



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Thursday, March 28, 2019

4:30 – 6:30 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair

David McCain, Vice Chair

Eli Chamberlain

Dara Marks Marino

Amanda Vigneau

Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Jenny Niemann

1. **Call to Order**

Chair Peterson called the meeting to order at 4:32pm.

2. **Roll Call**

Chair Petersen

Vice Chair McCain

Commissioner Chamberlain

Commissioner Marks Marino

Commissioner Vigneau

Commissioner White

3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

Tamara Lawless, City of Flagstaff Water Conservation Manager, welcomed the commission to celebrate the water conservation program's 30 Years of Conservation on Friday, April 5th at Heritage Square downtown. The event kicks off Water Awareness

Month, including the National Mayor's Challenge for Water Conservation which gives community members a chance to sign a pledge. Flagstaff won the challenge in 2017 and got second place in 2018.

4. Approval of Minutes

A. February 28, 2019

Commissioner McCain motioned to approve the February minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner White. All voted in favor.

5. Business

A. Earth Day (5 minutes) – Maggie Twomey

Requested Action: Informational

Maggie Twomey, Volunteer and Event Coordinator, shared that Earth Day would be held at Bushmaster Park on Saturday, April 20th. The event kicks off with a community cleanup sponsored by Bookmans and hosted by Arizona Conservation Experience. Free yoga at the park will begin at 10:00am. Three free workshops focused on the separate topics of composting, water harvesting, and recycling will be held throughout the day.

The commissioners were given the opportunity to sign up as volunteers to station the event's Information Booth. In addition, commissioners were invited to help hang door hangers during April 9th - 12th with the goal of hanging 1,600 door hangers total.

Mrs. Jenny Niemann agreed to help coordinate an Adopt-an-Avenue cleanup for the commissioners.

B. Electric Bikes and Electric Scooters Proposed Amendments to City Code (20 minutes) – Nicole Antonopoulos and Martin Ince

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Mrs. Nicole Antonopoulos, Sustainability Manager, and Mr. Martin Ince, Multi-Modal Transportation Planner, presented on staff's efforts on amending City Code to properly address electric bicycles and electric scooters ("e-bikes" and "e-scooters").

First, Mr. Ince reviewed existing state legislation and city code. State legislation covers electric bicycles, electric personal assistive mobility devices (e.g., Segways), personal delivery services, and Neighborhood Electric Vehicles/motorized quadcycles.

Under the legislation, a person who uses an electric personal assistive mobility device has all the rights and duties that are applicable to pedestrians. Personal delivery services, recently introduced on the Northern Arizona University campus, can operate on sidewalks and in crosswalks and on roadways at 25 miles per hour (mph) or less and also have the rights and duties of pedestrians. Neighborhood electric vehicles cannot operate at more than 25 mph and are not allowed on highways with a posted speed limit of more than 35 mph. Motorized quadcycles can only operate at 15 mph and cannot go on roads more than 35 mph.

Electric bikes are divided into three classes. Class 1 has pedal assist and cannot go more than 20 mph. Class 2 has a throttle and cannot go more than 20 mph. Class

three has pedal assist and cannot go more than 28 mph. A person riding an electric bicycle has the same rights and duties as a person riding a bicycle. A label is required on electric bicycles that indicates the classification number, top assisted speed, and motor wattage.

Class 1 and 2 can be used on bicycle and multi-use paths (e.g., Flagstaff Urban Trail System [FUTS]) although local authority can prohibit them on paths. Class 3 may not be used on bicycle and multi-use paths unless it is within or adjacent to a roadway, but local authority may allow them on paths.

Mrs. Antonopoulos added that the City is going to submit a joint Request for Proposal with Northern Arizona University (NAU) for a bike share program. Staff is requesting that 10% of the bikes in the bike share program be electric.

The State has also proposed legislation to address e-scooters. Staff will make recommendations to City Council on e-bicycles as well as e-scooters. In the case of e-scooters, staff is hoping to have a policy in place if and when private companies bring e-scooters to Flagstaff.

In Flagstaff, bicycles are allowed on sidewalks except in certain areas of downtown and the Southside Neighborhood. Roller skates/blades, scooters, and skateboards are also prohibited in these specific areas of town. Mr. Ince mentioned that sidewalk prohibitions might be extended to other Flagstaff neighborhoods.

In February, staff released a survey that had 376 respondents. Mr. Ince showed results categorized by device and by facility. Respondents generally felt that e-bikes belonged in bike lanes and on paved FUTS. There was less consensus on whether or not e-scooters belonged in bike lanes or on paved FUTS. Respondents did not think e-bikes or e-scooters should be allowed on sidewalks or downtown. The tone of the survey comments was mostly negative.

Potential changes to the City Code include revisions to: allow bicycles and segways on sidewalks (unless posted prohibited); prohibit electric and motorized bicycles and scooters from sidewalks, and; require bicycles and scooters on the sidewalk to yield to pedestrians, give audible signals to pedestrians when overtaking, and operate at a speed that is prudent and reasonable. For FUTS, revisions would: allow bicycles, class 1 and 2 e-bikes, segways, scooters, and skateboards, but prohibit class 3 e-bikes and motorized bikes.

Staff plans to make recommendations for Code revisions to City Council in the near future.

Mr. Ince mentioned that there are two sides to this issue and that the Bike Advisory and Pedestrian Advisory Committees (“BAC” and “PAC”) have spent many hours thinking through what recommendations to make.

Commissioner White commented that the benefit of getting around town using alternative transportation needed to be considered.

Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni suggested that it might be useful to install more signage along areas of the FUTS where there is concern about the safety of e-bikes on these paths.

Commissioner Marks Marino motioned that the commission support the recommendations from the PAC and BAC. Commissioner White seconded. All in favor.

Commissioner Marks Marino motioned that consider prohibiting certain sections of the FUTS from e-bikes. Commissioner Chamberlain seconded. One nay from Commissioner White. All others voted in favor.

C. City Hall South Lawn Project (10 minutes) – Tamara Lawless

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Mr. Ed Shenk, Stormwater Project Manager, and Mrs. Tamara Lawless, Water Conservation Manager, presented on a project proposal for on the City Hall South Lawn. The goal is to implement Low Impact Development landscaping features that are more sustainable than the current lawn. The project is funded by a Water Infrastructure Finance Authority (WIFA) grant and \$5,000 from the Water Conservation program.

The project may be delayed while ADOT installs a new righthand turn land off Humphreys and replaces a bridge on Route 66 in front of City Hall.

Design charrettes were held in 2018 to gather input from community partners on how the space could be used. Ideas included preserving the cement-covered space for political activism, using native plants to display our local ecosystem, reducing water consumption with xeriscape features, creating usable spaces, embracing beauty, and more.

TerraBIRDS produced a concept design which incorporates a path, additional shade plants, fruit trees, low-profile rocks in the Rio de Flag channel, and terracing. Native grass meadows would replace traditional lawn and the existing pavement could be converted to a permeable surface. Similar features are suggested for the north side of City Hall.

The estimated project value \$64,000 annually. Benefits include reduced lawn maintenance and irrigation costs, greenhouse gas emissions savings, reduced flood risk, and stormwater pollution reduction.

Water Conservation and Sustainability staff submitted funding requests to the City Budget Team to carry out this project, but were not successful for Fiscal Year 2020.

Mrs. Lawless and Mr. Shenk added that there may be opportunities to replace the green lawn with native grass mixes or water-efficient blends like Pearl's Premium.

Vice Mayor Adam Shimoni commented that it would be great to incorporate interactive components, such as a labyrinth. John Taylor, TerraBIRDS, added that they would like to do a pilot starting with the trail and plant terracing. He also mentioned that TerraBIRDS would like to use youth engagement to get this work done.

Chair Peterson offered help in turf removal.

D. Active Transportation Plan (20 minutes) – Martin Ince

Requested Action: Informational

Mr. Ince, Multimodal Transportation Planner, introduced two master plans. Staff has been making presentations to other commissions and the plans will eventually go to City Council for decisionmaking.

The Active Transportation Master Plan addresses walking and biking while the FUTS Master Plan guides future development of the FUTS system. He mentioned that master plans implement the goals and policies of the Flagstaff Regional Plan. He also added that the City will most likely create its own transportation plan in the near future.

Mr. Ince mentioned that the master plans have goals and targets as well as metrics. Chair Peterson emphasized the need for transportation goals and mechanisms in place for meeting goals. He used Davis, California and Copenhagen, Denmark as good examples. These communities prioritize pedestrians and bicycles over cars and they have been able to meet their goals.

Mr. Ince reviewed the guiding principles of the plan which include:

1. Being walk and bike-friendly (and defining what that means)
2. There is substantial opportunity in Flagstaff to increase walking and biking
3. Walking and biking need to be supported and encouraged in order to thrive
4. More people will choose to walk and bike when it is comfortable, convenient, and appealing
5. Better walking and biking options are essential to enhancing mobility

He then reviewed the seven goals:

1. Complete transportation networks for walking and biking.
2. Take care of the existing network through maintenance, snow removal, obstructions, closures, and detours.
3. Build a supportive community by promoting walking and biking and building equity.
4. Improve safety via education, enforcement, and safety campaigns.
5. Promote supportive land use and complete streets.
6. Travel demand management (try to reduce single occupancy vehicles by encouraging other options).
7. Assess progress by setting benchmarks and targets.

Chair Peterson recommended better definition of density.

Mr. Ince showed survey results about the types of transportation people use depending on where they live. Results showed that more than 50% of people use alternative modes of transportation in the core of Flagstaff (downtown and Southside). Mr. Ince mentioned that many communities have travel demand management (TDM) programs to help people have the choice to use alternative forms of transportation.

Community engagement has been a big focus of both the master plans. Staff have done seven surveys with over 2,000 responses, hosted public meetings, and provided information and feedback opportunities at community events.

Mr. Ince closed by showing a plan schedule that includes additional stakeholder engagement, public review, detailed review, and final approval. He directed those interested in learning more to the following website: www.flagstaff.az.gov/atmp.

Mr. Ince mentioned that Prop 419 provides funding to address missing trails, bike lanes, and sidewalks. He added that staff will consider how to make the infrastructure and network more comfortable so that people actually use them.

Chair Peterson recommended that there be an implementation plan with metrics based on very specific goals.

E. Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (20 minutes) – All

Requested Action: Informational

Last month, the Sustainability subcommittee of the commission met to review the funding requests related to the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan that went to the City Manager and Budget Team. The subcommittee sent a letter to the Interim City Manager with their thoughts and did receive a response.

Ms. Antonopoulos presented on the recommendations that went forward to the City Manager's budget related to the Sustainability Section which will be presented to City Council for consideration. She added that City Council can follow these recommendations, recommend items that were not recommended by the Budget Team, or recommend new items. specifically relating to the Sustainability Commission.

The Materials Management Coordinator was approved for ongoing funding. However, the permanent part-time position for Community Stewards Assistant Position was not approved although the funding is there. Therefore, this work will still be outsourced.

The Climate and Energy Data Coordinator position was not funded. The greenhouse gas inventory software also was not funded. Chair Peterson mentioned that these two budget items are critical to moving forward on implementation of the Climate Action and Adaptation Plan (CAAP) the fact that they were not recommended for funding is very problematic.

Funding was recommended for a part-time Climate Engagement Coordinator. Other recommended budget items include: funding for a bike share system, funding for the Food Waste Program, increased funding for the Neighborhood Sustainability Grants, funding for behavior change and educational marketing campaigns, funding for the Indigenous Youth Service Academy, increased funding for the Energy Rebate Program, funding for community gardens, backyard composting and education, and others.

Overall, more than \$300,000 will be recommended from the Sustainability Section to Council. The budget retreat will be held April 23rd and 24th and these meetings are open to the public.

Commissioner White made a motion that the Sustainability subcommittee representing the Sustainability Commission formerly advise the City Council to fund

the Climate and Energy Data Coordinator position and the greenhouse gas tracking software. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Marks Marino. All in favor.

F. Sustainability Section Update (10 minutes) – Nicole Antonopoulos

Requested Action: Informational

Sustainability staff moved to 419 Mogollon after being office-less for one month.

Sustainability staff have many events coming up in the near future including Earth Day, the Innovative Waste Challenge, and Lights Out Flagstaff.

Ms. Antonopoulos mentioned that the Winter Stewards program is doing well. During three cleanups, 68 volunteers have donated over 138 hours. Focused on litter.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Chair Peterson shared that he went to Council to request that the Sustainability Section be elevated to Division status, but it did not go forward.

7. Adjournment

Chair Petersen adjourned the meeting at 6:39pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2019.
