



MINUTES
City of Flagstaff
Sustainability Commission

Thursday, August 23, 2018
4:30 – 6:00 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL
211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair
Eli Chamberlain
Dara Marks Marino

David McCain
Amanda Vigneau
Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Nicole Antonopoulos

1. Call to Order

Chair Petersen called the meeting to order at 4:32pm.

2. Roll Call

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Chair Petersen	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Marks Marino
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Vice Chair McCain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Vigneau
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner Chamberlain	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Commissioner White

3. Public Participation

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public participation.

4. **Approval of Minutes**

A. June 6, 2018

Commissioner McCain submitted revision requests by email to Nicole Antonopoulos. Commissioner Marks Marino motioned to approve the minutes. The motion was seconded. All voted in favor.

5. **Business**

A. Sustainability Neighborhood Grants (45 Minutes) – All

▪ **Grant Application Review**

Requested Action: Discussion and vote

Sustainability Neighborhood Grant applicants were on the agenda to present their grant applications. The Commissioners determined it would be best to listen to all of the grantee with time for questions, then follow with a short discussion.

Afterward, the Commissioners would make their votes. This process was decided in order to make for a fair process.

▪ **Azulita Project - Flagstaff Doesn't Suck**

Three Board Members from Azulita Project presented on their grant proposal "Flagstaff Doesn't Suck" (the project title was changed to "Strong, Free Flagstaff"). Marie Camel is a marine biologist, Lauren Figueroa, is a graduate student in Sustainable Communities at Northern Arizona University (NAU), and Martin Stonebreaker did not announce her title.

Commissioners were provided with a handout with project details. The presenters explained that their project is aimed at education. They are partnering with the NAU Green Jacks who will pass out information to local businesses on the environmental issues associated with straws. The funds requested under the grant will go towards educational materials. The Azulita Project did a dry run at Karma restaurant which is a straw-free business. The presenters emphasized that the idea of the project is to help educate restaurant staff and is not by any means meant to be a shaming campaign.

The presenters described their project as a second tier approach in addressing ocean pollution. Through their project, they can help businesses understand that plastic is not the only solution. The first tier would be action through policy. The applicants view their project as a low hanging fruit and in line with what other businesses in town are already doing (examples mentioned include The McMillan, Macy's and Criollo, all of which are already focused on plastic reduction).

The applicants suggested that tackling global plastic issue is challenging, but this project could create local awareness and action which goes a long way.

▪ **Flagstaff High School - Green Eagle**

The Flagstaff High School applicant was not present and no presentation of their project was given during the meeting.

- **Museum of Northern Arizona - ADA Accessible Pathway and Garden Expansion**

Jan Busco is Research Botany Specialist at the Museum of Northern Arizona (MNA) and is the liaison between MNA and the Colton Community Garden, a 100% volunteer-based garden. Carol Fritzingler and is a volunteer with Colton Community Garden and self-appointed garden manager. Colton Garden is across from MNA and has gone through peaks and valleys over the years.

Their grant project is intended to keep the current momentum going with the revival of the garden as a place for public education and enjoyment. The garden includes three primary types of plants: native plants, vegetables, and agricultural crops focused on native culture. The project purpose is to create a demonstration garden at the Colton Garden entrance to showcase different ways people can grow plants water consciously and in low-cost ways at high altitude. The materials used to create this area would all be local and recycled.

Commissioner Chamberlain asked whether or not the project would be open to everyone. Mrs. Fritzingler responded that it would be open to the public.

- **Graduate Research - Precious Plastics**

Tyler Linner is a graduate student in the Sustainable Communities program at NAU focusing his thesis on plastic recycling. He mentioned that there is a nonprofit in the Netherlands called Precious Plastic that offers open source plans for plastic recycling machines. Mr. Linner received a grant from NAU to buy a plastic shredder machine and compressor. He recycles plastics that would normally go to the landfill in Flagstaff using these machines.

He requested a grant through the Sustainability Neighborhood Grants program to purchase an extruder from Precious Plastic which will allow him to create a more presentable project. Without the extruder, Mr. Linner is able to recycle plastics, but the product created has a confetti-like design due to the various types of plastics being recycled. An extruder will give all his finished products a pinkish hue.

Mr. Linner mentioned that he will open source the document that outlines how to make the plastic recycling machines. He mentioned that he will work with the producer of these products in Portland to sell back the products produced under this project to the Portland company.

Mr. Linner mentioned that he has a website with a blog and photos: <https://plastic.linnerdesign.com/>. Mr. Linner will post updates about the project on the website and on his Facebook page.

The commissioners then engaged in discussion of each of the projects. The Sustainability Neighborhood Grants have funds from both the Sustainability Section and Water Services.

Commissioner McCain motioned to fund the Azulita Project “Strong, Free Flagstaff.” Commissioner Marks Marino seconded the motion. All in favor.

Commissioner Vigneau (previously Ulmer) expressed reservations about the Colton Garden project because she felt that garden projects have been done many times in the past. Discussion was had about what is sustainable and Commissioner Peterson commented on the social/quality of life aspect of the project which is important for sustainable communities. Commissioner White agreed and mentioned the importance of mental health. Commissioner Mark Marino asked the grantees for clarification on a past grant granted to MNA for composting bins. Mrs. Busco mentions that this proposed project would connect with the composting project. Commissioner Marks Marino expressed concern about giving too much money to same entities.

Commissioner McCain motioned that they fully fund the Colton Garden project. Seconded. The vote passes with three “yeas” from Commissioners Chamberlain, McCain, and Peterson. There were two “nays” from Commissioners Ulmer and Marks Marino.

Commissioners discussed concerns about the Precious Plastic project and whether or not to wait on taking a vote until they heard from the Flagstaff High School project. Public comment from the Azulita Project applicants mentioned the value of the Precious Plastic project. The individual also commented that while the Flagstaff High School recycling bin project was a nice idea that fact is that recycling is not the solution. She also mentioned that the Mr. Linner could also make the recycling bins with his machine.

Commissioner Marks Marino moved that they fund the Precious Plastic project. Commissioner Vigneau seconded. The grant application was approved.

▪ **Staff Proposed Changes to Grant Process**

Requested Action: Discussion and vote

Ms. Antonopoulos presents on administrative efficiencies that they are trying to move forward regarding the Neighborhood Sustainability grants. Lessons learned from the last year highlighted a need to align the grant application process with the close out of the fiscal year. Commissioners will review the proposed changes at their September meeting.

B. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan Update (15 minutes)– Jenny Niemann

Requested Action: Informational

Mrs. Niemann, Sustainability Specialist, provided an update on the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP). In June, Mrs. Niemann presented the preliminary plan to the Sustainability Commission. She mentioned that Ms. Antonopoulos presented this to City Council at the end of June.

In July, they held three open houses that were not well attended, but included very rich conversation. They also had two online surveys that mirrored the open houses with the first requesting general comments on the plan and the second asking for specific comments. The online surveys had low participation.

Mrs. Niemann and Sustainability staff will go to Council three times to review the content of the plan. Three work sessions will occur September 25th, October 9th,

and October 23rd to review the content of the plan. The draft plan will be published on September 19th for the Council agenda. The Final Plan will be released to Council and the community on November 7th. The November 20th Council meeting will include time to adopt the Plan (this is the week of Thanksgiving).

Mrs. Niemann discussed how they will focus on operationalizing equity so that they consider equity in the implementation actions and in policy. They will utilize a check list to ensure that equity is always part of the discussion.

The Implementation Plan will also include a Community Action Guide which will give the public a guide on how they as individuals can take action on climate. They will also have a Community Outreach Strategy which will be an internal document that describes how staff will communicate with the public on the plan.

Also to be included is a Funding Options section to discuss how actions will be funded. Another section entitled Accountability and Reporting will help them stay accountable to the goals they've set in the plan. This section will also include an annual progress report with a greenhouse gas inventory (which they already do annually) plus key performance indicators for every goal in the plan. An online dashboard will help the public understand what goals and indicators exist and who is responsible for overseeing each goal.

The plan would be updated every five years. Mrs. Niemann showed a graphic which highlighted the fact that Flagstaff would only reach 18% reduction in greenhouse gas emissions with implementation of the CAAP while the goal is 80%. Implementation plan elements for year one will include a huge amount of work in order to help move the needle towards getting closer to our 80% goal.

Commissioner McCain expressed concern that the Sustainability Section has not been fully funded in the past and asked for clarification on who makes decisions about funding. Ms. Antonopoulos described several layers of decisionmaking through the budgetary process. The final budget is approved in late May with resolutions that adopt the budget presented to Council in June.

C. Sustainability Section Update (10 minutes) – Nicole Antonopoulos

Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Antonopoulos emphasized the Climate Action updates that will be presented to Council this fall. Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned the Solid Waste proposed rate increase that will be presented to Council on Tuesday, August 28th. This rate has not been increased since 2008. They will discuss volumetric pricing also known as Pay as You Throw. The City currently spends less than sixteen cents per resident on recycling education.

Staff will present an update on the energy and renewable energy efforts on September 25th.

Ms. Antonopoulos also announced bittersweet news that McKenzie Jones has moved on to the City of Sedona. We now have good partnership opportunities with them. Dylan Lenzen is the Acting Community Sustainability Specialist. They are working internally for a refresh opportunity on the Zero Waste Coordinator.

They are also doing an organizational study to catch up with the growth of the section.

- 6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All**
Commissioner McCain mentioned that Friends of Flagstaff’s Future is hosting a City Council Candidate forum on August 30th from 5:30pm-8pm at Coconino Community College Lone Tree.

- 7. Future Agenda Items (5 Minutes) – All**
 - A. City of Flagstaff Open Spaces Program**
 - B. Regional Plan**
 - C. Local Economies**
 - D. Community Agriculture**
 - E. Animal Keeping Code**
 - F. Staff Proposed Changes to Sustainability Grant Process**

- 8. Adjournment**
Chair Petersen adjourned the meeting at 6:08pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2018.
