

REGIONAL PLAN ANNUAL REPORT 2017

Questions and answers generated from the June 27th, 2018 presentation to the Planning and Zoning Commission.

Airport

1. Do we have a private plane landing fee?

Answer per Barney Helmick, Flagstaff Airport Director: *No, we only do landing fees on Commercial operators. Medical Flights, Charters, Airlines, and Cargo companies are the primary ones. Very few airports charge landing fees on private pilots. If we did Private pilots we would receive a FAA Part 13 complaint from AOPA. They just did that on several airports back east. The only airports that have been able to do that are private airports. I personally would oppose any effort to impose a landing fee on private pilots. We have close to 100 based pilots that would lead the charge in opposition to this.*

Public Facilities – Solid Waste

1. Do you have any thoughts on the future landfill numbers now that plastic recycling rules have changed? Any guesses on how much more will enter the landfill now?

Answer per Matthew Morales, Landfill Project Manager: *This topic is so hot right now and it is too early to tell. We need more time before we can deliver those numbers with confidence.*

Answer per Dylan Lenzen, Acting Sustainability Specialist: *It's hard to provide a super accurate number since the MRF hasn't been selling a significant portion of their plastic for some time. They also haven't landfilled it just yet either. In looking at the few years of data from the MRF before they stopped selling much of their plastic, roughly one-quarter of the plastic they were recycling was the #3-7 plastic that is no longer recyclable. It's hard to know how accurate this number is, as more of that material might have made its way into the "residuals" that get sent to the landfill. The #3-7 plastics also make up a much smaller percentage of total recyclables, as plastic weighs significantly less than other materials like aluminum. As Matt mentioned, we'll need to wait to really understand the impacts of the recent changes.*

2. Does recycling generate any money? Or how much more does it cost to recycle vs dispose in the landfill?

Answer per Dylan Lenzen, Acting Sustainability Specialist: *It's difficult to provide a concrete answer to the costs of our recycling program and compare them to landfilling costs. Due to the manner in which the contract with Norton Environmental (the MRF operator) was written, the recycling side of the business has significant costs associated with it. The contract stipulates a minimum tonnage that the City is responsible for delivering to the MRF. When that minimum tonnage is not met, the City is required to pay the MRF and cover the difference. Just in our annual minimum guarantee we will owe \$1.4m per year until the end of the contract that doesn't include the regular tipping fee for what we actually deliver. The City does receive a market share on the material that is sold by the MRF. How much depends on contamination level and markets. The revenue share is based on the amount Norton sells the material for above a base rate specified in the agreement. An example is the base price for cardboard is \$40/ton. We would share 50% of the revenue above that number. So if they sell it at \$40/ton we get nothing. As you can imagine, with recent changes to international recycling markets,*

this market share will take a hit. We are waiting on some numbers from Norton about the revenue share last year and the current trend. It is also difficult to compare the cost of recycling to the costs of landfilling, since we don't have a way of quantifying the cost of siting a new landfill in today's dollars. This would be the proper way of comparing costs, since a major benefit of recycling is extending the life of the landfill. Given all that is happening with recycling markets, it's also clear that the financial model for recycling will change in communities throughout the country. But, it's difficult to say exactly what that will look like.

3. Once our landfill is full, do we have a plan for another site?

Answer per Matthew Morales, Landfill Project Manager: Short Answer is no...but it is hard to convey the price it will cost the City in future years to purchase a new landfill site.

4. How much toxic waste enters the landfill?

Answer per Matthew Morales, Landfill Project Manager: None-We don't accept toxic waste.

5. How do we handle the methane?

Answer per Matthew Morales, Landfill Project Manager: See the detailed description in the City of Flagstaff Public Works – Solid Waste Section 2018 Solid Waste Plan:

<https://www.flagstaff.az.gov/1872/Cinder-Lake-Landfill-Public-Reports>

6. Could more construction waste be recycled? State law limits us from requiring anything but do you guys have any thoughts on how this could be improved.

Answer per Matthew Morales, Landfill Project Manager: I am working with Darren Bingham to start a pilot project for crushing concrete without rebar. In the meantime, we are permitted to grind lumber and use it as a form of alternative daily cover (we have to cover our trash every day).

Answer per Dylan Lenzen, Acting Sustainability Specialist: We are in the process of exploring new strategies for diversion. In the Spring we convened our first Construction Waste Advisory Committee that includes multiple partners for the construction and reuse industries, as well as the County. We are hoping to develop a pilot project or two after our next meeting in August to better utilize the programs that Matt mentioned.

Water Resources

1. Will the Red Gap Ranch water need to be blended? Is it really alkaline and would have to be blended?

Answer per Erin Young, Water Resources Manager: Either blended, treated, or both.

2. What is the potential to use reclaimed water to drink?

Answer per Erin Young, Water Resources Manager: The potential is a real option now that state law has new rules to allow "Direct Potable Reuse". Of course there are stringent guidelines tied to DPR. We are currently investigating costs to build a DPR facility, as well as costs for advanced treatment (not quite to the purity of DPR water) other alternatives such as groundwater recharge or augmentation of Upper Lake Mary water, and all alternatives including Red Gap Ranch will be compared in a Water Resources Master Plan in FY20

3. What is the potential to inject the reclaimed water back into our aquifer?

Answer per Erin Young, Water Resources Manager: *Great potential.*

Impervious Surfaces

1. Will we know how much impervious land, land area, is for automobiles (opposed to roofs for example)? Will we split out asphalt from roads separate from asphalt for parking lots?

Answer per Jim Janecek, Stormwater Section Project Manager: *The Stormwater Section funded the creation of an impervious surface layer in 2014 with a rather limited budget, so to simply things we created a single impervious surface layer and did not discern between different types. This serves our needs since we use the impervious surface layer for hydrologic modeling and stormwater billing. I believe the new effort this past year (still ongoing but close to finishing) was to add/update our impervious surface layer but no subcategories would be created. The goal of the effort was to primarily determine what the accurate billing would be for each property owner. However, there may be ways to query buildings in GIS and subtract that number.*

Questions and answers generated from the August 21st, 2018 presentation to the City Council.

Community Well Being

1. Flagstaff has had between 24 and 23 percent of its population below the poverty level over the past four years. What is the national average?

Answer per US Census via American FactFinder: *The 2016 American Community Survey 5-Year Estimate for Arizona is 17.7 percent and is 15.1 percent for the entire United States.*

Note that the Census defines “individuals below the poverty level” by a set of money income thresholds that vary by family size and composition. The official poverty thresholds do not vary geographically. The official poverty definition uses money income before taxes and does not include capital gains or noncash benefits such as public housing, Medicaid, and food stamps.

Answer per Gail Jackson, Business Attraction Manager: *Please have a look at this link <https://www.census.gov/library/visualizations/time-series/demo/census-poverty-tool.html> Poverty rates by County. It's done every ten years and they have information up until 2010. If you look at Coconino County we were at 34.6% of those living in Poverty in 1960. We are currently at 21.4%. Flagstaff makes up 65% of the msa (County). The Counties with the highest are at 49.5% - 44.6%. These counties are in North and South Dakota, Georgia and Louisiana. Those counties with the lowest living in poverty range from 3.3-3.9%. These Counties are in Texas, Alaska, Illinois, Virginia and New Jersey.*

2. Are there any specific efforts to bring Flagstaff's percent living in poverty down?

Answer per Gail Jackson, Business Attraction Manager and David McIntire, Community Investment Director: *In Business Attraction, we are pursuing the high wage low impact employers that also align with many of our community values. By pursuing the targeted sectors of Advanced Manufacturing, Biosciences, Healthcare and Digital Sector this will bring higher paid jobs to our community and allow for those residences who desire enhance their prosperity. Alongside Business Attraction efforts the City provides support for existing businesses through a variety of Business Retention and Expansion Programs, and also works to help businesses grow and thrive through the management of two facilities we have on Innovation Mesa (the Business Incubator and Business Accelerator) and the contract we have with MOONSHOT at NACET for Business Services. These services, along with Business Attraction, are all designed to support growth in jobs, wages and prosperity which is intended to reduce the number of families experiencing poverty.*