



Commission on Council Salaries

[Click here to join the meeting](#) or +1 520-415-3558,,820516579#

City Hall, Council Conference Room, 211 W Aspen Avenue

October 12, 2022 – 8:00 a.m.

DRAFT MINUTES

- I. Call to Order 8:02 am
- II. Roll Call

Alex Martinez	X Jim Wine
X Allison Eckert	X Kyle Nitschke
Ben Ruddell	X McKenzie Jones, Vice Chair
X Brandon Cruickshank	X Ryan Martin, Chair
Ellen Jimenez	
- III. Recommended Protocol for Members and Other Participants in the Virtual Meeting

All individuals who are attending virtually should have their microphones on mute to keep the background noise out of the meeting room. If you would like to speak, please indicate this by raising your hand or making a comment in the chat.
- IV. Public Participation

The Commission cannot act upon items presented during the Public Participation portion of the agenda. Individual Commission members may ask questions of the public but are prohibited by the Open Meeting Law from discussion or considering the item among themselves until the item is officially placed on the agenda. Each public comment or presentation will be limited to five (5) minutes.

 - A. Councilmember Adam Shimoni shared the previous City Council requested the review of City Council salaries. Not a day goes by that he is not working on City work. Tuesday meetings are a small piece of the work. It is full-time. Council members are liaisons to commissions, committees, and groups. It is like being a doctor and on-call. Very few jobs can compliment this work. There is a limited scope of people that can do this and find complimentary employment. They want to run but cannot do it due to the financial barriers. Working class raising a family would experience great sacrifice financially. Council is directly hiring the City Attorney and City Manager, and both earn around \$200,000 and leadership around \$180,000. Working with high level official and City budget. Two people made it onto the ballot for 4 Council positions. Enhance diversity on Council to better reflect the community. County treats elected appropriately and need to do this at the City level.
 - B. Coral Evans the previous Mayor from 2016 and 2020 and served as Council member previously from 2008 to 2016. Her family has been in Flagstaff for six generations. There is approximately 80,000 who reside in Flagstaff, 150,000 in and out each day, and 6 million visitors. When she served as Mayor she worked four jobs. She worked between 9 pm and 3 am because she was not needed as Mayor during that time. She would get up at 7 am for her day job and had a side job making bath and body products. The Mayor works full-time and the previous Mayor would come over to her home asking for food because she could not afford to eat. Eventually that Mayor had to get a job which reduced the amount of time she could dedicate to being Mayor. The County has districts so splits up population and its not the same in the City. She still has the last binder created for a Council meeting prior to moving to fully electronic and it was 1,100 pages. This has to be read in your free time. The City has a half a billion-dollar budget. This is a 24-hour seven day a week job. Council is unable to go places without being stopped and asked about what is happening. You need a skill set to do the job to run meetings. Work with City officials and other jurisdictions and elected officials including Sovren Nations. Minimum wage will be pay more than the Council salary. She served as Mayor taking a vow of poverty. She was lucky to have the house her grandfather built in 1942. She asked the Commission to look at what is the demand, skills needed, how serve and compensation.

C. Chair Martin asked if there had been any written feedback received through the City website. Shannon Anderson responded there had not been any information submitted.

V. Approval of Minutes

A. September 28, 2022

1. Motion to approve meeting minutes by Ryan Martin.
2. Second by Allison Eckert.
3. All approved, motion carried.

B. October 5, 2022

1. Motion to approve meeting minutes by Jim Wine.
2. Second by Ryan Martin.
3. All approved, motion carried.

VI. Discussion Items

A. Discuss Mayor and Council salaries and routine expenses recommendation

1. Review draft City Council presentation
 - a. Reviewed background of City Code on Council Salaries, Council request process, and struggle to fill vacancies
 - b. Provided when the commission was appointed and timeline of Citizen Commission
 - i. Council appointed commissioners on April 19, 2022
 - ii. Selected commissioners from 5 identified commissions between June and August
 - iii. Citizen Commission met in September and October
 - c. Included details of the information the Citizen Commission considered when making their recommendation
 - i. Mayor and Council examples of work
 - ii. Municipal benchmark data
 - iii. County benchmark data
 - iv. 8.3% Consumer Price Index
 - v. Minimum wage
 - vi. Cost of living
 - vii. Living wage
 - d. Community outreach
 - i. City website
 - ii. Form on City website
 - iii. Press release
 - e. Salary recommendations
 - i. Mayor: increase salary from \$38,500 to \$54,340 following the 2022 election and from \$54,340 to \$70,180 effective December 1, 2024
 - ii. Councilmembers: increase salary from \$25,500 to \$44,650 following the 2022 election and from \$44,650 to \$63,800 effective December 1, 2024
 - f. Stipend recommendation
 - i. Mayor: increase routine travel and meals monthly stipend from \$150 to \$200 per month with a vehicle and \$250 to \$300 per month without a vehicle
 - ii. Councilmembers: increase routine travel and meals monthly stipend from \$166 to \$200 per month
 - g. Supporting statements
 - i. Recognizes irregular schedule of Council members and difficulty to fit within a normal work schedule
 - ii. Ability to attract quality and diverse candidates to fill Council vacancies
 - iii. Aligns council salaries closer to County Board of Supervisor and like community salaries
 - iv. Compensates for the time being spent fulfilling duties and meeting community expectations
 - v. Provides a sustainable wage
 - vi. Recognizes the role, responsibility, and impact of City Council member decisions

- vii. Continues differential between Councilmembers and Mayor
- 2. Review draft ordinance
 - a. Updates the Mayor and Council salaries in section A based on the salary recommendation outlined above
 - b. Section B has been updated to provide language from the City Charter about the increase or decrease of Council salaries
 - c. Update the routine travel and meals monthly stipend in section E based on the stipend recommendation outlined above

VII. Action Items

- A. Approval of Council salaries and routine expenses recommendation
 - 1. Motion to approve the recommended Council salaries and routine expenses by Ryan Martin.
 - 2. Second by Allison Eckert.
 - 3. All approved, motion carried.

VIII. Adjournment 8:38 am



For Special Accommodations, please notify Stacy Fobar in the City Clerk's Office at (928) 213-2077 or (928) 774-5281 (TDD) at least three business days prior to the scheduled meeting time.

CERTIFICATION OF POSTING OF NOTICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing notice was duly posted at Flagstaff City Hall on October 10, 2022 at 2:00 pm in accordance with the statement filed by the Commission on Council Salaries with the City Clerk.

Dated this 10th day of October. *S. Anderson*