

MINUTES

**CITY OF FLAGSTAFF
SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION**

THURSDAY

January 27, 2022

**ONLINE MEETING
MICROSOFT TEAMS**

4:30 – 6:30 PM

Vision: The City of Flagstaff is a culture and community that thrives in response to the Climate Crisis.

Mission: To advise Sustainability Section Staff on matters related to climate and sustainability, support community projects through Neighborhood Sustainability Grants, and provide feedback to the City Council on sustainability issues.

1. Call to Order

Chair McCain called the meeting of the Sustainability Commission held January 27th, 2022, to order at 4:30 pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Konkel
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair White	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Dailey
<input type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Steiger	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner McCormick

Others present: Lee Bryant (Minutes), Marissa Molloy (Staff Liaison), Jenny Ortega (Presenter), Jenny Niemann (Staff/Presenter), Tiffany Antol (Presenter), Austin Aslan (City Council Liaison)

3. Land Acknowledgement

The Flagstaff City Council humbly acknowledges the ancestral homelands of this area's Indigenous nations and original stewards. These lands, still inhabited by Native descendants, border mountains sacred to Indigenous peoples. We honor them, their legacies, their traditions, and their continued contributions. We celebrate their past, present, and future generations who will forever know this place as home.

4. Public Comment

Public Participation enables the public to address the Commission on any subject within their jurisdiction that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. Due to Open Meeting Laws, the Commission cannot discuss or act on items presented during this portion of the agenda. To address an item that is on the agenda, please use the Teams Chat function: simply type in 'public comment' to indicate to the Chair that you would like to comment.

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

The Chair will then recognize you when it is time for public comment, and staff will unmute your microphone if needed.

No Public Comment

5. Approval of Minutes

Moved by Commissioner Konkol, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the December 9th, 2021 minutes.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

6. Business

A. Advisory Groups (5 minutes)

Jenna Ortega, Climate Engagement Coordinator, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Informational

Chair McCain asked Ms. Ortega to share her background and why her position with the City was exciting to her before discussing her topic. Ms. Ortega has a background in aquatic field work throughout the Northwest. After moving to Flagstaff, she wanted to get more involved with community action. Ms. Ortega then discussed the climate advisory group initiative recommended during the Climate Neutrality Plan development process. The goal of advisory groups is to bring community voices into climate action and decision making and ensure that all community members felt heard. The initial advisory groups are Youth, Business, and Equity. Each group will be a diverse collective of Flagstaff residents and provide support and suggestions to the City to help connect the City with the people and businesses it serves. Ms. Ortega asked if the Commission could help spread the word, encourage interest and participation, and share application information with their networks.

Commissioner McCormick asked about applications received so far. Ms. Ortega said she would like more but explained she is focusing on the Youth group right now and targeting her outreach. Both the Equity and Business groups have a handful of applications, even without much targeted outreach. Commissioner McCormick explained that in her outreach efforts she tries to meet people where they are, like presenting to already existing interest groups, and wondered if that would work for finding advisory group applicants. Ms. Ortega said she is presenting to a

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

student group and would prefer to meet in-person with anyone interested, though the pandemic makes that challenging.

B. Sustainable Building Incentive (30 minutes)

Jenny Niemann, Climate Program Manager, and Tiffany Antol, Planning Development Manager, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Jenny Niemann and Tiffany Antol presented on the Amendment to Zoning Code Section 10-30.070 Residential Sustainable Building Standards PZ-21-00282. This incentive is optional and provides up to a 25% density increase on developers' property with four requirements: water resource protection, transportation and air quality, waste, and energy efficiency. Previously the incentive was not used much and conflicted with incentives for affordable housing. The proposed zoning code amendment is aimed at correcting these issues and includes replacing the HERS 50 standard with all-electric energy efficient buildings that comply with one of several energy requirements, incorporating electric vehicle charging stations, revised waste reduction requirements, and allowing the Planning Director to enter into an agreement with property owners that comply with all these standards to increase their maximum residential density by 25%. With the proposed changes, Water Resource Protection provisions now include all buildings within a residential development; Transportation and Air Quality provisions now require being within ¼ of a transit stop or providing electrical vehicle charging stations; and Waste Reduction and Management provisions now require both a materials management plan and a construction and demolition waste management plan. The Energy Efficiency provisions include three options in place of the former HERS 50 standards: all-electric zero energy building, all-electric energy-efficient building, or a triple certification. The revisions are being made to further support the goals and strategies of the Carbon Neutrality Plan.

Commissioner Dailey asked if the density bonus would be attractive enough to developers or if any feedback had been received. Ms. Antol said it had been used three times under the current configuration and that the Sustainability Office was helping to educate businesses on the incentives. The incentive has been used in conjunction with affordable housing incentives. Commissioner Dailey asked if the reason this incentive does not

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

run afoul of the state law is because it is an incentive and not a prohibition. Ms. Niemann confirmed.

Commissioner McCormick asked what the plans were for demolition waste. She noted she had recently spoken with a local rancher who would like to get concrete for erosion control. Ms. Niemann said she would like to connect Commissioner McCormick with Kaeli Wells who focuses on waste management. About three years ago Staff formed a working group to look at demolition waste and received good feedback from developers. Commissioner McCormick said she would be happy to talk to Ms. Wells.

Commissioner Dailey asked what levers exist for building standards of single-family homes to incentivize no additional gas hookups. Ms. Antol explained that this incentive can be used for single family homes and that most developers she is working with own whole subdivisions. Ms. Niemann said Staff has not gotten that far thinking on fuel switching but that as the energy code is updated electricity can be used to push energy efficiency goals.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to approve the Sustainable Building Incentive as presented today.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

C. Lefty Loosey Budget Change Request (5 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Vote

Marissa Molloy reviewed a letter from Lefty Loosey regarding a request to move \$1,000 from volunteer stipends to safety equipment.

Moved by Vice Chair White, seconded by Commissioner Dailey to approve Lefty Loosey budget change request.

Chair McCain said it sounded great and was a positive move. Commissioner McCormick thanked Lefty Loosey for the previous and current budget updates.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

D. Commissioner Introductions (10 minutes)

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Discussion

Chair McCain asked the Commissioners to introduce themselves, to share why they were here and what they are excited about getting involved with, and a nonwork-related activity they have been enjoying this month.

Chair McCain shared that he thought Flagstaff had a lot to do to meet the Carbon Neutrality Plan and has been hiking on the weekends.

Commissioner White said he was happy to be part of the Commission because it does important work building ecological and social sustainability. He has been learning how to use his new 3-D printer.

Commissioner Dailey joined the Commission to focus on climate-related issues and has been cross-country skiing.

Commissioner Konkel introduced herself as an NAU faculty member in the undergraduate public health program with interests in sustainability and active transportation. In her spare time, she has been hiking and taking her dog to Sedona.

Commissioner McCormick expressed appreciation for the time to get to know the people she is sharing her opinions with. She said she was an ecologist and botanist and has lived in Flagstaff for 22 years. She said she felt it was time to get involved with local politics regarding sustainability. Lately she has been dancing and participating in Flagstaff Free Motion at FALA practicing her DJ skills.

Chair McCain discussed a possible clean-up opportunity along Aspen near City Hall as a way for the Commission to get together and meet each other.

Lee Bryant talked about her previous work with the City of Flagstaff and current snow play adventures.

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Chair McCain celebrated Ms. Molloy's promotion to Commission liaison. Ms. Molloy said she was very excited to be in the new position and in her free time has been sewing and mending.

E. Responses to Commissioner Feedback on December Meeting (10 min)

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Informational and Discussion

Chair McCain reviewed the survey feedback and discussed changes to future meetings. In the survey, they received suggestions to add introductions to the meetings, increase meeting efficiency by prioritizing items related to the Carbon Neutrality Plan, and to send agendas earlier. Chair McCain noted that agendas will now be sent on Thursdays with the caveat that emails may be sent with last minute changes. Another suggestion was to have agendas on Google Docs with notes taken in real time. Ms. Molloy said that minutes are often difficult to understand before they are published but will consider feedback or ideas for other options to provide real time updates. Chair McCain said he would love feedback on his facilitation and is always trying to improve. Based on feedback, Chair McCain said he would like to do better at giving Commissioners a sense that they were making Flagstaff more sustainable.

F. Chair and Vice Chair Succession Planning (10 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Vote

Ms. Molloy said that several other Commissions have the Vice Chair automatically assume the Chair role, which can lead to training opportunities for the Vice Chair, and asked if this were how the Commission would like to handle its elections. Chair McCain reinforced that if he is reelected, he would step down next year and that having a formal system where the Vice Chair steps up would be helpful.

Commissioner McCormick asked if the Chair and Vice chair currently serve for one year. Chair McCain said he was not sure if that was formalized but it might be good to add one-year term limits to Chair and Vice Chair positions into this motion. Commissioner McCormick asked if this Vice Chair conversion to Chair would take place now and if Vice Chair White was okay with this. Chair McCain said it would go into effect with the new

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

election next month and the Vice Chair would serve one year as Vice Chair and one year as Chair.

Vice Chair White had similar questions and requested clarity on what would be voted on. He asked if they would elect a Chair and Vice Chair every year or elect a Chair and Vice Chair and the Vice Chair would move to being Chair the next year. Chair McCain said it was the latter and asked if the Commission would have elections every two years. Commissioner Dailey said they would elect a new Vice Chair every year and Vice Chair White agreed.

Commissioner Konkel said that it is good for the Chair to serve two years, noting that changing Chairs every year can feel overwhelming. She said she would vote to formalize the process so that the Chair serves two years, and the Vice Chair has the option to move into the Chair position, but that it was not a requirement. Chair McCain said that sounded good.

Vice Chair White asked for the exact wording. Ms. Niemann spoke to the implications of a two-year term for Chair and Vice Chair, after which the Vice Chair would move to Chair making it a four-year term. She noted that this is longer than most terms and has a cascading nature to consider.

Chair McCain asked Ms. Molloy how other Commissions have set elections and Ms. Molloy said her understanding was that it was on a year basis but that she could look further into this. Ms. Niemann asked, if the Commission wanted to decide tonight, if they value chair longevity or training opportunity.

Commissioner Konkel said it made sense to have a two-year term for the Chair without the expectation that the Vice Chair must move into the Chair position. There could be a two-year long term for Chair and elections for Vice Chair every year.

Chair McCain said they could elect a chair every year. Commissioner Konkel suggested elections every year but each person elected could have the opportunity to serve two years if they wanted. Chair McCain restated Commissioner Konkel for clarity of understanding.

Minutes

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner McCormick said she saw the merit of having a Chair serve two years but would like to know more about the training burden. Chair McCain shared his thought of having the Vice Chair attend the last two or three agenda planning meetings with the liaison, which would be a three-hour commitment for training. He then asked Ms. Molloy how necessary training is. Ms. Molloy said Staff was very willing to train the new Chair on the agenda-planning process. Ms. Niemann said that to accomplish the goal for training perhaps the election could occur with a three-month transition time.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Chair McCormick to update the Commission officer election process such that elections will take place each year in September with a three-month transition training period for the new Chair, the Chair will have the option of putting themselves up for election to serve two terms, and the Vice Chair will be elected each year with no expectation of becoming Chair.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

G. Chair and Vice Chair Nominations (10 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff

Requested Action: Discussion

Ms. Molloy opened the floor for nominations for Chair and Vice Chair. Commissioner McCormick nominated Chair McCain for chair. Vice Chair White said he would be happy to serve another year as Vice Chair and nominated himself. Commissioner Konkel seconded Commissioner McCormick's nomination of Chair McCain for Chair and seconded Vice Chair White's nomination of himself for Vice Chair.

H. Proposed Process to Determine Commission's Future Actions Supporting the CNP (15 minutes)

Chair McCain

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Chair McCain asked for feedback about Commissioners receiving the three-hour Climate Ambassador Training and receiving options from Sustainability staff on how the Commission can support the Carbon Neutrality Plan (CNP) afterwards. Commissioner Konkel said she would

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

love to receive the training and that it would be very impactful and help her support the CNP on an individual basis. She said that receiving options from staff to support the CNP would be best.

Ms. Molloy added that staff is working on budget requests and asked if the Commission would like to request any other formal training. Chair McCain asked Ms. Molloy to share more about the equity training staff is hoping to receive. Commissioner McCormick asked Ms. Molloy for more information about the climate training. Ms. Molloy talked about previous staff training on racial bias and awareness of equity through USDN, though specifics are still in the works for future trainings. Ms. Niemann explained that the Climate Ambassador Training has a foundation in climate science, what the City is doing, and what actions people can take to have conversations about climate change. She said it is grounded in the idea that conversations are important for climate action.

Commissioner McCormick asked if options could be added to the Google survey about what they would like to hear about in the training and what additional items they would like the City to cover. Chair McCain clarified that the Climate Ambassador Training is already established and that the options would be for additional training. He asked Ms. Molloy when the budget was due. She responded that it was due by next Wednesday and that she could create a feedback form.

Commissioner Dailey said he would rather see more time spent on carbon neutrality items and expressed major hesitations about whether the projects they fund are making climate action better or worse. He said pivoting time to the CNP would be a good thing all around. Chair McCain noted the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant working group is trying to decrease the amount of time spent on the grant process and move more deeply into carbon neutrality.

Commissioner McCormick expressed appreciation for the opportunity to help support Sustainability Staff and move the ball forward.

Moved by Chair McCain, seconded by Vice Chair White to approve the proposed path for the Commission to determine how to support the CNP; the first step is to receive Climate Ambassador Training during the Commission's meetings, and the second step is for Staff to

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

present a report to the Commission with options of how to support the CNP, which they will choose from to determine how to move forward.

Vote: 5-0 Unanimously passed

Ms. Niemann requested that Commissioners have ideas of actions they would like to take and topics in the CNP they would like to focus on. Chair McCain said he sees the training as a way for Commissioners to dialog with Staff.

Commissioner McCormick asked whether Jenny would like a list of what the Commission would like to work on or prioritize within the CNP or a list of additional things outside of the CNP. Ms. Niemann said she was interested in what the Commission can work on and would rather have the list co-created during the Climate Ambassador Training through dialogue with Commissioners.

Chair McCain shared that he and Nicole Antonopoulos discussed the potential of Commissioners helping to support Ms. Ortega with the Resilient Neighborhood Network or tensions delineated within the CNP and Climate Action and Adaptation Plan.

I. Staff Update (5 minutes)

Marissa Molloy, Administrative Assistant, City of Flagstaff
Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Molloy gave an update on Sustainability Staff's activities. Commissioner Dailey said there is a lot of room for public education on why electrification is important, asking for electrification demonstrations. Ms. Molloy said she would pass the idea along to Staff. Chair McCain said he read an article that articulates how much methane leaks from gas stoves and asked Ms. Molloy to forward information to Sustainability Staff.

7. To and From

None

8. Future Agenda Item Requests

Minutes
City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Commissioner Konkel requested an update on the status of community input and City Council's decisions regarding the Lone Tree overpass.

9. Adjournment

The meeting of the Sustainability Commission on January 27th, 2022, adjourned at 6:09 pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk. This notice has been posted on the City's website and can be downloaded at www.flagstaff.az.gov.

Dated this ____ day of _____, 2022.

Marissa Molloy, Sustainability Commission Staff Liaison