



MINUTES

City of Flagstaff Sustainability Commission

Thursday, July 25th, 2019

4:30 – 6:30 pm

CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL

211 West Aspen Avenue, Flagstaff, Arizona

A quorum of the Flagstaff City Council may be in attendance of the Sustainability Commission meeting.



In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact 928-213-2100. Notification at least 48 hours in advance will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Brian Petersen, Chair

David McCain, Vice Chair

Eli Chamberlain

Breanna Guzman

Dara Marks Marino

Kevin White

STAFF LIAISON:

Jenny Niemann

MINUTES:

Lisa Clark

1. **Call to Order**

Vice Chair McCain called the meeting to order at 4:30pm.

2. **Roll Call**

____ Chair Petersen

 X Vice Chair McCain

 X Commissioner Chamberlain

 X Commissioner Guzman

 X Commissioner Marks Marino

 X Commissioner White

3. **Public Participation**

At this time, any member of the public may address the Commission on any subject that is not scheduled before the Commission on that day. The Arizona Open Meeting Law prohibits the Commission from discussing or taking action on an item which is not listed on the prepared agenda. Commission members may, however, respond to criticism made by those addressing the Commission, ask staff to review a matter, or ask that a matter be placed on a future agenda. To address the Commission on an item that is on the agenda, please wait for the Chair to call for Public Comment at the time the item is heard.

No public participation.

4. **Approval of Minutes**

A. **June 27th, 2019**

Vice Chair McCain asked that the header from the June 27th meeting as well as the May 23rd and April 25th meetings be changed from “Agenda” to “Minutes”. He also asked that “Northern Arizona University” be removed after “Flagstaff Leadership Program” within the Over the Rainbow Butterfly Garden section as the program is not through the university.

Commissioner White motioned to approve the minutes with the changes above. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Chamberlain. All voted in favor with one abstention by Commissioner Marks Marino.

5. **Business**

A. **Bike Ordinance – upcoming process to review signage and enforcement (10 minutes) – Martin Ince**

Requested Action: Discussion

Martin Ince, Multimodal Transportation Planner with the Community Development Department, reported on the status of the E-bike and E-scooter code revisions. Currently, Class 1 and 2 E-bikes that have a maximum speed of 20 miles per hour are allowed on all sidewalks except downtown and the entire Flagstaff Urban Trail System (FUTS) except for the Nate Avery Trail and the Arizona Trail, which includes a section of FUTS from Butler Ave. to the Francis Short Pond which can be seen on a map shown by Mr. Ince. Class 3 E-bikes, which can operate at a maximum of 28 miles per hour, are prohibited on all sidewalks and FUTS. E-scooters are permitted on paved FUTS trails including the paved sections of the Arizona Trail but not on sidewalks or unpaved FUTS. This code has been adopted by City Council, and the Commission was asked for suggestions related to signage and enforcement.

To inform the new signage along the FUTS and sidewalks, some best practices for trail etiquette education were gathered from national advocacy groups like Rails to Trails and American Trails and from other communities. These best practices include signs that encourage E-bikes to go slow in congested areas or keep to the right and adding centerline markings to paved areas. Vice Chair McCain encouraged finding ways to integrate the new signage into the old system that is already present. Commissioner Marks Marino suggested using successive signs along FUTS that would contain only one rule but would be spaced out along the trail.

As an alternative to signage, Vice Chair McCain asked whether those who distribute the E-bikes could distribute some information and guidelines. Mr. Ince agreed that he could create a basic card with general guidelines to be handed out with the E-bikes. He also mentioned that there is currently only one FUTS trailhead sign with trail etiquette information but it contains too much information, despite already having been edited multiple times.

Vice Chair McCain also asked whether any decisions had been made yet on how the new E-bike and E-scooter code would be enforced. Mr. Ince explained that enforcement would not be practical through the Police Department, but that users could enforce the rules themselves. Enforcement will be on the agenda in August.

B. Sustainability Neighborhood Grant Process Follow Up (20 Minutes) – All
Requested Action: Discussion

As the Neighborhood Sustainability Grant process changed since last year, Ms. Niemann asked for feedback on the changes from the Commissioners. In June, the Commission decided to fully fund six applications and partially fund three applications. The General Sustainability grant money has all been awarded, but there is still about \$3,000 left for Water Conservation grants so another round of applications will be accepted in the winter. The changes to the grant process include having an application deadline rather than a rolling application, a new application form, the criteria and scoring used to select awarded applicants, and the grant money will now be provided in full at the start of the project rather than through reimbursements.

Commissioner Chamberlain asked whether Compost Crowd provided a Flagstaff address, thus ensuring their eligibility. The address was given immediately after the June meeting, so Compost Crowd will be awarded grant money.

The Commissioners discussed the changes. They were in agreement that it was beneficial to have all applicants at once and to use a scoring system based on concrete criteria. Commissioner White suggested adding a requirement in the application process for a detailed itemized budget to help guide the decision-making process.

Vice Chair McCain observed that there seemed to be more applicants than ever before and asked if that was due to a different marketing process. Ms. Niemann explained that more marketing was done than in past years, but that the new hard deadline may have encouraged more people to apply.

The new disbursement system is easier for Sustainability staff to manage. Lisa Clark has stepped into the role of liaison for the Neighborhood Sustainability Grants program and has been checking in with all of the grantees to ensure that they all know the requirements and that the project timelines and budgets are still as the Commission expected. Two groups have already completed the necessary steps to receive their grant funds, and the process has been going well so far.

All of the groups who were awarded money will be giving presentations at the July 2020 Commission meeting. Commissioner Marks Marino expressed concern that the next round of applicants will be presenting the month before at the June 2020 meeting, which means that there will be little to no time for other business.

Ms. Niemann asked if the Commission wanted to clarify the language for exclusions for grant money uses related to salary and wages. The Commissioners agreed to leave the salary and wage issue to be determined on a case-by-case basis.

C. Working Group (formerly known as Sub-Committees) discussion – updates and next steps (40 minutes) – All

Working Group guidelines – Jenny Niemann

Working Group structure – David McCain

Requested Action: Discussion and Direction

Working Group Guidelines

The City Clerk Office has drafted new guidelines on Sub-Committees and Working Groups within Commissions. Ms. Niemann explained the differences between the two groups, and the Commission confirmed that they would like to form Working Groups rather than Sub-Committees. The function of a Working Group is to research particular subjects that can be brought back to the Commission for discussion or decisions, and Working Groups are less formal than Sub-Committees and can include members outside of the Commission. Commissioner may communicate with each other within the context of the Working Groups as long as duties of the Commission are not discussed.

The Sustainability section will be starting outreach next week for their two new Climate Action Working Groups in health and equity. They are looking for 10-15 people in each group, and are currently taking applications.

City Council will also be moving back to the liaison format to communicate with the Commission. An assigned Councilmember will communicate with the Commission and report back to Council starting in the fall. There will be more information on this process soon.

Working Group Structure

Vice Chair McCain created a short document outlining the new expectations and process for Commission Working Groups to ensure clarity and accountability. Each Commission Working Group will be independently staffed with no funding, and resources include Climate Leaders that will be trained starting August 7th and the Climate Action Working Groups. The Commission Working Groups will meet outside of the regular Commission meetings and report back monthly.

The first step for the Commission Working Groups is to create two-page Action Plan to guide tasks for October through March to be shared with the Commission at the September meeting. The Action Plans will be sent to Ms. Niemann by September 20th.

D. Letter to Council – Appreciation for FY20 budget decisions (10 minutes) – Kevin White

Requested Action: Discussion and Vote

Commissioner White wrote a letter to send to City Council expressing gratitude about the budget decisions that were made. Commissioner Marks Marino recommended that the Commission be capitalized throughout the letter.

Commissioner Marks Marino suggested that email approvals be used in the future if it needs to be done quickly.

Commissioner Marks Marino motioned to approve the letter with the discussed changes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Chamberlain. All voted in favor.

E. Climate Leaders Program Speakers (10 minutes) – Jenny Niemann

Requested Action: Information and Recommendations

Ms. Niemann presented the current list of speakers that have been secured for the Climate Leaders Program. Initially, she had intended for the Commission to have more input on who those speakers would be, but she was not able to wait since the topic was postponed due to time constraints at the June meeting. There will be eight different three-hour sessions with two different topics each related to a particular focus area and climate action in the community. These sessions will be only open to those who register and will happen on Wednesdays from 5:30pm-8:30pm starting August 7th. Many topics will be covered including climate change in Flagstaff, public health, equity, communication, and energy. There are a wide variety of speakers including Chair Petersen, Commissioner Chamberlain, Mayor Evans, Northern Arizona University (NAU) professors, community members, and more. The sessions will be mostly discussion-based, but the format will change depending on the speaker. The Climate Leaders Program will be repeated once annually.

Ms. Niemann asked for the Commission's suggestions for people to include in a panel focused on becoming a local climate action leader. Vice Chair McCain suggested contacting the Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance and Sunrise Movement. Commissioner White suggested reaching out to Sarah King from Flagstaff Federated Community Church and Jeff Hall from Lowell Observatory.

The Commissioners also brought up names of people that could supplement the communication-focused webinar. Vice Chair McCain mentioned Peter Friederici from NAU. Commissioner Marks Marino also suggested Amanda Capp from NAU and Lee Bryant with the Sustainability Section.

Commissioner White also requested that more focus be given to economics. He suggested bringing in an NAU professor, and will send specific names to Ms. Niemann.

After the eight weeks of seminars, the Climate Leaders are required to put in 30 hours of volunteering which can include hosting dinners focused on climate action or giving presentations to the community.

Commissioner White requested that the seminars be recorded and available to the public. Ms. Niemann will look into it, and suggested that the presentation part could be publicly available but not the discussion to still ensure that those who register are getting the most out of it.

New registrations will be accepted until August 7th.

F. Sustainability Section update (10 minutes) – Jenny Niemann

Requested Action: Information

Ms. Niemann gave an update on the Sustainability Section. Staff have been focused on flood mitigation post-Museum Fire including sandbag distribution, directing traffic, and talking to people. Nicole Antonopoulos attended a meeting focused on the post-fire recovery plan and community resiliency. All of the Sustainability media have transitioned to support City and County efforts. Commissioner White asked whether the sandbag process will continue into the future, as the flood risk will

remain for years. Ms. Niemann replied that there is a lot of work being done in the burn area and the floodplain to mitigate the flood risk, but there are still many unknowns in the process so sandbags are the immediate solution on the individual level and larger scale mitigation will be done for the long term. The Commission does not need to get involved in the flood mitigation and post-fire efforts unless asked as most of the efforts are being done by the County.

The community greenhouse gas inventory for 2018 was submitted last week to the Carbon Disclosure Project (CDP) and the municipal inventory is now in progress. The greenhouse gas inventories used to be voluntary but are now required for the City of Flagstaff since City Council joined the Global Covenant of Mayors, so small changes are being made to the inventory report as compared to past reports. Ms. Niemann will give a presentation on the inventory at the August Commission meeting.

The Sustainability Section is doing a Movies on the Square sponsorship next Saturday, August 3rd, with a community trash cleanup right before. They will also be tabling during the movie.

6. To and From (5 Minutes) – All

Commissioner Marks Marino highlighted an upcoming Global Climate Strike to occur on September 20th. It will be a youth-led event with adult participation, and she is hoping for a strong showing in Flagstaff. There will be a youth training session on August 10th where any youth who are interested and want to become leaders will crystallize their message and organize how they want the strike to happen. There will likely be a downtown strike location as well as participation in schools. More information will be available next month.

Commissioner Chamberlain brought up a Northern Arizona Climate Change Alliance event on Saturday, August 3rd from 2pm-4pm at the First Congregational Church. There will be a presentation on “Keeping the Earth: Religious and Scientific Perspectives on the Environment” which relates climate change to religion.

Vice Chair McCain mentioned that August 21st is International Peace Day. The theme is “Climate Action for Peace”. This is an opportunity to educate the community and Vice Chair McCain will work with Commissioner Marks Marino to connect with the groups involved in the Global Climate Strike to set up a table at the event.

Vice Chair McCain also mentioned the Friends of the Library book sale from August 2nd to August 4th at the Flagstaff Public Library.

Ms. Niemann pointed out that Chair Petersen will be speaking at NAU on August 15th at 5:30pm in SBS West, room 200, on “Climate Change Myths and the Search for Real Solutions”.

7. Adjournment

Vice Chair McCain adjourned the meeting at 5:51pm.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on _____, at _____ a.m./p.m. in accordance with the statement filed by the Disability Awareness Commission with the City Clerk.

Dated this _____ day of _____, 2019.
