



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff

Sustainability Commission

Thursday, September 27, 2018

4:30 – 6:00 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair
Eli Chamberlain
Dara Marks Marino

David McCain
Amanda Vigneau
Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Nicole Antonopoulos

1. **Call to Order**

Chair McCain called the meeting to order at 4:32pm.

2. **Roll Call**

Chair Petersen (by phone)

Vice Chair McCain

Commissioner Chamberlain

Commissioner Marks Marino

Commissioner Vigneau

Commissioner White

3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public participation.

4. Approval of Minutes

A. August 23, 2018

Commissioners Marks Marino and McCain submitted revision requests by email and hard copy to Nicole Antonopoulos. These edits will be applied. Commissioner Chamberlain motioned to approve the minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioners White and Marks Marino. All voted in favor.

5. Business

A. Four Propositions on the November 2018 Ballot for Flagstaff Voters to Consider (30 Minutes)

Requested Action: Informational

Jeff Meilbeck, General Manager and CEO of NAIPTA, presented information on Propositions 419, 420, and 421. He explained that the City and NAIPTA are working together on a multimodal approach to transportation. He presented a map showing how the propositions interrelate.

Proposition 419 was originally approved in 2000. If not renewed, it will sunset in 2020. Mr. Meilbeck presented projects that have been funded under this tax including the Cedar Avenue FUTS bridge, the West and Arrowhead improvements to the street (with bike lanes and sidewalks added), and the Soliere extension. If Prop 419 passed, J.W. Powell would be extended to connect with Lake Mary Road and on through to 4th Street. In addition, roundabouts would be installed near Little America and 148 bicycle and pedestrian paths would be constructed. Proposition 419 does not include funding for public transportation.

Proposition 420 is to bridge the railroad tracks at Lone Tree Road. This project has been studied for 20 years and has similar goals as the 4th Street overpass project.

Proposition 421 is for more buses, more often. The Mountain Line system has increased significantly in the last eighteen years. Mr. Meilbeck mentioned that when you reduce the amount of time people have to wait for a bus, they ride more. He described a threshold for ridership where a bus every 15 minutes gets the system to a point where people don't need a schedule. He mentioned that in our society, until a bus system gets to the 15-minute threshold, people don't ride as much. Weekday buses would go from 30 minute intervals to 15-20 minutes if Prop 421 passed. Similarly, weekend bus intervals would go from 1 hour to 30 minute intervals and the routes would run later into the night. Mr. Meilbeck mentioned that they have leverage with NAU who promises to buy a bus pass for every student if the proposition passes. If Prop 421 did not pass, it is unclear if NAU will still buy passes for every student.

The current retail sales tax is at 8.951% and would go to 9.331% if all three propositions passed. About half of the retail sales tax in the City of Flagstaff goes towards transportation (which amounts to about 1%). There are open houses planned and a website available with additional information on these propositions.

Commission Peterson asked how Prop 421 would affect the permanent transportation network. Mr. Meilbeck responded that Prop 421 would build the

permanent transportation network and connect the highest density areas to try to move the most people by transit.

Mr. Dan Folke, Acting Community Development Director, presented on Proposition 422 which focuses on improving housing affordability. He mentioned that affordability is a national standard defined as a household spending no more than 30% of their gross income on housing costs. The proposition asks the Flagstaff voters to address whether or not to authorize the City of Flagstaff to issue and sell general obligation bonds in principal amount up to \$25 million. Mr. Folke noted that this is a Council priority. There is also a goal in the Regional Plan 2030 that relates to this.

He then presented data from the Arizona Department of Housing (2015) showing that the median home price in Flagstaff was \$299,300 and the wage to meet that affordability target would need to be \$34.43. Mr. Folke mentioned that by the end of 2016, the median home price was up to \$350,000. Similarly, average rent for a two-bedroom apartment in Flagstaff was \$1,033 and the hourly rate would need to be \$19.87. Housing Solutions of Northern Arizona did a more recent survey and found that the average rent for a two-bedroom was \$1,441. About 45% of Flagstaff population own their homes which is almost 20% less than the national average. Our cost of living is 15.6% greater than the national average.

The first step if Prop 422 passed would be to create an advisory committee made up of residents of Flagstaff from different income brackets and people who work in the housing industry. The committee would make recommendations to Council on how to use the funds and what the program looks like. Ultimately, Council would make all final decisions.

Funds would be available to private homebuilders and nonprofits for building new homes and apartments to lower the cost of ownership and rent. The City could do a program similar to the Federal Section 8 voucher program. The details of the program will be flexible because the needs may change due to fluctuations in local market and housing conditions.

The program will be paid for through the secondary property tax which are used to pay off general obligation bonds which have been issued by the Council. The secondary property tax rate is currently 0.8366% per \$100 of net assessed value. The City has been able to maintain this rate by paying off old bonds before issuing new bonds and that is the plan for Prop 422. The City has the legal capacity to set the secondary tax rate at 2.2%.

The Commission had questions about whether or not the bond includes interest, whether or not there will be other bonding needs in the future, and whether or not homes and rental units under this program would remain affordable in perpetuity.

B. Sustainability Neighborhood Grants (30 minutes)– All Grant Application Updates

Requested Action: Discussion and vote

Ms. Antonopoulos walked the Commission through edits to the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant Application. She mentioned that they had an opportunity to

look at the structure of the grant program and that it was always designed to be improved. She said the biggest changes to the program are on the administrative side.

The Commission discussed how often they should accept grant proposals and whether or not to provide grantees with the grant funds upfront (versus reimbursing grantees). The Commission recommended having one grant cycle with grant proposals due May 1st (or June 1st). They also recommended that grant funds be provided upfront to make the program more accessible and equitable. Recommendation from staff side is that the project be completed in six-month period. The Commission chose to wait on deciding whether or not grant proposals should be presented in May with Commission decisions on the grant awards during the same meeting or to make the decision at the June meeting.

The Commission recommended specific language in the grant application or a grantee packet on expenditure tracking and the need for submitting all receipts with the final report. They also suggested several changes in the language within the grant application.

Commissioner White motioned to vote to accept the changes to the program and application. Commissioner Marks Marino seconds. All in favor.

C. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan and Sustainability Section Update (5 minutes) – Nicole Antonopoulos

Requested Action: Informational

Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned that the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan had one work session with Council and has two more planned (October 9th and 23rd). Staff are walking the Council through the draft plan in sections to get their input. October will focus on public input with three open houses at the Murdoch Center scheduled for October 4th, 8th, and 11th. Coffee and Climate is also scheduled on October 19th and there is a community survey online. The plan will be presented for adoption on November 20th 2018.

Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned that during the September 25th City Council meeting the Flagstaff Climate Action Council requested that the Sustainability Commission review and comment on Key Performance Indicators and Targets. She provided the Commission with several options for providing this input. The Commission decided not to pursue these options and instead will wait until their October meeting to give their endorsement for the plan.

Ms. Antonopoulos then provided Sustainability Section updates. She mentioned upcoming events including the 15 Minute Makeover, Make a Difference Day, and Drop-Off Day. She requested help from the Commission at these events.

Ms. Antonopoulos also shared that the the City has an upcoming target for renewable energy goal of 35% by 2020. In 2017, the Council established a transition to 100% renewables. The first area staff are focusing on related to electricity is energy efficiency at the City. Staff issued a request for proposals for an energy purchase solicitation for up to 19 megawatts of renewable energy. If this is not approved by APS, the City has the option to buy renewable energy

credits on the open market which are running at one tenth of a penny per kilowatt-hour. The City is also bringing on an additional 140,000 square feet of facilities in the next year which means their energy use will increase. Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned that the City participated in the APS Partners for Sustainable Futures program. Through the program, the City applied for a premium to bring the airport and the Aquaplex to 100% renewable generate electricity.

Ms. Antonopoulos then presented on natural gas. The City is focusing on energy efficiency as it relates to natural gas and will need to conduct retro-commissioning and purchase renewable energy credits. Most natural gas is used at the City wells for Water Services. She closed the energy conversation by mentioning that Prop 127 would require Arizona to be 50% powered by solar and wind by 2030. The Arizona Corporation Commission are also hoping to look into deregulation of electric utilities.

Ms. Antonopoulos introduced statistics from the six-month pilot program they conducted with SPIN. The program ends in October. They had almost 11,000 miles ridden in less than five months with just 200 bikes. Staff will be working with their transportation partners to collect feedback and issue another community survey about the community's experience with the program. Staff will issue another request for proposal in partnership with NAU. In addition, Ms. Antonopoulos will bring forward an ordinance to Council on changing their City code in order to protect City right of ways.

Sustainability Section started an Anti-Idling Campaign. They found that people idle most at train stops, parking lots, and drive thrus.

She closed by sharing that vandalism has occurred at Picture Canyon. The vandalism is irreparable, but Sustainability staff brought in experts to try to minimize the effects of the vandalism. They are also working with Flagstaff Area Monuments to try to reduce future vandalism.

D. Sustainability Neighborhood Grant Report Out (5 Minutes) – Emily Melhorn

Requested Action: Informational

Mrs. Melhorn was unable to attend the meeting and agreed to provide a report out at the next commission meeting.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

None.

7. Future Agenda Items (5 Minutes) – All

A. City of Flagstaff Open Spaces Program

B. Regional Plan

C. Local Economies

D. Community Agriculture

E. Animal Keeping Code

8. Adjournment

Chair McCain adjourned the meeting at 6:15pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2018.
