presenter), Ryan McElligott (Presenter), Lorie Cavalli (Presenter), Pilar Gutierrez (Presenter), Jalyn Gearries (Presenter)

3. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address an item that is on the agenda, please use the Teams Chat function: simply type in 'public comment' to indicate to the Chair that you would like to comment. The Chair will then recognize you when it is time for public comment, and staff will unmute your microphone if needed.

No Public Comment

4. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the October 28th, 2021 minutes.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

5. Business

A. Climate Action & Resiliency Bond Discussion

Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Director, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Informational and Vote

Nicole Antonopoulos presented on the 2022 Bond Package Options. Sustainability Staff was asked to develop a proposal for a bond package that accelerates the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP). The proposal will be presented to the City Manager appointed Citizen Bond Committee. The Committee will begin meeting next week and will make a formal recommendation to the City Council in June 2022 for the November 2022 ballot. She presented on known needs for the CNP and proposed projects Staff would like to submit to the Citizen Bond Committee. Combined, the eight proposed projects come to a total of \$71.5 million. The City only has about \$60 million in bond capacity, and this proposal is one of many going to the Citizen Bond Committee. The Citizen Bond Committee will be tasked with putting a package together for City Council that fits within the available \$60 million threshold. Ms. Antonopoulos asked for the Commission to vote to approve the package that Staff will be submitting to the Citizen Bond Committee. She said there are very targeted, prescriptive goals in the CNP that Staff has calculated in terms of impact to achieve carbon neutrality by 2030. She said the proposed projects are in support of that framework.

Vice Chair White asked for clarification on what they would be voting on. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that she is asking the Commission to vote to approve the full package. She said it would be very helpful to have the Commission's support when presenting this to the Citizen Bond Committee. Vice Chair White noted that the package being proposed is \$72 million but the limit is \$60 million. He asked if this would be over multiple election cycles or if it would be expanding the City's bond capacity. Ms. Antonopoulos said Staff is letting the Citizen Bond Committee know their full needs for the CNP goals. Staff knows they won't get the full \$71.5 million but will be asking the Committee what they would recommend out of everything that is listed to City Council for the November 2022 ballot. Vice Chair White asked if by endorsing the package, the Commission would be asking that the Citizen Bond Committee put these at a higher priority than other bond projects. Ms. Antonopoulos said no, and that they would just like to be able to say that the Sustainability Commission has

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

reviewed the package and that the projects are in line with the CNP. She added that Staff is on an incredibly accelerated timeline.

Commissioner Dailey mentioned a federal tax credit for EPA certified stoves that is available for the next couple years. He asked if Staff was looking to extend past the expiration of that credit or if it would be a front-loaded credit. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that they were trying to leverage against the federal tax credit. She said 45% of single-family homes in Flagstaff are rental units and Staff is trying to encourage property owners to make their rental units more efficient. She added that when Staff writes up their package for the Citizen Bond Committee, they are going to include this information. Commissioner Dailey asked if the credit was strictly for rental units. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that it was for anyone, but Staff is targeting investment property owners. She added that it would partner nicely with their work with RentLab. Commissioner Dailey asked about the incremental and integration cost under the new APS tariff. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that their calculations were an estimate they worked on with internal resources and with APS to offset some of the infrastructure cost and lower the rate for APS customers in Flagstaff. Commissioner Dailey asked if the City was going to do the development work rather than leave it to APS. Ms. Antonopoulos confirmed, adding that she would like his professional opinion on that strategy later.

Commissioner McCormick noted that the Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act was signed on Monday and said she was hoping that the City could get funds from that Act and that the Citizen Bond Committee would consider this Act in their calculations. Ms. Antonopoulos said Staff has been monitoring the bill and will be aggressively pursuing funding opportunities. She said to finish the current needs for safe and accessible bike and pedestrian infrastructure, it would cost around \$129 million. Proposition 419 only provides \$29 million. This does not include future build out. She said Staff is looking at this as the strategy to accelerate bike and pedestrian infrastructure and added that Staff will be back to the Commission to talk about the infrastructure bill and the City's strategy on pursuing funding. Commissioner McCormick asked how the ideas for the regional food production and distribution hub were generated. Ms. Antonopoulos answered that they were the result of long conversations with regional growers and members of the community who are involved at the state level, as well as the Sustainable and Economic Development Initiative. She said it has been an evolution over the past 10 years, and Staff is recommending the number based on the CNP. Commissioner McCormick said the regional

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

commercial kitchen seemed like an important niche and wondered if the element of job training was really what was limiting people. She went on to say the vertical food farming idea seemed really specific and that it might be beneficial to broaden it a bit. Ms. Antonopoulos said she would reach out to their partners to dive into that more. Commissioner McCormick said one of the limitations for food hubs is distribution, marketing, and selling. Ms. Antonopoulos confirmed and said that in working with local individuals for the CNP, Staff heard that loud and clear. She said Staff can expand on that. Commissioner McCormick asked where Staff got the number for auxiliary dwelling units, noting that it seemed low. She said building zone code changes might be more of an incentive. Ms. Antonopoulos said Staff has the zoning code on their radar and that they did research in looking at programs in other communities. She added that it didn't mean they couldn't increase the recommendation.

Chair McCain asked if Staff would be presenting the projects to the Citizen Bond Committee in a priority framework. Ms. Antonopoulos confirmed.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner McCormick to approve the bond list as presented.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

B. Discussion of Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Funds Used Retroactively

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Marissa Molloy introduced the discussion on whether Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Funds should be able to be used retroactively. She said the Flagstaff College project was hoping to use funds retroactively, and Staff was unable to find anything in the grant guidelines saying they couldn't. She said if the Commission were to vote to approve funds being used retroactively, costs would be required to have been incurred during the same fiscal year and applicants would need to have dated receipts. Staff also recommended that clear language be added on whatever the Commission decided.

Commissioner Konkell asked if funds used retroactively would mean that the project was already paid for and completed or almost finished, and if it would be a reimbursement. Ms. Molloy confirmed. Commissioner Konkell said she was

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

hesitant as they have many great projects that haven't been funded. She said if a project already had funding, she didn't know why they would need funding unless they were paying out of their own pocket. She noted that she didn't recall seeing the reason or need for reimbursement in Flagstaff College's grant proposal. Chair McCain asked if Commissioner Konkel was leaning towards not supporting the request. Commissioner Konkel confirmed. Commissioner McCormick said it could be for a piece of the project they had to pay for to get moving. She also noted that she reviews and writes a fair amount of grant proposals, and retroactive payments are typically not allowed. She suggested that since the language was not in the grant guidelines, the Commission could potentially allow for the funds to be used retroactively in this one instance. Chair McCain asked if Flagstaff College specified anything more about their reasons for wanting retroactive payment. Ms. Molloy answered that she did not recall if anything was specified in their budget. Commissioner Konkel said to keep things fair and equitable she was hesitant to approve the request. Chair McCain noted that Staff requested edits on the grant guidelines regardless, and noted if a grant working group was formed, they could do that. Chair McCain asked if a motion needed to be formed in the positive. Ms. Molloy confirmed.

Chair McCain made a motion to allow grant funds to be used retroactively this term. The motion did not receive a second and failed to go to a vote.

C. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Presentations

Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Applicants

Requested Action: Informational and Vote

Danya Gorel presented on Terra BIRDS' Neighborhood Sustainability Grant project application. Vice Chair White asked at what hourly rate student interns would be paid. Ms. Gorel answered that they would be paid \$15 per hour. Commissioner Konkel asked if the students' school curriculum would be updated to include the educational piece or if the workshops would be optional, and if the latter was the case, how they would ensure participation. Ms. Gorel answered that the English class at Ponderosa High School did a project where they told the students stories about the trees at the landsite, and then the students transcribed them. At Flagstaff High School, they did a soil science activity. For social studies they do history of place on walks. For math the students regularly use ratios and measurements. She said they can do a lot in an outdoor space with all the subjects. Chair McCain asked if Ms. Gorel answered Commissioner Konkel's question. Commissioner Konkel confirmed.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Pete Morrow and Barb Tait presented for Lefty Loosey's One Ride Away project. Commissioner Konkol asked if they had thought of a meaningful way to involve clients of FSS in the repairs or education on bike mechanics. Mr. Morrow confirmed, saying it was something they would like to be able to focus on more in the future. He said their focus right now is on getting the FSS fleet up to par as soon as possible, and then getting their volunteers trained to perform repairs safely. He said it takes repetition and practice on different types of bikes to acquire enough knowledge to safely perform mechanical work. They are focusing efforts on their own volunteers to hopefully eventually increase their capacity to train others in the future. He added that it takes a considerable amount of time and attention to make sure the tools are being used correctly. They have two training mechanics who perform safety checks on every bike and give feedback to volunteers on the work they're doing. He noted that they could do different tasks with the shelter like organizing parts by component or size, reading tire sizes, or familiarizing people with the parts of a bike.

Michele James presented on the Friends of Flagstaff's Future's Air Quality Monitoring & No Idling Campaign for Flagstaff Schools project. Commissioner Konkol asked if the toolkit would have content appropriate for students at all levels from K-12. Ms. James answered that the focus was on K-6 and on the elementary school. She said it would be possible to create a toolkit for the higher grades, but that it is a different audience that could work with a separate proposal. She noted she would want someone who has a background in curriculum for older kids to assist and create something that would be useable in the classroom. She said she has examples from what other people have done and from talking with the elementary school teachers for the younger kids. Commissioner Dailey asked if the focus of this project could shift to getting to school by some means other than single occupancy vehicles instead of on idling. Ms. James said she didn't think it was possible at this point in time, but that she could address that concern and provide information about alternate ways to get to school in the toolkit. She said the project was focused on no idling because of a predicted increased lack of good air quality and resiliency.

Dr. Alice Christie presented on Tynkertopia's Neighborhood Sustainability Grant project. Commissioner Konkol asked how the project would involve volunteer management and for additional details about the classes they would offer. Dr. Christie answered that volunteers would be recruited via social media, websites,

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

and social events. Volunteer training would be a one-hour face to face module as well as ongoing modeling. Volunteers would have access to shared google documents about the project as well as a shared calendar where they can sign up to volunteer. Volunteers would be matched to their special talents, be included in decision making, and receive a t-shirt, monthly thank you notes, and an appreciation event at the end of the growing season. Dr. Christie went on to say all the classes would be offered on site. Each quarter they would offer 1-hour modules on gardening, composting, rainwater harvesting, weeding and nutrition led by staff and volunteers as well as master gardeners that need volunteer hours. Children and adults would have free garden plots at the garden if they attended four classes. Dr. Christie said they want to support participants and residents to build a sense of community and a sense of sustainability and to have the gardens provide food and physical activity.

James Kennedy and Heather Marcy presented for the Flagstaff Family Help Center's project. Commissioner Konkol asked for more information on the educational programs. Mr. Kennedy said every Monday they have an outdoor group with a licensed counselor and staff member from the center that involves a conversation and a mindfulness activity. He said all lesson plans are approved by a clinician with the agency. In the past they have done planting, rainwater harvesting, compost bin building, and seed starting. Making gardening and the outdoors accessible and open-ended lessons help the kids they work with.

Dawn Rodriguez presented for Tara Roark's project, Educating and Engaging Youth Affected by Museum Flooding. Chair McCain asked if the project would be sustainable over time. Ms. Rodriguez said we can sustainability pass on knowledge about how devastating fires can be and how big fires in Flagstaff have been human caused so that future generations understand that they need to be careful around fire because it can have a huge effect on people's lives. Chair McCain asked for clarification on the group carrying out the project. Ms. Rodriguez said it was a group of residents led by people who were affected and saw the devastation. She asked if he wanted names. Chair McCain declined. Commissioner Konkol asked what they would do if they had too few or too many classes sign up for field trips. Ms. Rodriguez said it would be worth it for anybody there. She said if they are able to bring this to the community, they will come.

Cullen Kirk presented on Jay Holt's Building Resiliency on Grandview Drive project. Chair McCain asked if they had contacted an engineer to get rates. Mr.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Kirk said he had been working with an engineer who said \$2,400 was a reasonable amount to have 1-3 design concepts depending on the size of flow. Chair McCain asked for clarification on what the educational resources would entail. Mr. Kirk said it would likely be printed flyers speaking to resources that are being developed and currently exist. There would be a link to the template with step-by-step instructions. The engineering plans will be public information available to anyone who is interested. He said there would also be photos and videos documenting how residents can obtain materials, build the walls, and how the walls hold up to flood events. He said he would be at many community meetings and events as would many others involved in the project.

Ryan McElligott presented for Liminal Flagstaff's Food Program Project. Chair McCain asked for clarification on their relationship with Bashas. Ryan McElligott answered that they are already in a partnership with Bashas, and they receive 15lbs of produce per week. They have already been able to start a community fridge, but they are hoping to cook with most of that food. Right now, they are just handing out raw foods and vegetables.

Lorie Cavalli presented on the University of Arizona Cooperative Extension's project for the Water Conservation Research Grant. Commissioner Dailey asked if it would be feasible to partner with a school in Sunnyside in lieu of De Miguel, noting that Sunnyside is where the stormwater runoff problems are occurring. Ms. Cavalli answered that they have done a lot of work with Killip Elementary this year, and the reason they started with De Miguel is because they already have a teacher committed to the project. She said she will solicit another teacher from the Sunnyside neighborhood. Commissioner Konkell asked how the comic books would be funded. Ms. Cavalli answered that last year, to support virtual learning, they turned a lesson on plants into a digital format comic book. They wrote a second interactive story and online lesson in comic book format that does not need to be printed. She said if they were to print it, it would be 15 color copies their team would absorb.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Konkell to fund the University of Arizona Coconino County Cooperative Extension with the requested \$2,950 of Water Conservation Research Grant Funds.

Commissioner Konkell asked how much funding was available in the Water Conservation Funds. Ms. Molloy answered that \$6,000 was available.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Chair McCain asked if the Commissioners would like to fund Neighborhood Sustainability Grant projects in the order that they were ranked and partially fund the last highest ranking project funds were available for. Commissioner Konkol asked if they were able to use leftover Water Conservation funds to fully or partially support other Neighborhood Sustainability Grant projects with strong water conservation aspects. Ms. Molloy said she had talked with Water Services Staff earlier and that Water Services Staff and Sustainability Staff were planning to meet to discuss leftover funds. She said she could reach out to see if Water Services Staff would allow them to use the funds for another project. Chair McCain said it sounded like a secondary issue. Commissioner Konkol said she was in support of funding projects in the order that they were ranked and partially funding the last highest ranking project funds were available for. She brought to attention some discrepancies in scores and asked if the Commission would like to discuss them. She said Liminal Flagstaff had one Commissioner with a much lower score than the other Commissioners. Commissioner Dailey said based on their presentation he could adjust his score. Commissioner Konkol noted the other project with a large discrepancy was Flagstaff College, but that the Commission had not voted to allow retroactive funding.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Vice Chair White to fund Lefty Loosey Bikes, Friends of Flagstaff Future, Jay Holt, Superyard Farms, COCO-OP, Dr. Ricardo Guthrie, AZ Custom Plastics, Community Assistance Teams of Flagstaff, Tynkertopia, and Northland Family Help Center for their requested amounts with Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Funds, and to fund Liminal Flagstaff with the remaining \$3,339.43.

Ms. Molloy asked if Liminal was unable to accept partial funding if the Commission would like her to continue to move down the list. Ryan McElligott said they would be able to accept partial funding.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Moved by Commissioner Konkol, seconded by Commissioner McCormick to have a discussion at the December meeting about which projects could receive funding if they are able to use the remaining Water Conservation funds.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

D. NAU Climate Science and Solutions Resilience and Adaptation Document

NAU Climate Science and Solutions Class

Requested Action: Informational and Discussion

Pilar Gutierrez and Jalyn Gearries presented on the Adaptation and Resilience Document. They reviewed the project's original goals, the current timeline and milestones, feedback received from City Council, Commissions, and the community, as well as the different sections of the document. The document serves as a resource with action items and a video outreach series for each section. Resources will be available on the City website upon completion of the document. It is currently in the final stages of a rigorous peer review process. Soon, they will perform outreach to raise awareness for the document.

Commissioner McCormick asked if their slides could be made available. They confirmed, saying they could include them in the hyperlink with the document and video series. Chair McCain asked when they were presenting to City Council. They answered that they would be presenting on November 30th.

E. Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Review Working Group

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Vote

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner McCormick to create a working group to optimize the grant process.

Vote: 4-0 passed unanimously

Chair McCain, Vice Chair White, and Commissioner Konkel volunteered to be on the working group. Commissioner McCormick asked if she would be able to share her thoughts. Chair McCain confirmed that they would be requesting feedback from Staff, Commissioners, and applicants.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

6. To and From

Chair McCain said City Council voted not to approve the bill that would have changed the language designating Lowell's use of land. He considers it a big success for sustainability.

7. Future Agenda Item Requests

None

8. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on November 18th, 2021, adjourned at 7:28 pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2020.

Jenny Niemann, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison