

---

## CITY COUNCIL REPORT

DATE: 11/16/2018

TO: Mayor and Council Members

FROM: Jenny Niemann, Climate and Energy Specialist

THROUGH: Andy Bertelsen, Public Works Director

CC: Barbara Goodrich and Kevin Treadway

SUBJECT: Climate Action and Adaptation Plan – Revision Summary

---

This document reviews the significant changes made to the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan, between the September 19<sup>th</sup>, 2018 Draft, and the final Plan document, released November 16, 2018. Changes were made based on community feedback and Council suggestions, and further the overarching goals of the Plan.

Changes are broken down into four categories:

- Major structural changes
- New content
- Secondary changes
- New or revised strategies and actions

### Major structural changes

**1. Moved the Implementation Strategy, which was formally section 3 of 4, to the second section of the Plan.**

*Rationale:* This highlights the importance of implementation, and is a more logical placement due to its overarching nature.

Former order

- Introduction
- Strategies and Actions
- Implementation Strategy
- Implementation Matrix

New order:

- Introduction
- Implementation Strategy
- Strategies and Actions
- Implementation Matrix.

**2. Re-arranged the Introduction section to flow more logically and match the order of the Executive Summary. The section now flows as follows:**

- Executive Summary
- Climate Change and Flagstaff: projected changes, impacts, and Flagstaff's contribution.
- Plan basis: Benefits of climate plans, and a Plan overview
- Plan specifics: vision, goals, targets, and impacts.

*Rationale:* Public feedback indicated the order was confusing. We worked with an NAU Climate Science and Solutions class to brainstorm a more logical order. The Plan now sets the context by reviewing the climate changes we can expect and the impacts in Flagstaff, and then moves on to the rationale behind this Plan, the development process, and Plan goals. This order makes the Plan more accessible and helps it to be used as a teaching tool.

**3. Re-arranged the Introduction section to flow more logically and match the order of the Executive Summary. The section now flows as follows:**

- Executive Summary
- Climate Change and Flagstaff: projected changes, impacts, and Flagstaff’s contribution.
- Plan basis: Benefits of climate plans, and a Plan overview
- Plan specifics: vision, goals, targets, and impacts.

**4. Re-arranged the Introduction section to flow more logically and match the order of the Executive Summary. The section now flows as follows:**

- Executive Summary
- Climate Change and Flagstaff: projected changes, impacts, and Flagstaff’s contribution.
- Plan basis: Benefits of climate plans, and a Plan overview
- Plan specifics: vision, goals, targets, and impacts.

*Rationale:* Public feedback indicated the order was confusing. We worked with an NAU Climate Science and Solutions class to brainstorm a more logical order. The Plan now sets the context by reviewing the climate changes we can expect and the impacts in Flagstaff, and then moves on to the rationale behind this Plan, the development process, and Plan goals. This order makes the Plan more accessible and helps it to be used as a teaching tool.

**5. Added action items to the Implementation Strategy. While there previously were actions in the Implementation Strategy, we moved them into action tables, similar to those in the Strategies and Actions section.**

*Rationale:* While this was a simple formatting change, it greatly increased the prominence of the implementation actions. This made the section easier to read, and clarifies the direction of the Plan.

**6. Moved the Vulnerability Assessment results on specific topics to the appropriate focus areas in the Strategies and Actions section.**

*Rationale:* This provides more context for each vulnerability when discussing the focus area most related to it. There are five vulnerability assessment topics that were added to the following corresponding sections: Natural Environment (pg. 65), Water Resources (pg. 76), Transportation and Land Use (pg. 93), Public Health, Services and Safety (pg. 115), and Economic Prosperity and Recreation (pg. 123).

**7. Moved the Vulnerability Assessment results on specific topics to the appropriate focus areas in the Strategies and Actions section.**

*Rationale:* This provides more context for each vulnerability when discussing the focus area most related to it. There are five vulnerability assessment topics that were added to the following corresponding sections: Natural Environment (pg. 65), Water Resources (pg. 76), Transportation and Land Use (pg. 93), Public Health, Services and Safety (pg. 115), and Economic Prosperity and Recreation (pg. 123).

**8. In the Strategies and Action section, added ‘Corresponding Strategies’ under each goal.**

*Rationale:* This better connects the goals and strategies, and provides a clearer summary of each focus area on the goal pages.

**9. The November 9<sup>th</sup> Plan version was revised for the November 20<sup>th</sup> City Council agenda packet, to facilitate printing and correct pagination errors.** Changes made include:

- The addition of pages 40, 62, and 130. These filler pages enable tabbed printing and do not add new content.
- A pagination error was fixed in the Transportation and Land Use section. On page 100 in the November 9<sup>th</sup> version, the tension case study overlapped with strategies and actions, and parts of strategies 4, 5 and 6 were concealed in error. These strategies and actions are now listed on pages 101 through 103.
- Minor page break changes were made to facilitate printing and readability.

**New content**

**10. Added significant content discussing tensions between the Plan goals and other community concerns and priorities.**

- Introduction: A call-out highlighting and their discussion (pg. 25)
- Strategies and Actions: One tension discussion in each focus area
 

▪ Natural Environment (pg. 72)	▪ Transportation & Land Use (pg. 102)	▪ Economic Prosperity & Recreation (pg. 127)
▪ Water Resources (pg. 81)	▪ Waste & Consumption (pg. 112)	
▪ Energy (pg. 87)	▪ Public Health, Services & Safety (pg. 120)	
- Implementation Strategy: One tension discussion on funding (pg. 56)

**11. Added call-outs to highlight or explain important topics:**

Title	What it covers	Page
<b>Ponderosa Pines in Jeopardy</b>	Discusses anticipated changes to Ponderosa pine forests	15
<b>Climate Change is Here</b>	Discusses the temperature increases we have already seen in Coconino County	16
<b>Who is More Vulnerable to the Impacts of Climate Change?</b>	Specifies what communities are vulnerable to climate change	19
<b>The Need for Aggressive, Global Action</b>	Discusses the October 2018 Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) highlighting the need for urgent action to contain global temperature rise to 1.5° Celsius	42
<b>Food Recovery Hierarchy</b>	Provides a framework for prioritizing food waste actions	111
<b>A Circular Economy</b>	Defines the circular economy framework	125
<b>Job Opportunities Associated with Adaptation to Climate Change</b>	Reviews jobs that are related to climate change adaptation	129

## Secondary changes

12. Added a Letter from the Mayor (pg. 2).
13. Highlighted the definitions of mitigation and adaptation (pg. 13).
14. Updated the emissions-vulnerability decision matrix (pg. 47).
15. Highlighted the Operationalizing Equity checklist (pg. 51).
16. Added reclaimed water performance indicators in the Water Resources Focus Area (pg. 78).
17. Updated performance indicators and targets in the Energy Focus Area (pg. 84).
18. Added implementation actions to the Implementation Summary Schedule (pg. 131).

## New or revised strategies and actions

19. Implementation Strategy Section (pg. 41):
  - Due to the reformatting of this section, all strategies are new, and all actions have been more clearly defined in the action tables.
  - New actions not discussed in the draft are listed here.

### Kickstarting Implementation (pg. 42)

- This section was moved to the front of the Implementation Strategy. The steps needed to begin implementation were more clearly defined.
- IM-1-C: Develop a climate mitigation and adaptation decision matrix to be integrated into City plan creation and updates, including the regional plan, zoning code, and engineering standards.
- IM-1-D: Establish financing systems that facilitate investments, emergency funds, and cash-flow availability to develop climate adaptation initiatives.
- IM-2-A: Refine targets for all goals in the first six months of implementation.
- IM-2-B: Create detailed blueprints for the implementation of each Plan strategy within the first six months of implementation.
- IM-2-C: Host a community conversation on the Global Warming of 1.5° C special report by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, to identify if City goals should be refined.
- IM-2-D: Identify how city codes complement this Plan and identify areas that may need minor and major modifications.

### Leadership (pg. 43)

#### Flagstaff City Council (pg. 43)

- These action items recognize separate Council processes.
- IM-3-A: Identify goals for the upcoming City Council term that will support Plan implementation.
- IM-3-B: Identify City Council budgetary priorities to support Plan implementation.
- IM-3-C: Identify state and federal legislative priorities that support the goals of the Plan and enable implementation of Plan strategies and actions.

#### Sustainability Commission (pg. 43)

- The roles of the Sustainability Commission were more clearly defined.
- IM-4-A: Review the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan progress report annually to assess the effectiveness of Plan implementation.
- IM-4-B: As part of the annual budget process, make recommendations to the City Manager’s Office for areas to prioritize in the City Manager’s proposed budget.

#### City Leadership (pg. 44)

- Narrative content and actions were added to discuss how climate action will be incorporated into the annual budget process.
- IM-6-A: Each division will identify efforts that support resiliency and greenhouse gas mitigation during the annual budget review process, strategic planning, and workplan implementation.
- IM-6-B: The City Manager’s office will ensure that climate action is prioritized and used as a criterion in budget team decision making.
- IM-6-C: The City Manager’s proposed budget, presented during the annual budget review process, will incorporate a report on climate mitigation and adaptation projects that are funded in existing workplans or will be incorporated into workplans for the fiscal year.
- IM-6-D: In preparation for the annual budget process, identify Capital Improvement Program projects that will mitigate the City’s vulnerability to climate change impacts.
- IM-6-E: To capitalize on existing programmatic infrastructure, take steps to expand existing programs such as residential energy efficiency rebates, Home Energy Efficiency 101 workshops, Neighborhood Sustainability Grants, and Climate Ambassador programming.

#### Municipal Organization Climate Action Planning (pg. 45)

- This new section better highlights how the City of Flagstaff, specifically, can incorporate climate mitigation and adaptation into its operations.
- IM-7-A: Continue to track municipal greenhouse gas emissions and publish a greenhouse gas inventory, which will be widely disseminated among City staff.
- IM-7-B: Update the City of Flagstaff Resiliency and Preparedness Study to recognize evolving scientific understanding of climate change risks and identify how City vulnerabilities have changed.
- IM-7-C: Implement a municipal planning process that focuses on education and capacity building, climate action assessment, and integration into division budgets.
- IM-7-D: Create a data management plan for the organization to integrate climate-related considerations into the work of all divisions.

#### Required Staff Capacity for Climate Action Coordination (pg. 46)

- IM-8-A: Evaluate staffing needs to address the priorities identified in the Plan, and provide adequate resources to implement the Plan.

#### Expanding Community Capacity (pg. 48)

- This was renamed from ‘building community capacity’.

- New details on Neighborhood Sustainability Grants, Climate Action Working Groups, and Resilient Neighborhood Groups were added to the narrative.
- IM-9-C: Create community working groups as needed to tackle challenging implementation topics or undertake work where greater community collaboration is needed.

#### **Operationalizing equity (pg. 50)**

- No significant changes.

#### **Accountability and Reporting (pg. 52)**

- The narrative section on monitoring was removed, and the content was combined with the narrative on reporting.
- IM-11-E: The City of Flagstaff Sustainability Section will provide an annual update to the public on Plan implementation, through an annual event held during the Flagstaff Festival of Science.

#### **Funding (pg. 54)**

- Information on a climate action tax was added to the list of funding possibilities.
- IM-12-A: City staff will develop a funding proposal that supports the success of Plan implementation, to be considered by the City Manager’s Office and the City Council as part of the annual budget process.

#### **Community Outreach (pg. 57)**

- IM-13-A: Create a comprehensive framework that identifies diverse outreach methods.

### **20. Strategies and Actions Section (pg. 63):**

#### **Water Resources (pg. 75)**

- WR-1-C: Increase the efficiency of municipal irrigation systems and practices.
- *Moved from other actions to priority actions:* WR-1-D: Purchase backup generators for the Flagstaff water and wastewater infrastructure system in order to achieve the City Council’s goal of providing a “sustained minimal” level of water services in the event of a catastrophic power loss.
- WR-3-E: Create a repair loan program for City customers to encourage repairs to aging water infrastructure in homes and businesses.

#### **Energy (pg. 83)**

- E-1-I: Work with partners to develop a specific plan for an aggressive building electrification program to decrease reliance on combustion fuels.

#### **Transportation & Land Use (pg. 92)**

- TLU-1-G: (*revised*) The City will support a city-wide, ongoing discussion about density and its implications, with clear objectives and deliverables, that align specifically with the Climate Plan. Community workshops and discussion forums will discuss trade-offs and opportunities, while

continuous educational opportunities will review the cost of free parking and other land use issues.

- TLU-1-H: Request transportation demand management plans for large developments, to support transportation choices and reduce parking needs.
- TLU-1-I: Incorporate climate action and adaptation criteria into entitlement reviews.
- *The following actions were moved from ‘other actions’ to ‘priority actions’:*
  - TLU-3-F: Educate City staff on best practices to respond to and support the transition to electric vehicles within the community.
  - TLU-3-G: Educate the public on existing state and federal incentives for efficient and electric vehicles, including tax incentives and at-home electric vehicle charging outlet incentives.
  - TLU-3-H: Introduce local incentives to accelerate the adoption of electric vehicles, such as modest mid-stream incentives for car dealers to sell electric vehicles, a sales tax rebate, bulk purchasing, and incentives for visitors to rent efficient vehicles.
  - TLU-3-I: Encourage car-free living by attracting additional electric vehicle car-sharing businesses to Flagstaff, providing incentives to ensure accessibility to residents in all neighborhoods.
  - TLU-3-J: Work with leading figures—such as elected officials, Northern Arizona University leaders, and business leaders—to commit to visibly switching to electric vehicles.

#### **Waste & Consumption (pg. 105)**

- WC-2-D: Increase resources for existing City food systems programming including community gardens, food policy and food waste prevention.
- WC-2-E: Establish a robust food recovery program to support community members and protect against disruptions, including working with food rescue organizations and commercial kitchens.

#### **Public Health, Services & Safety (pg. 114)**

- PH-3-D: Support the development of neighborhood resiliency groups.
- PH-3-E: Provide information on what residents can do to reduce their carbon footprint and how their households can be more resilient.
- PH-5-B: Initiate a working group on public health and climate change, including participation from the Coconino County Public Health Services Department (CCPHSD), the City of Flagstaff, and NAU, among others.

#### **Economic Prosperity & Recreation (pg. 122)**

- Strategy 1 was revised to: Accelerate the transformation to a low-carbon economy that minimizes emissions and can effectively adapt as the climate changes.
- EPR-1-H: Focus business development efforts on businesses that have lower impacts on natural resources.